

**INDEPENDENT CITIZENS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
OF THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR REGENERATIVE
MEDICINE**

June 4 and 5, 2007 Minutes DRAFT

The Independent Citizens Oversight Committee met on June 4 at the Luxe Hotel on Sunset Boulevard in Los Angeles, and at the University of California, Los Angeles, on June 5, as noted in the notice and agenda.

June 4 – Luxe Hotel, 11461 Sunset Boulevard, Los Angeles, California

Open Session:

1. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 p.m.
2. Melissa King led the ICOC in the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. Roll Call. Members present: Baltimore, Price, Brenner, Duckles, Henderson, Chairman Klein, Lansing, Rome, Pomeroy, Prieto, Roth, Sheehy, Steward, Wright, and Vice-Chair Penhoet. Lack of a quorum was noted. The assembled members agreed to proceed with the meeting subject to subsequent ratification of their decision to proceed and any actions taken.
4. **Agenda Item 7:** The ICOC received reports from the Acting President, Lori Hoffman, and Interim Chief Scientific Officer, Dr. Arlene Chiu.
5. **Agenda Item 8:** Consideration of Recommendations from the Grants Working Group and Facilities Working Group on Shared Laboratories and Techniques Course Grant applications, RFA 07-01. The ICOC heard presentations from Dr. Arlene Chiu, Dr. Kumar Hari, Rick Keller and ICOC Member Jeff Sheehy, describing the Shared Labs RFA, the parallel evaluation of the applications received by two working groups (the Scientific and Medical Research Funding Working Group and the Scientific and Medical Research Facilities Working Group), and a summary of their funding recommendations. General Counsel described the procedures to govern the ICOC's consideration of the grant applications and recommendations.

Motion to fund those applications listed in Tier 1 (501, 505, 507, 511, 514, 518, 519, 520, 522, 523, 524) in the combined recommendations table, and also application number 500, made by Wright and seconded by Roth: Ayes 15, Noes 0. Members voting Aye except as to those applications as to which the member

is recused: Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Henderson, Lansing, Penhoet, Pomeroy, Rome, Sheehy and Steward. Members voting Aye without exception: Klein, Prieto, Roth and Wright.

Motion to move Application 521 to funding category made by Sheehy, seconded by Wright. Ayes 14, Noes 0. Ayes: Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Henderson, Klein, Penhoet, Pomeroy, Price, Prieto, Rome, Roth, Sheehy, Steward and Wright. Recused from discussion and voting: Lansing.

Dinner recess.

Closed Session – After the dinner recess, the ICOC reconvened in closed session, as duly noticed in the notice of meeting and agenda pursuant to Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D). The closed session recessed at 9:30 p.m.

June 5 – UCLA Grand Horizon Room 3rd Floor, Covel Commons, Sunset Village: 330 De Neve Drive, Los Angeles, California 90024

1. The Chair reconvened the public meeting at approximately 9:40 a.m.
2. Melissa King led the ICOC in the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. Roll Call. Members present: Azziz, Baltimore, Price, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Markland, Kessler, Chairman Klein, Lansing, Levey, Vice-Chair Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Prieto, Roth, Sheehy, Steward and Wright. A quorum was noted.
4. **Consent Items 4 and 5:** Motion to approve Consent Calendar items made by Lansing and seconded by Friedman. Motion adopted by voice vote, all in favor and none opposed.
5. **Agenda Item 8:** At the request of the Chair, Member Sheehy summarized the actions taken the previous evening with respect to this item.

Motion to ratify motions adopted by less than a quorum of ICOC on June 4 (to fund 500, 501, 505, 507, 511, 514, 518, 519, 520, 521, 522, 523, and 524) made by Wright and seconded by Roth. Motion carries unanimously 19-0 on roll call vote. Members voting Aye, with exception of applications as to which the member is recused: Azziz, Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Kessler, Lansing, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Sheehy and Steward; members voting aye without exception: Klein, Prieto, Roth and Wright.

Closed Session: The ICOC met in closed session for discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product and prepublication, confidential scientific research or data relating to Shared Research Laboratory Grant applications, as duly

noticed in the notice of meeting and agenda pursuant to Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C). Member Shestack joined the ICOC meeting during the closed session.

After the closed session, the ICOC resumed the meeting in open session, and further motions were entertained, as follows:

Renewed motion to ratify motions adopted by less than a quorum of ICOC on June 4 (to fund 500, 501, 505, 507, 511, 514, 518, 519, 520, 521, 522, 523, 524), made by Wright and seconded by Roth. Motion carried unanimously 19-0 on roll call vote. Members voting Aye, with exception of applications as to which the member is recused: Azziz, Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Kessler, Lansing, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Sheehy and Steward; members voting aye without exception: Klein, Prieto, Roth and Wright.

Motion to move application 508 to funding category made by Azziz and seconded by Pomeroy. Motion carried 14 Ayes, 2 Noes; 1 abstention on roll call vote. Ayes: Azziz, Friedman, Kessler, Klein, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Prieto, Roth, Shestack and Wright; Members voting No: Baltimore and Brenner; Members abstaining: Sheehy. Recused from discussion and voting: Duckles, Lansing and Steward.

Renewed motion to ratify motions adopted by less than a quorum of ICOC on June 4 (to fund 500, 501, 505, 507, 511, 514, 518, 519, 520, 521, 522, 523, 524) made by Prieto and seconded by Wright. Motion carried unanimously 20-0 on roll call vote. Members voting Aye with exception of applications as to which the member is recused: Azziz, Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Kessler, Lansing, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Sheehy and Steward; members voting aye with no recusals: Klein, Prieto, Roth, Shestack and Wright.

Motion to move application 506 to funding category by Wright and seconded by Pomeroy. Motion carried 12 Ayes, 2 Noes, 4 Abstentions, on roll call vote. Members voting Aye: Azziz, Kessler, Klein, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pomeroy, Prieto, Roth, Sheehy, Shestack and Wright. Members voting No: Brenner and Friedman. Members Abstaining: Baltimore, Duckles, Price and Steward. Recused from discussion and voting: Lansing and Pizzo.

Motion to move application 502 to funding category made by Roth and seconded by Pomeroy. Roth offered and Pomeroy accepted a friendly amendment to fund with the conditions recommended by the Scientific and Medical Research Funding Working Group (“1) hire 1-2 management people with proper SRL management experience to meet the demand; 2) require a management plan that assures access to multiple investigators and sets priorities, and 3) perform an annual review to confirm that the facility is serving the region with this shared resource.”). Motion carried as amended: 14 Ayes, 1 No, 2 Abstentions, on roll call vote. Members voting Aye: Azziz, Duckles, Kessler,

Klein, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Prieto, Roth, Shestack and Wright. Members voting No: Steward. Members abstaining: Friedman and Sheehy. Recused from discussion and voting: Baltimore, Brenner and Lansing.

Motion to move application 504 to funding category made by Prieto and seconded by Wright: Motion carried: 14 Ayes and 2 Abstentions, on roll call vote Members voting Aye: Azziz, Brenner, Duckles, Kessler, Klein, Levey, Penhoet, Pizzo, Price, Prieto, Roth, Sheehy, Shestack and Wright. Members abstaining: Baltimore and Steward. Recused from discussion and voting: Friedman, Markland, Lansing and Pomeroy.

Motion not to fund applications in Tier 2 made by Wright and seconded by Prieto. Friendly amendment by Wright and accepted by Prieto to state: Not to fund applications remaining in Tiers 2 and 3 (to wit: 503, 509, 510, 512 and 517): Motion carried: 19 Ayes, on roll call vote. Members voting Aye with exception of applications as to which the member is recused: Azziz, Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Kessler, Lansing, Markland, Levey, Pizzo, Sheehy and Steward. Members voting Aye without exception: Klein, Penhoet, Pomeroy, Price, Prieto, Roth and Wright.

Motion to fund the top six scored techniques courses (applications 501, 511, 518, 523 and 524) made by Wright and seconded by Roth: Motion passes unanimously, 20 Ayes, no abstentions, on roll call vote. Members voting Aye with exception of applications as to which the member is recused: Azziz, Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Kessler, Lansing, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Sheehy and Steward. Members voting Aye without exception: Klein, Prieto, Roth, Shestack and Wright.

Motion not to fund applications numbers 500, 504, and 517 made by Roth and seconded by Wright. Motion carries unanimously, 20 Ayes and no abstentions, on roll call vote. Members voting Aye with exception of applications as to which the member is recused: Azziz, Baltimore, Brenner, Duckles, Friedman, Kessler, Lansing, Levey, Markland, Penhoet, Pizzo, Pomeroy, Price, Sheehy and Steward. Members voting Aye without exception: Klein, Prieto, Roth, Shestack and Wright.

6. **Agenda Item 12.** Consideration of the Facilities Grants Administration Policy. CIRM staff Rick Keller presented the policy to the board and a discussion was held.

Motion to approve the Facilities Grants Administration Policy made by Wright and seconded by Roth. Motion carries unanimously by voice vote, all in favor none opposed.

7. **Agenda Item 19:** Consideration of concept proposal for an RFA for CIRM New Faculty Awards. Chief Scientific Officer Dr. Arlene Chiu described the proposal and the board discussed possible amendments to the RFA.

Motion: to approve concept plan for CIRM New Faculty RFA made by Sheehy, seconded by Lansing. Motion carried unanimously by voice vote, all in favor and none opposed.

Closed Session

8. **Agenda Item 20:** As duly noticed in the notice and agenda, the ICOC went into closed session for discussion of personnel pursuant to Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a), and Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D).

The meeting reconvened in open session without report, and then adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "T. Pachter". The signature is stylized with a large initial "T" and a cursive "Pachter".

Tamar Pachter
General Counsel