

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

BEFORE THE
INDEPENDENT CITIZENS' OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
AND THE APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE
TO THE
CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR REGENERATIVE MEDICINE
ORGANIZED PURSUANT TO THE
CALIFORNIA STEM CELL RESEARCH AND CURES ACT
REGULAR MEETING

LOCATION: SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT MARRIOTT
WATERFRONT, BAYSIDE ROOM II & III
1800 OLD BAYSHORE HIGHWAY
BURLINGAME, CA 94010

DATE: JANUARY 30, 2025
9 A.M.

REPORTER: BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR
CSR. NO. 7152

FILE NO.: 2025-2

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

ITEM DESCRIPTION	PAGE NO.
OPEN SESSION	
1. CALL TO ORDER	4
2. ROLL CALL	4
3. CHAIR'S REPORT	6
4. VICE-CHAIR'S REPORT	12
5. PRESIDENT'S REPORT	207
6. RESOLUTIONS	26
RESOLUTION HONORING MOHAMED ABOUSALEM	
RESOLUTION HONORING AL ROWLETT	
CONSENT CALENDAR	48
7. CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES FROM DECEMBER 12 ICOC MEETING	
8. CONSIDERATION OF APPOINTMENT OF MEMBERS TO THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP	
9. CONSIDERATION OF APPOINTMENT OF A MEMBER TO THE FACILITIES WORKING GROUP	
OPEN SESSION	
10. CONSIDERATION OF APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE TO CLINICAL PROGRAM ANNOUNCEMENTS (CLIN 1, 2, AND 4)	134
11. CONSIDERATION OF APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE TO TRANSLATIONAL PROGRAM ANNOUNCEMENTS (TRAN 1, 2, 3, AND 4)	86
12. CONSIDERATION OF APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE TO DISCOVERY PROGRAM ANNOUNCEMENTS (DISC4 REMIND)	50

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X (CONT'D.)

13. CONSIDERATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS FROM GOVERNANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REGARDING ICOC CHAIR, ICOC VICE-CHAIR, AND CIRM PRESIDENT/CEO REVIEW	199
CLOSED SESSION	206
14. DISCUSSION OF CONFIDENTIAL INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY OR WORK PRODUCT, PREPUBLICATION DATA, FINANCIAL INFORMATION, CONFIDENTIAL SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH OR DATA, AND OTHER PROPRIETARY INFORMATION RELATING TO APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE TO AGENDA ITEMS 10, 11, AND 12 (HEALTH & SAFETY CODE 125290.30(F) (3) (B) AND (C)).	
15. DISCUSSION OF PERSONNEL [EVALUATION OF ICOC CHAIR] (GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 11126, SUBDIVISION (A); HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 125290.30(F) (3) (D)).	
OPEN SESSION	
16. GENERAL COMMENTS ON THE ARS PROCESS	223
17. PUBLIC COMMENT	223
18. ADJOURNMENT	225

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JANUARY 30, 2025; 9 A.M.

CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN. I'D LIKE TO WELCOME THE MEMBERS OF THE BOARD AND THE PUBLIC TO THIS, THE 164TH MEETING. OF THE INDEPENDENT CITIZENS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE, AND THE 60TH MEETING OF THE APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE BOARD. I CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. AND WE WILL STAND AND I WILL LEAD THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE.

(THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE.)

CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK OUR DIRECTOR OF BOARD GOVERNANCE, SCOTT TOCHER, TO CALL THE ROLL.

MR. TOCHER: ABSOLUTELY. EYAD ALMASRI.

DR. ALMASRI: YES.

MR. TOCHER: KIM BARRETT.

DR. BARRETT: PRESENT.

MR. TOCHER: DAN BERNAL. GEORGE BLUMENTHAL.

DR. BLUMENTHAL: HERE.

MR. TOCHER: MARIA BONNEVILLE.

VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: PRESENT.

MR. TOCHER: JOHN CARETHERS.

DR. CARETHERS: PRESENT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.
2 DR. CHOU: PRESENT.
3 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.
4 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: PRESENT.
5 MR. TOCHER: DEBORAH DEAS.
6 DR. DEAS: HERE.
7 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.
8 DR. DULIEGE: HERE.
9 MR. TOCHER: YSABEL DURON.
10 MS. DURON: HERE.
11 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
12 DR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: HERE.
13 MR. TOCHER: ELENA FLOWERS.
14 DR. FLOWERS: PRESENT.
15 MR. TOCHER: JUDY GASSON. DAVID HIGGINS.
16 DR. HIGGINS: HERE.
17 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
18 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: PRESENT.
19 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
20 MR. LAJARA: PRESENT.
21 MR. TOCHER: PAT LEVITT.
22 DR. LEVITT: PRESENT.
23 MR. TOCHER: HALA MADANAT.
24 DR. MADANAT: PRESENT.
25 MR. TOCHER: LINDA MALKAS.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. MALKAS: HERE.
2 MR. TOCHER: SHLOMO MELMED. CAROLYN
3 MELTZER.
4 DR. MELTZER: PRESENT.
5 MR. TOCHER: CHRISTINE MIASKOWSKI.
6 DR. MIASKOWSKI: PRESENT.
7 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
8 DR. PADILLA: HERE.
9 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.
10 MR. PANETTA: HERE.
11 MR. TOCHER: JOYCE SACKY.
12 DR. SACKY: HERE.
13 MR. TOCHER: MARVIN SOUTHARD.
14 DR. SOUTHARD: PRESENT.
15 MR. TOCHER: SUZANNE SANDMEYER. KAROL
16 WATSON. YAEL WYTE.
17 DR. WYTE: HERE.
18 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.
19 DR. XU: HERE.
20 MR. TOCHER: KEITH YAMAMOTO.
21 DR. YAMAMOTO: HERE.
22 MR. TOCHER: GREAT. THANKS VERY MUCH.
23 MR. CHAIR, WE HAVE A QUORUM.
24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, SCOTT.
25 MEMBERS OF THE BOARD, WE HAVE A MANAGEABLY COMPACT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AGENDA FOR TODAY'S MEETING. AND I WANT TO
2 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THIS MEETING IS TAKING PLACE AT A
3 TIME OF ENORMOUS CHANGE AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL
4 AFFECTING OF HOW THIS NATION DEALS WITH ISSUES
5 RELATED TO THE HEALTH OF ITS CITIZENS.

6 THE VICE CHAIR IN HER REPORT WILL REFER TO
7 SOME OF THE CHANGES OR PAUSES THAT AFFECT SCIENTIFIC
8 FUNDING, RESEARCH, CLINICAL TRIALS, AND OTHER GRANTS
9 AND PROGRAMS. BUT I WANT TO START OFF FIRST WITH AN
10 INTRODUCTION OF A NEW BOARD MEMBER, YAEL WYTE.

11 YAEL IS CURRENTLY THE PROGRAM AND
12 EDUCATION MANAGER OF THE ALZHEIMER'S ASSOCIATION,
13 CALIFORNIA SOUTHLAND CHAPTER, BASED IN CULVER CITY,
14 CALIFORNIA. SHE'S BEEN IN THIS ROLE SINCE 2016,
15 DIRECTING A GREAT MANY PROGRAMS FOR FAMILIES,
16 PATIENTS, AND CAREGIVERS WITHIN THE ALZHEIMER'S
17 COMMUNITY AND IN THE WIDER COMMUNITY TO INCLUDE
18 LEARNING PROGRAMS FOR FIRST RESPONDERS.

19 I WOULD LIKE TO ASK YAEL, WHO WAS SWORN IN
20 THIS VERY MORNING, TO INTRODUCE HERSELF TO THE
21 BOARD. YAEL.

22 MS. WYTE: THANK YOU. MORNING, EVERYBODY.
23 I'M THRILLED TO BE HERE AND LOOKING FORWARD TO
24 LEARNING, ABSORBING, AND PARTICIPATING. THAT WAS A
25 GREAT SUMMARY. I'M FROM L.A., BEEN PRETTY MUCH

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WORKING WITH ALZHEIMER'S AND DEMENTIA FOR ABOUT 20
2 PLUS YEARS. MY FAVORITE THING TO DO IS LEAD SUPPORT
3 GROUPS, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO LEARNING MORE. THANK
4 YOU.

5 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, YAEL.

6 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: WELCOME.

7 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: WELCOME.

8 I'D LIKE TO REPORT ON SOME RECENT
9 ACTIVITIES. EARLIER THIS MONTH I JOINED THE VICE
10 CHAIR, OUR PRESIDENT, AND OTHER CIRM LEADERS AT THE
11 ANNUAL NUCLEUS FORUM HELD IN MENLO PARK. THE FORUM
12 BRINGS TOGETHER ABOUT 80 LEADERS IN BIOTECHNOLOGY,
13 MANY OF WHOM HAD BEEN ATTENDING THE FORUM FOR YEARS.
14 INVITEES INCLUDED THE FOUNDER AND THE PRESENT,
15 FUTURE, AND SEVERAL PAST PRESIDENTS OF ISSCR, WHO
16 SPONSORED THE GATHERING, AND INCLUDED LEADING
17 ACADEMIC, RESEARCHERS, AND REPRESENTATIVES OF
18 SEVERAL START-UP COMPANIES, SEVERAL OF WHOM HAVE
19 RECEIVED GRANTS FROM CIRM. ALSO IN ATTENDANCE WERE
20 REPRESENTATIVES OF RELEVANT PHARMA COMPANIES AND
21 INVESTORS IN BIOTECHNOLOGY VENTURES.

22 THE PROGRAM ALLOWED THESE FOUR GROUPS OF
23 PEOPLE TO INTERFACE AND BUILD COMMUNITY AND PERSONAL
24 RELATIONSHIPS. IT STARTED WITH A RECEPTION AND
25 KEYNOTE ADDRESS BY THE FORMER PRESIDENT OF STANFORD

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 UNIVERSITY, WHICH WAS ENTERTAININGLY MODERATED BY
2 THE DEAN OF HARVARD MEDICAL SCHOOL, DR. GEORGE
3 DALEY. THE THEME OF THE KEYNOTE WAS THE ROLE OF AI
4 IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF NEW THERAPIES.

5 THE NEXT DAY THERE WERE THREE PANELS, THE
6 FIRST OF WHICH WAS CHAIRED BY ANDREW PLUMP OF TAKEDA
7 PHARMACEUTICAL. IT FEATURED DEVELOPERS AND EXPERTS
8 FROM BIG PHARMA WHO DISCUSSED THE CHALLENGES OF
9 BRINGING CELL AND GENE THERAPIES TO MARKET. THE
10 EMPHASIS, AS EXPRESSED BY MELISSA THOMAS OF ELI
11 LILLY, AND OTHERS, WAS ON THE NEED FOR THESE TO BE
12 TRANSFORMATIONAL AND NOT MERELY INCREMENTAL TO BE
13 VIABLE COMMERCIALY. THE OTHER PANELISTS WERE
14 CATHERINE PRIEST OF NEURONA THERAPEUTICS; JAY
15 BRADNER OF AMGEN; AND JULIANNE BRUNO OF CRISPR
16 THERAPEUTICS.

17 OVERALL THERE WAS A SENSE OF OPTIMISM FOR
18 THE FUTURE. THE SICKLE CELL DRUG CASGEVY BY VERTEX
19 THAT USES CRISPR WAS REFERRED TO AS A NOTABLE STEP
20 FORWARD. CHALLENGES FACING THE FIELD INCLUDE DRUG
21 DELIVERY, SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES, AND SCALE.

22 NEXT ON THE AGENDA WAS A SERIES OF
23 SCIENTIFIC TALKS ORGANIZED BY PAST ISSCR PRESIDENT,
24 AMANDER CLARK. THEY SPOTLIT HIGHLIGHTS OF RECENT OR
25 ONGOING RESEARCH RANGING FROM BASIC DISCOVERY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THROUGH CLINICAL TRIALS. WE HEARD FROM RYAN FLYNN,
2 A YOUNG M.D. PH.D. AT HARVARD, WHO IS EXPLORING AND
3 DEFINING CELL SURFACE RNA BIOLOGY. STANFORD'S
4 MICHELLE MONJE GAVE AN OVERVIEW ON THE NEUROSCIENCE
5 OF CANCER AND ITS IMPLICATIONS FOR THE THERAPY OF
6 GLIOMAS. BENJAMIN REUBENOFF REPORTED ON WORK AT
7 HADASSAH HOSPITAL ON PLURIPOTENT STEM CELLS FROM
8 BASIC RESEARCH TO OPHTHALMIC CLINICAL APPLICATION
9 FOR AGE-RELATED MACULAR DEGENERATION. AND FINALLY,
10 LORENZ STUDER REPORTED ON THE COMPLETION OF THE
11 BLUEROCK/BAYER PHASE 1-2 PARKINSON'S THERAPY PROGRAM
12 AND THE NEXT GENERATION CELL THERAPY AND DRUG
13 DISCOVERY PLATFORMS FOR PARKINSON'S DISEASE.

14 THE LAST PANEL TITLED "FINANCING COMPANIES
15 TODAY" WAS FOCUSED ON FINANCING COMPANIES IN OUR
16 CONTEMPORARY, INCREASINGLY CHALLENGING WORLD. THE
17 PANEL WAS CHAIRED BY VENTURE CAPITALIST AND C-SUITE
18 HABITUE, KNOWN FOR HER 30 PLUS OF BRINGING VALUE TO
19 SHAREHOLDERS, MS. SUSAN SIEGEL. OTHER PARTICIPANTS
20 INCLUDED VIKRAM BAJAJ OF FORESITE CAPITAL; RAJIV
21 KAUL, A DIRECTOR OF FIDELITY'S SELECT BIOTECHNOLOGY
22 FUND; VINEETA AGARWALA OF ANDREESSEN HOROWITZ, WHICH
23 IS A VENTURE CAPITAL FIRM SPECIALIZING IN AI, BIO
24 AND HEALTH, ISSUES AMONG OTHER TECHNOLOGIES; AND
25 KATIE ELLIAS, AN INVESTIGATOR IN LIFE DESIGNS AND

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MEDICAL DEVICES RECENTLY RECRUITED TO SAB'S
2 BIOTHERAPEUTICS BOARD.

3 THE MAIN TAKEAWAY WAS THAT VENTURE CAPITAL
4 CONTINUES TO SUPPORT PHASE 2 AND PHASE 3 LATER
5 CLINICAL TRIALS, BUT THEY ARE VERY MUCH LESS
6 INVOLVED IN EARLIER STAGE CLINICAL OR OTHER CLASSES
7 OF EARLY RESEARCH.

8 THE AUDIENCE WAS ENCOURAGED TO HAVE
9 REGULAR AND OPEN CONVERSATIONS WITH THE FINANCING
10 COMMUNITY AND TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON MANUFACTURING
11 AND THE COST OF GOODS.

12 THE SESSIONS WERE SIGNIFICANT, THE
13 INTERFACE WAS IMPORTANT. IT ALLOWED OUR CIRM
14 REPRESENTATIVES TO NETWORK, CATCH UP, AND BUILD
15 COMMUNITY WITH EXPERTS AND AWARDEES IN PHARMA, CELL
16 AND GENE THERAPY, AND WITH THE INVESTORS.

17 LET ME END WITH AN UPDATE ON THE
18 SUSTAINABILITY OF CIRM PROJECT. SINCE THE LAST
19 BOARD MEETING IN DECEMBER, I HAVE HAD INTRODUCTORY
20 DISCUSSIONS WITH A NUMBER OF INDIVIDUALS, MOST OF
21 THEM OUTSIDE OF CIRM, WHO HAVE INSIGHT AND/OR
22 FIRSTHAND EXPERIENCE IN ISSUES THAT ANY OF US
23 CONCERNED ABOUT CIRM'S LONG-TERM VIABILITY NEED TO
24 BE AWARE OF.

25 THESE INDIVIDUALS INCLUDE A FORMER

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 GOVERNOR OF CALIFORNIA, THE FOUNDING FATHER OF CIRM
2 AND THE PRINCIPAL AUTHOR OF PROPOSITIONS 71 AND 14,
3 THE CAMPAIGN AND LEGAL ADVISOR FOR THOSE SAME
4 PROPOSITIONS, A FORMER BOARD CHAIR, AND A FORMER
5 PRESIDENT AND CEO OF CIRM.

6 WE DISCUSSED THE THINKING UNDERLYING EACH
7 OF THE HALF DOZEN DIFFERENT POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS FOR A
8 LONG-TERM SOLUTION TO CIRM'S VIABILITY. FOR
9 REFERENCE PURPOSES, AND IN GENERAL TERMS, THESE
10 INCLUDE THE ROLES OF PHILANTHROPY, OF INVESTMENT, OF
11 PUBLIC/PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP, THE FOUNDATION MODEL,
12 THE ROLE OF THE STATE LEGISLATURE, AND THE BALLOT
13 INITIATIVE PROCESS.

14 I SHOULD HAVE A ROADMAP FOR HOW TO DEVELOP
15 A SUSTAINABILITY PLAN READY FOR COMMENT BY THE MARCH
16 MEETING. NOTICE I SAID A ROADMAP FOR HOW TO
17 DEVELOP, NOT A ROADMAP FOR SUSTAINABILITY BY MARCH
18 IF THE AGENDA OF THAT MEETING IS NOT STRETCHED TOO
19 LONG BY WHAT WILL BE OUR FIRST HEARING OF NEW OR
20 AMENDED CONCEPT PLANS PURSUANT TO OUR EVOLVING
21 STRATEGIC ALLOCATION FRAMEWORK. THANK YOU FOR THAT.

22 THAT'S THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I'M NOW GOING
23 TO CEDE THE MICROPHONE TO OUR VICE CHAIR MARIA
24 BONNEVILLE FOR HERS.

25 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: GOOD MORNING. I

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 HAVE A FEW UPDATES FOR YOU TODAY. I'LL START WITH
2 GOVERNMENT RELATIONS. AND I DON'T WANT TO OVERSTATE
3 THAT I KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON IN DC BECAUSE I'M NOT
4 SURE ANY OF US DO, BUT I CAN GIVE YOU JUST A
5 HEADS-UP ON WHAT WE'VE BEEN HEARING.

6 AND AS YOU CAN IMAGINE, I AND THE TEAM
7 HAVE SPENT THE BETTER PART OF THE WEEK TRYING TO
8 UNDERSTAND EXACTLY WHAT THE FLURRY OF EXECUTIVE
9 ORDERS AND MEMOS ENCOMPASS. I'VE BEEN IN CONTACT
10 WITH COLLEAGUES AT NIH, FDA, THE UC SYSTEM, OUR
11 POLICY CONSULTANTS IN DC, AND THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE.

12 THERE'S A LOT OF CONFUSION AROUND THE MEMO
13 THAT WAS RELEASED BY THE WHITE HOUSE ON MONDAY
14 EVENING, THAT WAS THEN RESCINDED WEDNESDAY MORNING.
15 COMMUNICATIONS FREEZE IS STILL ON, AND THE EXECUTIVE
16 ORDER AROUND DEI IS STILL IN EFFECT.

17 SOME KEY ISSUES WE'VE ASKED THEM TO
18 MONITOR ONGOING FOR US IN THIS UNCERTAIN TIME:
19 FUNDING CUTS AND RESTRUCTURING OF THE AGENCIES
20 INCLUDING CDC, FDA, NIH, CHANGES IN THE IRA
21 IMPLEMENTATION, CHANGES TO SUBSIDIES AND MEDICAID
22 INCLUDING MY PILOT PROGRAM FOR SICKLE CELL DISEASE,
23 RARE DISEASE HUB, PEDIATRIC PRIORITY REVIEW VOUCHER
24 BECAUSE IT WAS LEFT OUT OF THE CONTINUING
25 RESOLUTION, STEM CELL TOURISM IN GENERAL, AND

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHANGES IN REGULATION ASSOCIATED WITH LABORATORY
2 DEVELOPED TESTS, WHICH COULD AFFECT NEWBORN
3 SCREENING AND OTHER PROGRAMS.

4 SO AS YOU KNOW, CIRM WAS BORN OUT OF
5 RESTRICTIONS IMPOSED BY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ON
6 STEM CELL RESEARCH AND IS NOW FORTUNATE TO BE IN A
7 POSITION WHERE WE CAN CONTINUE TO SUPPORT THE FIELD
8 IN THESE TIMES OF UNCERTAINTY. I THINK WE'RE ALL
9 BRACING FOR THE WORST AS THE SITUATION CONTINUES TO
10 UNFOLD. CIRM WILL REMAIN FLEXIBLE AND ADAPTABLE SO
11 THAT WE CAN HELP OUR COLLEAGUES AND REMAIN A
12 DEDICATED SOURCE OF FUNDING. WE DON'T KNOW QUITE
13 YET HOW THIS WILL AFFECT OUR PROGRAMS, AND THE TEAMS
14 ARE PREPARED TO TAKE ALL OF THIS INTO ACCOUNT AS
15 THEY DEVELOP THE NEW CONCEPT PLANS AND BRING THEM TO
16 THE VARIOUS SUBCOMMITTEES AND BOARD.

17 WE'LL FIND CREATIVE SOLUTIONS WHILE
18 REMAINING TRUE TO OUR CORE VALUES AS AN
19 ORGANIZATION.

20 SO I KNOW A LOT OF BOARD MEMBERS PROBABLY
21 HAVE COMMENTS ON WHAT'S GOING ON IN DC. SO I JUST
22 WANT TO ALLOW MY COLLEAGUES TO MAKE ANY COMMENTS
23 THAT THEY WISH TO MAKE ON THAT TOPIC. I HAVE OTHER
24 THINGS TO REPORT IN ON THAT ARE HAPPIER. SO I'LL
25 OPEN IT UP NOW IF ANYONE WANTS TO COMMENT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. LEVITT: WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TIME.

2 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I REALIZE. HOW
3 ABOUT LIMITED COMMENTS? PAT.

4 DR. LEVITT: YEAH, I MEAN -- YOU KNOW THE
5 REALITY IS THAT THERE'S -- UNPREDICTABILITY IS A
6 GREATER STRESSOR THAN DIRECT NEGLECT OR ABUSE,
7 BELIEVE IT OR NOT, UNPREDICTABILITY. AND THAT'S THE
8 STATE THAT WE'RE LIVING IN. AND FROM A RESEARCHER
9 PERSPECTIVE, AND I'VE HAD ONE OF MY NEW GRANTS
10 FROZEN. AND AT CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL LOS ANGELES, WE
11 HAVE LIKE OVER A HUNDRED GRANT APPLICATIONS THAT
12 WERE SUBMITTED IN THE FALL THAT ARE JUST SITTING
13 THERE. SO IT'S A REALLY TRYING TIME.

14 AND BECAUSE THERE'S CHANGES THAT OCCUR
15 ALMOST ON THE HOUR IN TERMS OF INTERPRETING WHAT ARE
16 PURPOSELY WRITTEN, VERY, VERY BROAD DIRECTIVES THAT
17 THEY CAN INTERPRET ANY WAY THAT THEY WANT. SO I
18 THINK WE'RE IN A REALLY CHALLENGING STATE.

19 I THINK CIRM BEING AWARE OF THIS AND
20 UNDERSTANDING THAT THERE'S LIKELY TO BE MORE AND
21 MORE ATTENTION PAID BY THE RESEARCH COMMUNITY, THE
22 BIOMEDICAL RESEARCH COMMUNITY, UNDERSTANDING WHAT
23 CIRM IS GOING TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT, I THINK, IS
24 REALLY IMPORTANT FOR US TO HAVE A LITTLE BIT OF
25 FORESIGHT. KIND OF LIKE COMING UP WITH WHAT WE DO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WHEN WE HAVE TO HAVE A PRESS STATEMENT OR SOMETHING.
2 WE SHOULD HAVE TO THINK ABOUT THAT AND NOT
3 NECESSARILY WAIT UNTIL THE TIDAL WAVE HITS. SO
4 THAT'S WHERE WE ARE.

5 AND FOR THOSE OF US WHO ARE EXPERIENCING
6 THIS DIRECTLY, AND WE HAVE A DEAN OF THE SCHOOL OF
7 MEDICINE WHO HAS HUNDREDS OF FACULTY THAT ARE
8 DEALING WITH THIS. SO IT'S NOT GREAT.

9 DR. MELTZER: THANKS, PAT. YEAH. I KNOW
10 WE'RE ALL REALLY CONCERNED, ESPECIALLY ABOUT THE
11 IMPACT ON AND THE NECESSITY TO CONTINUE TO DIVERSIFY
12 CLINICAL TRIALS, TO IMPROVE ACCESS OF CARE, THINGS
13 THAT ARE SO FUNDAMENTAL TO CIRM, AND HOW THAT IS
14 GOING TO BE INFLUENCED ON THE FEDERAL LEVEL IN TERMS
15 OF FUNDING. SO LOTS MORE TO FIGURE OUT, BUT IT IS
16 QUITE CONCERNING.

17 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: JOHN.

18 DR. CARETHERS: I WILL ADD THE CONFUSION
19 IS PRETTY WIDESPREAD, NOT ONLY AMONGST OUR FACULTY
20 AND THE RESEARCHERS; BUT AS PAT MENTIONED, THE
21 DEFINITIONS ARE CRAZY. I'M AT SAN DIEGO AND EVEN
22 DONORS HAVE CALLED AND SAID, "SHOULD I DONATE?
23 WHAT'S GOING ON? IS THE RESEARCH GOING TO BE ABLE
24 TO CONTINUE?" SO I THINK IT EXTENDS BEYOND JUST THE
25 RESEARCHERS AND THE ADMINISTRATORS.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WE HAVE HAD FOUR CONTRACTS SPECIFICALLY
2 TARGETED LARGELY BECAUSE THEY SUPPORTED GENDER
3 EQUITY. AND SO THOSE ARE CEASE AND DESIST ORDERS
4 THAT WE HAVE TO CARRY OUT. THERE'S ALSO, WE HAVE A
5 NUMBER OF FACULTY WHO WORK BETWEEN THE UNIVERSITY
6 AND THE VETERANS ADMINISTRATION HOSPITAL. AND THEY
7 ALL GOT THAT MASS EMAIL OFFER TO RESIGN BY
8 SEPTEMBER. AND I'M TELLING MY FACULTY DON'T PUSH
9 THE BUTTON BECAUSE SALARY, BUT I BET YOU SOME OF THE
10 STAFF AND SOME ERRANT PEOPLE WILL DO THAT. SO IT'S
11 JUST CHAOS.

12 DR. DEAS: YES. I THINK I WAS NEXT.
13 THANK YOU. YES. I DO BELIEVE THAT AS CIRM WE NEED
14 TO BEGIN TO THINK ABOUT OUR FUNDING, HOW WE'RE GOING
15 TO SUPPORT, ET CETERA. AT THE SAME TIME I WOULD
16 CAUTION THAT WE MUST BE INTENTIONAL, STRATEGIC, AND
17 NOT ENGAGE IN ANTICIPATORY OBEDIENCE AND BEGIN TO
18 UNWIND THINGS IN ANTICIPATION.

19 WE'VE SEEN IN THE LAST FEW DAYS A FLURRY,
20 A PULL-BACK, AND WE SHOULD BE INTENTIONAL, PAUSE,
21 AND THINK THROUGH IT, AND NOT BEGIN TO UNWIND
22 THINGS.

23 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I COMPLETELY
24 AGREE. KIM.

25 DR. BARRETT: AND JUST TO ADD, I

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 COMPLETELY ENDORSE WHAT PAT SAID, THAT UNCERTAINTY
2 IS FAR MORE DAMAGING THAN JUST BEING TOLD THAT
3 EVERYTHING IS STOPPING. AND WE ARE TRYING TO GET A
4 SENSE OF OUR OVERARCHING LIABILITY AS THE FEDERAL
5 GOVERNMENT TRIES TO PULL THINGS BACK. THE MEMO THAT
6 WAS RESCINDED SUGGESTED THAT THERE MIGHT EVEN BE
7 EFFORTS TO RECOUP MONIES THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN
8 AWARDED, WHICH OBVIOUSLY WOULD BE HUGELY DAMAGING
9 BECAUSE WE RELY ON THOSE FOR FACULTY AND STAFF AND
10 TRAINEE SALARIES.

11 AND I AM PARTICULARLY CONCERNED ABOUT THE
12 IMPACT ON EARLY CAREER INVESTIGATORS WHO ARE THE
13 FUTURE OF STEM CELL RESEARCH AND EVERY OTHER TYPE OF
14 BIOMEDICAL RESEARCH. AND I THINK WE HAVE TO MONITOR
15 THAT VERY CAREFULLY. INEVITABLY WE WERE ALREADY
16 RECEIVING A FLOOD OF APPLICATIONS. THE FLOOD WILL
17 NOW BECOME -- WHAT'S WORSE THAN A FLOOD? -- DELUGE.

18 DR. MALKAS: A WILDFIRE. TRUST ME. BEEN
19 THERE.

20 MR. TOCHER: YSABEL.

21 MS. DURON: OKAY. THANK YOU. AS THE
22 PATIENT ADVOCATE HERE, AS A LATINA, AS A MEMBER OF A
23 COMMUNITY THAT'S UNDER ATTACK ON MULTIPLE SIDES,
24 EVEN THOUGH IT DOESN'T PERSONALLY AFFECT ME, AND AS
25 SOMEONE WHO SAT HERE AND LUCKILY HAD COMPANIONS WHO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AGREE THAT WE NEEDED A DEI POLICY, I THINK
2 THAT -- AND AS SOMEONE WHO'S A COMMUNICATOR BY
3 TRAINING, I THINK, TO YOUR POINTS, WE NEED TO GET
4 OUR MESSAGES TOGETHER.

5 WE NEED TO ALSO SEND MESSAGES TO OUR
6 COMMUNITIES, TO THE PUBLIC, OUR TAXPAYERS WHO MAKE
7 THIS POSSIBLE, WHAT WE WANT TO DO, HOW WE'RE GOING
8 TO DO IT. THEY NEED TO BE CLEAR THAT WE'RE STILL
9 HERE TO SUPPORT THE SCIENCE, BUT ALSO TO SUPPORT OUR
10 COMMUNITIES TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY CONTINUE TO BE
11 INCLUDED IN ALL OF THESE ADVANCES AND THE THINGS
12 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO GET DONE.

13 I JUST THINK IT NEEDS TO -- WE NEED TO
14 MAKE SURE THAT WE SEND A MESSAGE THAT WE'RE NOT
15 ABANDONING PEOPLE BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT WE'RE ALL
16 ABOUT IS PEOPLE. AND AS LONG AS I'VE BEEN AROUND,
17 THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST HORRIFIC TIMES THAT I HAVE
18 EVER EXPERIENCED. AND I KNOW, HAVING SPOKEN TO A
19 LOT OF MY COLLEAGUES, I'M SURE YOU ALL ARE TOO.

20 AND WELCOME TO OUR PUBLIC AND OUR PARENTS.
21 WE EMBRACE YOU AND WE CARE ABOUT YOU AND WE CARE
22 ABOUT THE ISSUES FOR YOUR FAMILIES, YOUR CHILDREN.

23 WE JUST HAVE TO SORT OF STAY VIGILANT AND
24 STAY ON TOP. WE SHOULD NOT LEAD FROM BEHIND, I
25 BELIEVE. I THINK IT'S NOT ABOUT MAKING TROUBLE, BUT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IT IS ABOUT STANDING FOR SOMETHING AND NOT BEING
2 COWED BY FEAR OR OPPRESSION BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S
3 WHAT'S WANTED CURRENTLY.

4 AND SO I'M JUST -- I'M JUST KIND OF
5 ALLOWING MY EMOTIONS TO COME OUT HERE, BUT I
6 DO KNOW, HAVING MET WITH J.T. AND MARIA AND OUR
7 COMMUNICATIONS TEAM, WE DEFINITELY NEED TO TAKE SOME
8 STANDS. AND I INVITE YOU, IN FACT, I INSIST WITH
9 ALL OF OUR RESEARCH LEADERSHIP COMMUNITY THAT AS WE
10 TRY TO GET MESSAGES OUT THERE, YOU PARTICIPATE WITH
11 US IN WRITING SOME OF THOSE TWO-, THREE-PARAGRAPH
12 RESPONSES FOR OUR NEWSLETTERS, FOR OUR WEBSITE, FOR
13 OUR SOCIAL MEDIA JUST SO WE CAN DISPERSE WHAT WE'RE
14 DOING, HOW WE'RE DOING IT, HOW WE INTEND TO KEEP
15 DOING IT TO AS MANY PEOPLE AS WE CAN COMMUNICATE
16 WITH. BUT THEY NEED TO HEAR IT FROM YOU, THE
17 EXPERTS. THEY NEED TO HEAR FROM YOU, THE
18 SCIENTISTS, THAT WE ARE NOT ABANDONING SCIENCE AND
19 WE'RE NOT ABANDONING OUR PUBLIC, AND WE'RE NOT
20 ABANDONING OUR PATIENTS. THANK YOU.

21 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: THANK YOU, YSABEL.

22 COUPLE OF OTHER UPDATES. I'LL START WITH
23 THIS ONE. IT SEEMS VERY SWEET GIVEN THE EVENTS OF
24 THE PAST WEEK. BUT IN EARLY JANUARY OUR FORMER
25 CONTACT AT THE WHITE HOUSE REACHED OUT AND ASKED

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CIRM TO ATTEND THE BIDEN ADMINISTRATION'S FINAL
2 EVENT FOCUSED ON CELL AND GENE THERAPY. AND ROSA
3 WENT TO REPRESENT CIRM.

4 THE FOCUS OF THE FORUM WAS EQUITABLE
5 ACCESS TO CELL AND GENE THERAPIES, INCREASING
6 CAPITAL FLOW FOR RARE DISEASES, AND DRIVING
7 INNOVATION IN MANUFACTURING AND DEVELOPMENT. THAT
8 JUST GOES TO SHOW HOW MUCH HAS CHANGED IN THOSE
9 SHORT TWO WEEKS.

10 SO THANK YOU, ROSA, FOR GOING AND MAKING
11 CONTACTS AND KEEPING THE SPIRIT ALIVE AND CIRM
12 RELEVANT AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL. SO THANK YOU.

13 I'M GOING TO REPORT OUT ON ACCESS AND
14 AFFORDABILITY WORKING GROUP ACTIVITIES. I'VE BEEN
15 WORKING WITH ROSA, GEOFF, AND EMILY ON AGENDA TOPICS
16 THAT WILL GO TO THE AAWG OVER THE COURSE OF THE NEXT
17 FEW MONTHS. AND TOP OF THE LIST IS GOAL NO. 5 OF
18 OUR STRATEGIC ALLOCATION FRAMEWORK, WHICH IS TO
19 ENSURE THAT EVERY BLA-READY PROGRAM HAS A STRATEGY
20 FOR ACCESS AND AFFORDABILITY. AND THAT INCLUDES
21 CLINICAL TRIAL DESIGN STRATEGIES THAT ADDRESS
22 INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO REIMBURSEMENT, VALUE
23 ASSESSMENTS TO GENERATE EVIDENCE NEEDED TO SUPPORT
24 THE REIMBURSEMENT OF APPROVED PRODUCTS BY PAYERS,
25 AND RESOURCES TO SUPPORT PROGRAMS WITH LIMITED

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 EXPERIENCE WITH ACCESS PLANNING, AND TO ENABLE THEM
2 TO EVALUATE OPTIONS IN THE AREA SUCH AS
3 MANUFACTURING SO THAT THEY ARE MAKING OPTIMAL
4 DECISIONS THAT CAN GET TO MASS PRODUCTION TO DRIVE
5 DOWN COST.

6 THAT'S A LOT. SO THE AAWG WILL BE
7 FOCUSING ON THAT FOR THE NEXT SEVERAL MONTHS WITH
8 MEETINGS PLANNED OUT THROUGH JUNE.

9 LASTLY, IN DECEMBER I WENT -- I ALONG WITH
10 MEMBERS OF TEAM ATTENDED A SMALL CONFERENCE IN SAN
11 DIEGO TO STRATEGIZE AROUND PATIENT ACCESS FOR CELL
12 AND GENE THERAPIES. AND IT WAS EXPERTS IN ADVANCED
13 THERAPIES WERE THERE TO DISCUSS NEW INNOVATIONS FOR
14 EXPANDED AND EQUITABLE ACCESS, ESPECIALLY IN THE
15 AREAS OF COST SAVINGS AND REIMBURSEMENT. AND THEN
16 OTHER AREAS THAT SHAPE COSTS AND PATIENT ACCESS IN
17 CELL THERAPIES, INCLUDING MANUFACTURING AND
18 INFRASTRUCTURE, GREATER UTILIZATION OF COMMUNITY
19 HOSPITALS AND CLINIC, CLINICAL DEVELOPMENT, AND
20 OPERATIONS.

21 WE HELPED SHAPE THAT AGENDA AND TO ENSURE
22 THAT THE RIGHT MIX OF PARTICIPANTS ATTENDED THE
23 MEETING. THE GROUP DISCUSSED POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS FOR
24 A WIDE VARIETY OF HEALTH CHALLENGES FOR MORE COMMON
25 CONDITIONS SUCH AS BLOOD CANCERS TO AUTOIMMUNE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DISEASE AND RARE INHERITED DISORDERS. SPECIFIC
2 IDEAS THAT COULD BENEFIT THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA
3 INCLUDED NEW WAYS TO UTILIZE THE NETWORK OF
4 CIRM-FUNDED ALPHA CLINICS, DRAWING ON CIRM'S
5 SCIENTIFIC PROMINENCE TO ATTRACT NEW PARTNERS FOR
6 LATE STAGE CLINICAL TRIALS, AND BUILDING ON CIRM'S
7 REAL-WORLD KNOWLEDGE TO CREATE RELIABLE, REPEATABLE
8 CONTRACTING FOR CELL AND GENE THERAPIES. THE
9 CONFERENCE REPORT IS FORTHCOMING, AND I'LL SHARE
10 THAT WITH THE BOARD ONCE IT'S READY.

11 THAT CONCLUDES MY REMARKS.

12 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARIA.
13 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NO. 6 NEXT, WHICH
14 IS A HAPPY PART OF THE AGENDA WHERE WE PUBLICLY AND
15 FORMALLY ACKNOWLEDGE AND THANK MEMBERS OF THIS BOARD
16 WHO HAVE LEFT THIS BOARD FOR THEIR SERVICE. AND WE
17 HAVE TWO SUCH PEOPLE TODAY.

18 BUT BEFORE I GET TO THE RESOLUTIONS, I'M
19 SORRY. THERE WAS AN OVERSIGHT AND I TAKE FULL
20 RESPONSIBILITY OF THIS. THERE WAS A SWEARING IN OF
21 ANOTHER BOARD MEMBER SINCE OUR LAST MEETING, AND I
22 WOULD LIKE TO FORMALLY INTRODUCE HIM TO THIS BOARD,
23 SEATED AT THE FRONT TABLE, DR. JOHN CARETHERS.

24 JOHN IS THE VICE CHANCELLOR FOR HEALTH
25 SCIENCES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA AT SAN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DIEGO SINCE JANUARY OF 2023. IN THIS POSITION HE
2 OVERSEES UC SAN DIEGO'S HEALTHCARE SYSTEM, ITS
3 SCHOOL OF MEDICINE, SCHOOL OF PHARMACY, AND SCHOOL
4 OF PUBLIC HEALTH.

5 HE'S A TRAINED GASTROENTEROLOGIST WITH A
6 LONG HISTORY OF INTEREST IN AND RESEARCH IN
7 HEREDITARY COLON CANCER GENETICS AND COLON CANCER
8 HEALTH DISPARITIES. HE HAS EDITED JOURNALS LIKE THE
9 *GASTROENTEROLOGY JOURNAL* OF HIS SPECIALTY, AND HE'S
10 BEEN CONTINUOUS -- I WONDER IF WE CAN CONTINUE TO
11 SAY THIS NEXT THING GOING INTO THE FUTURE --
12 CONTINUOUSLY FUNDED BY THE NIH.

13 JOHN, WOULD YOU LIKE THE OPPORTUNITY TO
14 ADDRESS THE BOARD?

15 DR. CARETHERS: THANK YOU FOR THE
16 INTRODUCTION, AND IT'S GREAT TO BE HERE. AND I WANT
17 TO SERVE CIRM AND WILLING TO LEARN FROM ALL OF YOU
18 ON THIS BOARD.

19 I DO HOPE TO SAY ALL OF US CAN CONTINUE TO
20 BE FUNDED BY NIH IN THE FUTURE. AND I'M STILL
21 HOPEFUL DESPITE ALL THE RECENT CHAOS AND DISRUPTIONS
22 BECAUSE WE NEED TO DO, AS DR. BARRETT MENTIONED, FOR
23 OUR YOUNGER GENERATION. THEY ARE OUR FUTURE, THEY
24 ARE THE ONES WHO'S GOING TO KEEP ADVANCING THE
25 KNOWLEDGE FOR CURES, AND SERVE US, AND TAKE CARE OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ALL OF US AS WELL.

2 SO IT'S A PLEASURE TO BE HERE, AND THANK
3 YOU, VITO, FOR THAT WONDERFUL INTRODUCTION.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: WELCOME, JOHN.

5 SO GOING BACK TO AGENDA ITEM NO. 6, OUR
6 RESOLUTIONS. THE FIRST FORMER BOARD MEMBER I WOULD
7 LIKE TO HONOR WITH A RESOLUTION IS MOHAMED ABOUSALEM
8 WHO'S SITTING IN THE FIRST ROW IN THE BACK. YOU
9 WILL ALL REMEMBER.

10 LET ME SAY A FEW THINGS ABOUT MOHAMED
11 MYSELF BEFORE I OPEN IT TO THE FLOOR.

12 MOHAMED WAS NOMINATED TO THE CIRM BOARD BY
13 GOVERNOR NEWSOM. HE JOINED THE ICOC IN MARCH OF
14 2022. HE WAS TRAINED AS A CIVIL ENGINEER AND HAS
15 SPECIALIZED TRAINING IN SURVEYING ENGINEERING AND AT
16 THE DOCTORAL LEVEL IN GEOMATICS ENGINEERING. IF
17 YOU'RE CURIOUS ABOUT THAT, JUST ASK ME.

18 HE HELD C-SUITE POSITIONS IN INDUSTRY
19 WHERE, AMONG OTHER ACCOMPLISHMENTS, HE ESTABLISHED A
20 CORPORATE PATENT COMMITTEE. HE MIGRATED OVER TO THE
21 ACADEMY, HOLDING SUCH POSITIONS AS ASSISTANT VICE
22 CHANCELLOR FOR RESEARCH WHERE HE ESTABLISHED THE
23 BIOTECH WET-LAB INCUBATOR FOR UC SANTA CRUZ
24 START-UPS AND OTHER ACCELERATOR INITIATIVES FOR UC
25 ENTREPRENEURS IN SILICON VALLEY.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 HE BECAME THE INAUGURAL VICE PRESIDENT FOR
2 RESEARCH AND INNOVATION AT SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY
3 FROM 2019 TO 2014 WHERE HE SUPPORTED FUNDING FOR
4 MULTIDISCIPLINARY RESEARCH AND CREATED FELLOWSHIPS
5 FOR BOTH STUDENTS AND FACULTY. HIS VISIONARY
6 LEADERSHIP LED TO THE CREATION OF THE SJSU SILICON
7 VALLEY SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT CENTER.

8 MOHAMED AND I OVERLAPPED FOR ONLY ONE
9 YEAR, BUT THAT WAS SUFFICIENT TIME TO APPRECIATE THE
10 TALENT AND DEDICATION HE BROUGHT TO CIRM. HE JOINED
11 THE IP AND INDUSTRY SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE BOARD VERY
12 SHORTLY AFTER JOINING THE BOARD ITSELF, AND HE HIT
13 THE GROUND RUNNING, BECOMING CO-CHAIR RATHER
14 QUICKLY, JOINING HIS TALENTS TO ANOTHER ESTEEMED
15 FORMER BOARD MEMBER, STEVE JUELSGAARD.

16 MOHAMED PLAYED A LARGE ROLE IN DEFINING
17 OUR WARRANT PROGRAM AND AMENDING OUR CO-FUNDING
18 REQUIREMENTS IN TRANSLATIONAL AND CLINICAL STAGE
19 RESEARCH, BOTH OF WHICH WERE PASSED BY THIS BOARD.
20 HE ALSO SERVED ON THE PRESIDENTIAL SEARCH COMMITTEE
21 THAT LED TO THE HIRING OF OUR FIFTH PRESIDENT AND
22 CEO, DR. JAMES THOMAS.

23 MOHAMED DREW FROM HIS BROAD, REAL-WORLD
24 EXPERIENCES, WAS ALWAYS READILY AVAILABLE, GAVE
25 VALUABLE FEEDBACK, TESTED ASSUMPTIONS BY INTELLIGENT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 QUESTIONING, AND WAS GENERALLY A JOY TO WORK WITH.
2 HE MADE RECOMMENDATIONS ON DATA SCIENCE TRAINING FOR
3 OUR EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM TRAINEES.

4 CIRM'S LOSS, MOHAMED, HAS BECOME THE KECK
5 GRADUATE INSTITUTE'S INESTIMABLE GAIN AS HE NOW
6 SERVES AS ITS THIRD PRESIDENT. MOHAMED, COME
7 FORWARD PLEASE. WE HAVE A RESOLUTION FOR YOU.
8 COME, YES.

9 (APPLAUSE.)

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OTHER BOARD MEMBERS
11 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK.

12 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: LEONDRA.

13 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: MOHAMED, I WANT TO LOOK
14 AT YOU, BUT IT'S HARD. OUR TIME ON THE BOARD
15 OVERLAPPED JUST A LITTLE BIT, BUT I THINK THAT
16 QUICKLY I GOT A SENSE OF YOUR CHARACTER AND WHO YOU
17 ARE. AND SO I JUST WANTED TO SHARE MY APPRECIATION
18 FOR YOU SHARING THAT WITH US. I ALWAYS LOOKED AT
19 YOU AS A BRAVE VOICE ON THE BOARD. THERE ARE MANY,
20 AND YOU ARE ONE OF THEM. AND YOU ALWAYS REMINDED US
21 WHAT IS FAIR, EQUITABLE AND, RIGHT. AND SO THANK
22 YOU FOR DOING THAT. I KNOW THIS ISN'T THE ONLY
23 SPACE THAT YOU PROBABLY DO THAT IN SPEAKING THAT
24 WAY, BUT THANK YOU FOR DOING IT HERE. IT WAS SO
25 IMPORTANT AND IT WAS NOTICED.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: GEORGE.

2 DR. BLUMENTHAL: WELL, I HAD THE DISTINCT
3 PLEASURE OF WORKING WITH MOHAMED FOR A NUMBER OF
4 YEARS WHEN HE WAS AT UC SANTA CRUZ WORKING IN THE
5 OFFICE OF RESEARCH. AND I CAN SAY THAT WAS A
6 TREMENDOUS PLEASURE FOR ME. AND THAT PLEASURE WAS
7 MULTIPLIED MANY TIMES WHEN I FOUND THAT MOHAMED WAS
8 JOINING THIS BOARD.

9 HE'S BEEN A VOICE OF SANITY AND REASON AND
10 LOGIC EVER SINCE HE JOINED THE BOARD HERE. AND I
11 REALLY APPRECIATED YOUR PRESENCE. AND, MOHAMED, I,
12 FOR ONE, AM GOING TO MISS YOU A GREAT DEAL, AND I
13 SUSPECT THE REST OF US WILL AS WELL.

14 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YSABEL.

15 MS. DURON: THANK YOU. I'M REALLY GOING
16 TO MISS YOU. I APPRECIATED YOU COMING A BOARD, BUT
17 AS A SAN JOSE STATE GRADUATE, I'M A LITTLE TICKED
18 OFF AT YOU FOR LEAVING US SINCE YOU WERE HELPING
19 CREATE SUCH A WONDERFUL SCIENCE PROGRAM AT SAN JOSE
20 STATE AND ACTUALLY PUSHING IT UP INTO THE ATMOSPHERE
21 TO REALLY MAKE IT A GREAT PLACE TO LEARN AND PREPARE
22 STUDENTS FOR SCIENCE.

23 SO I WILL KIND OF FORGIVE YOU, BUT I'M
24 SORRY TO SEE YOU GO ALSO FROM THE BOARD. THANK YOU
25 VERY MUCH, AND I HOPE WE CONTINUE TO SEE EACH OTHER

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SOME WAY.

2 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: PAT AND THEN HALA.

3 DR. LEVITT: WELL, I WAS -- I'M GOING THE
4 SAME DIRECTION. I'M GOING TO PILE ON WHAT YOU JUST
5 SAID. I KNOW THE KECK INSTITUTE HAS, WILL BENEFIT
6 GREATLY FROM ALL OF YOUR EXPERTISE AND YOUR
7 HUMANITY, WHICH CAME THROUGH IN YOUR SERVICE ON THE
8 BOARD, BUT I'M NOT HAPPY THAT YOU HAVE LEFT THE
9 BOARD. I CAME A LITTLE BIT BEFORE YOU, AND YOU'VE
10 MADE A HUGE DIFFERENCE -- YOU MADE A HUGE DIFFERENCE
11 IN A VERY SHORT PERIOD OF TIME. SO CONGRATULATIONS
12 TO THE KECK INSTITUTE. I FEEL BADLY FOR SAN DIEGO
13 STATE --

14 DR. BARRETT: SAN JOSE STATE.

15 DR. LEVITT: SAN JOSE STATE. SORRY.
16 SORRY. MY BRAIN IS IN SAN DIEGO WHERE I'M AN
17 ALUMNUS. SAN JOSE STATE. THIS IS WELL DESERVED.

18 DR. MADANAT: SO MOHAMED AND I DIDN'T
19 OVERLAP AT CIRM. ACTUALLY I TOOK KIND OF HIS SPOT
20 WHEN HE LEFT. SO LITTLE DIFFERENT EXPERIENCE HERE.
21 BUT MOHAMED AND I, WHEN I JOINED MY ROLE AS VICE
22 PRESIDENT, HE WAS THE OTHER VICE PRESIDENT AT SAN
23 JOSE STATE, AND VERY FEW OTHERS IN THE SYSTEM, IT
24 WAS ONE MORE ONLY WITHIN THE CSU. AND WITHOUT HIM,
25 I COULDN'T HAVE DONE MY JOB AT SAN DIEGO STATE,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 LEARNED INCREDIBLY A LOT FROM HIM. AND I MISS HIM
2 IN THAT ROLE AS A COUNTERPART WITHIN THE SYSTEM, AND
3 I'M SURE ALL OF YOU DO HERE BECAUSE WHAT I LEARNED
4 FROM HIM TRANSLATES IN EVERY SETTING THAT I'VE SEEN
5 HIM IN. THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU DO.

6 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: SO THE GOVERNOR IS
7 THE ONLY ONE WHO CAN APPOINT SOMEONE FROM THE CAL
8 STATE SYSTEM. AND SO HE MADE AN AMAZING CHOICE.
9 AND SO I THANK HIM, BUT I THANK YOU FOR BEING ON THE
10 BOARD. I'M REALLY LUCKY. I'VE GOT -- I'VE HAD A
11 CHANCE TO WORK WITH THE BOARD AND BE PART OF THE
12 BOARD FOR ALL OF THESE YEARS. AND I GET TO SPEND
13 TIME WITH YOU, AND IT WAS REALLY WONDERFUL.

14 YOU WERE ALWAYS VERY REASONABLE WHEN I
15 SOMETIMES CALLED SOUNDING UNREASONABLE. AND I
16 REALLY APPRECIATED JUST THAT COUNTERPOINT AND THAT
17 UNDERSTANDING OF, YOU KNOW, IF YOU LOOK AT IT THIS
18 WAY, MARIA. OKAY. I'LL LOOK AT IT THAT WAY. SO
19 THANK YOU.

20 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: J.T.

21 DR. THOMAS: SO, MOHAMED, WHEN -- FIRST OF
22 ALL, WHEN I WAS READING YOUR RESOLUTION, AND THIS
23 SORT OF APPLIES VERY MUCH TO MOHAMED, BUT TO
24 EVERYBODY HERE, AND YOU READ DOWN EVERYTHING YOU'VE
25 DONE. AND WE ALL SORT OF SIT HERE AND VIEW

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 OURSELVES IN THE CONTEXT OF CIRM AND SORT OF FORGET
2 ABOUT EVERYTHING THAT CAME BEFORE THAT. THE LITANY
3 OF THINGS THAT YOU'VE DONE WAS UNBELIEVABLE AND SO
4 IMPRESSIVE AND, I'M SURE, CENTRAL TO THE GOVERNOR
5 APPOINTING YOU TO THE BOARD. AND I INVITE PEOPLE TO
6 READ MOHAMED'S RESOLUTION. REALLY AMAZING.

7 SECONDLY, WHEN YOU JOINED THE BOARD AT A
8 TIME WHEN I WAS SORT IN THE TAIL END OF MY TENURE AS
9 BOARD CHAIR, YOU CAN TELL VERY QUICKLY HOW
10 PARTICIPATORY AND INTERESTED IN CERTAIN THINGS,
11 DIFFERENT BOARD MEMBERS -- EVERYBODY COMES WITH
12 DIFFERENT SETS OF INTEREST. AND SEEING WHERE YOU
13 WERE COMING FROM AND THE SORTS OF THINGS THAT YOU
14 EMPHASIZED WANTED TO HAVE YOU ON THE IP AND INDUSTRY
15 SUBCOMMITTEE. AND AS YOU WILL RECALL, ONE DAY YOU
16 WOKE UP AND I HAD APPOINTED YOU AS CO-CHAIR. AND
17 YOU SAID, "THAT'S VERY INTERESTING. THANK YOU VERY
18 MUCH." I SAID, "WELL, THE REASON THAT I DID THAT
19 WAS THAT YOU ARE SO COMPETENT IN THAT SPACE AS WELL
20 AS EVERYTHING ELSE, THAT IT WAS A ROLE THAT WAS
21 PERFECTLY SUITED FOR YOU." AND, OF COURSE, AT THE
22 TIME ECHOING COMMENTS WE WERE HOPING YOU WOULD SERVE
23 AS FOR MANY YEARS, BUT AS WE KNOW NOW, YOU'VE GONE
24 ON TO OTHER THINGS.

25 BUT I JUST WANTED TO SAY WHAT A PLEASURE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IT WAS HAVING YOU HERE. YOU WERE PART OF THIS
2 ILLUSTRIOUS BODY WHERE EVERYBODY CONTRIBUTES SO
3 MUCH. YOU BROUGHT SPECIFIC EXPERTISE THAT NOBODY
4 ELSE DID, ALL OF WHICH WAS SO HELPFUL. SO THANK YOU
5 AND WELL DESERVED NEW POSITION THAT YOU HAVE, AND
6 THEIR GOOD FORTUNE IS OUR LOSS, BUT WE APPLAUD YOU
7 FOR EVERYTHING. SO THANK YOU.

8 DR. ABOUSALEM: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

9 (APPLAUSE.)

10 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: WE NEED A MOTION
11 TO ACCEPT THE RESOLUTION -- ADOPT THE RESOLUTION.

12 DR. BLUMENTHAL: SO MOVED.

13 DR. SOUTHARD: SECOND.

14 MR. TOCHER: GEORGE, SECOND BY MARV.

15 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: SCOTT, WILL YOU
16 TAKE THE ROLL.

17 MR. TOCHER: ALL THOSE IN THE ROOM IN
18 FAVOR SAY AYE. THOSE OPPOSED? ANY ABSTENTIONS?
19 I'LL POLL THE MEMBERS ON THE PHONE.

20 JUDY CHOU.

21 DR. CHOU: AYE.

22 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

23 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

24 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.

25 MR. LAJARA: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.

2 DR. PADILLA: YES.

3 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.

4 MR. PANETTA: AYE.

5 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.

6 DR. XU: AYE.

7 MR. TOCHER: AND KEITH YAMAMOTO.

8 DR. YAMAMOTO: AYE.

9 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU. THE MOTION IS
10 ADOPTED.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MOHAMED.

12 DR. ABOUSALEM: THANK YOU SO MUCH. JUST A
13 FEW WORDS. I KNOW YOU HAVE A PACKED AGENDA. BUT
14 GOOD MORNING TO ALL OF YOU, MR. CHAIR, MADAM VICE
15 CHAIR, MR. PRESIDENT, ENTIRE ICOC GOVERNING BOARD,
16 AND ALL CIRM STAFF. IT IS TRULY AN HONOR TO STAND
17 BEFORE YOU TODAY.

18 DURING MY TENURE ON THE CIRM GOVERNING
19 BOARD, I WAS PRIVILEGED TO SERVE ALONGSIDE ITS TEAM,
20 SCIENCE AND COMMUNITY LEADERS WHO SHARED THE
21 UNWAVERING COMMITMENT TO HEALING AND UPLIFTING OUR
22 COMMUNITIES THROUGH ADVANCED TREATMENTS AND CURES
23 FOR CHRONIC DISEASES.

24 I WAS PARTICULARLY IMPRESSED BY THE
25 DEDICATION AND PASSION DISPLAYED BY ALL BOARD

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MEMBERS IN EVERY DECISION REGARDLESS OF ITS
2 MAGNITUDE AND THE TRUE COMMITMENT TO ALL PATIENTS,
3 INCLUDING THOSE FROM UNDERREPRESENTED AND
4 HISTORICALLY UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES.

5 THE CIRM OPERATION IS TRULY A TESTAMENT TO
6 THE PROFESSIONALISM AND CARE OF ITS STAFF WHO
7 DILIGENTLY AND EQUITABLY INVEST IN PROGRAMS THAT
8 DELIVER EXCEPTIONAL RESULTS. WHILE THE SCIENTIFIC
9 RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT SUPPORTED BY CIRM IS NOT
10 DIRECTLY PERFORMED ON-SITE, THE ORGANIZATION'S
11 SOPHISTICATED AND ENTREPRENEURIAL APPROACH SETS IT
12 AS A GOLD STANDARD FOR GRANTING PROGRAMS SUPPORTING
13 HEALTH SCIENCES.

14 I AM PROUD TO HAVE BEEN A PART OF THIS
15 WORLD-CLASS OPERATION DEDICATED TO THIS WORTHY
16 CAUSE. I EXTEND MY SINCERE GRATITUDE TO YOUR
17 RECOGNITION TODAY. A SPECIAL THANK-YOU GOES TO
18 GOVERNOR NEWSOM FOR HAVING ENTRUSTED ME WITH THIS
19 IMPORTANT RESPONSIBILITY. I HOPE THAT MY
20 CONTRIBUTIONS HAVE IN SOME WAY ADVANCED THE VALUE OF
21 THE INVALUABLE WORK THAT YOU ALL DO. THANK YOU VERY
22 MUCH.

23 (APPLAUSE.)

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I HAVE A SECOND
25 RESOLUTION. THIS IS WITH REGARD TO AL ROWLETT WHO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IS NOT WITH US HERE IN THE ROOM, BUT HE IS ONLINE.
2 HE'S ON ZOOM. GOOD. WELCOME, AL.

3 AL ROWLETT JOINED THE CIRM BOARD OF
4 DIRECTORS IN 2013 AT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE
5 SPEAKER OF THE CALIFORNIA ASSEMBLY TO SERVE AS THE
6 MENTAL HEALTH PATIENT ADVOCATE. DURING HIS 11 YEARS
7 WITH US, HE SERVED AS CHAIR OF THE FINANCE
8 SUBCOMMITTEE, A MEMBER OF THE APPLICATION REVIEW AND
9 GOVERNANCE SUBCOMMITTEE, THE TASK FORCE ON
10 NEUROSCIENCE AND MEDICINE, THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP,
11 AND THE ACCESS AND AFFORDABILITY WORKING GROUP. HE
12 WORKED TIRELESSLY IN OPERATIONALIZING CIRM'S
13 COMMITMENT TO DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION.

14 HE'S MADE A PROFOUND IMPACT ON THE STATE,
15 BUILDING ON HIS FORMAL TRAINING IN SOCIAL WORK AND
16 BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION. THIS LED HIM IN 1981 TO
17 TURNING POINT COMMUNITY PROGRAMS ACTIVE IN MENTAL
18 HEALTH AND COMMUNITY SUPPORT, RAISING OVER 43 YEARS
19 FROM REHABILITATION -- RISING OVER 43 YEARS FROM
20 REHABILITATION COUNSELOR TO CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER.

21 AL EXPANDED TCPC'S IMPACT THROUGHOUT NINE
22 NORTHERN CALIFORNIA COUNTIES BY EMPHASIZING THE
23 BENEFIT OF HOUSING AND RESPITE SERVICES AS AN
24 ALTERNATIVE TO EMERGENCY ROOM VISITS OR PSYCHIATRIC
25 HOSPITALIZATIONS. HE SERVED AS THE BOARD CHAIR OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE OF BEHAVIORIAL HEALTH
2 SOLUTIONS, A BOARD DIRECTOR OF THE UNITED STATES
3 PSYCHIATRIC REHABILITATION ASSOCIATION, AND AS
4 COMMISSIONER OF THE CALIFORNIA MENTAL HEALTH
5 SERVICES OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY COMMISSION,
6 WHICH CAME ABOUT AFTER THE PASSAGE OF THE MENTAL
7 HEALTH BALLOT INITIATIVE KNOWN AS PROPOSITION 1.

8 A MAN OF FAITH, HE ROUNDS OUT ALL OF THIS
9 WORK OF SERVICE AS THE BOARD CHAIR OF THE FELLOWSHIP
10 OF CHRISTIAN ATHLETES IN SACRAMENTO. AL CONTINUES
11 TO BE AN ACTIVE FINANCIAL STEWARD OF CIRM THROUGH
12 HIS SERVICE NOW ON THE CITIZENS FINANCIAL
13 ACCOUNTABILITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. THIS IS A
14 SIX-MEMBER BOARD CHAIRED BY THE STATE CONTROLLER
15 THAT EACH YEAR REVIEWS CIRM'S FINANCIAL PRACTICES
16 AND PERFORMANCE. IN FACT, J.T. WILL REPORT ON THIS
17 MOST RECENT MEETING OF THE CFAOC WHERE WE HAD A
18 SWEET REUNION WITH AL ROWLETT.

19 I AM LEAVING AL'S OTHER ACTIVITIES,
20 INCLUDING HIS OUTREACH -- I'M LEAVING OUT HIS OTHER
21 ACTIVITIES, INCLUDING HIS OUTREACH TO THE HOMELESS
22 IN SAN FRANCISCO AND SACRAMENTO AND HIS MISSION
23 TRIPS TO ORPHANAGES OR TO BUILD HOMES OR TO CREATE
24 WATER ACCESS IN GHANA, SPAIN, JAMAICA, AND MEXICO.

25 AL, WE DON'T KNOW HOW YOU MANAGE TO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SQUEEZE US INTO THIS BUSY LIFE OF YOURS. WE
2 CERTAINLY THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE. WE WELCOME
3 YOU HERE TODAY TO HEAR OUR COMMENTS FOR YOU.

4 ARE THERE ANY BOARD MEMBERS? YES. I'LL
5 START WITH MARV.

6 DR. SOUTHARD: SO, AL, I THINK CIRM WAS
7 THE FIFTH BOARD THAT WE SERVED ON TOGETHER. AND I
8 KIND OF THINK, AL, EVEN THOUGH YOU'RE YOUNGER THAN I
9 AM, I THINK OF YOU AS MY OLDER BROTHER BECAUSE
10 YOU'VE SHOWN ME HOW TO DO THIS WORK SO CLEARLY AND
11 DEFINITELY.

12 AS WE FIRST STARTED DOING THE DEI REVIEWS,
13 THERE WERE TIMES WHEN SOME OF THE REVIEWS WERE
14 MINIMAL, I THINK, WOULD BE THE WORD. AND YOU
15 WOULDN'T PUT UP WITH THAT. AND ONE OF THE THINGS
16 THAT WE LEARNED HOW TO DO IS TO DO A REAL, HONEST,
17 AND TRUE DEI EVALUATION OF THE PROPOSALS. AND ONE
18 OF THE THINGS THAT'S HAPPENED OVER TIME, THEY'RE
19 INFINITELY BETTER THAN THEY WERE IN THE EARLY
20 STAGES. IT REALLY IS TRUE. AND, AL, YOU MADE THAT
21 HAPPEN.

22 I THINK FOR ME THE MOST IMPORTANT THING
23 THOUGH, AL, IS THE WORK THAT YOU HAVE DONE IN
24 TURNING POINT WAS A REAL, TRUE COMMUNITY SERVICE.
25 YOU PUT THE DEI IDEAS INTO ACTUAL PRACTICE IN REAL

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 COMMUNITIES. AND AS TURNING POINT HAS FLOURISHED
2 BECAUSE OF YOUR LEADERSHIP, IT WAS REALLY REMARKABLE
3 TO SEE DEI AND COMMUNITY OUTREACH REALLY, HONEST TO
4 GOD HAPPEN INSTEAD OF JUST BEING PRO FORMA.

5 SO, AL, YOU HAVE BEEN A LEADER. NOW, AS
6 YOU'VE RETIRED, WHAT, TWO DAYS AGO FROM TURNING
7 POINT, TURNING POINT IS AT A TURNING POINT. BUT YOU
8 WILL CONTINUE TO SERVE AS YOU ALWAYS HAVE, AND YOUR
9 FAITH IS REALLY EVIDENT, AND IT NOURISHES AND GUIDES
10 US ALL. SO, AL, AS YOUR YOUNGER BROTHER, THANK YOU.

11 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I THINK LEONDR
12 WAS NEXT AND THEN CHRIS AND KIM.

13 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: I HAD TO WRITE THIS
14 DOWN SO I DON'T GET TEARFUL. I THINK IT'S REALLY
15 FITTING ON THE HEELS OF MLK'S BIRTHDAY A FEW WEEKS
16 AGO AS WELL AS A FEW DAYS AWAY FROM STEPPING INTO
17 BLACK HISTORY MONTH TO SHARE THIS QUOTE FROM MARTIN
18 LUTHER KING THAT MAKES ME THINK OF AL. AND THAT IS
19 "OF ALL THE FORMS OF INEQUALITY, INJUSTICE,
20 HEALTHCARE IS THE MOST SHOCKING AND INHUMANE." AND
21 THOUGH THAT'S VERY SUMMERATE, IT STILL RINGS TRUE
22 TODAY. AND I THINK IT IS FITTING FOR YOU, AL,
23 BECAUSE YOU REALLY HAVE DEDICATED YOUR LIFE, YOUR
24 CAREER PERSONALLY AND PROFESSIONALLY TO AMELIORATING
25 HEALTH DISPARITIES, PARTICULARLY BEHAVORIAL HEALTH

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DISPARITIES, AND YOU'VE DONE THIS THROUGH YOUR
2 PERSONAL LIFE. YOU'VE DONE THIS THROUGH YOUR
3 COMMUNITY LEADERSHIP AND ALL OF THE ACCOLADES. AND
4 YOU'VE DONE THIS THROUGH YOUR SERVICE AT CIRM AS
5 WELL.

6 SO THANK YOU FOR BEING A PERSONAL FRIEND
7 AND A MENTOR AND A LEADER. AND I WILL SEE YOU
8 BECAUSE YOU STILL SIT ON 50 MILLION BOARDS. I JOKE
9 WITH AL THAT HE'S NOT REALLY RETIRING. I DON'T
10 THINK HE KNOWS HOW TO. BUT THANK YOU. THANK YOU
11 FOR THE LEADERSHIP, THANK YOU FOR THE CARE FOR YOUR
12 FAMILY, YOUR COMMUNITY, AND THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING
13 YOU WILL CONTINUE TO DO FOR THE BEHAVIORIAL HEALTH
14 COMMUNITY.

15 DR. MIASKOWSKI: AL, I WANT TO ECHO MARV'S
16 ELOQUENT COMMENTS AND EXPRESS TO YOU MY GRATITUDE.
17 YOU MAY NOT KNOW THIS, BUT COMING ON THE BOARD IS AN
18 OVERWHELMING EXPERIENCE. AND I LEARNED SO MUCH FROM
19 YOU PARTICULARLY IN THE GWG IN TERMS OF HOW TO WRITE
20 DEI REVIEWS, HOW TO SPEAK UP AND ADVOCATE FOR
21 PATIENTS. I WAS VERY, VERY, VERY SAD WHEN THEY SAID
22 YOU WERE STEPPING DOWN FROM THE BOARD. YOU ARE
23 TRULY MISSED. AND I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU SO, SO
24 MUCH FOR ALL YOU DID AND ARE CONTINUING TO DO.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHRISTINE.

2 DR. BARRETT: AL, YOU MAY NOT KNOW THE
3 IMPACT THAT YOU'VE HAD ON A LOT OF PEOPLE, AND YOU
4 CERTAINLY PROBABLY DON'T KNOW THE IMPACT THAT YOU'VE
5 HAD ON ME. BUT IN MUCH THE SAME WAY THAT CHRIS
6 SAID, THAT COMING ON THIS BOARD IS A LITTLE
7 OVERWHELMING AND INTIMIDATING, ONE OF THE EARLY
8 TOUCHPOINTS FOR ME WAS TO WATCH HOW YOU CONDUCTED
9 YOURSELF AND HOW YOU ALWAYS HAD SOMETHING IMPORTANT
10 TO SAY WHEN YOU COMMENTED ON ANY ISSUE.

11 I WOULD SAY, AND I GUESS IT'S CONSISTENT
12 WITH EVERYTHING THAT WE'VE HEARD ABOUT YOUR LIFE AND
13 YOUR CONTRIBUTIONS AND YOUR SERVICE, THAT YOU WERE A
14 MORAL COMPASS FOR THIS BOARD. AND I PERSONALLY
15 REALLY APPRECIATED THAT. SO WE DIDN'T HAVE THE
16 OPPORTUNITY TO GET TO KNOW EACH OTHER VERY WELL
17 PERSONALLY, BUT KNOW THAT THERE ARE PEOPLE OUT THERE
18 WATCHING YOU THAT YOU MAY NEVER KNOW THAT YOU
19 INFLUENCED, BUT YOU REALLY HAVE. SO THANK YOU SO
20 MUCH, AND I TOO VERY MUCH MISS HAVING YOU ON THIS
21 BOARD WITH US.

22 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. YSABEL.

23 MS. DURON: AL, I MISS YOU. I MISS YOUR
24 QUIET BUT FIRM, COMMANDING PRESENCE. AND AS KIM
25 SAID, I MISS THE COMMANDING WAY IN WHICH YOU HANDLE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE TOPICS. I MISS FEELING LIKE SOMEONE'S GOT MY
2 BACK, AND I APPRECIATE THAT YOU WERE HERE AND
3 HOLDING DOWN THE FORT AND MAKING SURE DEI IS PRESENT
4 AND THAT IT BECAME STRONGER AND VERY MUCH A PART OF
5 CULTURE AND HOW WE LOOK AT THINGS TODAY. SO I
6 APPRECIATE THAT, BUT I DO MISS YOU, AND I HOPE ALL
7 IS WELL FOR YOU. AND I KNOW THAT YOU WILL CONTINUE
8 TO MAKE GOOD AND BE GOOD OUT THERE IN THE WORLD.
9 THANK YOU.

10 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I STARTED WORKING
11 WITH AL THE DAY HE BECAME A BOARD MEMBER, AND I
12 REMEMBER THE FIRST TIME WE MET AND J.T. AND I WENT
13 TO GO VISIT HIM IN HIS OFFICE IN SACRAMENTO. AND I
14 THOUGHT HE IS SUCH A PLEASURE, AND IT WAS SUCH A
15 WELCOMING VOICE ON THE BOARD. AND OVER THOSE 13
16 YEARS, AL, WE'VE BECOME FRIENDS WHICH TO ME IS
17 VALUABLE AND AMAZING. AND I FEEL REALLY FORTUNATE
18 THAT I'VE HAD THAT OPPORTUNITY AND THAT YOU'VE
19 ALLOWED ME TO BECOME ONE OF YOUR FRIENDS.

20 AND WORKING WITH YOU AND SITTING ON THE
21 GWG WITH YOU HAS BEEN REALLY REMARKABLE BECAUSE YOU
22 REALLY CHALLENGED ME TO SORT OF LOOK AT THINGS IN A
23 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE AND SEE THINGS THAT I MISSED
24 THE FIRST TIME AROUND AND REALLY CHALLENGED PERHAPS
25 MY THOUGHTS AROUND WHAT A GOOD DEI PLAN MIGHT BE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SO THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR EVERYTHING. AND I KNOW
2 THAT IF I ASK YOU TO DO SOMETHING, YOU'LL DO IT. SO
3 BE CAREFUL. YOU MAY BE SEEING MORE OF US. SO THANK
4 YOU FOR EVERYTHING YOU'VE DONE FOR US.

5 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARIA.
6 J.T.

7 DR. THOMAS: AL, SO YOU ARE AND ALWAYS
8 WILL BE THE MAN. CHAIRS OF BOARDS ALWAYS HAVE GO-TO
9 PEOPLE THAT THEY PARTICULARLY RELY ON FOR THE
10 SOUNDEST ADVICE. AND YOU AND I OVER OUR MANY YEARS
11 TOGETHER HAD COUNTLESS DISCUSSIONS, NOT JUST IN THE
12 CONTEXT OF SUBCOMMITTEES WHICH YOU EITHER CHAIRED OR
13 WERE A MEMBER OF, BUT ABOUT ALL THINGS CIRM. AND
14 YOU UNFAILINGLY GAVE OUTSTANDING ADVICE, WHICH I
15 TOOK TO HEART IN EACH AND EVERY INSTANCE. AND THAT
16 HELPED ME AND THE BOARD ADVANCE IN A WAY THAT
17 CONTINUED TO GIVE US OUR BEST SHOT AT FULFILLING OUR
18 MISSION.

19 YOU WERE A UNIQUE VOICE ON THE BOARD.
20 YOUR COMBINATION OF EXPERTISE, OF FAITH, OF CARING,
21 OF WANTING TO DO WHAT WAS THE RIGHT THING AT ALL
22 TIMES MADE A HUGE DIFFERENCE. WHEN WE HAD THE
23 OPPORTUNITY TO ADD SOME NEW MEMBERS OF THE BOARD IN
24 THE MENTAL HEALTH AREA, YOU WILL RECALL, AS I DO,
25 VIVIDLY OUR DISCUSSION IN WHICH CASE -- WHICH TIME

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU SAID, "YOU KNOW, I'VE GOT THESE TWO FRIENDS
2 NAMED LEONDRA AND MARV." AND THAT SENTENCE LED TO
3 THE APPOINTMENT AND JOINING OF TWO MARVELOUS BOARD
4 MEMBERS WHO BROUGHT SO MUCH WHICH YOU KNEW THEY
5 WOULD.

6 AND JUST WANT TO SAY THAT WE REALLY MISS
7 YOU, REALLY, ALL CAPS, AND FEEL PRIVILEGED TO HAVE
8 HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO WORK WITH YOU FOR SO MANY
9 YEARS. AND, OF COURSE, NO COMMENT WOULD BE COMPLETE
10 WITHOUT SAYING THAT YOU SENDING ME ALL THOSE TEXTS
11 ABOUT THE GIANTS WERE KIND OF IRRITATING, BUT AT THE
12 MOMENT I'VE GOT THE LAST LAUGH. SO I JUST WANT TO
13 SAY THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU DID. IT WAS WONDERFUL
14 SERVING WITH YOU. IT'S WONDERFUL THAT YOU'RE THERE
15 TO GIVE TREMENDOUS CONTEXT AND INSTITUTIONAL MEMORY
16 TO THE CFAOC AS THEY OVERSEE WHAT WE'RE DOING. AND
17 I COUNT YOU AS A GREAT FRIEND AND LOOK FORWARD TO
18 MANY MORE DISCUSSIONS ON MANY TOPICS. SO THANK YOU,
19 AL.

20 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, J.T. I'D
21 LIKE TO -- SORRY, ANNE-MARIE.

22 DR. DULIEGE: JUST SIMPLY TO SAY TO BOTH
23 MOHAMED AND AL, NOTHING ORIGINAL TO ADD TO WHAT WAS
24 SAID, BUT HOW MUCH WE ALREADY MISS YOU. YOU HAD
25 SUCH A PRESENCE AND YOU'RE ALREADY MISSED, BOTH OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU. SO THANK YOU, AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL ALL STAY IN
2 TOUCH ONE WAY OR ANOTHER. THANK YOU.

3 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: HAVE I MISSED ANY
4 HANDS? IF NOT, I WOULD LIKE TO CAP OFF THIS
5 CONVERSATION WITH A MOTION TO ACCEPT THIS RESOLUTION
6 IN HONOR OF AL ROWLETT'S SERVICE TO THIS BOARD.

7 DR. SOUTHARD: SO MOVED.

8 DR. BARRETT: SECOND.

9 MR. TOCHER: I DIDN'T HEAR A SECOND.

10 DR. BARRETT: SECOND.

11 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU, KIM.

12 IS THERE ANY BOARD COMMENT ON THE MOTION?

13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: IS THERE PUBLIC
14 COMMENT? ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD? I
15 THOUGHT I ASKED. OKAY. I THINK YOU CAN PROCEED.

16 MR. TOCHER: ALL THOSE IN THE ROOM IN
17 FAVOR SAY AYE. THOSE OPPOSED SAY NAY. ANY
18 ABSTENTIONS? I'LL POLL THE MEMBERS ON THE PHONE.

19 JUDY CHOU.

20 DR. CHOU: AYE.

21 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

22 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

23 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.

24 MR. LAJARA: YES.

25 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. PADILLA: YES.

2 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.

3 MR. PANETTA: AYE.

4 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.

5 DR. XU: AYE.

6 MR. TOCHER: AND KEITH YAMAMOTO.

7 DR. YAMAMOTO: AYE.

8 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU. THE MOTION

9 CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, SCOTT.

11 AL, WE WILL MAKE SURE YOU ARE IN RECEIPT OF THIS
12 PROCLAMATION. WOULD YOU LIKE TO ADDRESS THE BOARD?

13 MR. ROWLETT: YES. THANK YOU. I WANTED
14 TO MAKE SURE THAT THE AUDIO WAS ACCEPTABLE. CAN YOU
15 HEAR ME?

16 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

17 MR. ROWLETT: GREETINGS TO THE CHAIR AND
18 VICE CHAIR AND TO CIRM'S PRESIDENT AND CEO, AND TO
19 ALL THE MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. MY HUMBLE APOLOGIES
20 FOR NOT BEING ABLE TO BE THERE. I HAVE A VOLUNTEER
21 COMMITMENT TODAY TO A GROUP OF INDIVIDUALS IN THE
22 COMMUNITY. AND AS YOU MIGHT EXPECT, IT IS THAT KIND
23 OF COMMITMENT THAT CONTINUES TO DRIVE ME EVERY DAY
24 IN THE WORK THAT I CONTINUE TO BE PRIVILEGED TO DO
25 IN THIS VERY UNIQUE TIME IN MY LIFE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 I ALSO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE AND APPRECIATE
2 VERY MUCH THE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF MY FAITH, WHICH IS
3 THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES THAT HELP ME IN LIFE EVERY
4 DAY. AS I LIVE, I THANK GOD EVERY DAY FOR THE
5 OPPORTUNITY THAT I HAD TO SERVE AS A MEMBER OF THE
6 CIRM BOARD. AND, YES, I ALSO WANT TO SAY THAT I TOO
7 WAS SO VERY MOVED BY YOUR COMMENTS. I WOULD BE
8 REMISS IF I DIDN'T ACKNOWLEDGE FRED FISHER. THE
9 LATE FRED FISHER HAD A TREMENDOUS IMPACT ON ME, AND
10 I WILL ALWAYS APPRECIATE AND MISS HIS ARTFUL
11 CONTRIBUTIONS.

12 THAT SAID, TO ALL THE MEMBERS OF THE
13 BOARD, THANK YOU. YOU ARE A LIGHT IN A TIME WHERE
14 THERE IS TURBULENCE AND UNEASINESS FOR SO MANY THAT
15 YOU ARE PRIVILEGED TO REPRESENT. HOWEVER, IN THE
16 WORDS OF LEONDR A CLARK-HARVEY, MY FRIEND AND
17 COLLEAGUE, I REMEMBER WHAT DR. KING SAID. HE SAID,
18 "GIVEN A CHOICE BETWEEN HATE AND LOVE, HE'D CHOOSE
19 TO CHOOSE LOVE VERSUS HATE BECAUSE HATE WAS TOO
20 GREAT A BURDEN TO BEAR."

21 AS A PATIENT ADVOCATE AT CIRM, I
22 UNDERSTOOD THE IMPORTANCE OF ADVANCING THAT CONCEPT
23 WHEN WORKING WITH UNDERSERVED -- COMMUNITIES THAT I
24 WAS PRIVILEGED TO REPRESENT AND COMMUNITIES THAT DID
25 NOT HAVE HOPE. COMMUNITIES THAT DID NOT OFTEN HAVE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ACCESS TO THE OUTSTANDING TECHNOLOGIES AND THERAPIES
2 THAT YOU ARE ADVOCATING FOR AND THAT YOU WERE
3 FUNDING. IT WAS THAT HOPE THAT SHIFTED THE
4 TRAJECTORY OF MY UNDERSTANDING OF THE UNIQUE ROLE
5 THAT CIRM PLAYS IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. DON'T
6 BE DISSUADED BY WHAT YOU HEAR, DON'T BE CONCERNED
7 ABOUT THE NEGATIVE RHETORIC, AND DON'T LET IT
8 OVERINFLUENCE WHAT YOU DO. WHAT YOU DO IS STILL
9 IMPORTANT, AND IT IS SO IMPORTANT TO ILLUSTRATE IN
10 CLOSING WITH THIS.

11 I HAD A UNIQUE PRIVILEGE OF SITTING WITH
12 TWO ADVOCATES ON MONDAY. AND THEY WERE ASKING ME
13 FOR SOME RECOMMENDATIONS, YSABEL, ABOUT ADVOCACY.
14 THEY WANTED HOPE BECAUSE THEY WERE WORKING WITH A
15 FAMILY WHERE THE MOM WAS UNHOUSED AND HER CHILD HAD
16 BEEN DIAGNOSED WITH SICKLE CELL AND SHE DIDN'T KNOW
17 WHAT TO DO. AND I REMEMBER CIRM IN THAT MOMENT AND
18 CONVEYED WHAT YOU EXPECT AN ADVOCATE TO CONVEY, NOT
19 JUST HOPE, BUT RESOURCE THAT WOULD HELP RESOLVE AND
20 REMEDY THE IMMEDIATE DILEMMAS, BUT ALSO TO LET THEM
21 KNOW THAT THERE'S A GROUP OF PEOPLE CALLED CIRM THAT
22 ARE WORKING WITHOUT FAIL ON CURES, CURES THAT THE
23 PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA NOT ONLY DESERVE,
24 BUT WANT THAT WILL NOT JUST AFFECT THOSE THAT HAVE
25 ACCESS, BUT THAT AFFECT THOSE POSITIVELY IN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 UNDERSERVED AND POORLY SERVED COMMUNITIES IN THE
2 STATE OF CALIFORNIA.

3 IT IS MY COMMITMENT TO ALL OF YOU TO
4 CONTINUE TO BE AN ADVOCATE JUST LIKE THE REST OF YOU
5 FOR EVERY PERSON, NOT JUST IN CALIFORNIA, BUT
6 THROUGHOUT THE REST OF OUR COUNTRY AND TALK ABOUT
7 THE GREAT WORK THAT YOU DO AT CIRM. IT WAS A
8 PRIVILEGE TO SERVE WITH YOU. AND I WILL CONTINUE TO
9 BE AN ADVOCATE FOR YOUR GREAT WORK. THANK YOU FOR
10 THE RECOGNITION. THANK YOU FOR THE TIME. AND THANK
11 YOU, CIRM, FOR YOUR COMMITMENT TO CURES FOR THE
12 PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, OUR NATION, AND
13 OUR WORLD. THANK YOU.

14 (APPLAUSE.)

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, AL.
16 THANK YOU AGAIN FROM EVERYONE. WELL, FROM THE
17 SUBLIME TO THE MUNDANE. LOOK AT THE NEXT AGENDA
18 ITEM NO. 7, WHICH IS --

19 MR. TOCHER: MR. CHAIR, IF I COULD JUST,
20 JUST FOR PLANNING PURPOSES, YES. AND FOR THE FOLKS
21 ON THE PHONE, WE'LL BE JUST TAKING A TEN-MINUTE BIO
22 BREAK AFTER CONSIDERATION BEFORE WE RECONVENE AS THE
23 APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE. SO JUST SO YOU
24 KNOW, COMING UP.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, SCOTT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SO BEFORE THE BREAK, WE'LL CONDUCT ONE MORE PIECE OF
2 BUSINESS, WHICH IS TO PASS THE CONSENT CALENDAR,
3 WHICH INCLUDES THE MINUTES FROM THE DECEMBER 12TH
4 ICOC MEETING. THERE'S A COPY OF THE MINUTES ON THE
5 BACK TABLE. I'VE LOOKED THEM OVER. I CAN'T FIND
6 ANY EMENDATIONS. SO I ASK FOR A MOTION TO ACCEPT,
7 UNLESS ANYONE WANTS TO ABSTRACT SOMETHING FROM THE
8 CONSENT CALENDAR. SEEING NO HANDS, MAY I HAVE A
9 MOTION TO ACCEPT IT?

10 DR. SOUTHARD: SO MOVED.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARV.
12 AND SECONDED?

13 MR. TOCHER: I HEARD YSABEL.

14 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YSABEL. I HEARD
15 YSABEL. ANY DISCUSSION?

16 MR. TOCHER: PUBLIC COMMENT.

17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: NO.

18 MR. TOCHER: ALL THOSE IN THE ROOM IN
19 FAVOR SAY AYE. THOSE OPPOSED SAY NAY. ANY
20 ABSTENTIONS? AND I'LL POLL THE MEMBERS ON THE
21 PHONE.

22 JUDY CHOU.

23 DR. CHOU: AYE.

24 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

25 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.

2 MR. LAJARA: YES.

3 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.

4 DR. PADILLA: YES.

5 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.

6 MR. PANETTA: YES.

7 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.

8 DR. XU: YES.

9 MR. TOCHER: AND KEITH YAMAMOTO.

10 DR. YAMAMOTO: YES.

11 MR. TOCHER: GREAT. THANKS VERY MUCH.

12 THE MOTION CARRIES. SO PERHAPS 10:15.

13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: WE WILL RECONVENE AT
14 10:15. THANK YOU.

15 MR. TOCHER: GREAT.

16 (A RECESS WAS TAKEN.)

17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: WE ARE BACK IN
18 SESSION. THANK YOU ALL. I'M GOING TO DIRECT YOUR
19 ATTENTION TO AGENDA ITEM 12, CONSIDERATION OF
20 APPLICATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE TO
21 OUR DISCOVERY PROGRAM ANNOUNCEMENTS REFERRED TO AS
22 DISC4 OR THE REMIND PROGRAM. GIL SAMBRANO IS GOING
23 TO LEAD THE PRESENTATION.

24 DR. SAMBRANO: I'M GIL SAMBRANO. THANK
25 YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M GIL

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SAMBRANO THE VICE PRESIDENT OF PORTFOLIO DEVELOPMENT
2 AND REVIEW AT CIRM. AND I'M GOING TO PRESENT TO YOU
3 THE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP AS
4 THEY PERTAIN TO THE DISC4 REMIND-L PROGRAM.

5 WITH EVERY MEETING THAT WE HAVE, THAT
6 INCLUDES THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP AS WELL AS THE
7 BOARD, WE ALWAYS START OFF WITH OUR MISSION, WHICH
8 IS TO ACCELERATE WORLD-CLASS SCIENCE TO DELIVER
9 TRANSFORMATIVE REGENERATIVE MEDICINE TREATMENTS IN
10 AN EQUITABLE MANNER TO A DIVERSE CALIFORNIA AND
11 WORLD. AND THIS IS AN IMPORTANT REMINDER TO OUR
12 REVIEWERS AS WELL AS OURSELVES ABOUT WHY WE ARE HERE
13 AND TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE FOCUSED ON THIS GOAL AS
14 WE ENDEAVOR IN THESE REVIEW SESSIONS.

15 THE REMIND PROGRAM, REMIND ITSELF IS AN
16 ACRONYM WHICH STANDS FOR RESEARCH USING
17 MULTIDISCIPLINARY INNOVATIVE APPROACHES IN
18 NEURODISEASES. ITS PURPOSE IN A GENERAL SENSE IS TO
19 ACCELERATE DISCOVERY OR MECHANISMS THAT UNDERLIE
20 NEUROLOGICAL DISEASES AND DISORDERS THAT LEAD TO
21 IDENTIFICATION, VALIDATION OF NOVEL TARGETS AND
22 BIOMARKERS FOR FUTURE TRANSLATIONAL OR CLINICAL
23 STUDIES.

24 IN THIS CASE OR FOR THIS INITIAL
25 OPPORTUNITY, WE FOCUSED EFFORTS ON NEUROPSYCHIATRIC

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DISORDERS. AND THE REMIND PROGRAM STRUCTURE ITSELF
2 IS INTENDED TO BE MULTIDISCIPLINARY AND
3 COLLABORATIVE. AS SUCH, THE REMIND-L AWARDS ARE
4 GOING TO SUPPORT EXPANSIVE, CROSS-DISCIPLINARY,
5 INTEGRATED STUDIES BY LARGE, COLLABORATIVE TEAMS
6 THAT WOULD APPLY A RANGE OF TECHNOLOGIES AND
7 APPROACHES TO THE PROBLEM AREA.

8 FOR THE PROPOSALS THAT ARE COMING TO US
9 THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING FOR FUNDING, THE OUTCOMES OF
10 THOSE PROPOSALS CAN VARY. THEY CAN INCLUDE ALL OR
11 SOME OF THESE ELEMENTS, WHICH ARE TO DISCOVER NOVEL,
12 MECHANISTIC INSIGHTS OR FURTHER OUR CURRENT
13 UNDERSTANDING OF NEUROPSYCHIATRIC DISEASE
14 MECHANISMS, TO ADDRESS MAJOR BOTTLENECKS IN THE
15 STUDY OF THOSE DISORDERS, TO EXPAND UNDERSTANDING OF
16 DISEASE MECHANISMS TO DIVERSE HUMAN POPULATIONS,
17 IDENTIFY AND VALIDATE NEW THERAPEUTIC HYPOTHESES,
18 TARGETS, AND BIOMARKERS.

19 THE REVIEW OF THESE APPLICATIONS FOLLOWS
20 THE TYPICAL THREE-STEP PROCESS OF ELIGIBILITY THAT
21 IS ASSESSED BY CIRM, MERIT REVIEW BY THE GRANTS
22 WORKING GROUP, AND THE FUNDING DECISIONS THAT'S MADE
23 BY THE APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE.

24 THE APPLICATIONS ARE ALL SCORED BY THE
25 GRANTS WORKING GROUP USING A SCALE OF 1, 2, OR 3.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AND THOSE THAT RECEIVE A SCORE OF 2 CAN HAVE THE
2 OPPORTUNITY TO RESUBMIT. I'LL TELL YOU A LITTLE
3 MORE AS WE GO OVER WHAT THE INITIAL OUTCOME OF THE
4 REVIEW WAS THAT HAPPENED SIX MONTHS AGO AND NOW THE
5 RESUBMISSIONS WHICH IS THE SUBJECT OF THIS LATEST
6 REVIEW.

7 SO BRIEFLY JUST WANT TO SHARE WHAT THE
8 REVIEW CRITERIA THAT THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP USES
9 FOR THIS REMIND COMPETITION. THE REVIEWERS EVALUATE
10 AND ASK WHETHER THE PROJECT HOLDS THE NECESSARY
11 SIGNIFICANCE AND POTENTIAL FOR IMPACT. WHETHER THE
12 PROPOSAL IS INNOVATIVE, HAS A SOUND RATIONALE, IS
13 WELL-PLANNED AND DESIGNED, IS FEASIBLE, AND UPHOLDS
14 THE PRINCIPLES OF DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION.

15 THE PANEL COMPOSITION INCLUDES OUR 15
16 SCIENTIFIC MEMBERS THAT ARE APPOINTED TO THE PANEL
17 BASED ON THEIR EXPERTISE, IN THIS CASE IN
18 NEUROPSYCHIATRIC DISORDERS. THEY CONDUCT THE
19 SCIENTIFIC EVALUATION AND ENTER THE SCIENTIFIC
20 SCORES FOR EVERY APPLICATION. WE ALSO HAVE OUR
21 GRANTS WORKING GROUP BOARD MEMBERS. SO THOSE ARE
22 OUR PATIENT ADVOCATE OR NURSE MEMBERS WHO
23 PARTICIPATE ON THE PANEL AND PROVIDE THE PATIENT
24 PERSPECTIVE ON SIGNIFICANCE AND POTENTIAL IMPACT AS
25 WELL AS PROVIDE OVERSIGHT ON THE PROCESS.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WE ALSO INCLUDE, AS NEEDED, SPECIALISTS,
2 SO SCIENTIFIC EXPERTS IN SPECIALIZED AREAS AS NEEDED
3 TO FILL IN ANY KNOWLEDGE GAPS THAT MAY BE NECESSARY
4 FOR THE REVIEW.

5 OKAY. SO WE'RE GOING TO START WITH WHAT
6 HAPPENED SIX MONTHS AGO. IN AUGUST WE CAME TO YOU
7 WITH THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP
8 FROM THE INITIAL REVIEW OF THE REMIND-L
9 APPLICATIONS. WE HAD AT THAT TIME 26 SUBMISSIONS
10 THAT WERE REVIEWED. THERE WERE FIVE APPLICATIONS
11 THAT EARNED A SCORE OF 1, NINE APPLICATIONS THAT HAD
12 A SCORE OF 2, NEEDING IMPROVEMENT, AND 12 THAT GOT A
13 SCORE OF 3, NOT WARRANTING FUNDING.

14 SO FOR THESE THE BOARD, THE APPLICATION
15 REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE, APPROVED FUNDING OF THOSE FIVE
16 APPLICATIONS WITH A SCORE OF 1 FOR THE TOTAL AMOUNT
17 OF 67.5 MILLION. SO THOSE APPLICATIONS ARE NOW IN
18 THE PROCESS OF BEING LAUNCHED. SOME HAVE LAUNCHED.
19 SO THOSE HAVE AND ARE MOVING FORWARD.

20 THE 12 THAT RECEIVED A SCORE OF 3 WERE NOT
21 FUNDED. AND THEN THE NINE THAT RECEIVED A SCORE OF
22 2 WERE INVITED TO REVISE AND RESUBMIT. AND THIS WAS
23 NOTING THAT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE FUNDS THAT
24 WERE ALLOCATED TO THIS CYCLE OF 88.2 MILLION AND THE
25 67.5 THAT UTILIZED BY THE FIVE APPLICATIONS LEAVES

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU WITH ABOUT 20 MILLION OR SO WITH WHICH WE COULD
2 FUND ONE OR TWO ADDITIONAL. SO KNOWING THAT, THOSE
3 NINE APPLICATIONS WERE INVITED TO RESUBMIT.

4 SO THE STATUS OF THAT IS THAT THOSE
5 APPLICATIONS, EIGHT OUT OF THE NINE INVITED
6 APPLICATIONS ACTUALLY SUBMITTED, AND THOSE WERE
7 REVIEWED BY THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP. AND THE FOCUS
8 OF THE REVIEW, THEN, WAS TO EVALUATE AND SCORE THE
9 RESUBMISSIONS THAT WOULD ADDRESS CONCERNS FROM
10 REVIEWERS FROM THE ORIGINAL REVIEW. AND SO THE
11 APPLICANTS PROVIDED A REVISION DOCUMENT, REDLINE
12 PROPOSAL OF WHAT CHANGES THEY WOULD MAKE. AND THEN
13 WE ALSO PROVIDED THE INITIAL REVIEW SUMMARY DOCUMENT
14 TO THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP FOR REFERENCE OF THE
15 CONCERNS THAT WERE ORIGINALLY RAISED.

16 ALL RIGHT. SO NOW WE COME TO THE
17 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP
18 PERTAINING TO THE RESUBMISSIONS. SO OF THE EIGHT
19 APPLICATIONS THAT CAME BACK WITH A REVISED
20 APPLICATION, THREE OF THOSE RECEIVED A SCORE OF 1,
21 FOUR RECEIVED A SCORE OF 2, AND ONE RECEIVED A SCORE
22 OF 3. THE TOTAL APPLICANT REQUEST FOR THE THREE
23 THAT RECEIVED A SCORE OF 1 IS 30.8 MILLION. THE
24 FUNDS AVAILABLE ARE 20.675 MILLION. SO IT'S NOT
25 POSSIBLE FOR US TO FUND ALL THREE THAT RECEIVED A

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SCORE OF 1.

2 SO AS SUCH, THE CIRM TEAM LOOKED AT THOSE
3 THREE APPLICATIONS THAT RECEIVED A SCORE OF 1 TO
4 IDENTIFY IF WE HAVE A RECOMMENDATION OF WHICH ONES
5 SHOULD BE FUNDED. SO IN LOOKING AT THIS, WE LOOKED
6 PRIMARILY TO THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP SCORE AND THE
7 RANK ORDER. AND AS YOU CAN SEE, THERE ARE TWO
8 APPLICATIONS THAT HAD A UNANIMOUS SCORE OF 1, IN ONE
9 CASE 15 MEMBERS VOTING IN FAVOR AND 14 IN THE OTHER
10 ONE. THE THIRD APPLICATION, 16400, RECEIVED A SCORE
11 OF 1, HAD A SPLIT VOTE OF EIGHT VERSUS SEVEN.

12 SO OUR RECOMMENDATION IS TO FUND THE ONES
13 WITH A UNANIMOUS SCORE AND NOT THE ONE THAT HAD THE
14 SPLIT VOTE. BUT BEYOND THE SCORE, THE FIRST TWO
15 APPLICATIONS DO BRING SOMETHING THAT IS DIFFERENT OR
16 UNIQUE COMPARED TO THE FIVE THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN
17 FUNDED OR ARE BEING LAUNCHED. THE FIRST ONE FOCUSES
18 ON THE NEUROVASCULATURE AND METABOLISM IN AUTISM
19 SPECTRUM DISEASE. AND THE SECOND ONE ON
20 MICRODELETION SYNDROMES. THE THIRD ONE HAS MANY
21 ELEMENTS THAT ARE PART OF PROPOSALS THAT WERE FUNDED
22 IN THE INITIAL ROUND.

23 IN ADDITION, THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP HAD
24 CONCERNS ABOUT THE LAST AIM, WHICH RELATED TO THE
25 AIM WHERE ALL OF THE DATA THAT WAS COLLECTED IN THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PREVIOUS AIMS WOULD COME TOGETHER IN ORDER TO BETTER
2 UNDERSTAND THE OUTCOMES AND PROPOSED POTENTIAL
3 THERAPEUTIC LEADS. AND SO THAT WAS THE WEAKEST PART
4 THAT THEY FOUND AND PREDOMINANTLY THE REASON FOR
5 THAT SPLIT VOTE.

6 SO GIVEN THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES, THE CIRM
7 TEAM IS RECOMMENDING THE FUNDING OF THE TOP TWO
8 APPLICATIONS: 16337 AND 16345. AND SO THOSE ARE
9 RECOMMENDATIONS, AND I'LL TURN IT BACK IT YOU.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, GIL, FOR
11 THAT PRESENTATION AND YOUR EXPLANATIONS. SO I'M
12 LOOKING FOR A MOTION.

13 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I'D LIKE TO MAKE A
14 MOTION ACTUALLY TO NOT FUND THOSE THAT ARE NOT
15 RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING AND START THERE.

16 MR. TOCHER: TO CLARIFY, THAT'S THE GRANTS
17 WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS TO NOT FUND.

18 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: GRANTS WORKING
19 GROUP RECOMMENDATION TO NOT FUND --

20 MR. TOCHER: CORRECT.

21 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: -- THOSE THAT WERE
22 NOT RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING. THANK YOU, SCOTT, FOR
23 THE CLARIFICATION.

24 DR. SAMBRANO: I APOLOGIZE. I FORGOT TO
25 SHOW THE SLIDE WHICH HAS JUST THE CONFLICTS JUST FOR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOLKS TO TAKE NOTICE OF IN TERMS OF DISCUSSION.

2 AND THEN LASTLY, THIS IS THE LIST OF
3 APPLICATIONS JUST FOR YOUR REFERENCE SO THAT YOU CAN
4 SEE THEM MORE CLEARLY AS YOU DISCUSS THEM.

5 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I NEED A SECOND TO
6 MARIA'S MOTION.

7 DR. SOUTHARD: SECOND.

8 MR. TOCHER: MARV SOUTHARD.

9 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. OKAY.
10 THE DISCUSSION IS OPEN FOR BOARD. MARIA, WOULD YOU
11 LIKE TO --

12 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I WOULD JUST LIKE
13 TO MAKE THE MOTION AND HAVE THE BOARD VOTE ON THAT
14 MOTION.

15 MR. TOCHER: RIGHT. I THINK IT WILL HELP
16 FACILITATE DISCUSSION OF THE REMAINING APPLICATIONS
17 BY MEMBERS WHO MIGHT OTHERWISE HAVE A CONFLICT.

18 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. SO RIGHT NOW
19 WE'RE LOOKING FOR COMMENT FROM BOARD MEMBERS. I SEE
20 ANNE-MARIE'S HAND. YES.

21 DR. DULIEGE: THANK YOU, GIL, AGAIN, FOR,
22 AS USUAL, AN EXCELLENT PRESENTATION AND VERY CLEAR
23 DATA THAT WE CAN HAVE ACCESS TO. SO SIMPLY IN
24 REGARDS TO THE LAST APPLICATION, 16400, I APPRECIATE
25 THE RECOMMENDATION COMING FROM THE CIRM TEAM. IS IT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 BOTH BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE MONEY TO FUND THE
2 THREE AND THE FACT THAT, COMPARED TO THE OTHER
3 APPLICATIONS, THIS ONE HAD SOME SUBOPTIMAL ASPECTS
4 TO IT? IS THE COMBINATION OF THESE TWO FACTORS THAT
5 JUSTIFY THE CIRM --

6 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ANNE-MARIE, SORRY.
7 THE MOTION IS NOT TO FUND --

8 DR. DULIEGE: OKAY. I JUMPED A LITTLE TOO
9 QUICKLY.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YOU'RE UP IN THE
11 GROUP.

12 DR. DULIEGE: SORRY FOR THAT. I WILL COM
13 UP. I THINK YOU GOT MY QUESTIONS.

14 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU,
15 ANNE-MARIE.

16 MR. TOCHER: VITO, SORRY. POINT OF ORDER.
17 I THINK THE SHADING IS VERY DIFFICULT TO SEE FOR
18 MEMBERS IN THE ROOM, THAT THE FIRST APPLICATION
19 BELOW THE LAST GREEN HIGHLIGHTED ONE IS IN A
20 DIFFERENT COLOR. THAT IS NOT THE SUBJECT OF THIS
21 MOTION. THAT'S 16400 WHICH LOOKS LIKE IT'S COLORED
22 IN SLIGHTLY OFF-WHITE. SO THIS MOTION IS WITH
23 RESPECT TO --

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THE LOWER FIVE.

25 MR. TOCHER: -- 16360 AND DESCENDING.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. DULIEGE: OKAY. THANK YOU. I'LL
2 WAIT.

3 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU.
4 CONVERSATION FROM BOARD MEMBERS ON MARIAS'S MOTION
5 TO NOT FUND THE BOTTOM FIVE? NOT HEARING THAT, ANY
6 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS MOTION?

7 MS. MANDAC: WE DO HAVE HANDS RAISED. I
8 JUST WANT TO CONFIRM ALL OF THE INDIVIDUALS WITH
9 HANDS RAISED, ARE YOU COMMENTING ON THE LAST FIVE
10 APPLICATIONS ON THIS LIST DISPLAYED ON THE SCREEN?
11 BECAUSE I RECOGNIZE TWO OF YOU AS APPLICATIONS ABOVE
12 THOSE FIVE. SO IF YOU'RE ONLY COMMENTING ON DISC
13 16360 AND BELOW, PLEASE KEEP YOUR HAND RAISED. IF
14 YOU ARE NOT COMMENTING ON ONE OF THOSE, PLEASE LOWER
15 YOUR HANDS. OKAY.

16 SO WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT. IT IS A
17 PHONE NUMBER: 415-640-8961. WE WILL HAVE A TIMER.
18 YOU WILL HAVE THREE MINUTES. WE WILL MUTE YOU AS
19 SOON AS THE THREE MINUTES IS OVER. SO PLEASE PAY
20 ATTENTION TO THE CLOCK ON YOUR SCREEN. YOUR TIME
21 STARTS NOW. PHONE NUMBER 415-640-8961, YOU WILL
22 NEED TO UNMUTE IF LIKE TO PARTICIPATE IN PUBLIC
23 COMMENT. ALL RIGHT.

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: NOTHING IS COMING
25 THROUGH?

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MS. MANDAC: NO.

2 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ALL RIGHT. OKAY.
3 NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IS SPEAKING ON THIS. WE CAN
4 PROCEED TO A VOTE. SCOTT, IF YOU WILL JUST STATE
5 THE MOTION AGAIN FOR CLARITY.

6 MR. TOCHER: SURE. JUST MAKING SURE WE'RE
7 CLEAR FOR CONFLICTS. THE MOTION IS TO NOT FUND THE
8 APPLICATIONS THAT THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP RECOMMEND
9 TO FUND WHICH ARE THE BOTTOM FIVE OF THE LIST THAT
10 YOU SEE; I.E., NOT INCLUDING 16337, 16345, OR 16400.

11 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

12 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

13 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.

14 DR. CHOU: YES.

15 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.

16 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.

17 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.

18 DR. DULIEGE: YES.

19 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.

20 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.

21 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

22 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

23 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.

25 MR. TOCHER: SORRY. I WANT TO CHECK.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: I WAS A BIT CONFUSED
2 WHEN I WAS CALLED I'M ON THE CONFLICT LIST.

3 MR. TOCHER: SORRY. WE HAD AN OLD LIST.
4 I'M SORRY. WE'LL CORRECT THAT ON THE RECORD.

5 RICH LAJARA.

6 MR. LAJARA: YES.

7 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.

8 DR. PADILLA: YES.

9 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.

10 MR. PANETTA: YES.

11 MR. TOCHER: MARV SOUTHARD.

12 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.

13 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.

14 MS. WYTE: YES.

15 MR. TOCHER: AND KEVIN XU.

16 DR. XU: YES.

17 MR. TOCHER. GREAT. THANK YOU. THE
18 MOTION CARRIES.

19 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. FLOOR IS
20 NOW OPEN TO A MOTION FOR THE REMAINING APPLICATIONS.
21 I WOULD SUGGEST THE PERSON MAKING THE MOTION
22 CONSIDER THE BUDGETARY CONSTRAINTS.

23 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: PAT HAS A
24 QUESTION.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: PAT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. LEVITT: SORRY. I CAN MAKE A MOTION.

2 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: IF YOU WANT TO MAKE
3 A COMMENT FIRST.

4 DR. LEVITT: THANK YOU.

5 MR. TOCHER: NO.

6 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YOU CAN'T MAKE A
7 MOTION, BUT YOU CAN COMMENT.

8 DR. LEVITT: I CAN COMMENT ABOUT --

9 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.

10 DR. LEVITT: THANK YOU.

11 DR. DULIEGE: I CAN MAKE THE MOTION.

12 DR. LEVITT: I'M READY TO GO. SO CAN YOU
13 HEAR ME?

14 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YEAH.

15 DR. LEVITT: OKAY. SO THIS IS RELATED TO
16 DISC 16400 WHICH WAS RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING. IT
17 DID HAVE A SPLIT VOTE IN TERMS OF TIER. I'LL FIRST
18 POINT OUT WHAT THE STUDY IS ABOUT. THE STUDY
19 INCLUDES ADDRESSING THE ETIOLOGY FROM THE
20 DEVELOPMENTAL PERSPECTIVE OF BOTH AUTISM AND
21 SCHIZOPHRENIA.

22 AS FAR AS I KNOW, AND I DON'T KNOW THE
23 COMPLETE PROFILE OF GRANTS, BUT I WAS ON THE
24 NEUROSCIENCE TASK FORCE, CHAIRED IT FOR SEVERAL
25 MEETINGS. WE HAVE ALMOST NOTHING IN PSYCHOSIS,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ALMOST ZERO, AND IT MAY BE ZERO. IN ADDITION TO
2 WHICH IT IS A STUDY THAT IS FOCUSED ON
3 AFRICAN-AMERICAN PATIENT SAMPLES, WHICH IS
4 EXTRAORDINARILY UNUSUAL IN THIS FIELD. ALMOST ALL
5 THE INFORMATION WE HAVE IN TRANSCRIPTOMICS AND
6 GENETICS IS NORTHERN EUROPEAN WHITE. THERE ARE
7 SEVERAL STUDIES ONGOING NOW THAT INCLUDE
8 AFRICAN-AMERICANS AND LATINAE POPULATIONS WITH
9 COMPLEX ANCESTRIES.

10 SO THIS IS ADDRESSING, FROM MY
11 PERSPECTIVE, A MAJOR BOTTLENECK. AND THAT'S USED IN
12 THE REVIEWS, IF YOU READ THE REVIEWS, IN TERMS OF
13 PSYCHOSIS ETIOLOGY AND IN TERMS OF THE POPULATION
14 THAT IS INCLUDED PROBABLY FOR THE FIRST TIME AT
15 CIRM, CERTAINLY AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL.

16 IF YOU GO DOWN AND LOOK AT DOES THE
17 PROJECT HOLD THE NECESSARY SIGNIFICANCE AND
18 POTENTIAL IMPACT, THE VOTE WAS 13 TO 1. IS THE
19 PROPOSAL INNOVATIVE, 13 TO 1. IS THE RATIONALE
20 SOUND, 14 TO 0. IS THE PROJECT WELL-PLANNED AND
21 DESIGNED, 9 TO 5. THAT'S FIRST TIER, SECOND TIER.
22 AND THE FIVE REALLY FOCUSED ON, AND I DON'T HAVE THE
23 GRANT, I DIDN'T READ THE GRANT, BUT REALLY FOCUSED
24 ON THE ANALYTICAL PART OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE OF
25 PUTTING ALL THIS DATA TOGETHER. THERE WERE LOTS OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 COMMENTS ABOUT THE HIGH THROUGHPUT TECHNOLOGY THAT
2 IS PROPOSED HERE. AND, AGAIN, I DON'T KNOW THE
3 DETAILS. IS THE PROJECT FEASIBLE, 13 TO 1. DOES
4 THE PROJECT UPHOLD THE PRINCIPLES OF DIVERSITY,
5 EQUITY, AND INCLUSION, 14/0.

6 SO WHEN I READ THOSE AND A FEW RED FLAGS
7 THAT I'LL MENTION, SO FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T
8 KNOW, I'M A DEVELOPMENTAL NEUROSCIENTIST. MY LAB
9 WAS THE FIRST TO DO TRANSCRIPTOME ANALYSIS FOR
10 SCHIZOPHRENIA IN 2000. SO I KNOW A BIT ABOUT THIS
11 FIELD. I'M A GRADUATE OF UCSD AS WELL. I WANTED TO
12 POINT THAT OUT.

13 THERE'S SEVERAL THINGS. ONE IS THAT THERE
14 ARE COMMENTS IN HERE ABOUT HOW THE MODEL MAY BE
15 RELEVANT FOR AUTISM BECAUSE IT'S A
16 NEURODEVELOPMENTAL DISORDER, MAYBE NOT FOR
17 SCHIZOPHRENIA, WHICH, OF COURSE, IS A
18 NEURODEVELOPMENTAL DISORDER. AND IF YOU LOOK AT THE
19 STUDIES THAT HAVE BEEN DONE OVER THE LAST DECADE,
20 WHOLE GENOME SEQUENCING ANALYSES, POLYGENIC RISK
21 SCORES, ET CETERA, THERE ARE LARGE SETS OF GENES
22 THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED THAT ARE RISK FOR
23 SCHIZOPHRENIA. AND EXPRESSION, THE ENRICHMENT OF
24 EXPRESSION IS SECOND TRIMESTER PRENATAL.

25 AND I'VE WRITTEN ABOUT THIS AND OTHERS

1 HAVE AS WELL. THIS IS A PRENATAL COMPONENT. SO
2 THIS MODEL IS -- THERE'S NOTHING IN THE LITERATURE
3 THAT SAYS AN IPSC MODEL OR AN ORGANOID MODEL IS
4 INAPPROPRIATE FOR SCHIZOPHRENIA BASED ON THE
5 BIOLOGY.

6 IN TERMS OF THE CRITICISMS OF THE
7 ANALYTICS, I'M SENSITIVE TO THIS BECAUSE WE'VE BEEN
8 DOING ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE AND MACHINE LEARNING
9 ON DATA ANALYSIS SINCE 2015. THE FIELD IS OLD. AND
10 I CAN TELL YOU THAT, JUST FROM MY EXPERIENCE AND
11 FROM DEALING WITH THIS IN A VERY BROAD WAY, DEEP
12 WAY, ACROSS BIOMEDICAL DISCIPLINES, THE AI AND
13 MACHINE LEARNING APPROACHES THAT WERE USED SIX
14 MONTHS AGO ARE DIFFERENT THAN THEY ARE NOW. THEY'RE
15 DIFFERENT NOW THAN THEY WERE EVEN SIX MONTHS AGO.

16 AND SO THERE'S SOME COMMENTS IN HERE ABOUT
17 ONE OF THE REVIEWERS PREDICTING THAT THIS IS GOING
18 TO FAIL BECAUSE OF WHATEVER THE APPROACH WAS. AND I
19 CAN'T COMMENT ON THE SPECIFICS. I HAVEN'T SEEN
20 THEM. BUT I THINK THAT IS MAKING A CASE THAT AN
21 INDIVIDUAL CAN ACTUALLY PREDICT WHAT AI MODELS -- AI
22 MODELS BY DEFINITION ARE MEANT TO BE FLEXIBLE,
23 ADAPTABLE, AND DEPEND EXCLUSIVELY ON DATA TO TRAIN
24 THE AI MODEL IN THE FIRST PLACE. AND SO THAT CAN'T
25 BE DONE UNTIL YOU HAVE THE DATA, AND THE ANALYTICS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THAT WILL OCCUR SIX MONTHS FROM NOW OR A YEAR FROM
2 NOW ARE GOING TO BE DIFFERENT, THERE'S NO DOUBT
3 ABOUT IT, THAN WHAT THIS GROUP OR ANY OTHER GROUP
4 PROPOSES TO DO IN THEIR STUDIES.

5 SO THAT'S THE CHALLENGE IN TERMS OF
6 REVIEWING THE ANALYTICAL PART BECAUSE WE KNOW IT'S A
7 MOVING OBJECT. IT'S REALLY HARD. SO I CAN SPEAK TO
8 THE SCIENCE. OF COURSE, I CAN SPEAK TO THE FACT
9 THAT WE HAVE PART OF A PROPOSITION TO DEAL WITH.
10 I'M CONCERNED ABOUT WE HAVE ALMOST NOTHING IN
11 PSYCHOSIS STILL AND WE'VE HAD SEVERAL YEARS OF THE
12 NEUROSCIENCE TASK FORCE DEALING WITH THIS. AND I
13 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE REMEDIES ARE FOR THIS.

14 BUT WHEN I LOOK AT THE REVIEWS OF THIS AND
15 CONSIDERING THE POPULATION AND THE FOCUS ON
16 PSYCHOSIS, I THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE SOME
17 CONVERSATION ABOUT HOW TO ADDRESS THIS.

18 IF IT'S THE STANDARD WAY IN WHICH A
19 REVISION IS HANDLED, YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT A DELAY OF
20 A YEAR OR MORE IN TERMS OF HOW LONG IT WOULD TAKE TO
21 COME BACK. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S THE CASE OR NOT
22 HERE, GIL. BUT I'LL STOP THERE AND HAVE OTHERS IF
23 THEY WANT TO COMMENT.

24 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: SO I THINK THE
25 PROBLEM IS THAT IT'S A BUDGETARY CONSTRAINT, AND

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THIS BUDGET IS LIMITED. AND SO I THINK OTHERWISE,
2 IF THERE HAD BEEN MORE IN THE BUDGET, IT WOULD HAVE
3 GONE THROUGH. SO I UNDERSTAND YOUR POINT, BUT WE'RE
4 CONSTRAINED BY A SPECIFIC BUDGET AMOUNT.

5 I DON'T KNOW HOW TO WEIGH IN ON IT OTHER
6 THAN THE TEAM WENT WITH THE TWO THAT WERE
7 RECOMMENDED. SO THAT'S WHERE THE PROBLEM IS. IT'S
8 NOT THAT THEY DIDN'T FIND THIS MERITORIOUS. IT'S
9 THAT THERE WAS NOT ENOUGH OF A BUDGET.

10 DR. LEVITT: SO CAN I REPLY? CAN I ASK A
11 QUESTION?

12 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YEAH. YOU CAN DO
13 WHATEVER YOU WANT, PAT.

14 DR. LEVITT: NO, I CAN'T.

15 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: ALMOST EVERYTHING.

16 DR. LEVITT: NO, I CAN'T. NOT IN MY
17 PRIVATE LIFE OR IN MY PROFESSIONAL LIFE, ESPECIALLY
18 MY PRIVATE LIFE.

19 I DON'T KNOW HOW THE BUDGETS ARE MANAGED.
20 I JUST KNOW AT A FEDERAL LEVEL BUDGET REQUESTS ARE
21 MANAGED IN A VERY PROACTIVE WAY BY PROGRAM
22 DIRECTORS. THESE BUDGETS ARE MODIFIED ALL THE TIME,
23 ALL THE TIME. I DON'T KNOW IF CIRM DOES THAT OR
24 WHETHER THE REQUEST THAT COMES IN IS THE REQUEST
25 THAT IS UTILIZED TO THEN DETERMINE WHAT THE BUDGET

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IS GOING TO BE OR WHETHER THERE'S A WAY OF --
2 THERE'S GOING TO BE MORE ON REMIND ACTIVITY GOING
3 ON; IS THAT RIGHT, GIL?

4 DR. SAMBRANO: YES, THAT'S RIGHT.

5 DR. LEVITT: YEAH. SO THERE'S GOING TO BE
6 MORE GRANTS COMING THROUGH, RIGHT, IN RESPONSE TO
7 THE 1.5 BILLION, 1.4 BILLION?

8 DR. SAMBRANO: RIGHT. SO LET ME JUST
9 CLARIFY IN TERMS OF THE BUDGET. THE WAY IT WORKS IS
10 WE HAVE AN ANNUAL BUDGET THAT THE BOARD APPROVES.
11 AND SO WE ALLOCATED SPECIFICALLY A GIVEN AMOUNT FOR
12 THIS INITIAL ROUND. SO WE STAY WITHIN THAT
13 ALLOCATED BUDGET THAT WAS APPROVED BY THE BOARD, AND
14 THAT'S BEEN OUR PRACTICE.

15 SO TO THE EXTENT THAT THERE WOULD BE
16 FLEXIBILITY IS IF THERE ARE FUNDS THAT REMAIN. AND
17 AS YOU'VE OBSERVED IN MANY CASES NOW, WE HAVE THE
18 ISSUE THAT THERE ARE MORE GRANT APPLICATIONS THAT
19 RECEIVE A FUNDABLE THAN WE CAN ACTUALLY COVER. SO
20 IT DOES MAKE THE DECISION-MAKING VERY DIFFICULT AND
21 CHALLENGING FOR EVERYONE. SO THAT UNFORTUNATELY IS
22 THE SITUATION HERE.

23 DR. LEVITT: CAN I ASK IF -- SO IF THE
24 TEAM LOOKED AT THIS AND LOOKED AT WHAT WE HAVE
25 COVERAGE IN TERMS OF AUTISM SPECTRUM DISORDER, WHICH

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE OTHER TWO ARE ABOUT, THE MICRODELETION AND THE
2 VASCULAR ONES -- AND I'M NOT GOING TO COMMENT ABOUT
3 THOSE. I READ ALL THROUGH THOSE IN GREAT DETAIL --
4 WHAT WAS THE TEAM'S CONSIDERATION IN TERMS OF THE
5 FOCUS THAT ONE OF THE TWO AREAS OF FOCUS FOR THIS
6 OTHER GRANT IS PSYCHOSIS AND THAT IT'S AN
7 AFRICAN-AMERICAN CLINICAL POPULATION THAT'S GOING TO
8 BE STUDIED? THAT'S CRITICAL BECAUSE WE KNOW FROM
9 PHARMACOGENOMICS THAT BOTH INCLUSION OF DIVERSITY
10 BOTH IN TERMS OF SEX AND IN TERMS OF THE ANCESTRY
11 MATTERS A LOT IN TERMS OF TREATMENTS THAT ARE GOING
12 TO COME DOWN THE PIKE.

13 DR. SAMBRANO: SO THAT'S A FAIR QUESTION.
14 AND WE DID CONSIDER THAT IN TERMS OF WHAT ELSE WE
15 FUNDED. SO I BRIEFLY MENTIONED THAT THERE WERE FIVE
16 APPLICATIONS THAT WERE FUNDED INITIALLY BEFORE THESE
17 HAD THEIR RESUBMISSIONS. AND SO LOOKING ACROSS
18 THOSE, THERE ARE SEVERAL THAT ARE DOING HIGH
19 THROUGHPUT PHENOTYPING OF RISK GENES, MOST OF THEM.
20 SO THERE'S FOUR PROJECTS THAT ARE FOCUSED ON AUTISM,
21 TWO ON SCHIZOPHRENIA. AND SO A LOT OF THE GENERAL
22 ELEMENTS ARE COVERED EVEN THOUGH IT MAY NOT BE
23 EXACTLY THE SAME.

24 SOME ARE GENERATING IPSC LINES FROM
25 DIVERSE GROUPS, NOT IN THE SAME WAY AS PROPOSED HERE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 BECAUSE I THINK THE WAY IT'S PROPOSED HERE IS RATHER
2 UNIQUE, BUT IN A GENERAL SENSE, THERE ARE OTHERS
3 THAT ARE ATTEMPTING TO DO SOME MORE THINGS.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I HAVE TWO SPEAKERS.
5 JOE PANETTA IS GOING TO BE FIRST FOLLOWED BY DR.
6 CARETHERS. JOE, ARE YOU ON THE LINE?

7 MR. PANETTA: THANKS, VITO. I'VE JUST GOT
8 A BASIC QUESTION SO THAT WE UNDERSTAND THIS. I KNOW
9 THESE ARE RESUBMISSIONS, BUT, GIL, IS THIS THE TOTAL
10 AMOUNT AVAILABLE FOR THE YEAR SO THAT THIS CANNOT BE
11 CONSIDERED AGAIN BECAUSE THERE ARE ABSOLUTELY NO
12 ADDITIONAL FUNDS AVAILABLE?

13 DR. SAMBRANO: WELL, CORRECT. FOR THIS
14 CYCLE, THIS COMPETITION, THAT IS THE MAXIMUM AMOUNT
15 THAT WE CAN EXPEND ON THIS. SO UNTIL THE NEXT
16 ITERATION OF REMIND COMES BACK, AND I BELIEVE, AND
17 ROSA CAN MAYBE SPEAK TO THIS, THE EXPECTATION IS
18 THAT THESE PROJECTS WOULD LIKELY BE ELIGIBLE FOR
19 COMING BACK WHEN THAT REOPENS.

20 MR. PANETTA: OKAY. THANKS. SO THERE IS
21 THE OPPORTUNITY FOR THIS TO COME BACK?

22 DR. SAMBRANO: YES.

23 MR. PANETTA: THANK YOU.

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: DR. CARETHERS.

25 DR. CARETHERS: I HAVE A VERY SIMILAR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 QUESTION. MY QUESTION SIMPLY WAS I NOTICE IT'S A
2 SECOND SUBMISSION. CAN IT COME BACK WHEN FUNDS ARE
3 AVAILABLE? SO EXACTLY THE SAME QUESTION. MOST --
4 FOR INSTANCE, AND THIS IS MY FIRST TIME HERE, BUT
5 MOST NIH GRANTS, EITHER YOU GET A FIRST CHANCE, A
6 SECOND CHANCE; BUT THEN, IF YOU REPACKAGE IT, IT CAN
7 COME IN AS A NEW GRANT. SO I DIDN'T KNOW WHAT THE
8 OPTIONS WERE FOR CERTAIN.

9 DR. LEVITT: WHAT'S THE TIMELINE?

10 DR. CANET-AVILES: SO JUST TO CLARIFY, AS
11 THE BOARD IS AWARE, WE HAVE -- AS PART OF THE
12 STRATEGIC ALLOCATION FRAMEWORK, WE ARE COMING IN THE
13 MARCH BOARD THAT WILL BE IN SACRAMENTO WITH NEW
14 CONCEPTS. AND PART OF THAT, WE ARE REVAMPING THIS
15 FORM, WHICH IS THE REMIND, AND THERE WILL BE MORE
16 OPPORTUNITIES COMING IN THE LATE SPRING FOR DISC
17 GRANTS. SO IF THE BOARD APPROVES AND THE BUDGET
18 THAT GOES WITH IT, THEN THERE WILL BE MORE
19 OPPORTUNITIES.

20 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, ROSA.

21 J.T.

22 DR. THOMAS: SO THIS COMMENT IS MAINLY FOR
23 THE NEWER BOARD MEMBERS JUST SO YOU'RE AWARE THAT
24 FROM TIME TO TIME THIS ISSUE COMES UP WHERE WE DON'T
25 HAVE ENOUGH FUNDING TO COVER PROJECTS RECOMMENDED

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR FUNDING. AND SOMEBODY, AT LEAST IN THE BACK OF
2 THEIR MIND, SAID WHY DON'T WE JUST INCREASE THE
3 BUDGET? AND I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT IT HAS ALWAYS
4 BEEN CIRM'S PRACTICE, AND HERE I'M CHANNELING FRED
5 FISHER AND STEVE JUELSGAARD, TO STICK TO BUDGETARY
6 DISCIPLINE AND NOT GET INVOLVED IN TRYING ON THE FLY
7 TO INCREASE BUDGETS TO ACCOMMODATE SITUATIONS LIKE
8 THIS.

9 SO I STRONGLY RECOMMEND THAT WE ADHERE TO
10 THE BUDGET THAT THE BOARD HAS PASSED AND DEAL WITH
11 THIS WHEN IT COMES BACK FOR RESUBMISSION.

12 DR. LEVITT: I WOULD JUST -- CAN I RESPOND
13 TO THAT?

14 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: PAT, YOU MAY SPEAK
15 AGAIN, YES.

16 DR. LEVITT: OKAY. SO MY COMMENTS ARE
17 FRAMED IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT WE'RE RESPONSIBLE FOR
18 IN TERMS OF PROPOSITION 14 AND THE EXTRAORDINARY
19 AMOUNT OF WORK THAT WENT INTO THE NEUROSCIENCE TASK
20 FORCE, AND THE DISCIPLINE THAT WE HAVE TO HAVE IN
21 TERMS OF TRYING TO ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS, WHICH WE
22 KNOW FROM THE TASK FORCE, ARE GOING TO BE
23 EXTRAORDINARILY DIFFICULT UNDER THE BEST OF
24 CIRCUMSTANCES. SO WHILE I AM IN MY ENTIRE CAREER
25 TRYING TO BE AS FISCALLY RESPONSIBLE AS POSSIBLE,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AND I EMBRACE THAT. J.T., YOU KNOW THAT. I'M JUST
2 QUITE WORRIED ABOUT MEETING THOSE GOALS AND THE
3 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT CAME OUT OF THE TASK FORCE.

4 AND SO -- AND I WAS MOST -- AND THAT IS MY
5 FRAME FOR, THEN, LOOKING AT THIS AND SAYING THERE
6 ARE SOME EXTRAORDINARILY UNIQUE COMPONENTS TO THIS
7 THAT ACTUALLY MEET SO MANY OF THE GOALS THAT GIL PUT
8 UP ON THE SCREEN IN TERMS OF REMIND AND IN TERMS OF
9 ADDRESSING THAT PART OF THE PROPOSITION.

10 SO I'LL STOP THERE, BUT I JUST -- IT IS
11 THE CASE THAT AT THE NIH OR THE NSF OR FEDERAL
12 AGENCIES, THE TURNAROUND TIME IS ABOUT ANYWHERE
13 BETWEEN THREE AND SIX MONTHS. YOU GET YOUR REVIEWS
14 BACK, YOU ADDRESS THEM ON A SECOND PAGE, AND THEN
15 YOU RESUBMIT. RIGHT? AND IF IT'S GOING TO BE THE
16 CASE THAT THIS IS GOING TO COME BACK IN THE SPRING,
17 OKAY. BUT I JUST NEEDED FOR FOLKS TO RECOGNIZE
18 WHERE WE ARE IN TERMS OF THE NEURO INITIATIVE AND
19 PARTICULARLY IN THE AREA OF IN NEUROPSYCHIATRY WHERE
20 WE STILL HAVE SUCH A LIMITED PORTFOLIO.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, PAT.
22 THAT WAS REALLY A GREAT CONTRIBUTION TO THIS
23 CONVERSATION.

24 LEADING UP TO THE MOTION, TO MAKE A
25 PECUNIARY PRELUDE, THE NUMBER OF DOLLARS INVOLVED IN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE TOTAL APPLICANT REQUEST, ONCE AGAIN FROM GIL'S
2 SLIDE, IS \$30.8 MILLION. THE FUNDS AVAILABLE,
3 HOWEVER, ARE ONLY \$20.6 MILLION. THERE ARE THREE
4 APPLICATIONS WHICH IN ORDER ARE ASKING FOR 10.3,
5 6.25, AND 14.27. THAT'S THE TOTAL OF 30 MILLION.
6 KNOWING THAT, MAY I HAVE A RESOLUTION?

7 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: A MOTION.

8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: A MOTION. THANK
9 YOU.

10 DR. DULIEGE: I MOVE.

11 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: WHAT'S THE MOTION?

12 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: WHAT'S THE MOTION,
13 ANNE-MARIE.

14 DR. DULIEGE: WHAT'S THE MOTION? THAT WE
15 APPROVE THE OR REQUEST NO. 1 AND 2 IN THIS LIST, THE
16 FIRST TWO IN GREEN, AND WE DO NOT APPROVE THE THIRD
17 ONE BECAUSE OF LACK OF FUNDING OR DOES NOT MATTER
18 WHY, BUT JUST TO CLARIFY.

19 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THAT'S CORRECT ON
20 ALL POINTS. AND THAT'S A VERY CLEAR MOTION. THANK
21 YOU. SECOND?

22 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: SECOND.

23 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I HAVE A SECOND FROM
24 MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE. DISCUSSION IS NOW OPEN TO
25 BOARD MEMBERS ON THIS MOTION.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. PANETTA: MR. CHAIR, CAN YOU PLEASE
2 REPEAT THE MOTION? I WASN'T ABLE TO HEAR IT. THANK
3 YOU.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES. JOE, IT'S
5 TO -- ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE MOVED THAT WE MOVE TO FUND
6 THE TOP TWO APPLICATIONS, 16337 AND 16345, AND NOT
7 FUND 16400.

8 MR. PANETTA: THANK YOU.

9 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: AND IT WAS SECONDED.
10 DID ALSO YOU WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT PERHAPS, JOE?

11 MR. PANETTA: YEAH. I WOULD BRIEFLY JUST
12 COMMENT, REALLY FOLLOWING UP ON J.T.'S COMMENT,
13 HAVING BEEN ON THIS BOARD FOR A WHILE, THAT IT'S
14 BEEN OUR PRACTICE TO FOLLOW FISCAL CONSTRAINTS, STAY
15 WITHIN OUR BUDGET. AND I WOULD SUPPORT THE MOTION
16 AND THAT WE CONTINUE TO ADHERE TO THAT PRACTICE.

17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, JOE. ARE
18 WE ARGUING OVER WHO'S NEXT? IS SOMEONE WANTING TO
19 SPEAK? OKAY.

20 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES, YOU CAN.

21 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: I'M SO TENTATIVE TODAY.
22 I APPRECIATE AND RESPECT OUR COLLEAGUES THAT HAVE
23 WEIGHED IN. I KNOW THAT'S NOT AN EASY TASK.
24 THERE'S A LOT OF THINGS TO WEIGH AND THERE'S LIMITED
25 FUNDS. SO I DEFINITELY APPRECIATE THAT. AND I WANT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 TO LIFT UP PAT'S COMMENTS AS WELL. I THINK IT IS
2 REALLY IMPORTANT, REGARDLESS OF THE BUDGET AND ALL
3 OF THE CONSTRAINTS THAT WE MUST WORK WITHIN, IT IS
4 STILL OUR DUTY AS BOARD MEMBERS TO LOOK AT THINGS
5 CRITICALLY EVEN THOUGH THEY'VE ALREADY HAD A REVIEW.
6 AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT IN THE COMMENTS THAT WERE
7 MADE AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO THINK ABOUT THESE
8 PARTICULAR COMMUNITIES AND OUR OPPORTUNITY, MAYBE
9 NOT NOW, BUT LATER TO ADDRESS FUNDING FOR PARTICULAR
10 PROJECTS THAT REALLY FOCUS IN HEALTH EQUITY AND
11 DIVERSITY. SO JUST WANTED TO ADD THOSE COMMENTS.

12 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, LEONDR A.
13 YES, CAROLYN.

14 DR. MELTZER: I UNDERSTAND THE BUDGET
15 CONSTRAINTS. AS THE CO-CHAIR OF THE NEURO TASK
16 FORCE WITH PAT, I JUST WANTED TO LODGE THAT I AGREE.
17 THIS IS A SIGNIFICANTLY IMPORTANT AREA TO LOOK AT.
18 I UNDERSTAND WE CAN'T RIGHT NOW, BUT IT'S IMPORTANT
19 SCIENCE, IMPORTANT GROUP AND WOULD ADD TO THE
20 KNOWLEDGE IN THIS SPACE. THANKS.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. MARVIN.

22 DR. SOUTHARD: I WAS JUST WONDERING IF
23 IT'S POSSIBLE WITHIN THE BUDGET THAT'S AVAILABLE TO
24 APPROACH THEM TO BEGIN SOME PIECES OF THIS PROJECT
25 WITH THE BUDGET THAT WE HAVE AVAILABLE AND THEN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CONTINUE THE REST AT A FURTHER TIME? IS THAT A
2 POSSIBILITY?

3 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I DON'T THINK THAT
4 THE BOARD IS CONSTITUTED IN A WAY THAT WE CAN HAVE
5 THAT DISCUSSION HERE GIVEN OUR BUDGETARY AND OUR
6 PROGRAMMATIC -- DO YOU WANT TO ADD SOMETHING TO
7 THAT? THE CONSTRAINTS --

8 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: MARV, IT'S MORE
9 ALONG THE LINES OF -- AND WE'VE ENCOUNTERED THIS
10 BEFORE -- GIVING THEM A SPECIFIC AMOUNT OF MONEY.
11 IT'S \$2 MILLION THAT'S AVAILABLE. THEY WOULD
12 ACTUALLY HAVE TO APPLY TO TALK ABOUT WHAT THE \$2
13 MILLION, THE GWG WOULD HAVE TO REVIEW THAT IN ORDER
14 TO UNDERSTAND WHETHER OR NOT IT WAS FEASIBLE GIVEN
15 THAT AMOUNT OF MONEY. SO IT CHANGES WHAT THE
16 APPLICATION IS.

17 IN THE PAST THAT'S JUST NOT THE APPROACH
18 THAT WE'VE TAKEN BECAUSE IT WOULD SEEMINGLY BE A NEW
19 APPLICATION THAT THE GWG WOULD HAVE TO REVIEW FOR
20 THAT LIMITED AMOUNT OF MONEY.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: IS THERE ANY MEMBER
22 OF THE PUBLIC THAT WANTS TO SPEAK TO THIS MOTION?

23 MR. TOCHER: THERE ARE TWO.

24 MS. MANDAC: WE HAVE TWO HANDS RAISED FOR
25 THIS ONE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: CLAUDETTE, IF YOU
2 CAN MANAGE THAT.

3 MS. MANDAC: SO WE HAVE TWO HANDS RAISED.
4 WE'LL GO WITH DAN GESHWIND FIRST AND THEN DAVID
5 HAUSSLER. YOU WILL BOTH HAVE THREE MINUTES EACH.
6 THERE IS A TIMER. AND THEY'RE BOTH SPEAKING ABOUT
7 DISC4-16400. IT'S THE THIRD APPLICATION ON THE
8 SCREEN ON THE TOP.

9 DAN, YOUR TIME STARTS NOW.

10 DR. GESCHWIND: CAN YOU HEAR ME?

11 MS. MANDAC: YES.

12 DR. GESCHWIND: GREAT. SO I'M TALKING
13 ABOUT OUR APPLICATION THAT'S JUST BEEN DISCUSSED,
14 THE DISC REMIND 16400. AS YOU SAW, IT RECEIVED A
15 TIER I SCORE BY THE EXPERT SCIENTIFIC REVIEW IN
16 GRANTS WORKING GROUP. AND DESPITE THE
17 RECOMMENDATION THAT IT HAS EXCEPTIONAL MERIT AND
18 WARRANTS FUNDING, IT'S NOT BEING RECOMMENDED BY THE
19 CIRM TEAM FOR FUNDING. AND AS MENTIONED, ABOUT \$4
20 MILLION ARE BEING LEFT ON THE TABLE DESPITE MULTIPLE
21 BOARD MEMBERS ALSO MENTIONING THAT THIS IS A
22 MERITORIOUS GRANT, AND THERE ARE MANY ASPECTS OF
23 THIS THAT SHOULD BE ACTUALLY TAKEN UP.

24 SO THERE'S NO NEED TO CURTAIL THE GRANT.
25 ONE COULD SIMPLY START THE FUNDING, AND THEN IN THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 NEXT BUDGET CYCLE THERE WOULD BE MONEY SINCE THERE'S
2 GOING TO BE REMIND-L AND THIS HAS BEEN RECOMMENDED
3 FOR FUNDING.

4 I JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT SEVERAL REASONS
5 WHY THIS SHOULD BE RECONSIDERED AND THIS IMPORTANT
6 PROJECT FUNDED. A PREEMINENT GOAL OF PROP 14 IS TO
7 DEDICATE 1.5 BILLION FOR DISEASES OF THE BRAIN SUCH
8 AS SCHIZOPHRENIA AND AUTISM. AND OUR PROPOSAL,
9 WHICH AIMS TO IDENTIFY THE DISEASE MECHANISMS
10 UNDERLYING SCHIZOPHRENIA AND AUTISM BY USING STEM
11 CELL MODELS, DIRECTLY ADDRESSES THIS URGENT PROP 14
12 PRIORITY.

13 ANOTHER IS THAT INCREASING THE
14 REPRESENTATION OF GROUPS THAT ARE UNDERREPRESENTED
15 IN BIOMEDICAL RESEARCH RECOGNIZES ANOTHER HIGH
16 PRIORITY. OUR APPLICATION IS UNIQUE IN THIS WAY.
17 WE'RE FOCUSING ON ONE OF THE MOST UNDERREPRESENTED
18 POPULATIONS IN PSYCHIATRIC DISEASE RESEARCH,
19 AFRICAN-AMERICANS. AND WE CREATE, AS THE REVIEWERS
20 STATE, AN UNPRECEDENTED, UNIQUE RESOURCE FOR THE
21 ENTIRE COMMUNITY.

22 THIRDLY, PROP 14 PRIORITIZES DIRECT
23 PATIENT ENGAGEMENT AND OUTREACH ACTIVITIES THAT
24 ENGAGE CALIFORNIA'S DIVERSE COMMUNITIES. OUR
25 PROPOSAL IS THE ONLY ONE THAT BRINGS TOGETHER A

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOCUS ON COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND EDUCATION TO
2 REMEDIATE THE LACK OF ADEQUATE INFORMATION THAT
3 FAMILIES HAVE RECEIVED AS TO THE CRITICAL ROLE OF
4 BIOMEDICAL RESEARCH IN THEIR FAMILY DISORDERS
5 COMBINED WITH OUR WORLD-CLASS EXPERTISE IN
6 NEUROPSYCHIATRIC DISORDER GENETICS, STEM CELL
7 MODELING, AND AI TECHNOLOGIES TO EXECUTE ONE OF THE
8 LARGEST INVESTIGATIONS TO DATE OF AUTISM AND
9 SCHIZOPHRENIA DISEASE MECHANISMS AND UNDOUBTEDLY THE
10 FIRST AND LARGEST OF ITS KIND IN AFRICAN-AMERICAN
11 POPULATIONS.

12 A KEY WIDELY RECOGNIZED HURDLE IN STEM
13 CELL RESEARCH IS SCALE AND THROUGHPUT. OUR ANALYSIS
14 IS THAT THE LARGEST SCALE, LEVERAGING UNIQUE
15 ADVANCED AUTOMATION PLATFORMS.

16 IN CLOSING, I THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND
17 ATTENTION. FOR MORE DETAILS AND OUR RESPONSE TO THE
18 LARGELY UNFOUNDED CRITIQUES, PLEASE SEE OUR PUBLIC
19 LETTER. GIVEN THE CLEAR ALLOCATION OF FUNDS FOR
20 THESE CONDITIONS IN PROP 14, WE BELIEVE IT DOES NOT
21 SERVE THE PURPOSE OF ADVANCING RESEARCH IN
22 PSYCHIATRIC DISORDERS, ADDRESSING HEALTH
23 DISPARITIES, AND ENGAGING OUR COMMUNITIES IN OUR
24 MISSION TO WITHHOLD FUNDING AT THIS STAGE FROM THIS
25 APPLICATION FOR WHICH FUNDING WAS RECOMMENDED. WHY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WAIT? THANK YOU.

2 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU, DR. GESHWIND.

3 NEXT WE HAVE DR. HAUSSLER. YOUR TIME STARTS NOW.

4 DR. HAUSSLER: HELLO. YES, THANKS FOR THE
5 OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE COMMITTEE. I THINK THIS
6 ISSUE WITH THE AI IS A BIT OF A RED HERRING FOR
7 THIS. WE ACTUALLY HAVE AN EXTRAORDINARILY STRONG
8 TEAM AND EXTENSIVE BACKGROUND IN AI. I'VE BEEN IN
9 THE FIELD FOR 40 YEARS, AND PROFESSOR MARIANOSCO
10 (PHONETIC) IS ABSOLUTELY A STUNNING NEW GENIUS
11 COMING OUT OF THE MIT PROGRAM IN THE LAST FIVE
12 YEARS. SO WE HAVE A GREAT TEAM COMBINING MY
13 LONG-TERM EXPERTISE AND HIS RECENT EXPERTISE.

14 I REALLY READ THE REVIEWERS AS KIND OF A
15 MISGUIDED DON'T TRY ANYTHING NEW ATTITUDE. AND THIS
16 IS EXACTLY THE ATTITUDE THAT HOLDS NIH BACK. WE
17 HAVE TO BE BOLD AND CREATIVE, AND THAT MEANS
18 EMPLOYING THE LATEST AI METHODS WHICH, AS WE HEARD
19 EARLIER IN THE BOARD, ARE DEVELOPING FROM -- MEMBERS
20 OF THE BOARD ARE DEVELOPING AT AN AMAZING RATE.

21 AI IS CHANGING THE WAY WE WORK. IT'S
22 DEMONSTRATED BREAKTHROUGHS IN ALL SECTORS IT'S
23 TOUCHED, INCLUDING MOLECULAR BIOLOGY WHERE, IN
24 EFFECT, WAS RECENTLY AWARDED THE NOBEL PRIZE.

25 THROUGH THE MANY CONSORTIA IN WHICH WE ARE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 LEADING DATA COORDINATION ANALYSIS HERE AT UCSC, WE
2 ARE FOR THE FIRST TIME REACHING THE COMBINED
3 CRITICAL DATA SIZE NEEDED TO UNLOCK EMERGING
4 CAPABILITIES OF AI. DON'T LEAVE CIRM OUT OF THIS
5 REVOLUTION. DON'T LEAVE AFRICAN-AMERICAN CELL LINES
6 OUT OF THE PUSH TO HAVE AI HELP DECODE THE
7 MECHANISTIC BASIS FOR GENOME AND DISEASE
8 RELATIONSHIPS. THIS WILL SUCCEED.

9 I HAVE A VERY STRONG INTUITION ABOUT
10 PUSHING THIS FORWARD NOW. I WOULD URGE YOU TO GET
11 THIS STARTED. WE NEED TO GET THE CELL LINES AND WE
12 NEED TO GET THE DATA GOING.

13 SO IF THERE'S MONEY LEFT ON THE TABLE, AS
14 I UNDERSTAND THERE IS, THIS IS A HIGHLY, HIGHLY
15 MERITORIOUS PROPOSAL. WE HAVE TO MAKE
16 AFRICAN-AMERICAN GENOTYPES MATTER. AND WE'LL DO
17 THAT BY A VERY SOPHISTICATED ANALYSIS OF A FIRE HOSE
18 OF DATA THAT THE GESHWIND LAB IS ABLE TO PRODUCE
19 FROM THESE CELLS, THESE EXTRAORDINARILY PRECIOUS
20 CELLS. IT IS ABSOLUTELY ABSURD TO THROW THIS
21 PROPOSAL UNDER THE BUS BECAUSE YOU DON'T BELIEVE THE
22 AI WILL WORK.

23 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU, DR. HAUSSLER.
24 YOUR TIME IS UP. VITO, BACK TO YOU.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, DOCTORS,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR YOUR WELL-THOUGHT OUT COMMENTS. ANY OTHER
2 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WISH TO SPEAK? ANY BOARD
3 MEMBER LIKE TO COMMENT? IF NOT, I'M GOING TO ASK
4 SCOTT TO PROCEED TO A VOTE THEN.

5 MR. TOCHER: ALL RIGHT. THE MOTION IS TO
6 ACCEPT THE TEAM RECOMMENDATION TO FUND APPLICATIONS
7 16337 AND 16345 AND NOT FUND APPLICATION 16400.

8 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

9 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

10 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.

11 DR. CHOU: YES.

12 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.

13 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.

14 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.

15 DR. DULIEGE: YES.

16 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.

17 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.

18 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

19 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

20 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.

22 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.

23 MR. LAJARA: YES.

24 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.

25 DR. PADILLA: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.

2 MR. PANETTA: YES.

3 MR. TOCHER: MARV SOUTHARD.

4 DR. SOUTHARD: ABSTAIN.

5 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.

6 MS. WYTE: YES.

7 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.

8 DR. XU: YES.

9 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT
10 MOTION CARRIES. VITO.

11 DR. DULIEGE: MAY I MAKE A COMMENT?

12 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ANNE-MARIE, YES.

13 DR. DULIEGE: JUST I WANT TO SAY HOW MUCH
14 I APPRECIATE THE TWO DOCTORS WHO PROVIDED THEIR
15 TESTIMONY. AND TO MAKE SURE THAT THERE IS NO
16 MISUNDERSTANDING, PARTICULARLY IN REGARDS TO THE
17 LAST INTERVENTION, IT IS NOT THAT THE CIRM TEAM NOR
18 THE ICOC FELT THAT THIS PROPOSAL LACKED MERIT. IN
19 FACT, IF THERE WAS SO MUCH DISCUSSION IS BECAUSE WE
20 BELIEVE THAT IT HAS MERIT. IT'S MOSTLY A MATTER OF
21 BUDGET AND BUDGET CONSTRAINTS. SO JUST TO CLARIFY
22 THAT POINT. THANK YOU.

23 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU,
24 ANNE-MARIE. WE CAN SKIP ITEM 14. AND NEXT ON THE
25 AGENDA IS AGENDA ITEM NO. 11. THIS IS THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CONSIDERATION OF THE APPLICATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN
2 SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE TO CIRM'S TRANSLATIONAL
3 PROGRAM ANNOUNCEMENTS TRAN1, 2, 3, AND 4. THIS WILL
4 BE THE LAST TRANS CYCLE UNTIL A REPLACEMENT PROGRAM
5 IS CREATED. GIL, YOU ARE GOING TO TAKE THE
6 PRESENTATION?

7 DR. SAMBRANO: YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

8 SO ONCE AGAIN, WE BEGIN WITH OUR MISSION,
9 AND I WANT TO SHOW YOU JUST BRIEFLY WHERE THE TRAN
10 PROGRAM SITS WITHIN OUR EXISTING PIPELINE OF
11 PROGRAMS. THIS TAKES SINGLE-PRODUCT CANDIDATES THAT
12 ARE PRODUCED POTENTIALLY THROUGH OUR DISCOVERY
13 AWARDS, TAKES THEM THROUGH TRANSLATIONAL ACTIVITIES
14 TO GET TO A PRE-IND MEETING OR AN EQUIVALENT IN
15 ORDER TO PREPARE FOR CLINICAL ACTIVITIES.

16 EXCUSE ME FOR MY DRY THROAT.

17 SO THE TRANSLATIONAL PROGRAM OFFERS FOUR
18 DIFFERENT TYPES OF OPPORTUNITIES FOR FOUR PRODUCT
19 TYPES. SO THERE ARE THERAPEUTICS, THERE ARE -- I
20 HAVE WATER. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I KEEP DRINKING IT.
21 IT MARGINALLY HELPS, BUT THANK YOU. SO THERE'S
22 THERAPEUTICS, DIAGNOSTICS, DEVICES, AND TOOLS. AND
23 EACH OF THEM HAVE SORT OF THEIR OWN UNIQUE
24 ACTIVITIES THAT THEY CONDUCT, AND I'LL SHOW YOU A
25 LITTLE BIT MORE OF THAT IN A BIT. BUT JUST TO NOTE,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IF THERE'S A NUMBER, SO FOR EXAMPLE, THE THERAPEUTIC
2 HAS 27 APPLICATIONS THAT WERE CONSIDERED, WHICH IS
3 WHERE WE GET THE MOST IN TERMS OF APPLICATIONS. THE
4 DIAGNOSTIC, DEVICES, AND TOOLS HAVE MUCH FEWER JUST
5 SO THAT YOU KNOW THE GENERAL LAY OF THE LAND, IF YOU
6 WILL, FOR THE APPLICATIONS THAT WE GET.

7 NOW, EACH OF THESE DIFFERENT PRODUCT TYPES
8 AS THEY ENTER INTO TRANSLATION HAVE TO BE AT A
9 CERTAIN STAGE OF READINESS. AND SO ON, FOR EXAMPLE,
10 WITH THE THERAPEUTICS, WE ARE LOOKING FOR CANDIDATES
11 WHERE DISEASE MODIFYING ACTIVITY IS DEMONSTRATED
12 THROUGH APPROPRIATE IN VITRO, IN VIVO MODELS. FOR
13 THE OTHERS HAVING FEASIBILITY DEMONSTRATED THROUGH
14 SOME TYPE OF PROTOTYPE BRINGS IT TO THE APPROPRIATE
15 STAGE.

16 NOW, THERE ARE A VARIETY OF ACTIVITIES
17 THAT ARE DEPENDENT ON, AGAIN, THE PRODUCT TYPE THAT
18 ARE CONDUCTED DURING THE TRAN AWARD WITH THE GOAL OF
19 EACH AT THE VERY END COMING TO A PRE-IND MEETING
20 WITH THE FDA IF IT'S A THERAPEUTIC OR SOME OTHER
21 PRE-SUBMEETING WITH THE FDA AS APPROPRIATE. OR IN
22 THE CASE OF TOOLS, WHERE THEY REACH A POINT OF BEING
23 ABLE TO TRANSFER THE DESIGN FOR MANUFACTURING AND
24 DISTRIBUTION FOR OTHERS TO USE. AND THIS COULD BE
25 FOR RESEARCH PURPOSES OR FOR CLINICAL PURPOSES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU WILL NOTE THAT EACH OF THE DIFFERENT
2 PRODUCT TYPES ALSO HAS A DIFFERENT AWARD DURATION.
3 SO FOR THE THERAPEUTIC, IT HAS UP TO 30 MONTHS, THE
4 OTHERS UP TO 24 MONTHS TO COMPLETE THE ACTIVITIES.
5 AND THE AWARD AMOUNTS ARE ALSO DIFFERENT AND
6 TAILORED TO THE TYPES OF ACTIVITIES THAT EACH
7 PRODUCT WOULD HAVE. SO 4 MILLION FOR A BIOLOGIC,
8 WHICH TENDS TO BE THE MOST EXPENSIVE, DOWN TO A
9 MILLION FOR THOSE THAT ARE PROPOSING A TOOL.

10 THE TRANSLATIONAL APPLICATIONS GO THROUGH
11 THE REVIEW PROCESS, AGAIN, IN A VERY SIMILAR WAY AS
12 I DESCRIBED BEFORE WITH THE THREE GENERAL STEPS.
13 BUT IN CASES LIKE WE HAVE HAD IN THE LAST COUPLE OF
14 TRAN CYCLES, WE END UP WITH MORE APPLICATIONS THAN
15 THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP CAN HANDLE IN A SINGLE
16 SESSION. SO WE DIVIDE THAT MERIT REVIEW INTO TWO
17 PARTS.

18 WE HAVE A POSITIVE SELECTION COMPONENT
19 WHERE THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP MEMBERS, INCLUDING
20 OUR PATIENT ADVOCATE MEMBERS, MAKE SELECTIONS OF THE
21 APPLICATIONS THAT THEY FEEL ARE LIKELY TO BE THE
22 MOST IMPACTFUL AND RESPONSIVE. THOSE ADVANCE TO THE
23 FULL MERIT REVIEW BY THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP.

24 AND SO IN THIS CASE WE RECEIVED 54
25 SUBMISSIONS FOR TRAN. FIFTY-THREE WERE ELIGIBLE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AND THROUGH THE POSITIVE SELECTION PROCESS, 23 WERE
2 SELECTED. AND THERE WERE NINE THAT BYPASSED THIS
3 BECAUSE THEY HAD IN A PREVIOUS CYCLE A SCORE BETWEEN
4 80 AND 84. SO WE HAD A TOTAL OF 32 THAT WERE
5 ADVANCED TO FULL GRANTS WORKING GROUP DISCUSSION AND
6 SCORING. AND SO WE'RE BRINGING THOSE, THEN,
7 RECOMMENDATIONS TO YOU.

8 THE COMPOSITION OF THE WORKING GROUP IS,
9 AGAIN, SIMILAR TO THE COMPOSITION AS I DESCRIBED
10 BEFORE FOR REMIND WITH OUR SCIENTIFIC MEMBERS, 15,
11 WHO ARE SELECTED BASED ON EXPERTISE TO SCORE EACH
12 APPLICATION, OUR GRANTS WORKING GROUP BOARD MEMBERS,
13 AND SPECIALISTS AS NEEDED TO FILL IN KNOWLEDGE GAPS.

14 THE SCORING IN THIS CASE IS BASED ON A 1
15 TO 100 SCALE. SO SCORES FROM 85 TO A HUNDRED MEANS
16 THAT THE APPLICATION SHOWS EXCEPTIONAL MERIT AND
17 WARRANTS FUNDING. SCORES BELOW THAT ARE NOT
18 RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING.

19 THE CRITERIA THAT ARE UTILIZED BY THE
20 GRANTS WORKING GROUP TO ARRIVE AT THEIR SCORE ARE
21 BASED ON THESE FIVE QUESTIONS. DOES THE PROJECT
22 HOLD THE NECESSARY SIGNIFICANCE AND POTENTIAL FOR
23 IMPACT? IS THE RATIONALE SOUND? DOES IT HAVE A
24 WELL-PLANNED PROJECT -- IS THE PROJECT WELL PLANNED
25 AND DESIGNED? IS IT FEASIBLE? AND DOES IT UPHOLD

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE PRINCIPLES OF DEI?

2 OKAY. SO THIS THE SUMMARY TABLE THE
3 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP.
4 THERE WERE 17 APPLICATIONS OUT OF THIS BATCH THAT
5 WERE DEEMED RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING BASED ON THE
6 SCORE OF HAVING 85 OR GREATER AND 15 THAT WERE NOT.
7 THE TOTAL APPLICANT REQUEST OF THOSE 17 APPLICATIONS
8 IS 78.2 OR SO MILLION. THE FUNDS AVAILABLE ARE 60
9 MILLION. SO, AGAIN, WE HAVE MORE APPLICATIONS THAT
10 ARE RECOMMENDED THAN WE CAN FUND WITH THE BUDGET.

11 I WANT TO JUST MAKE A NOTE ABOUT MINORITY
12 REPORTS. SOMETIMES YOU MAY OBSERVE THAT WE HAVE A
13 MINORITY REPORT LINKED TO APPLICATIONS. THIS
14 HAPPENS BASED ON WHETHER THE APPLICATION IS NOT
15 RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING, BUT HAS 35 PERCENT OR MORE
16 MEMBERS THAT SCORE TO FUND THE APPLICATION. SO ANY
17 APPLICATION THAT MEETS THOSE CRITERIA HAS A MINORITY
18 REPORT INCLUDED. IN THIS PARTICULAR CYCLE THERE
19 WERE NO APPLICATIONS THAT QUALIFIED FOR A MINORITY
20 REPORT.

21 SO THE CIRM TEAM RECOMMENDATIONS, GIVEN
22 THE BUDGET CONSTRAINTS, PUT US IN A PLACE WHERE WE
23 CAN RECOMMEND UP TO 13. AND PART OF THE
24 CONSIDERATION HERE WAS TO MAXIMIZE THE NUMBER OF
25 APPLICATIONS BASED ON THE VARIABLE BUDGETS THAT ARE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 REQUESTED TO HAVE THE GREATEST NUMBER OF
2 APPLICATIONS THAT CAN FIT WITHIN THAT BUDGET. SO
3 THOSE 13 LEAD TO AN AMOUNT OF 57.5 MILLION, WHICH IS
4 WELL WITHIN THE 60 MILLION THAT WE HAVE AVAILABLE TO
5 US.

6 NOW, THE CIRM PROGRAMS TEAM, AND THIS IS
7 LED BY DR. SHYAM PATEL, SO HE LEADS THE PRECLINICAL
8 DEVELOPMENT TEAM, EXAMINED THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP
9 RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS. AND SO BASED PRIMARILY ON
10 THE GWG SCORE OR THE RANK ORDER OF THE SCORE PUT
11 TOGETHER THESE TEAM RECOMMENDATIONS. BUT THEY DID
12 HAVE ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS RELATED TO PORTFOLIO
13 DIVERSIFICATION AND PROGRESSION. AND SO IF YOU
14 WOULD LIKE ADDITIONAL COLOR ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS,
15 I INVITE DR. SHYAM PATEL TO PROVIDE THAT.

16 BUT BEFORE WE GO THERE, I WANT TO HAVE US
17 PUT UP THE EXCEL SPREADSHEET. AND THAT SHOWS THE
18 LIST OF APPLICATIONS SO THAT YOU CAN SEE, HOPEFULLY,
19 MORE CLEARLY WHICH APPLICATIONS ARE RECOMMENDED AND
20 WHICH ONES ARE NOT. I ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT --
21 THEY'RE WORKING ON IT -- A COUPLE OF THINGS. AND
22 MAYBE I'LL STATE IT.

23 SO YOU HAVE THESE MATERIALS IN FRONT OF
24 YOU AS WELL IN HARD COPIES. THE LAST TRANSLATIONAL
25 ROUND WE WERE IN SIMILAR SITUATION WHERE WE HAD MANY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MORE APPLICATIONS THAT WERE RECOMMENDED THAN WE
2 COULD FUND. THERE WERE SIX APPLICATIONS THAT WERE
3 ESSENTIALLY LEFT ON THE TABLE BECAUSE WE COULDN'T
4 COVER THOSE. SO THOSE APPLICANTS REAPPLIED TO THIS
5 CYCLE. THEY CAME BACK. ALL SIX ARE STILL IN THE
6 TOP TIER, AND THOSE ARE ALL RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING.

7 SO ESSENTIALLY THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE
8 HAVE WOULD INCLUDE THEM AS NOW THE GROUP THAT WOULD
9 BE FUNDED. AND THEY ARE SHOWN AS AN ASTERISK WITH A
10 YES UNDER THE RESUBMISSION COLUMN IN THAT TABLE.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, GIL. I
12 CERTAINLY HOPE WHEN YOU ASKED FOR MORE COLOR, YOU
13 DIDN'T MEAN WITH RESPECT TO YOUR SPREADSHEET. TWO
14 COLORS ARE ENOUGH.

15 OKAY. SO HERE WE HAVE IT, 17 RECOMMENDED
16 BY THE GWG. THAT WAS NARROWED DOWN BY BUDGET
17 CONSTRAINTS TO 13 THAT ARE FUNDED IN GREEN. AND --
18 I THOUGHT I HAD A REQUEST FOR A MOTION. I NEED A
19 REQUEST -- A MOTION, EXCUSE ME, TO ACCEPT THE
20 RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TEAM.

21 DR. DULIEGE: IS IT TO ACCEPT THE
22 RECOMMENDATION OF THE TEAM, OR IS IT TO ACCEPT THOSE
23 THAT WERE NOT RECOMMENDED, GO THROUGH, AND THEN
24 WE'LL BE ABLE TO KNOW THE RECOMMENDED. JUST TO
25 UNDERSTAND --

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU FOR THE
2 CLARIFICATION QUESTION. I WAS LOOKING, GIVEN THE
3 COMPLEXITY OF THIS SPREADSHEET FOR SORT OF A MORE
4 OMNIBUS MOTION TO ACCEPT THE TOTAL RECOMMENDATION OF
5 THE TEAM AS PRESENTED.

6 THERE IS JOE ON THE LINE. YES. OKAY.
7 JOSEPH.

8 MR. PANETTA: THANK YOU. I'LL MAKE THAT
9 MOTION.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. THANK YOU
11 VERY MUCH. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

12 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: SECOND.

13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SECOND FROM MARK
14 FISCHER-COLBRIE. THANK YOU.

15 SO THIS MOTION IS NOW OPEN TO DISCUSSION
16 FROM MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. ANNE-MARIE, PLEASE.

17 DR. DULIEGE: THANK YOU AGAIN FOR THE VERY
18 DETAILED EXPLANATION OR AT LEAST A VERY CLEAR
19 EXPLANATION. AND WE UNDERSTAND TWO THINGS. GOOD
20 NEWS IS THOSE WHO RESUBMITTED WERE FUNDED. THE
21 IMPLICATION, THAT'S GREAT NEWS. THE SECOND, WE HAVE
22 TO APPLY OUR JUDGMENT BECAUSE THE TOTAL ENVELOPE
23 EXCEEDED THE BUDGET FOR THIS CYCLE.

24 IN THAT CONTEXT, IF YOU CAN HELP US BETTER
25 UNDERSTAND WHY THERE WERE SOME YES THAT HAVE,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THINKING ABOUT THE LAST ONE, THAT HAD A SCORE OF 85,
2 OTHERS WITH A SCORE OF 87 WERE NOT RECOMMENDED FOR
3 THE CIRM TEAM THAT WOULD HELP. THANK YOU.

4 DR. SAMBRANO: SO, SHYAM, IF YOU'D LIKE TO
5 SPEAK TO THAT.

6 DR. PATEL: YEAH, CERTAINLY. SO OUR
7 METHODOLOGY WAS TO FIRST RELY BY THE GWG RANKED
8 SCORING. YOU CAN HEAR ME NOW. SO I'LL START AGAIN.

9 SO OUR METHODOLOGY WAS TO FIRST RELY ON
10 THE GWG RANK SCORINGS. THE REVIEW TEAM PROVIDES TWO
11 METRICS ON THAT, WHICH IS THE MEAN AND THE MEDIAN
12 SCORE. SO IF YOU LOOK AT THAT LIST, UP UNTIL THE
13 NINTH APPLICATION, I BELIEVE, THERE'S A CONSISTENT
14 SCORE OF MEAN AND MEDIAN. ALL THOSE HAVE 87 OR
15 HIGHER MEAN AND MEDIAN. AND SO THOSE WERE ONES THAT
16 WE RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING.

17 BELOW THAT THERE'S A MIX OF MEAN AND
18 MEDIAN SCORES. AND SO THE FIRST THING WE DID WAS,
19 FIRST, AGAIN, PRIORITIZE THE GWG SCORING, BUT THEN
20 TO TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION PORTFOLIO
21 DIVERSIFICATION.

22 AND TO GET TO ANNE-MARIE'S QUESTION AT
23 HEART, THE LAST APPLICATION IS BEING RECOMMENDED FOR
24 FUNDING, WHICH IS THE TRAN4 APPLICATION. BECAUSE
25 AFTER WE HAD GOTTEN THROUGH THE TRAN1S, THAT WAS THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ONE THAT COULDN'T BE FUNDED BECAUSE OF ITS BUDGET.

2 SO IF YOU GO TO -- YOU CAN'T SEE IT RIGHT
3 NOW. BUT THE TRAN1 THAT IS THE LAST GREEN ONE,
4 AFTER THAT THE REMAINING FUNDS ONLY ALLOW FOR
5 FUNDING OF THAT TRAN4.

6 DR. DULIEGE: THANK YOU.

7 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ANYONE WANT TO MAKE
8 A COMMENT? ANY HANDS RAISED?

9 MR. TOCHER: FOR BOARD MEMBERS.

10 MS. MANDAC: FOR PUBLIC?

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: NOT YET.

12 MR. TOCHER: SORRY. WE'RE JUST SURVEYING
13 FOR BOARD MEMBER COMMENT AT THE MOMENT. WE'LL GET
14 TO PUBLIC COMMENT IN JUST A MOMENT.

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU.

16 MR. TOCHER: IT DOESN'T APPEAR SO.

17 DR. DULIEGE: I DON'T MEAN TO ALWAYS BE
18 THE ONE ASKING A QUESTION, BUT I WILL SAY APPRECIATE
19 THIS. THERE'S ONE THING, THOUGH, AND, YES, THERE'S
20 ACTUALLY VALUE IN DIVERSIFYING THE PORTFOLIO,
21 INCLUDING FUNDING TRAN4. ON THE OTHER HAND, THIS
22 ONE, TRAN4, HAD EIGHT YESES AND SEVEN NOS, WHICH
23 MAKES IT VERY AVERAGE IN QUALITY, I THINK, OR
24 FEASIBILITY PROPOSAL.

25 SO THAT'S WHERE IT BECOMES A LITTLE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 UNCLEAR TO ME. ARE WE FAVORING THIS TIME THE
2 DIVERSITY OF PROPOSALS TO BE CLEAR VERSUS MAYBE,
3 MAYBE THE QUALITY OR FEASIBILITY? AND THANK YOU FOR
4 YOUR CLARIFICATION ON THIS ONE.

5 DR. PATEL: OF COURSE. YEAH. NO. SO
6 THAT LAST ONE IS BECAUSE IT CAN BE FUNDED OUT OF THE
7 ONES THAT WERE REMAINING. AND IT ALSO HAS BROAD
8 POTENTIAL TO IMPACT EX VIVO GENETIC ENGINEERING OF
9 CELLS. AND SO THAT IN A SENSE, IF THAT TOOL WERE TO
10 PROGRESS WITHOUT THE FUNDING, IT COULD HAVE BROAD
11 IMPACT ON OUR FIELD.

12 BUT -- SO THE WAY THAT THIS HAS BEEN
13 APPLIED, JUST TO CLARIFY A LITTLE BIT MORE, IS THAT
14 WE WENT THROUGH FIRST -- WE GOT TO THE 87, 87.
15 THOSE ONES WERE ALL RECOMMENDED. THERE WAS ONE MORE
16 RECOMMENDED, THEN THERE'S A REMAINING SET OF FUNDING
17 THAT'S LEFT AFTER THAT. AND SO WE WENT LINE BY LINE
18 WITH EACH OF THOSE AWARDS, THE TRAN1 APPLICATIONS
19 THAT ARE THERE, AND THEN WE RECOMMENDED THE NEXT
20 THREE AND NOT THE TWO BLOOD CANCER ONES FOR FUNDING.
21 THAT WAS BASED ON PORTFOLIO DIVERSIFICATION AS WELL
22 AS WITHIN OUR PORTFOLIO.

23 SO AFTER WE GET THROUGH THOSE THREE TRAN1S
24 THAT ARE RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING, THE ONLY ALLOWABLE
25 REMAINING FUNDS WOULD ALLOW US TO FUND THAT TRAN4

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 BECAUSE IT WAS MERITORIOUS FROM THE GWG PERSPECTIVE,
2 IT WAS ALLOWABLE FROM A FUNDING PERSPECTIVE, AND
3 BECAUSE IT WAS A TRAN4 THAT COULD POTENTIALLY, AS A
4 TECHNOLOGY PLATFORM, HAVE BROAD APPEAL, WE SUGGESTED
5 TO RECOMMEND FOR FUNDING.

6 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: FOLLOW UP,
7 ANNE-MARIE? NO. OKAY. THAT WAS A VERY NICE
8 EXPLANATION, SHYAM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I DON'T
9 SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISH TO
10 COMMENT ON THE MOTION?

11 MS. MANDAC: YES. THERE ARE HANDS RAISED.
12 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, IF YOU HAVE AUDIO ON ON YOUR
13 END FOR THIS MEETING, IF YOU WOULD PLEASE TURN IT
14 OFF. SO THERE IS ONE PERSON IN THE MEETING ROOM WHO
15 WILL BE SPEAKING ON THIS APPLICATION AND FOUR
16 CURRENTLY ON ZOOM.

17 I DO SEE ONE OF THE MEMBERS WITH A HAND
18 RAISED I WAS EXPECTING FOR A CLINICAL PROGRAM. SO I
19 JUST WANT TO REMIND PUBLIC MEMBERS WE ARE ON
20 TRANSLATIONAL PROGRAM APPLICATIONS. SO COMMENTS
21 SHOULD PERTAIN TO THE TRANSLATIONAL PROGRAM.

22 SO WE'LL START WITH THE FIRST SPEAKER,
23 DANIEL LAU, WHO IS WITH US IN THE MEETING ROOM.
24 DANIEL, IF YOU COULD APPROACH THE MICROPHONE. THERE
25 IS A TIMER. YOU WILL HAVE THREE MINUTES. AS SOON

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AS THE THREE MINUTES IS OVER, AUDIO WILL MUTE THE
2 MICROPHONE. YOUR TIME STARTS NOW.

3 MR. LAU: MORNING.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: MORNING.

5 MR. LAU: WE ARE DAN AND MINNIE, AND WE
6 ARE FROM SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA. AND OUR SON MATTHEW
7 HAS SANFILIPO SYNDROME TYPE B, ALSO KNOWN AS
8 MPSIIIB.

9 I'M SPEAKING FOR APPLICATION 16907, WHICH
10 WAS RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING, BUT WAS LEFT OUT DUE TO
11 BUDGET. TODAY MATTHEW IS HEALTHY, HAPPY, AND
12 LIVELY. HE LOVES PLAYING HOT WHEELS WITH HIS OLDER
13 BROTHER. HE LOVES BELTING OUT ELMO SONGS IN THE
14 CAR. EVEN AT THREE YEARS OLD HE THINKS ABOUT
15 OTHERS. HE SAVES HIS BROTHER SNACKS AND TREATS AND
16 INVITES FRIENDS TO OUR HOUSE.

17 HE HAS A BRIGHT FUTURE, BUT IN A FEW YEARS
18 HE'LL BE UNABLE TO SING ELMO SONGS, TALK, AND LAUGH
19 WITH HIS BROTHER AND FRIENDS, OR RUN AROUND AND JUMP
20 AROUND. HE WILL LOSE ALL MENTAL CAPACITIES AND WILL
21 LIKELY DIE AS A TEENAGER.

22 SANFILIPO TYPE B IS 100 PERCENT FATAL.
23 HE'S ALREADY SHOWING EARLY SYMPTOMS AND WILL FACE
24 IRREVERSIBLE DECLINE WITHOUT TREATMENT.

25 ACCORDING TO THE UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE ECONOMIC BURDEN FOR PATIENTS IS \$8 MILLION. A
2 CURE CAN REDUCE MASSIVE BURDENS ON THE HEALTHCARE
3 SYSTEM.

4 THIS APPLICATION WAS UNANIMOUSLY VOTED 13
5 TO ZERO ON SCIENTIFIC RATIONALE, PLANNING AND
6 DESIGN, FEASIBILITY, AND DEI PRINCIPLES.

7 ONE OUTLIER LIKELY AFFECTING THE SCORE WAS
8 A CRUCIAL MISTAKE BY THE REVIEWERS IN CALCULATING
9 THE INCIDENCE RATE. IT IS NOT 1 IN 1 MILLION, BUT
10 IS ACTUALLY 1 IN 25,000 BASED ON PUBLISHED RESEARCH.
11 IT IS OFTEN UNDERSCREENED AND UNDERCOUNTED.

12 ARTICLE 5, SECTION 4 OF THE GWG BYLAWS
13 SAYS, "THE PRESIDENT SHOULD ALERT THE GWG AND THE
14 APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE TO MATTERS THAT HAVE
15 BEEN FOUND TO BE INCORRECT IN THE REVIEW OF A GRANT
16 APPLICATION." AMONG THE CLIN, TRAN, AND DISC
17 BUDGETS, THERE IS A TOTAL OF \$45 MILLION SITTING
18 UNUSED AND POSSIBLY UP TO \$125 MILLION VARIANCE
19 BASED ON THE FY 24/25 NOVEMBER MEETING.

20 IS IT POSSIBLE FOR THE BOARD TO CONSIDER A
21 REALLOCATION OF THE UNUSED BUDGETS TO FUND
22 QUALIFYING TRAN¹ APPLICATIONS LIKE THIS ONE ON
23 SANFILIPO TYPE B? OR ALTERNATIVELY, COULD THE BOARD
24 CONSIDER PARTIALLY FUNDING THE REMAINING 2.5 MILLION
25 TRAN BUDGET IF THE TEAM BRINGS PRIVATE FUNDING?

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 TIME IS NOT ON OUR SIDE, AND MATTHEW AND CHILDREN
2 LIKE HIM DEPEND ON THIS. THANK YOU.

3 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DAN,
4 MINNIE, AND MATTHEW FOR JOINING US TODAY.

5 NEXT WE WILL PROCEED TO PEOPLE ON ZOOM.
6 IT WILL BE DR. FLORENCE LAI FIRST FOLLOWED BY DR.
7 KATE MASIUK. YOU WILL BOTH HAVE THREE MINUTES EACH.
8 DR. LAI, YOU HAVE THE FLOOR.

9 DR. LAI: I'M FLORENCE LAI, A NEUROLOGIST
10 AT MASS GENERAL HOSPITAL IN BOSTON, ASKING THAT THE
11 BOARD VOTE TO FUND THE LIFESAVING STEM CELL GENE
12 THERAPY FOR SANFILIPPO B, TRAN1-16907. THIS IS A
13 FATAL BRAIN DISEASE THAT HAS BEEN COMPARED TO
14 ALZHEIMER'S DISEASE BUT IN CHILDHOOD.

15 AS A RESEARCHER IN ALZHEIMER'S DISEASE
16 MYSELF, I HAVE SEEN FIRSTHAND ITS DEVASTATING EFFECT
17 ON HUNDREDS OF MY PATIENTS AND THEIR FAMILIES. A
18 SIMILAR COGNITIVE AND PHYSICAL DETERIORATION IN
19 SANFILIPPO B STARTS BEFORE AGE SIX WITH DEATH IN THE
20 TEEN YEARS AND SOME AS YOUNG AS TEN. THIS WILL BE
21 THE FATE OF MY GRANDSON MATTHEW, WHOM YOU'VE JUST
22 SEEN, AND OTHER CHILDREN IF A CURE IS NOT DEVELOPED
23 IN TIME.

24 I WAS SURPRISED TO LEARN THAT SANFILIPPO B
25 IS NOT RARE. IT'S ABOUT 1 IN 25,000 LIVE BIRTHS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ACCORDING TO PUBLISHED NEWBORN SCREENING, WHICH IS
2 THE GOLD STANDARD, NOT THE 1 IN 1 MILLION THAT
3 REVIEWERS INCORRECTLY QUOTED, WHICH PROBABLY
4 DECREASED THE SCORE. IN FACT, IT'S MUCH MORE COMMON
5 THAN SEVEN OTHER GENETIC DISORDERS THAT RECEIVED
6 GENEROUS CIRM FUNDING.

7 AND SANFILIPPO B IS ON PAR WITH SPINAL
8 MUSCULAR ATROPHY, WHICH ALREADY HAS A GENETIC CURE
9 AND HAS SAVED COUNTLESS LIVES. ALSO, THE PROPOSED
10 STUDY WILL USE THE SAME TECHNOLOGY THAT HAS ALREADY
11 PROVEN CURATIVE IN SANFILIPPO A, A VERY CLOSE
12 VARIANT TO B. IN ANIMAL MODELS THE SANFILIPPO B
13 SHOWS COMPLETE ERADICATION OF THE TOXIC HEPARAN
14 SULFATE AND A REVERSAL TO NORMAL BRAIN -- NORMAL
15 BEHAVIOR AND DEVELOPMENT.

16 THIS RESEARCH HAS THE COMMITTED
17 INVOLVEMENT OF DRS. DONALD KOHN OF UCLA AND BRIAN
18 BIGGER OF THE UK, LEADING WORLD EXPERTS IN THE
19 LENTIVIRAL DELIVERY OF A NORMALIZED GENE FROM THE
20 PATIENT'S OWN BLOOD AND IS A ONE-TIME CURE. THIS
21 HAS GREAT IMPACT AND WILL BRING TREMENDOUS HOPE TO
22 THOSE WITH SANFILIPPO B AND WILL SAVE MILLIONS OF
23 DOLLARS IN LIFETIME HEALTHCARE COSTS.

24 THE NEED IS CRITICAL FOR THIS
25 TRANSFORMATIVE GENE THERAPY TO CURE SANFILIPPO B.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHILDREN WITH SANFILIPPO B HAVE TICKING TIME BOMBS
2 IN THE RELENTLESS GENERATION OF THIS CONDITION.
3 THEREFORE, TIME IS OF THE ESSENCE. I URGE THE ICOC
4 TO PUT FORTH A MOTION TO FUND THIS STUDY, PERHAPS
5 EVEN DRAWING ON THE MILLIONS OF UNUSED DOLLARS AND
6 OTHER BUDGETED CIRM INITIATIVES TO DO SO. I ASK FOR
7 FLEXIBILITY THAT THIS COULD BE PARTIALLY FUNDED AND
8 FAMILIES AND FOUNDATIONS COULD FUND THE REST. IT
9 WOULD BE SO HELPFUL TO START THIS RIGHT AWAY.

10 PRECIOUS CHILDREN WITH SANFILIPO ARE
11 DEPENDING ON YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DR. LAI.
13 NEXT UP WE HAVE DR. MASIUK TO BE FOLLOWED BY DR.
14 YVONNE CHEN.

15 DR. MASIUK: HI. I'M KATE MASIUK. I'M A
16 PI ON GRANT APPLICATION 16907, PROPOSING
17 HEMATOPOIETIC STEM CELL GENE THERAPY FOR SANFILIPPO
18 B. AS YOU'VE HEARD FROM THE FAMILY, SANFILIPPO B IS
19 AN ABSOLUTELY DEVASTATING NEURODEGENERATIVE DISEASE
20 THAT'S OFTEN REFERRED TO AS CHILDHOOD DEMENTIA.

21 THESE CHILDREN GO FROM BEING HAPPY AND
22 HEALTHY KIDS TO SLOWLY LOSING THEIR DEVELOPMENTAL
23 MILESTONES, EVENTUALLY BECOMING NONVERBAL,
24 WHEELCHAIR BOUND, AND DYING IN THEIR TEENAGE YEARS.
25 THERE ARE ZERO AVAILABLE TREATMENT OPTIONS.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ONE REALLY IMPORTANT POINT THAT I WOULD
2 LIKE TO MAKE ABOUT OUR PROPOSAL IS THAT IT HAS A
3 VERY HIGH LIKELIHOOD OF DELIVERING AN ACTUAL CURE TO
4 THESE PATIENTS. AND THAT'S BECAUSE, AS DR. LAI
5 MENTIONED, THERE'S ALREADY A VERY SUCCESSFUL THERAPY
6 THAT IS ALREADY IN THE CLINIC FOR THE CLOSELY
7 RELATED SANFILIPPO A SYNDROME. THIS THERAPY WAS
8 ALSO DEVELOPED IN THE LAB WITH OUR CO-I DR. BRIAN
9 BIGGER, WHO IS ONE OF THE WORLD'S LEADING EXPERTS ON
10 LYSOSOMAL STORAGE DISEASES. AND THIS USES AN ALMOST
11 IDENTICAL APPROACH TO THE ONE THAT WE'RE PROPOSING,
12 BUT IT JUST CHANGES THE AFFECTED GENE OF INTEREST.

13 AND WHAT WE'VE SEEN IN THE SANFILIPPO A
14 TRIALS IS THAT CLEARING THE BRAIN OF THESE TOXIC
15 HEPARAN SULFATE METABOLITES IN THESE PATIENTS CAN BE
16 CURATIVE. AND I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT AN INCREMENTAL
17 DIFFERENCE. BUT IN THIS TRIAL WE'VE SEEN THESE KIDS
18 BECOME FULLY FUNCTIONAL, HEALTHY KIDS THAT CAN RIDE
19 A SCOOTER OR EVEN ARGUE WITH THEIR PARENTS AT THEIR
20 CLINIC VISITS.

21 WE'VE SHOWN SIMILARLY EXCELLENT MOUSE
22 MODEL DATA IN OUR GRANT, THAT OUR THERAPY CAN ALSO
23 COMPLETELY CLEAR BRAIN LEVELS OF HEPARAN SULFATE,
24 SUGGESTING THAT OUR THERAPY CAN ALSO BE A CURE FOR
25 THIS DISEASE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 I'D ALSO LIKE TO JUST HIGHLIGHT THAT WE
2 ACTUALLY HAVE THE TEAM IN PLACE TO EFFICIENTLY AND
3 SUCCESSFULLY BRING THIS TO THE CLINIC. THE
4 PRECLINICAL WORK OF THIS APPLICATION WILL BE DONE IN
5 THE LAB OF DR. DONALD KOHN, WHO IS A CO-I ON THIS
6 APPLICATION AND I'VE WORKED WITH FOR MANY YEARS.
7 AND WE'VE SUCCESSFULLY BROUGHT SO MANY SIMILAR EX
8 VIVO LENTIVIRAL VECTORS TO THE CLINIC.

9 WE KNOW AT THIS POINT -- WE HAVE
10 ESSENTIALLY A REGULATORY PLAYBOOK TO IND. WE KNOW
11 EXACTLY WHAT TOX STUDIES WOULD NEED TO BE DONE,
12 EXACTLY WHAT PRECLINICAL DATA, EXACTLY HOW TO DO THE
13 MANUFACTURING. I'M VERY CONFIDENT THAT WE CAN BRING
14 THIS TO THE CLINIC AND HAVE IT BE EFFICACIOUS.

15 WE ALSO FEEL THAT THERE WERE SOME SERIOUS
16 ERRORS MADE BY THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP IN OUR
17 REVIEW. MOST IMPORTANTLY, THAT THEY CITED A 40-FOLD
18 LOWER PREVALENCE FOR THIS DISEASE THAT IS ACTUALLY
19 PUBLISHED FROM NEWBORN SCREENING WHEN POTENTIALLY
20 UNDERESTIMATING THE IMPACT OF THIS THERAPY.

21 CIRM SET OUT IN 2020 VIA PROP 14 TO BRING
22 NEW CURES TO THE CLINIC FOR NEURODEGENERATIVE
23 DISEASES, AND THIS IS, I THINK, AN EXCELLENT
24 OPPORTUNITY FOR CIRM TO INVEST IN A POTENTIAL CURE
25 FOR THIS DISEASE. CIRM HAS BEEN HISTORICALLY A

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 NATIONWIDE LEADER AND A BEACON OF HOPE FOR THESE
2 FAMILIES IN RARE DISEASES. AND I ENCOURAGE THE
3 BOARD TO CONSIDER FUNDING THIS PROPOSAL AND GIVE
4 THESE FAMILIES HOPE.

5 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DR.
6 MASIUK. DR. CHEN, YOU'RE UP NEXT. AND AFTER THAT
7 WILL BE THE PHONE NUMBER (619) 535-6876. SO ALL
8 PRIOR SPEAKERS HAVE BEEN FOR 16907. DR. CHEN IS
9 SPEAKING FOR 16912. DR. CHEN, YOU HAVE THE FLOOR.

10 DR. CHEN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
11 OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. MY NAME IS YVONNE CHEN. I'M
12 A PROFESSOR OF IMMUNOLOGY AND CHEMICAL ENGINEERING
13 AT UCLA, AND I'M THE PI OF THE TRAN1-16912
14 APPLICATION THAT WILL DEVELOP A NEXT GENERATION
15 CAR-T CELL THERAPY FOR GLIOBLASTOMA, WHICH IS BRAIN
16 CANCER.

17 I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT FOUR POINTS IN SUPPORT
18 OF OUR THERAPY. FIRST, RELATIVE TO CIRM'S MISSION
19 TO DELIVER TRANSFORMATIVE TREATMENTS IN CALIFORNIA
20 AND BEYOND, I WOULD LIKE TO EMPHASIZE THAT OUR TEAM
21 HAS HAD A SUCCESSFUL TRACK RECORD IN TRANSLATING
22 HOMEGROWN, CUTTING-EDGE THERAPY TO THE CLINIC. THE
23 FIRST CAR-T CELL THERAPY DEVELOPED BY MY GROUP HAS
24 YIELDED BEST-IN-CLASS SAFETY AND EFFICACY PROFILES
25 IN PATIENTS WITH B-CELL LYMPHOMA, LEADING TO THE

1 FOUNDING OF A CALIFORNIA COMPANY THAT EMPLOYED OVER
2 A HUNDRED SCIENTISTS. THIS THERAPY IS NOW ENTERING
3 PHASE 2 CLINICAL TESTING.

4 FURTHERMORE, WITH OUR PREVIOUS TRAN1
5 FUNDING FOR BCMA-CS1 CAR-T CELL THERAPY, WE
6 SUCCESSFULLY COMPLETED NOT JUST THE PRE-IND MEETING,
7 BUT A FULL IND PACKAGE THAT HAS NOW BEEN APPROVED BY
8 THE FDA FOR THE TRIAL TO PROCEED. THIS TRACK RECORD
9 DEMONSTRATES OUR EXPERIENCE AND COMMITMENT TO
10 DEVELOPING INNOVATIVE THERAPIES THAT CAN AND WILL BE
11 EFFICIENTLY IMPLEMENTED IN THE CLINIC.

12 SECOND, THIS APPLICATION DESCRIBES A NOVEL
13 AND AMBITIOUS APPROACH TO ADDRESS GLIOBLASTOMA,
14 WHICH IS THE MOST COMMON TYPE OF PRIMARY BRAIN
15 TUMORS THAT HAS NO EFFECTIVE TREATMENT OPTIONS. ONE
16 MAJOR LIMITATION IS THAT GLIOBLASTOMA IS HIGHLY
17 HETEROGENEOUS, MEANING WITHIN EVEN ONE PATIENT THE
18 TUMOR CELLS CAN HAVE VERY DIFFERENT GENETIC AND
19 PROTEIN EXPRESSION PROFILES. AND THAT HAS MADE IT
20 VERY DIFFICULT FOR TARGETED THERAPIES, INCLUDING
21 CAR-T CELL THERAPIES, TO ADDRESS.

22 HERE WE HAVE DEVELOPED A NEXT GENERATION
23 THERAPY THAT CAN EFFECTIVELY ELIMINATE MULTIPLE
24 MODELS OF ORTHOTOPIC BRAIN TUMORS INCLUDING ANTIGEN
25 HETEROGENEOUS BRAIN TUMORS. VERY IMPORTANTLY,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 EFFICACY AND TOXICITY OFTEN FORM A DOUBLE-EDGED
2 SWORD. AND IN OUR THERAPY WE HAVE DEVELOPED A WAY
3 TO BOTH BOOST EFFICACY AND DIRECTLY ADDRESS
4 POTENTIAL TOXICITIES THAT HAVE BEEN ASSOCIATED WITH
5 CYTOKINE-ARMORED CAR-T CELL THERAPY. MORE DETAILS
6 ON THIS CAN BE FOUND IN OUR WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS.

7 THIRD, COST IS ALWAYS A SIGNIFICANT
8 CONCERN WHEN IT COMES TO CELL-BASED THERAPIES. AND
9 PART OF THIS PROJECT WILL BE FOCUSED ON DEVELOPING
10 NOVEL MANUFACTURING PROTOCOLS THAT WILL
11 SIGNIFICANTLY REDUCE THE TIME AND COST OF CAR-T CELL
12 THERAPY WHICH WOULD BOTH BRING BENEFIT TO PATIENTS
13 BY NOT ONLY REDUCING COST, BUT ALSO REDUCING THE
14 AMOUNT OF TIME THEY HAVE TO WAIT BEFORE THEY CAN
15 RECEIVE THERAPY.

16 FINALLY, I'D LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT THE
17 GWG VOTES FOR OUR SPECIFIC REVIEW CATEGORIES,
18 INCLUDING SIGNIFICANCE, RATIONALE, DESIGN,
19 FEASIBILITY, AND DEI, WERE ALL CONSISTENTLY 11 TO 13
20 YESES OUT OF 13, INDICATING BROAD SUPPORT. SO WE
21 HOPE THE AGS WILL CONSIDER SUPPORTING THIS VERY
22 IMPORTANT PROJECT. AND WE THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

23 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DR. CHEN.
24 YOUR TIME IS UP. I DO APOLOGIZE TO THE 619 NUMBER.
25 I HAVE NOTICED THAT THERE IS ANOTHER SPEAKER FOR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 16912. SO WE'D LIKE TO GO TO DR. LINDA LIAU FIRST
2 AND THEN WE'LL GO TO THE PHONE NUMBER. SO, DR.
3 LIAU, YOU HAVE THE FLOOR.

4 DR. LIAU: THANK YOU. CAN YOU ALL HEAR ME
5 OKAY?

6 MS. MANDAC: YES.

7 DR. LIAU: HI. I'M LINDA LIAU, AND I AM A
8 CHAIR IN THE DEPARTMENT OF NEUROSURGERY AT UCLA AND
9 DIRECTOR OF THE UCLA BRAIN CANCER SPORE, WHICH IS
10 ONE OF ONLY THREE CURRENTLY ACTIVE NCI-DESIGNATED
11 SPORE PROGRAMS IN CALIFORNIA. I'M ALSO
12 CO-INVESTIGATOR WITH DR. CHEN ON THIS APPLICATION ON
13 NEXT GENERATION CAR-T THERAPY FOR GLIOBLASTOMA WHICH
14 WAS DEEMED MERITORIOUS AND RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING,
15 BUT EXCLUDED BECAUSE OF BUDGET.

16 I'VE BEEN A PRACTICING NEUROSURGICAL
17 ONCOLOGIST FOR 27 YEARS NOW; AND DESPITE SEEING
18 AMAZING PROGRESS IN MANY OTHER CANCERS, BRAIN
19 CANCER, PARTICULARLY GLIOBLASTOMA, STILL REMAINS ONE
20 WITHOUT A CURE. AND THE AVERAGE PROGNOSIS OF THESE
21 PATIENTS IS STILL LESS THAN TWO YEARS. THE MAJORITY
22 OF THESE PATIENTS ARE YOUNG, BETWEEN THE AGES OF 30
23 TO 60, AND AT THE PRIME OF THEIR LIVES. AND IT IS
24 TRULY HEARTBREAKING TO HAVE TO BREAK THIS DIAGNOSIS
25 TO PATIENTS AND FAMILIES DAY AFTER DAY ONLY TO TELL

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THEM THAT THERE'S NOT MUCH WE CAN DO BEYOND
2 TRADITIONAL RADIATION AND CHEMOTHERAPY AND THEY
3 REALLY ONLY HAVE TWO YEARS TO LIVE.

4 WE HAVE A VERY STRONG TRACK RECORD AT UCLA
5 IN TRANSLATIONAL BRAIN CANCER RESEARCH AND BREAKING
6 NOVEL CELLULAR THERAPIES AND IMMUNOTHERAPIES TO
7 CLINICAL TRIALS, INCLUDING PERSONALIZED VACCINES AND
8 OTHER CELLULAR THERAPIES SUCH AS THE ONE THAT WE'RE
9 PROPOSING HERE.

10 I THINK ONE OF THE REASONS THAT WE CANNOT
11 YET CURE BRAIN CANCER IS BECAUSE OF ITS LOCATION IN
12 THE BRAIN AND THE WAY IT INVADES THE BRAIN.

13 GLIOBLASTOMA IS A CANCER THAT MALIGNANTLY
14 INVADES THE BRAIN WITH FINGERS OF TUMOR CELLS THAT
15 TRAVEL DEEP INTO AREAS OF THE BRAIN THAT WE CANNOT
16 TAKE OUT SURGICALLY, WE CANNOT TARGET WITH RADIATION
17 WITHOUT KILLING NORMAL BRAIN CELLS, AND WE CANNOT
18 DELIVER DRUGS TO BECAUSE OF THE BLOOD-BRAIN BARRIER
19 AND HETEROGENEITY. AS SUCH, NOVEL CELLULAR
20 THERAPIES LIKE THIS APPROACH THAT WE ARE PROPOSING
21 ARE LIKELY GOING TO BE THE MOST EFFECTIVE WAYS THAT
22 WE CAN DELIVER THERAPEUTICS TO CANCER CELLS IN THE
23 BRAIN.

24 I KNOW THAT CIRM HAS BUDGET CONSTRAINTS
25 THAT PRECLUDES FUNDING OF ALL THE MERITORIOUS GRANTS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 BEING PROPOSED, BUT WE BELIEVE THAT THE IMPACT OF
2 THIS PROJECT WILL FAR EXCEED THE INVESTMENT.
3 GLIOBLASTOMA IS AN EXTREMELY DEVASTATING DISEASE,
4 IMPACTING TENS OF THOUSANDS OF PATIENTS EACH YEAR
5 WITH NO NEW FDA-APPROVED TREATMENTS IN ALMOST 20
6 YEARS. AS SUCH, PATIENTS ARE DESPERATELY SEEKING
7 NEW, INNOVATIVE TREATMENTS. WE HAVE PATIENTS WEEKLY
8 THAT ARE LEAVING CALIFORNIA THAT ARE TRAVELING ALL
9 OVER THE COUNTRY AND TO OTHER COUNTRIES TO GET
10 CELLULAR THERAPIES THAT ARE LIKELY LESS EFFICACIOUS
11 THAN THE ONE THAT WE ARE DEVELOPING HERE.

12 CIRM HAS THE ABILITY TO MAKE CALIFORNIA
13 TRULY A LEADER IN THIS FIELD.

14 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DR. LIAU.
15 THE NEXT SPEAKER WE HAVE IS A PHONE NUMBER, (619)
16 535-6876. IF YOU COULD PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME, WHAT
17 APPLICATION YOU ARE SPEAKING ABOUT, AND THE FLOOR IS
18 NOW YOURS.

19 DR. CONWAY: HELLO. MY NAME IS ANTHONY
20 CONWAY, PI FOR APPLICATION TRAN 16956,
21 HYPOIMMUNOGENIC IPSC-DERIVED TCR-NK CELLS FOR
22 ONCOLOGY. THIS IS A RESUBMISSION OF APPLICATION
23 TRAN1-16023 WHICH WAS ALREADY APPROVED FOR FUNDING
24 BY THE ARS IN MAY 2024. I WAS THE PI FOR THAT
25 APPLICATION AS WELL, BUT UNDER A DIFFERENT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR-PROFIT INSTITUTION. THAT INSTITUTION WAS
2 UNFORTUNATELY NOT ABLE TO ACCEPT THE GRANT. BUT AS
3 PER CIRM'S GUIDANCE, I RESUBMITTED THE APPLICATION
4 UNDER A NEW NON-PROFIT INSTITUTION THAT WAS FOUNDED
5 WITH THE SPECIFIC PURPOSE OF OPERATIONALIZING THE
6 ACTIVITIES WITHIN THAT GRANT, STEM THERAPEUTICS, A
7 CALIFORNIA-BASED COMPANY.

8 THIS NEW APPLICATION, RESUBMITTED
9 APPLICATION, HAS THE SAME MILESTONES, DELIVERABLES,
10 AND A STRENGTHENED TEAM, INCLUDING HOWARD FEDEROFF,
11 A FORMER MEMBER OF THE GOVERNING BOARD OF CIRM WHERE
12 YOU ALL ARE SITTING TODAY AS WELL AS TRENT SHARE
13 (PHONETIC) OF MY COMPANY'S BOARD OF DIRECTORS. HE'S
14 FULLY SUPPORTIVE OF THIS WORK AND COMMITTED TO THE
15 SUCCESS OF STEM THERAPEUTICS AND PRO'S PROJECT. I
16 WOULD REFER YOU TO HIS LETTER OF SUPPORT SUBMITTED
17 WITHIN THE APPLICATION IN JULY OF 2024.

18 BOTH THE ORIGINAL SUBMISSION AND THE
19 RESUBMISSION WERE RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING BY THE GWG
20 WITH THE ORIGINAL SCORING OF 90 AND THE MOST RECENT
21 TIME SCORING 87. THE ORIGINALLY APPROVED FOR
22 FUNDING \$4.1 MILLION, TO THE BEST OF MY
23 UNDERSTANDING, WAS NOT USED FOR ANY OTHER PROGRAM
24 AND WENT BACK INTO THE CIRM GENERAL FUND.

25 THERE'S VARIOUS ADVANTAGES FOR THE THERAPY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PROPOSED TO BE DEVELOPED WITHIN THIS PROPOSAL ,
2 INCLUDING COMPARED TO THE CURRENTLY APPROVED
3 AUTOLOGOUS TCRT AND CAR-T THERAPIES FOR RELAPSED
4 REFRACTORY MULTIPLE MYELOMA, INCLUDING THIS
5 ALLOGENEIC TCR-NK, IS OFF THE SHELF, HAS LOW COST OF
6 GOODS, HAS A BETTER SAFETY PROFILE THAN T CELL
7 THERAPIES, HAS BETTER PATIENT ACCESSIBILITY, WHICH
8 IS A KEY FOCUS FOR THE PROPOSED WORK AND THERAPY.

9 THE FACT THAT THIS THERAPY IS ALSO
10 HYPOIMMUNOGENIC IPSC-DERIVED MEANS THAT IT'S
11 RE-DOSABLE, HAS DECREASED DRUG PRODUCT
12 HETEROGENEITY, INCREASED ANTITUMOR DURABILITY, AND
13 FORMS THE BASIS OF A HIGHLY ENGINEERABLE IPSC CELL
14 LINE THAT CAN BE USED FOR CREATING EVEN MORE HIGHLY
15 ENGINEERED CELL THERAPIES FOR RECALCITRANT SOLID
16 TUMORS.

17 THIS PATIENT POPULATION STILL HAS QUITE A
18 HIGH UNMET MEDICAL NEED AND ACTUALLY A MULTIPLE
19 MYELOMA PATIENT WILL BE SPEAKING BRIEFLY IN SUPPORT
20 OF THIS PROPOSAL AS WELL. AND SO I WOULD HIGHLY
21 ENCOURAGE THE BOARD TO RECONSIDER THE DECISION AND
22 TO FUND THIS APPLICATION WHICH HAS ALREADY BEEN
23 RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING BY THE GWG TWICE AS WELL AS
24 THE CIRM BOARD ONCE UNDER ITS ORIGINAL SUBMISSION
25 UNDER THE DIFFERENT FOR-PROFIT INSTITUTION. THANK

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU.

2 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DR.
3 CONWAY. SO THAT COMMENT WAS FOR 16956. MY SINCERE
4 APOLOGIES TO THIS NEXT SPEAKER, GLENN O'NEILL FROM
5 THE CURE SANFILIPPO FOUNDATION, FOR MISSING YOU IN
6 THE FIRST TRANCHE WHEN I WAS GOING THROUGH 16907.
7 THE FLOOR IS YOURS, GLENN.

8 DR. O'NEILL: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS GLENN
9 O'NEILL, PRESIDENT OF CURE SANFILIPPO FOUNDATION.
10 THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK ON BEHALF OF
11 THE DIRE AND URGENT NEED FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF A
12 TRANSFORMATIVE TREATMENT FOR THE CHILDREN AND
13 FAMILIES AFFECTED BY THE UTTERLY DEVASTATING
14 NEURODEGENERATIVE DISEASE CALLED SANFILIPPO SYNDROME
15 TYPE B.

16 MANY OF YOU HAVE LOVED ONES OR OTHER
17 ADULTS YOU KNOW OF WHO HAVE BEEN AFFLICTED WITH
18 FORMS OF DEMENTIA. AND I ASK YOU TO IMAGINE WHAT IT
19 WOULD BE LIKE IF IT AFFECTED NOT AN ADULT WHO HAD A
20 FULL LIFE, BUT A YOUNG CHILD WHOSE POTENTIAL IS
21 ENTIRELY STOLEN.

22 CHILDREN WITH SANFILIPPO SYNDROME FACE A
23 HEARTBREAKING PROGRESSION FOLLOWED BY FIRST INITIAL
24 DEVELOPMENTAL DELAYS FOLLOWED BY A LOSS OF SPEECH,
25 COGNITIVE ABILITY, MOTOR FUNCTION, CULMINATING IN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DEATH OFTEN IN THE TEENAGE YEARS. CHILDREN GO FROM
2 TALKING TO SCREAMING TO SILENCE, FROM EATING THEIR
3 BIRTHDAY CAKE WITH JOY TO BEING FED THROUGH G-TUBE
4 WHEN THEY CAN NO LONGER EAT BY MOUTH OR SWALLOW
5 THEIR OWN SALIVA. THEY GO FROM RUNNING WILD AND
6 FREE ON THE PLAYGROUND TO BEING UNABLE TO EVEN ROLL
7 OVER IN BED. EACH SUCCESSIVE LOSS BRINGS A NEW WAVE
8 OF GRIEF AND HARDSHIP.

9 AS THE PARENT OF A 15-YEAR-OLD DAUGHTER
10 WITH SANFILIPPO SYNDROME, I CAN TESTIFY TO THIS
11 REALITY. AND YOU CAN READ FROM OUR SUBMITTED
12 COMMENTS AND NUMBER OF LETTERS FROM AFFECTED
13 FAMILIES WHO ARE WAITING FOR THE STEM CELL THERAPY
14 THAT THIS GRANT WOULD DEVELOP. AGAIN, THERE ARE NO
15 TREATMENTS FOR THIS DISEASE WHICH IS DESTROYING OUR
16 CHILDREN'S BRAINS AND BODIES.

17 THE GRANT 16907 IS DEVELOPING A
18 HEMATOPOIETIC STEM CELL THERAPY WHICH WILL PROVIDE A
19 LIFELONG RESTORATION OF ENZYMES TO CORRECT THE ROOT
20 CAUSE OF THIS DISEASE, SAVING LIVES, AND REDUCING
21 SOCIETAL COST BURDEN OF CARE. WE RESPECTFULLY ASK
22 YOU TO RECONSIDER AND AWARD FUNDING TO THIS GRANT.

23 THIS RESEARCH HAS AN UNUSUALLY HIGH
24 LIKELIHOOD OF SUCCESS TO PROCEED TO CLINICAL TRIAL,
25 DEMONSTRATE EFFECTIVENESS, AND PROCEED THROUGH THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DRUG APPROVAL REGULATORY PATHWAY FOR THE FOLLOWING
2 REASONS. FIRST, THE TEAM HAS A DEMONSTRATED TRACK
3 RECORD AND EXPERTISE TO CONDUCT THIS WORK ACROSS
4 PHASES OF DRUG DEVELOPMENT.

5 SECONDLY, EXTREMELY POSITIVE DATA IS
6 COMING OUT OF THE CLINICAL TRIAL FOR A SISTER FORM
7 OF SANFILIPPO TYPE A WHICH WAS DEVELOPED BY THE SAME
8 SCIENTIST AS OUR CURRENT GRANT AND GIVES US
9 CONFIDENCE THAT WE'LL SEE SIMILAR RESULTS. CHILDREN
10 TREATED IN THAT TRIAL ARE ACHIEVING UNHEARD OF
11 DEVELOPMENTAL GAINS AND EVEN TYPICAL NEURO
12 DEVELOPMENT AT AN AGE WHERE THEY WOULD HAVE BEEN
13 EXPECTED TO PROGRESS TO AN INFANTILE COGNITIVE
14 LEVEL.

15 THIRD, THE SANFILIPPO COMMUNITY IS ROBUST
16 AND ACTIVE IN ITS COMMUNICATION AND COLLABORATION
17 WITH THE SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY WHICH WILL ENABLE
18 EFFICIENT AND FULL ENROLLMENT IN A FUTURE CLINICAL
19 TRIAL.

20 AND LASTLY, THE FDA IS NOW ALIGNED WITH
21 THE SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY ON THE USE OF HEPARAN
22 SULFATE AS A BIOMARKER WHICH ALLOWS US TO UTILIZE
23 THE ACCELERATED APPROVAL PATHWAY, SPEEDING AND
24 CLARIFYING THE PATH TOWARD POTENTIAL APPROVAL OF
25 THIS THERAPY.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AGAIN, WE IMPLOR THE BOARD RESPECTFULLY
2 TO EXERCISE ITS DISCRETION AND ALLOCATE FUNDING TO
3 THIS VERY MERITORIOUS AND NEEDED STEM CELL THERAPY
4 IN LINE WITH ITS PRIORITIES, TRANSFORM THE BURDEN OF
5 DEVASTATING NEUROLOGICAL DISEASE. THANK YOU FOR
6 YOUR CONSIDERATION OF OUR SINCERE REQUEST. THANK
7 YOU.

8 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, GLENN.
9 MR. CHAIR, THERE ARE NO MORE COMMENTS.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU,
11 CLAUDETTE, FOR MANAGING THAT. JUST A COMMENT ON THE
12 PUBLIC COMMENT, IF YOU WILL. THE BOARD RECEIVED A
13 VERY LARGE OUTPOURING OF COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE
14 PUBLIC AND FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY. WE
15 APPRECIATE THAT. IF I AM TYPICAL OF THE BOARD
16 MEMBERS, I SPENT MUCH OF THE LAST WEEK READING THE
17 DOZENS AND DOZENS OF THESE LETTERS IN THEIR
18 ENTIRETY. I THANK THE SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY FOR
19 THEIR EXPLANATIONS AND SOMETIMES THEIR CRITIQUE OF
20 OUR INTERNAL REVIEW. I THANK THE PARENTS AND FAMILY
21 MEMBERS OF THE AFFECTED INDIVIDUALS FOR FLESHING OUT
22 THE ENTIRE HUMAN IMPACT AND FROM OTHERS WHO JUST
23 MADE VERY, VERY STRONG ARGUMENTS.

24 SO I'M SURE ALL BOARD MEMBERS TOOK STOCK
25 OF EVERYTHING YOU SAID, AND WE APPRECIATE THE CARE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AND PASSION THAT YOU PUT INTO THAT EFFORT. THANK
2 YOU.

3 YES, MARK.

4 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: JUST A FOLLOW-UP
5 QUESTION, GIL. IF YOU COULD REMIND ME AGAIN WHAT
6 STATUS THESE APPLICATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN VETTED FOR
7 APPROVAL, BUT COULDN'T PROCEED FOR OTHER BUDGETARY
8 REASONS. WHAT SORT OF TIMELINE DOES THAT FIT INTO
9 GOING FORWARD?

10 DR. SAMBRANO: I'M SORRY. I JUST WANT TO
11 MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND THE QUESTION. YOU'RE SAYING
12 AN OPPORTUNITY FOR THE FOUR THAT ARE NOT CURRENTLY
13 RECOMMENDED BY THE CIRM TEAM TO HAVE AN ANOTHER
14 OPPORTUNITY?

15 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.

16 DR. SAMBRANO: SO THIS IS SIMILAR TO
17 REMIND IN THE SENSE THAT WE'RE BRINGING NEW CONCEPTS
18 TO THE BOARD IN MARCH THAT INCLUDES A MORE
19 COMPREHENSIVE PROGRAM THAT'S RELATED TO
20 TRANSLATIONAL ACTIVITIES PLUS OTHERS THAT WE WOULD
21 EXPECT THESE COULD COME INTO ONCE THAT PROGRAM IS
22 LAUNCHED. AND SO WE HAVE THE PROGRAMS TEAMS. AND,
23 SHYAM, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK TO THAT IN
24 A LITTLE MORE DETAIL.

25 DR. PATEL: YEAH. WE'RE WORKING AS FAST

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AS WE CAN TO DEVELOP A NEW PROGRAM, PRECLINICAL
2 DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM, WHICH IS GOING TO COMBINE ON
3 THE TRANSLATIONAL AND IND-ENABLING ACTIVITIES, WHICH
4 IS THE CLIN1, TO CREATE A FUNDING OPPORTUNITY THAT
5 COULD POTENTIALLY ACCELERATE PROGRAMS FASTER THAN WE
6 ARE DOING TO DATE.

7 DR. BARRETT: CAN I ASK A QUESTION ABOUT
8 16956, WHICH WAS A RESUBMISSION? AND IF I
9 UNDERSTOOD THE SPEAKER CORRECTLY, THEY SAID THAT THE
10 ORIGINAL --

11 THE REPORTER: MICROPHONE. THANK YOU.

12 DR. BARRETT: I WANTED TO SPEAK ABOUT
13 16956. AND IF I UNDERSTOOD THE SPEAKER CORRECTLY,
14 WHO SPOKE ON BEHALF OF THIS APPLICATION, IT WAS
15 ORIGINALLY AWARDED AND WAS NOT ABLE TO BE ACCEPTED
16 BY THE PREVIOUS INSTITUTION. SO COULD SOMEBODY
17 EXPLAIN WHY THAT WAS THE CASE?

18 DR. PATEL: YES. THIS SPEAKER HAS
19 MENTIONED IT, SO I CAN SPEAK TO THAT AS WELL, WHICH
20 IS THAT THIS APPLICATION WAS AWARDED FOR FUNDING IN
21 THE PRIOR ROUND WHERE THERE WAS, AGAIN, A LIMITATION
22 OF FUNDING. IT WAS ONE OF THE ONES THAT WAS AWARDED
23 BY THE BOARD. DURING THE AWARD CONTRACTING, THE
24 COMPANY DIVESTED FROM THAT PROGRAM, AND IT DIVESTED
25 FROM A SIMILAR PROGRAM ALSO THAT IS ONGOING RIGHT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 NOW AT MD ANDERSON WHERE THEY'RE IN CLINICAL TRIAL
2 WITH A CORD BLOOD-DERIVED APPROACH FOR THE SAME
3 INDICATION AND BASICALLY THE SAME TARGET.

4 AND SO THIS IS THE IPSC-DERIVED VERSION.
5 AND SO IN THIS PARTICULAR INSTANCE, THEY FORMED A
6 NON-PROFIT AND REAPPLIED FOR THIS ROUND.

7 DR. BARRETT: THANK YOU.

8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: FINAL
9 OPPORTUNITY --

10 DR. DULIEGE: SO WE ARE CONTINUING TO
11 EVALUATE, MAYBE SLIGHTLY STRUGGLE WITH THE SITUATION
12 OF THESE FOUR APPLICATIONS BECAUSE, AGAIN, TO
13 CLARIFY, THE CIRM TEAM BELIEVE THAT THEY HAVE MERIT
14 TO BE FUNDED. IT'S REALLY A MATTER OF MOSTLY
15 BUDGET, TO A LESSER EXTENT DIVERSITY OF THE
16 APPLICATIONS.

17 AND SO EITHER SHYAM OR MAYBE J.T. AS WELL,
18 WHAT ARE GOING TO BE THE MECHANISM WHERE WE CAN
19 ADDRESS IT WHILE STILL RESPECTING THE NEED TO BE
20 STRINGENT FROM A BUDGET PERSPECTIVE AND IN VIEW OF
21 THE FACT THAT EVERYONE WHO IS AFFECTED BY THIS
22 DISEASE DIRECTLY OR INDIRECTLY, I WOULD SAY MOSTLY
23 THE FAMILY AND THE PATIENTS, REALLY FEEL A SENSE OF
24 URGENCY. WE KEEP THAT IN MIND. IT'S AT THE
25 FOREFRONT AND YET WE CANNOT ALWAYS ACT PURELY ON

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THAT FOR REASONS I JUST MENTIONED. SO THANKS.

2 WHAT WILL HAPPEN NEXT? THEY WILL BE ABLE
3 TO RESUBMIT? WE NEVER CAN PROMISE ANYTHING AHEAD OF
4 TIME, BUT THERE IS A FAIR LIKELIHOOD OF ACCEPTANCE
5 AND, AGAIN, NO PROMISE THERE? CAN YOU CLARIFY THAT
6 AND TIMELINES PLEASE?

7 DR. PATEL: SINCE THE PROGRAM IS UNDER
8 DEVELOPMENT, I CAN'T COMMENT BEYOND THAT. BUT THAT
9 PROGRAM IS DESIGNED TO COVER THE RANGE OF ACTIVITIES
10 THAT ARE BEING PROPOSED HERE PLUS MORE TO GET TO THE
11 IND.

12 DR. DULIEGE: TIMELINES PLEASE.

13 DR. PATEL: SO RIGHT NOW WHAT WE PUBLICLY
14 DISCLOSED IS THAT WE WOULD TAKE THAT CONCEPT TO THE
15 END OF MARCH BOARD MEETING. OUR NORMAL TIMELINES
16 FOR ACTIVATING A PROGRAM ARE ROUGHLY TWO MONTHS
17 AFTER THE CONCEPT APPROVAL. AND OUR INTENT IS TO
18 MOVE AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE FOR A VERY COMPLICATED
19 PROGRAM THAT WE'RE DEVELOPING HERE. THAT WOULD BE
20 WHAT WE HAVE HISTORICALLY DONE.

21 DR. DULIEGE: JUST TO BE CLEAR AGAIN. AND
22 THERE'S MANY IFS HERE. AND THESE ARE IMPORTANT.

23 DR. CANET-AVILES: WE NEED TO TAKE INTO
24 ACCOUNT THAT IT WILL BE CONCOMITANT WITH THE OTHERS.
25 BUT WE ARE TRYING TO REVAMP THE PROCESSES INTERNALLY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SO WE CAN BE MORE EFFICIENT AND SWIFT. SO LATE
2 SPRING IS WHEN THESE APPLICATIONS COULD BE AVAILABLE
3 FOR APPLYING, WE HOPE, IF THE BOARD APPROVES IN
4 MARCH. THAT'S THE GOAL. THAT'S WHAT WE ARE ALL
5 WORKING TOWARDS.

6 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: JUDY CHOU HAS A
7 COMMENT AND THEN SUZANNE.

8 DR. CHOU: MAYBE IT'S A COMMENT AS WELL AS
9 A QUESTION. THIS MAY NOT BE SPECIFICALLY ADDRESSING
10 THE APPLICATION OF 16907, BUT I THINK I'D LIKE TO
11 KNOW. FIRST OF ALL, I BELIEVE THE PREVALENCE OF THE
12 DISEASE MUST BE A VERY IMPORTANT FACTOR WHEN WE
13 CONSIDER THE GRANT. AND THEN IF THERE'S ARGUMENT
14 ABOUT THIS DISCREPANCY THERE, HOW DO WE ADDRESS
15 THAT? AND THAT'S A QUESTION TO THE TEAM. AND THIS
16 WAS HOW DO WE TAKE THAT INTO CONSIDERATION?

17 DR. PATEL: CERTAINLY. WE LOOKED INTO
18 THAT. AND THE REVIEWERS' COMMENTS, WHILE THERE ARE
19 SOME TYPOS, THEY ARE BASED ON A PUBLICATION THAT WAS
20 CITED BY THE APPLICANT AS WELL. IN THAT PUBLICATION
21 THEY LOOKED AT A 20-YEAR TIME FRAME OF PATIENTS WHO
22 HAD BEEN REGISTERED AS MEMBERS WHO HAVE THE VARIOUS
23 TYPES OF MPS. IN THERE THEY FOUND THAT IN THE U.S.
24 AS A WHOLE 40 PATIENTS WERE REGISTERED WITH HAVING
25 MPSIIIB. NOW, THIS IS NOT NEWBORN SCREENING, BUT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THAT'S WHAT THEY HAD PUT IN THERE OVER A 20-YEAR
2 PERIOD.

3 SO BASED ON THAT, THEY CALCULATED
4 INCIDENCE AND PREVALENCE, WHICH IS SOME OF WHICH WAS
5 BEING CITED BY THE REVIEWERS.

6 THERE HAVE BEEN OTHER STUDIES DONE. FOR
7 EXAMPLE, THERE HAS BEEN A TAIWANESE STUDY WHERE OVER
8 A ONE-YEAR PERIOD THEY DID NEWBORN SCREENING FOR
9 VARIOUS TYPES OF RARE DISEASES, INCLUDING MPSIIIB.
10 IN THERE THEY SCREENED 70,000 PATIENTS AND FOUR
11 PATIENTS HAD MPSIIIB, WHICH IS 1 IN 25,000 INCIDENCE
12 THAT YOU HEAR.

13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SUZANNE. I'M SORRY.
14 YES.

15 DR. SANDMEYER: SO I REALIZED INFORMALLY
16 COMMUNITIES ARE ALWAYS SUPPORTING AND POTENTIATING
17 THE WORK THAT CIRM DOES. SO MY QUESTION IS IS THERE
18 ANY FORMAL PRECEDENT FOR HAVING COMMUNITIES MATCH
19 CIRM FUNDING?

20 DR. SAMBRANO: THERE'S PRECEDENT FOR
21 MATCHING, BUT TYPICALLY THE WAY WE TREAT THE
22 APPLICATIONS IS THERE'S A SPECIFIC BUDGET REQUEST
23 FOR ACTIVITIES. AND SO WE EITHER FUND THE FULL
24 AMOUNT OR WE DON'T. WE HAVEN'T HAD A PRECEDENT
25 WHERE WE AWARD HALF OF WHAT'S REQUESTED AND ALLOW

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR MATCHING, AT LEAST HISTORICALLY.

2 DR. SANDMEYER: IT COULD BE REQUIRED AS A
3 MATCH.

4 DR. SAMBRANO: OH, AND WE HAVE. WE HAVE
5 REQUIRED CO-FUNDING, WE HAVE REQUIRED MATCHING, AND
6 SOME DO MATCH, BUT WE NORMALLY KNOW OF THAT AHEAD OF
7 TIME, NOT IN THE COURSE OF, SAY, A DECISION HERE.

8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ANNE-MARIE.

9 DR. DULIEGE: SO MAYBE LET'S FOLLOW UP ON
10 THIS POINT. I'M NOT SUGGESTING THAT WE CHANGE THE
11 WAY WE OPERATE TODAY FOR A VARIETY OF REASONS. BUT
12 I'M CURIOUS TO HEAR FROM THE CIRM TEAM AT LARGE IF
13 THIS SITUATION COULD BE CONSIDERED IN THE NEAR
14 FUTURE. IS THERE MERIT TO THIS RECOMMENDATION THAT
15 WAS MADE BY A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC AS WELL AS BY ONE
16 OF OUR COLLEAGUES HERE? AND THE CONSIDERATION IS
17 THAT IF THE FUNDING -- THERE'S LIMITATION IN
18 FUNDING, COULD IT BE CONSIDERED THAT WE WOULD APPLY
19 PARTIAL FUNDING MATCHED BY PERSONAL FINANCES AND
20 FUND-RAISING OTHERWISE? PLEASE COMMENT ON MERIT
21 VERSUS DOWNSIDES, NOT FOR TODAY, BUT SHOULD WE
22 CONSIDER IT IN THE FUTURE?

23 DR. THOMAS: SO I DO NOT THINK IT'S
24 APPROPRIATE FOR TODAY SINCE WE'RE ON THE FLY, BUT IT
25 IS SOMETHING THAT WE CAN DISCUSS INTERNALLY ON THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 TEAM AND REVERT BACK.

2 DR. DULIEGE: THAT'S EXACTLY MY POINT.

3 THANK YOU.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: IS THERE ANYONE --

5 MR. TOCHER: WE DO HAVE ADDITIONAL PUBLIC

6 COMMENT THAT THE PERSON WHO WAS UNABLE TO REACH

7 THROUGH THE FIRST ROUND. SO IF YOU'D LIKE TO MAKE

8 THAT. CLAUDETTE.

9 DR. THOMAS: COULD YOU HOLD ON ONE SECOND?

10 DR. PATEL HAS A RELEVANT POINT TO MAKE HERE.

11 DR. PATEL: THERE IS AN EXAMPLE OF AN

12 APPLICANT COMMITTING CO-FUNDING AT THE BOARD MEETING

13 AND THE AWARD BEING PARTIALLY FUNDED. WE'RE LOOKING

14 INTO THE DETAILS OF THAT AT THE MOMENT.

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SHYAM, CAN YOU BE A

16 LITTLE MORE SPECIFIC?

17 MR. TOCHER: I THINK HE SAID HE'S LOOKING

18 INTO IT.

19 DR. PATEL: WE'RE LOOKING INTO IT IF THAT

20 IS RELEVANT TO THE BOARD. IF YOU WANT US TO

21 CONTINUE LOOKING INTO IT, WE CAN.

22 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YEAH. I'M SORRY. BUT

23 I APPRECIATE YOU TRUNCATING THAT, BUT WHAT DID YOU

24 MEAN WHEN YOU FIRST SPOKE WHEN YOU SAID EXAMPLE?

25 ARE YOU SAYING THAT THERE'S BEEN PRECEDENTS? ARE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU SAYING THERE'S -- I THINK AS A BOARD MEMBER AND
2 SINCE YOU DID STATE THAT OUT LOUD, I'D LIKE TO
3 BETTER UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU WERE GETTING AT. THANK
4 YOU.

5 DR. PATEL: CERTAINLY. SO I USED TO BE ON
6 THE REVIEW TEAM, AND I RECALL AN EXAMPLE. THIS WAS
7 DURING THE PROP 71 DAYS WHERE THERE WAS A SIMILAR
8 ISSUE IN TERMS OF BUDGETS. AND THERE WAS AN
9 APPLICANT WHO HAD AT THE BOARD MEETING PROPOSED TO
10 CO-FUND AN APPLICATION. AND SO WE'RE LOOKING INTO
11 THAT AND WHAT THE SITUATION THERE WAS.

12 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: I APPRECIATE YOUR
13 TRANSPARENCY AND HISTORY.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I APOLOGIZE FOR
15 INTERRUPTING. THERE'S STILL PUBLIC COMMENT TO BE
16 MADE ON 16956.

17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: IS THIS A MEMBER OF
18 THE PUBLIC SPEAKING, CLAUDETTE?

19 MS. MANDAC: WE CAN GO UNMUTED, BUT YES.
20 WE DO HAVE A HAND RAISED. WE DID EXPECT A PUBLIC
21 COMMENT ON 16956. WE WERE NOTIFIED THROUGH A
22 YOUTUBE CHAT. A REMINDER TO EVERYONE WATCHING,
23 YOUTUBE IS ONLY FOR VIEWING. THERE IS NO ABILITY
24 FOR US TO HEAR PUBLIC COMMENT THROUGH YOUTUBE. SO
25 ALL THE DIAL-IN INFORMATION ON THE AGENDA IS TO JOIN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE ZOOM WHERE YOU CAN MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. THE
2 AGENDA ALSO HAS INSTRUCTIONS IF YOU'RE DIALING IN BY
3 PHONE. YOU MUST PRESS STAR NINE. FOR THOSE VIDEO
4 CONFERENCING, YOU RAISE A HAND.

5 SO WE DO HAVE A PERSON WITH A HAND RAISED,
6 (408) 773-3800. IF YOU COULD UNMUTE YOURSELF, YOU
7 WILL HAVE THREE MINUTES. PLEASE MAKE SURE TO
8 IDENTIFY YOURSELF AND THE APPLICATION NUMBER. YOUR
9 TIME STARTS NOW.

10 DR. TSAI: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. MY NAME
11 IS RUBY TSAI. I AM THE CEO AND FOUNDER OF APPLIED
12 STEM CELL, A CALIFORNIA CORPORATION BASED IN
13 MILPITAS, CALIFORNIA.

14 SO TODAY I'M HERE TO EXPRESS MY SUPPORT
15 FOR ANTHONY CONWAY'S CIRM GRANT. THE GRANT NUMBER
16 IS 16956. FOR THIS GRANT WE WILL PROVIDE GMP GRADE
17 IPSC LINES AND GENE EDITING CAPABILITIES UNDER GMP
18 TO SUPPORT HIS RESEARCH. AND WE ARE ALSO AN
19 INDUSTRY PARTNER OF CIRM, PROVIDING GMP GRADE IPSC
20 LINES TO CIRM GRANTEES.

21 SO OVER THE PAST 16 YEARS, WE HAVE
22 EMPLOYED HUNDREDS OF INDIVIDUALS IN CALIFORNIA,
23 CONTRIBUTING SIGNIFICANTLY TO THE STATE ECONOMY AND
24 ALSO IN ADVANCING STEM CELLS AND REGENERATIVE
25 MEDICINE RESEARCH.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SO ANTHONY'S PROPOSAL ADDRESSES NOT ONLY
2 CRITICAL UNMET NEEDS OF ONCOLOGY PATIENTS, BUT ALSO
3 BROADER CHALLENGES IN THE ALLOGENEIC CELL THERAPY
4 SPACE. AS YOU KNOW, CURRENTLY MOST APPROVED CELL
5 THERAPIES ARE AUTOLOGOUS, SUCH AS CAR-T CELL
6 THERAPY, MEANING ONE PRODUCT IS MADE FOR ONE
7 PATIENT. THESE THERAPIES ARE PROHIBITIVELY
8 EXPENSIVE AND COSTING \$450,000 PER DOSE AND UP TO
9 SEVERAL MILLION DOLLARS FOR TWO OR THREE DOSES.
10 EVEN MORE CONCERNING IS THAT LESS THAN 5 PERCENT OF
11 PATIENTS HAVE ACCESS TO THESE TREATMENTS.

12 ANTHONY'S INNOVATIVE APPROACH STARTS WITH
13 ONE SINGLE CELL LINE, WHICH IS IPSC OR INDUCED
14 PLURIPOTENT STEM CELLS, ENGINEERED TO BE
15 HYPOIMMUNOGENIC AND TARGET TO KILL CANCER CELLS. SO
16 THIS ALLOWS THE RESULTING CELL PRODUCTS TO SERVE
17 MANY PATIENTS IN A COST-EFFECTIVE MANNER. SO THESE
18 OFF-THE-SHELF PRODUCTS CAN PROVIDE ON-DEMAND
19 TREATMENT, ADDRESSING THE URGENT NEEDS OF PATIENTS
20 WHO CANNOT AFFORD TO WAIT FOR CUSTOM THERAPIES.
21 PATIENTS DON'T HAVE TIME TO WAIT AND PATIENTS NEED
22 TO BE TREATED RIGHT NOW.

23 SO AT APPLIED STEM CELL WE ENVISION A
24 WORLD WHERE EVERYONE HAS ACCESS TO THE MEDICINES
25 THEY NEED BECAUSE THEY'RE AFFORDABLE, AVAILABLE, AND

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 EFFECTIVE. SO ANTHONY'S PROJECT ALIGNS PERFECTLY
2 WITH APPLIED STEM CELL'S VISION. SO ON BEHALF OF
3 APPLIED STEM CELL'S BOARD OF DIRECTORS, I'M VERY
4 PLEASED TO PROVIDE THIS NEW INFORMATION TO THE CIRM
5 BOARD REGARDING CO-FUNDING.

6 APPLIED STEM CELL WILL PROVIDE A HALF
7 MILLION DOLLARS EITHER IN CASH OR IN KIND TO SUPPORT
8 ANTHONY'S PROPOSED CIRM PROJECT CONTINGENT UPON HIS
9 SUCCESSFUL RECEIPT OF THE CIRM FUNDING FOR GRANT.
10 THE NUMBER AGAIN IS 16956. AND AS ANTHONY ALREADY
11 MENTIONED, THIS GRANT WAS FUNDED, AWARDED...

12 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH. RUBY, THE
13 TIME IS UP.

14 ARE THERE ANY OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
15 WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE COMMENT ON TRANSLATIONAL
16 PROGRAM APPLICATIONS? AS A REMINDER --

17 MR. STEVENSON: YEAH. MY NAME IS ALLEN
18 STEVENSON.

19 MS. MANDAC: OKAY. IF YOU COULD IDENTIFY
20 YOUR NAME, THE APPLICATION NUMBER, AND YOU HAVE
21 THREE MINUTES.

22 MR. STEVENSON: MY NAME IS ALLEN
23 STEVENSON. I'M SPEAKING ON APPLICATION 16956.
24 MARCH 30TH OF 2016, I WAS SICK AND STANDING IN THE
25 SHOWER AND I STARTED COUGHING. IT CAUSED MY L5

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 VERTEBRA TO COLLAPSE. I LATER FOUND OUT I HAD
2 FRACTURES IN EVERY VERTEBRA, I HAD CLUSTERS OF
3 FRACTURES IN MY RIBS AND STERNUM, AND I HAD LESIONS
4 ALL OVER MY BODY. THEY TOLD MY WIFE THAT MY SKULL
5 LOOKED LIKE SWISS CHEESE.

6 SO I'M A PATIENT. I'VE BEEN FIGHTING
7 MULTIPLE MYELOMA SINCE 2016. I'M ALSO INVOLVED IN
8 PATIENT ADVOCACY, AND I RUN A FACEBOOK GROUP WITH
9 ABOUT 9,000 MEMBERS FROM AROUND THE WORLD.

10 I KNOW THE NEEDS OF THE MULTIPLE MYELOMA
11 COMMUNITY GLOBALLY. THE CURRENT TREATMENTS CARRY
12 MANY SIDE EFFECTS AND RISKS. THEY'RE EXTREMELY HARD
13 ON PATIENTS. I DID BACK-TO-BACK STEM CELL
14 TRANSPLANTS. ONE OF MY MEMBERS THAT DID CAR-T
15 RECENTLY DID NOT RECOVER. THEY'RE ALSO FINANCIALLY
16 VERY, VERY DIFFICULT BECAUSE OF THE NEED TO TRAVEL
17 FOR THESE REALLY HARD TREATMENT OPTIONS.

18 SO I'M FULLY SUPPORTIVE OF THIS PROPOSED
19 THERAPY. THERE'S JUST A NEED FOR MORE TREATMENT
20 OPTIONS FOR THIS INCURABLE DISEASE. GOOGLE DOES NOT
21 SAY NICE THINGS ABOUT MULTIPLE MYELOMA. AT THE TIME
22 I WAS DIAGNOSED IT SAID THAT I HAD A FIVE-YEAR LIFE
23 EXPECTANCY. THIS CAN HELP MEET THE NEEDS OF THE
24 UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES AND ALLOW PEOPLE IN RURAL
25 AREAS A TREATMENT OPTION THAT DOES NOT REQUIRE THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 EXPENSIVE TRAVEL TO THE MAJOR TREATMENT CENTERS.
2 THANK YOU. ONE AGAIN, THIS IS ON APPLICATION 16956
3 THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY FUNDED FOR 4.1 MILLION.

4 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, ALLEN.

5 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, SIR. I
6 HAD ANNE-MARIE AND THEN J.T.

7 DR. DULIEGE: J.T., GO FIRST AND I'LL
8 FOLLOW.

9 DR. THOMAS: SO WITH RESPECT TO THIS
10 NOTION OF SUPPLYING CO-FUNDING, ET CETERA, THE
11 UNDERSTANDING IN THE PREVIOUS INSTANCE WAS THERE
12 WAS -- THE CO-FUNDING WAS BROUGHT TO THE TABLE
13 IMMEDIATELY, WHICH IS A DIFFERENT SITUATION THAN
14 WE'RE DEALING WITH HERE OF A SUGGESTION THAT
15 CO-FUNDING COULD BE ATTAINED PHILANTHROPICALLY OR
16 WHATEVER. THIS IS JUST NOT THE TIME TO TRY TO GET
17 INTO THAT. AT SUCH TIME AS THE APPLICANT WOULD
18 REAPPLY, WHICH WOULD, AS DR. PATEL SAID, BE SOMETIME
19 IN THE SPRING, ASSUMING THE BOARD APPROVES THE
20 PREDEVELOPMENT CONCEPT PLAN IN MARCH, TO THE EXTENT
21 THAT THERE IS AN ELEMENT OF THIS THAT WOULD
22 CONTEMPLATE A CO-FUNDING ADDITION TO THE CIRM GRANT,
23 THAT CAN BE BROUGHT AND BE PART OF THE ANALYSIS OF
24 THE GWG. THIS JUST ISN'T THE APPROPRIATE TIME TO
25 GET INTO THAT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. DULIEGE: TOTALLY AGREE. AND I WANTED
2 TO CLARIFY THAT IT IS FREQUENTLY THE CASE THAT AS
3 BOARD MEMBERS WE HAVE TO WALK THIS FINE LINE BETWEEN
4 CERTAINLY LISTENING TO THE COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC
5 AND AT THE SAME TIME SUPPORTING THE CIRM TEAM'S
6 QUALITY RECOMMENDATION THAT THEY HAVE MADE AFTER
7 VERY CAREFULLY THINKING ABOUT ALL THE PROS AND CONS.

8 AND SO IN FOLLOW-UP TO WHAT YOU JUST SAID,
9 J.T., I SUPPORT APPROVING THE RECOMMENDATION THAT
10 HAS BEEN MADE WHILE MAYBE HAVING SOME FEEDBACK AT
11 ANOTHER TIME IN DUE TIME ABOUT THESE OPPORTUNITIES
12 FOR CO-FUNDING, WHEN, HOW, AND WHY, AND MAYBE
13 WHETHER THEY ARE HELPFUL OR NOT. SO THANK YOU FOR
14 THAT, J.T., FOR THIS CLARIFICATION.

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I SEE NO OTHER HAND
16 FROM BOARD MEMBERS, AND THE PUBLIC, HAVING BEEN
17 HEARD FROM, SCOTT, YOU MAY PROCEED TO A VOTE ON THE
18 MOTION.

19 MR. TOCHER: SURE. AND I'LL REITERATE.
20 THE MOTION IS TO ACCEPT THE TEAM'S RECOMMENDATION TO
21 FUND THE 13 APPLICATIONS IDENTIFIED IN THE
22 PRESENTATION AND TO NOT FUND THE REMAINING
23 APPLICATIONS.

24 JUDY CHOU.

25 DR. CHOU: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.
2 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.
3 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.
4 DR. DULIEGE: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
6 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.
8 DR. HIGGINS: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
11 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
12 MR. LAJARA: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
14 DR. PADILLA: YES.
15 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.
16 MR. PANETTA: YES.
17 MR. TOCHER: MARV SOUTHARD.
18 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
19 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
20 MS. WYTE: YES.
21 MR. TOCHER: AND KEVIN XU.
22 DR. XU: YES.
23 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU. THE MOTION
24 CARRIES.
25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANKS, SCOTT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: AS A POINT OF ORDER, I THINK
2 WHAT WE'LL DO IS, GIVEN WHERE WE ARE IN THE
3 SCHEDULE, WE'LL BREAK FOR LUNCH NOW, RETURN IN 45
4 MINUTES. SO LET'S SAY 12:50, AND WE'LL PICK UP THE
5 CLIN ROUND AT THAT TIME.

6 SORRY. MARK.

7 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YEAH. I JUST WANT
8 TO TAKE THE PERSPECTIVE THAT IN ADDITION TO
9 OPPORTUNITIES FOR BEING ABLE TO REAPPLY FOR GRANTS,
10 HOPEFULLY IN THE RELATIVELY NEAR TERM, BECAUSE OF
11 THE CIRCUMSTANCES AROUND SOME OF THESE APPLICATIONS
12 WHERE THEY HAD TO PASS THE REVIEW PROCESS, BUT
13 THERE'S INSUFFICIENT BUDGETARY DOLLARS, THAT WE HAVE
14 SORT OF AN INTERNAL FLAG OF SPECIAL CONSIDERATION,
15 NOT IN TERMS OF THE PROCESSES, BUT JUST HIGHLIGHTING
16 WHAT THE CIRCUMSTANCES ARE. SO AS WE GO THROUGH THE
17 REVIEW PROCESSES, THAT THIS IS IN A CATEGORY THAT
18 GETS HIGHLIGHTED.

19 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: I'M SO GRATEFUL FOR THE
20 DISCUSSION AND FOR THE SHARING OF THE PUBLIC. AND I
21 MIGHT I SAY THAT IS ONE OF THE MOST WELL-BEHAVED
22 THREE-YEARS-OLDS I'VE SEEN. I HAVE TWO LITTLE BOYS
23 AND THEY WOULD BE CLIMBING THE WALL. SO GOOD JOB,
24 PARENTS. KEEP IT UP.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I THINK WE CAN GO TO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 LUNCH AND RETURN AT 12:50. THANK YOU.

2 (A RECESS WAS TAKEN.)

3 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I'D LIKE TO COME
4 BACK INTO SESSION FOR PART 2. HAYLEY, DON'T GO
5 AWAY. WE'RE GOING TO DIRECT OUR ATTENTION NOW TO
6 AGENDA ITEM NO. 10. THIS IS THE CONSIDERATION OF
7 ALL THE APPLICATIONS THAT WERE SUBMITTED IN RESPONSE
8 TO A CLINICAL PROGRAM ANNOUNCEMENT. AND THE
9 PRESENTATION WILL BE MADE BY DR. HAYLEY LAM.

10 DR. LAM: GOOD AFTERNOON. IT'S MY
11 PLEASURE TODAY TO PRESENT THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP
12 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE CLINICAL PROGRAM.

13 AS ALWAYS, WE BEGIN WITH OUR MISSION,
14 ACCELERATING WORLD-CLASS SCIENCE TO DELIVER
15 TRANSFORMATIVE REGENERATIVE MEDICINE TREATMENTS IN
16 AN EQUITABLE MANNER TO A DIVERSE CALIFORNIA AND
17 WORLD.

18 CURRENT STATUS OF THE CLINICAL BUDGET WAS
19 APPROVED JUST IN DECEMBER FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE
20 FISCAL YEAR FOR 76.7 MILLION. THE CURRENT ASK TODAY
21 FOR THESE SIX APPLICATIONS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION
22 ARE A TOTAL LITTLE OVER 50 MILLION.

23 A BIT ON THE CLINICAL PROCESS WHICH IS
24 DIFFERENT FROM THE TRANSLATIONAL, WHICH WE DISCUSSED
25 BEFORE LUNCH. THE SCORING SYSTEM IS A 1, 2, 3. A 1

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IS A RECOMMENDATION FOR FUNDING. A 2 IS A DO NOT
2 RECOMMEND AT THIS TIME, BUT PROVIDES THE APPLICANT
3 TO SUBMIT WITH REVISIONS IN RESPONSE TO THE GRANTS
4 WORKING GROUP. AND A SCORE OF 3 IS A DO NOT
5 RECOMMEND, AND THE APPLICANT CANNOT RESUBMIT THE
6 APPLICATION FOR SIX MONTHS.

7 THE SCIENTIFIC SCORING IS BASED ON THE
8 FOLLOWING FIVE REVIEW CRITERIA. DOES THE PROJECT
9 HOLD THE NECESSARY SIGNIFICANCE AND POTENTIAL FOR
10 IMPACT? IS THE RATIONALE SOUND? DOES THE DATA
11 SUPPORT THE PROJECT? IS THE PROJECT WELL-PLANNED
12 AND DESIGNED? SO IS WHAT THEY'RE PLANNING TO DO
13 WITH THE AWARD APPROPRIATE? IS THE PROJECT
14 FEASIBLE? SO DOES IT HAVE A TEAM AND RESOURCES IN
15 PLACE TO EXECUTE? AND DOES THE PROJECT UPHOLD
16 PRINCIPLES OF DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION? SO
17 FOR THE CLINICAL PROGRAM, THIS FOCUSES PRIMARILY ON
18 HEALTH EQUITY AND DIVERSITY.

19 THE CLINICAL PROGRAM ALSO HAS A DIVERSITY,
20 EQUITY, AND INCLUSION SCORE. THE SCORE IS
21 DETERMINED BY THE BOARD MEMBERS OF THE GRANTS
22 WORKING GROUP, AND THE SCORING SYSTEM IS DIFFERENT.
23 IT'S FROM A ZERO TO TEN. A TEN BEING AN OUTSTANDING
24 RESPONSE.

25 THE CRITERIA FOR THE DEI SCORE ARE AROUND

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE OVERARCHING CATEGORIES OF THE OVERALL COMMITMENT
2 OF THE APPLICANT TO DEI, THE PROJECT PLANS THAT THEY
3 PLAN TO EXECUTE IN SPECIFICITY WITH DEI, AND WITH
4 REGARDS TO THE CULTURAL SENSITIVITY OF THE TEAM.

5 SO TOGETHER THE FORM OF THE REVIEW PANEL
6 IS UP TO 15 MEMBERS OF THE ROLES, AND THESE FOLKS A
7 SCIENTIFIC SCORE FOR ALL APPLICATIONS. THESE ARE
8 EXPERTS IN DISEASE AREA, MANUFACTURING, PRODUCT
9 DEVELOPMENT, AND REGULATORY. WE ALSO HAVE OUR
10 GRANTS WORKING GROUP BOARD MEMBERS WHO ARE PATIENT
11 ADVOCATE AND NURSE MEMBERS OF THE BOARD HERE, AND
12 THEY PROVIDE THE DEI EVALUATION AND PROVIDE A DEI
13 SCORE ON ALL APPLICATIONS AS WELL AS CAN PROVIDE A
14 SUGGESTED SCIENTIFIC SCORE IF THEY SO CHOOSE.

15 FOR THE CLINICAL PANELS, WE ALSO HAVE
16 SCIENTIFIC SPECIALISTS WHICH ARE NOT VOTING FOLKS
17 THAT PROVIDE A SCIENTIFIC EVALUATION IN SPECIALIZED
18 EXPERTISE AS NEEDED.

19 SO ON TO THE SPECIFIC APPLICATIONS FOR
20 TODAY. THE FIRST ONE UP FOR DISCUSSION IS
21 CLIN1-16103. THIS IS A GENE THERAPY FOR DOK7,
22 CONGENITAL MYASTHENIC SYNDROME. THE APPLICANT IS
23 REQUESTING JUST UNDER 3 MILLION WITH AROUND 700,000
24 IN CO-FUNDING FROM A CALIFORNIA ORGANIZATION. AND
25 THIS IS TO COMPLETE THE TASKS NEEDED TO FILE AN IND.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 A LITTLE BACKGROUND ABOUT THIS PROJECT.
2 THE TARGETED INDICATION IS A GROUP OF RARE
3 NEUROMUSCULAR DISORDERS THAT RESULTS IN MUSCLE
4 WEAKNESS AND DUE TO THE FAULTY SIGNALING BETWEEN THE
5 NERVE AND THE MUSCLE CELLS. THE SEVERITY OF THE
6 DISEASE HAS A WIDE RANGE FROM NEEDING TO USE
7 BREATHING AIDS TO A COMPLETE INABILITY TO MOVE.

8 CURRENT STANDARD OF CARE TREATS THE
9 SYMPTOMS ONLY AND ARE ESSENTIALLY TREATMENTS THAT
10 HELP WITH THE SIGNAL TRANSMISSION BETWEEN THE
11 NEURONS AND MUSCLE CELLS. THESE TREATMENTS REQUIRE
12 CHRONIC ADMINISTRATION, AND THE EFFECTIVENESS OF
13 THEM CAN DECREASE OVER TIME. THE PROPOSED GENE
14 THERAPY COULD POTENTIALLY BE A ONE-TIME TREATMENT.

15 CIRM DOES NOT HAVE ANY OTHER PORTFOLIO
16 PROJECTS THAT ARE ACTIVE IN THE TRANSLATIONAL AND
17 CLINICAL SPACE, AND THE APPLICANT HAS NOT PREVIOUSLY
18 RECEIVED CIRM FUNDING.

19 THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GRANTS WORKING
20 GROUP WAS A UNANIMOUS RECOMMENDATION TO FUND
21 CLIN1-16103 WITH A DEI SCORE OF 8, AND THE CIRM TEAM
22 RECOMMENDATION CONCURS WITH THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP
23 FOR A RECOMMENDATION TO FUND THIS APPLICATION FOR
24 2.89 MILLION.

25 I'LL HAND IT OVER TO CHAIR IMBASCIANI.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, HAYLEY.

2 ANY MEMBERS IN CONFLICT?

3 MR. TOCHER: YES.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: NO, NOT FOR THIS
5 ONE.

6 MR. TOCHER: NO, THERE ARE. THERE'S FOUR.

7 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: FOUR. I DIDN'T SEE
8 THE SLIDE. OKAY. THERE YOU GO. THANK YOU. ALL
9 RIGHT. CHAIR WILL ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

10 DR. SOUTHARD: MOVE APPROVAL.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARV.
12 CAN WE HAVE A SECOND PLEASE?

13 DR. DULIEGE: SECOND.

14 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE
15 SECONDS. THE DISCUSSION OF THIS APPLICATION IS NOW
16 OPEN FOR BOARD MEMBERS. IF THERE IS NONE, WE CAN
17 ASK FOR THE PUBLIC'S COMMENTS.

18 MR. TOCHER: I DON'T SEE ANY. THERE ISN'T
19 ANY.

20 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THERE ISN'T ANY.
21 ALL RIGHT. SCOTT, THAT MEANS...

22 MR. TOCHER: JUST ONE SECOND. ALL RIGHT.
23 THE MOTION IS TO FUND APPLICATION 16103.

24 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

25 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.
2 DR. CHOU: YES.
3 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.
4 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.
6 DR. DULIEGE: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
8 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.
10 DR. HIGGINS: YES.
11 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
12 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
14 MR. LAJARA: YES.
15 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
16 DR. PADILLA: YES.
17 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA. MARV SOUTHARD.
18 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
19 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
20 MS. WYTE: YES.
21 MR. TOCHER: AND KEVIN XU.
22 DR. XU: YES.
23 MR. TOCHER: I DON'T THINK JOE HAS
24 REJOINED. JOE PANETTA, ARE YOU THERE? OKAY. IN
25 ANY EVENT, THE MOTION CARRIES. THANK YOU.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I'M SORRY, SCOTT.

2 MR. TOCHER: YES. THE MOTION CARRIES.

3 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. OKAY.

4 HAYLEY, YOU CAN PROCEED.

5 DR. LAM: ALL RIGHT. NEXT APPLICATION IS

6 CLIN1-17165. THIS IS AGING THERAPY FOR

7 SPINOCEREBELLAR ATAXIA TYPE III. THE APPLICANT IS

8 REQUESTING AROUND 5.7 MILLION TO COMPLETE THE

9 ACTIVITIES AND TO SUBMIT AN IND.

10 A LITTLE BIT OF BACKGROUND ABOUT THIS

11 PROJECT. THIS IS A NEURODEGENERATIVE DISEASE CAUSED

12 BY A MUTATION IN THE ATAXIN-3 GENE WHERE THERE ARE

13 EXTRA REPEATS IN THE CODING REGION. THIS CAUSES

14 PROBLEMS WITH THE ENZYME'S ABILITY TO INTERACT

15 NORMALLY WITH OTHER PROTEINS AND CAUSES TOXIC

16 ACCUMULATION OF THE ATAXIN.

17 SO THE SYMPTOMS USUALLY APPEAR IN MIDLIFE

18 AND IMPACT SEVERAL AREAS, INCLUDING THE PATIENT

19 GAIT, BALANCE, AND SPATIAL AWARENESS, AND EYE

20 MOVEMENT. SO THIS IS A PROGRESSIVE DISEASE THAT IS

21 EVENTUALLY FATAL.

22 THE CURRENT STANDARD OF CARE TREATS THE

23 SYMPTOMS ONLY, MAINLY FOCUSED ON PAIN RELIEF AND THE

24 ANTISPASTICITY DRUGS. THE PROPOSED TREATMENT IS AN

25 ANTISENSE OLIGONUCLEOTIDE THAT ALLOWS THE CELLS TO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PRODUCE A FUNCTIONAL ATAXIN GENE PROTEIN BY SKIPPING
2 OVER THE EXTRA REPEATED SECTION OF THE GENE.

3 CIRM DOES NOT HAVE ANY OTHER ACTIVE
4 TRANSLATIONAL OR CLINICAL AWARDS IN THIS INDICATION,
5 AND THE APPLICANT HAS NOT RECEIVED PRIOR CIRM
6 FUNDING.

7 THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GRANTS WORKING
8 GROUP WAS A UNANIMOUS RECOMMENDATION TO FUND
9 CLIN1-17165 WITH A DEI SCORE OF 7, AND THE CIRM TEAM
10 RECOMMENDATION CONCURS WITH THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP
11 FOR A RECOMMENDATION TO FUND THIS APPLICATION FOR
12 5.69 MILLION. AGAIN, I HAND IT TO CHAIR IMBASCIANI.

13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU AGAIN,
14 HAYLEY. CHAIR WOULD LIKE TO HEAR A MOTION TO FUND
15 THE RECOMMENDED --

16 DR. DULIEGE: MOVE.

17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. ANNE-MARIE.

18 DR. DULIEGE: YES. I MOVE THIS
19 APPLICATION.

20 DR. SOUTHARD: SECOND.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. ANY
22 BOARD MEMBER WISH TO DISCUSS THIS APPLICATION,
23 17165? IF NOT, WE'LL OPEN IT TO THE PUBLIC.

24 MR. TOCHER: DOESN'T APPEAR TO BE ANY
25 PUBLIC COMMENT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: AND CLAUDETTE
2 AGREES. OKAY. LET'S GO TO A VOTE THEN. THANK YOU.
3 MR. TOCHER: MARIA BONNEVILLE.
4 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.
6 DR. CHOU: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.
8 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.
10 DR. DULIEGE: YEAH.
11 MR. TOCHER: YSABEL DURON.
12 MS. DURON: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
14 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.
15 MR. TOCHER: ELENA FLOWERS.
16 DR. FLOWERS: YES.
17 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.
18 DR. HIGGINS: YES.
19 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
20 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
21 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
22 MR. LAJARA: YES.
23 MR. TOCHER: CHRIS MIASKOWSKI.
24 DR. MIASKOWSKI: YES.
25 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. PADILLA: YES.

2 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA. MARV SOUTHARD.

3 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.

4 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.

5 MS. WYTE: YES.

6 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.

7 DR. XU: YES.

8 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MR.

9 CHAIR, THE MOTION CARRIES.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU AGAIN. IS
11 THERE A QUESTION OR COMMENT -- NO. OKAY.

12 DR. DULIEGE: I KNOW WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE
13 OF THIS REVIEW, BUT JUST EVEN NOW RIGHT AT THE END,
14 IT MIGHT BE USEFUL FOR THE NEW BOARD MEMBERS AND FOR
15 SOME OF US TO UNDERSTAND WHY THE PROCESS FOR THE
16 CLIN REVIEW IS DIFFERENT FROM THE PROCESS THAT WE
17 WENT THROUGH THIS MORNING, AND AT SOME POINT MAYBE
18 TO DEAL AT ANOTHER TIME WHAT'S THE TOTAL BUDGET AND
19 WHAT'S THE PART OF THE BUDGET FOR ANY WE'RE GOING TO
20 FUND TODAY. WE CAN DO THAT AT THE END OF THE REVIEW
21 IF THAT'S MORE PRACTICAL.

22 DR. LAM: I CAN JUST BRIEFLY ADDRESS THAT.
23 SO AS I MENTIONED, I THINK THE THIRD SLIDE, THE
24 TOTAL BUDGET ALLOCATION FROM THE BOARD FOR THE
25 CLINICAL PROGRAM FOR THE FIRST HALF OF THIS YEAR IS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 76.7 MILLION, AND THE TOTAL ASK ACROSS ALL SIX
2 APPLICATIONS THAT ARE BEING PRESENTED TODAY IS OVER
3 ON 50 MILLION. I'LL PROVIDE SOME CONTEXT.

4 IN ADDITION TO THAT, I SUPPOSE COMPARED TO
5 THE TRANSLATIONAL PROGRAMS, INSTEAD OF CONSIDERING
6 THE APPLICATIONS AS A COMPLETE COHORT OF ALL
7 APPLICATIONS THAT WERE SUBMITTED AND REVIEWED BY THE
8 GRANTS WORKING GROUP, THE CLINICAL PROGRAM RIGHT NOW
9 WE CONSIDER EACH APPLICATION INDIVIDUALLY AND MAKE
10 FUNDING DECISIONS FOR EACH SEPARATE APPLICATION.

11 SO THE REASON BEING THAT AT THE GRANTS
12 WORKING GROUP THAT IS ALSO HOW THE APPLICATIONS ARE
13 CONSIDERED AS A SINGLE STANDALONE PROJECT AND NOT IN
14 COMPARISON AGAINST OTHER CLINICAL SUBMISSIONS. I
15 HOPE THAT'S HELPFUL.

16 DR. DULIEGE: YEAH. THAT'S HELPFUL. IT
17 DOESN'T HELP US TO UNDERSTAND WHY IT'S A DIFFERENT
18 PROCESS. AND I'M NOT TRYING TO SUGGEST THAT WE'RE
19 CHANGING IT TODAY, BUT IT'S HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND
20 WHY IS IT DIFFERENT EVEN AT THE LEVEL OF THE GRANT
21 WORKING GROUP, AND THEN WE CAN MOVE FORWARD.

22 DR. SAMBRANO: I'M HAPPY TO SPEAK TO IT IF
23 YOU WANT RIGHT NOW. BUT WHEN WE STARTED THE
24 CLINICAL PROGRAM, THE NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS THAT WE
25 WOULD GET PER CYCLE, SO WE WERE DOING 12 CYCLES PER

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YEAR, VARIED. SOMETIMES IT WAS JUST A SINGLE
2 APPLICATION. AS A RESULT, THERE WAS NOTHING TO
3 COMPARE IT TO. AND SO WE ESTABLISHED A SCORING
4 SYSTEM OF 1, 2, 3 AND A PROCESS THAT LOOKED AT THEM
5 INDIVIDUALLY.

6 SO IN THE CASE WHERE WE GOT ONE, WE COULD
7 REVIEW THAT SINGLE ONE. IF WE GOT THREE, THERE WAS
8 NO NEED TO COMPARE THEM. EACH ONE WAS TREATED AS IF
9 IT WAS ALONE IN THE CYCLE. AND SO THAT HAS
10 CONTINUED ALTHOUGH NOW WE'VE REACHED A POINT WHERE
11 WE'RE GETTING MORE APPLICATIONS. SO IN RETHINKING
12 THE CLINICAL PROGRAM, THAT'S PART OF WHAT WE'RE
13 THINKING ABOUT.

14 DR. DULIEGE: THANK YOU.

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANKS, GIL. THAT
16 WAS VERY HELPFUL. SUZANNE.

17 DR. SANDMEYER: ALSO, I GUESS TO FOLLOW
18 UP, IT SEEMS LIKE A FACTOR IS THAT THERE IS LESS
19 ALLOCATED NOW TO FUND THE ONES THAT WE CONSIDER THAN
20 THE MAXIMUM POSSIBLE. AND SO AT SOME POINT THOSE
21 TWO NUMBERS MIGHT COME TOGETHER, AND THEN WE MIGHT
22 WANT TO CHANGE THE PROTOCOL BEFORE THAT OCCURS IF
23 THAT MAKES SENSE.

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. NO OTHER
25 QUESTIONS. LET'S MOVE ON THEN.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. LAM: THE NEXT APPLICATION IS
2 CLIN2-14796. THESE ARE THE CONFLICTS OF INTEREST.
3 THIS APPLICATION IS A PROGRAM PROPOSING A
4 STEM CELL THERAPY TO INDUCE DELAYED TOLERANCE AFTER
5 A KIDNEY TRANSPLANT. THE APPLICANT IS REQUESTING
6 OVER 7 MILLION TO COMPLETE A PHASE 1 CLINICAL TRIAL.
7 A LITTLE BIT OF BACKGROUND ON KIDNEY
8 TRANSPLANTS. KIDNEY FAILURE HAPPENS WHEN THE
9 KIDNEYS CAN NO LONGER FILTER AND CLEAN THE BLOOD AS
10 NEEDED. AND PEOPLE WITH KIDNEY FAILURE REQUIRE
11 LONG-TERM DIALYSIS OR A KIDNEY TRANSPLANT.
12 CURRENTLY THESE TRANSPLANT RECIPIENTS
13 REQUIRE LIFELONG IMMUNOSUPPRESSIVE DRUGS TO PREVENT
14 THE REJECTION OF THE DONOR ORGAN. AND THESE
15 IMMUNOSUPPRESSION DRUGS INCREASE THE RISK OF
16 INFECTION, CANCER, DIABETES, AND HEART DISEASE.
17 THE GOAL OF THE CURRENT PROJECT IS TO
18 DELIVER AND INFUSION OF THE DONOR BLOOD STEM AND
19 PROGENITOR CELLS AFTER THE KIDNEY TRANSPLANT AND
20 WITHDRAW IMMUNOSUPPRESSIVE DRUGS. THIS WOULD
21 ULTIMATELY IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF THE LIFE OF THE
22 PATIENTS AND PROLONG THE FUNCTIONALITY OF THE DONOR
23 KIDNEY.
24 THE CIRM PORTFOLIO HAS SEVERAL ACTIVE
25 KIDNEY TRANSPLANT PROJECTS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CLINICAL TRIALS. ONE IS A PHASE 3 TRIAL THAT USES A
2 SIMILAR APPROACH IN A SIMILAR TARGET POPULATION,
3 WHICH IS HLA-MATCHED KIDNEY TRANSPLANT RECIPIENTS
4 EXCEPT THAT THE STEM CELL TRANSPLANT IS COMBINED AT
5 THE SAME TIME AS THE KIDNEY TRANSPLANT.

6 THE OTHER THREE PROJECTS ARE EARLY PHASE
7 CLINICAL TRIALS FOR HLA-MISMATCHED KIDNEY
8 RECIPIENTS, INCLUDING ONE FOR PEDIATRIC PATIENTS
9 WITH GENETIC DISEASES. AND THEY HAVE SIMILAR
10 APPROACHES AS WELL EXCEPT WITH DIFFERENT
11 COMBINATIONS OF CELL TRANSPLANTS OR DIFFERENT TIMING
12 OF THE KIDNEY OR THE STEM CELL TRANSPLANT ITSELF.

13 THIS PARTICULAR APPLICANT HAS NOT RECEIVED
14 PRIOR CIRM FUNDING, AND THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE
15 GRANTS WORKING GROUP WAS A UNANIMOUS RECOMMENDATION
16 TO FUND CLIN2-14796 WITH A DEI SCORE OF 8. AND THE
17 CIRM TEAM RECOMMENDATION CONCURS WITH THE GRANTS
18 WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION TO FUND THIS
19 APPLICATION FOR 7.34 MILLION. PASS TO CHAIR
20 IMBASCIANI.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: ANY QUESTIONS OF
22 HAYLEY --

23 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I ACTUALLY HAVE A
24 QUESTION BEFORE A MOTION IS THE TABLE. I KNOW --
25 I'M GOING TO CHANNEL STEVE JUELSGAARD, WHICH WE'VE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MENTIONED HIM SEVERAL TIMES TODAY. I DON'T KNOW IF
2 HE'D BE HAPPY ABOUT THAT OR NOT. I WANTED TO
3 UNDERSTAND HOW THIS PROPOSAL FITS IN WITH OTHER
4 THINGS THAT WE'VE FUNDED IN THIS AREA. I KNOW WE
5 FUNDED A LOT IN THIS AREA. SO I JUST WANT TO
6 UNDERSTAND FROM A BIGGER PICTURE OF OUR PORTFOLIO
7 HOW IT WORKS --

8 DR. LAM: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK
9 DR. CANET-AVILES TO SPEAK TO THIS.

10 DR. CANET-AVILES: THANK YOU, MADAME VICE
11 CHAIR.

12 SO AS DR. LAM WAS MENTIONING, WE HAVE
13 THREE OTHER PROJECTS. AND ONE OF THEM, THE ONE THAT
14 WE CAN SEE ON THE TOP, HAS FUNDED A SUCCESSFUL PHASE
15 3 CLINICAL TRIAL WHICH IS ALSO A MATCH TOLERANCE
16 PROGRAM. AND AS HAYLEY WAS SAYING, THE ONLY
17 DIFFERENCE IS THE DELAY. AND THE COMPANY HAVING
18 COMPLETED THIS PHASE 3 CLINICAL TRIAL HAS ACTUALLY
19 BEEN LOOKING FOR PARTICIPANTS TO COMMERCIALIZE.
20 THEY DISSOLVED THE COMPANY, SUSPENDING OPERATIONS
21 WHILE THEY ARE TRYING TO FIND A PARTNER TO
22 COMMERCIALIZE.

23 THE OTHER TWO PROGRAMS, PERHAPS THEY CAN
24 HAVE AN EFFECT IN A LARGER POPULATION BECAUSE THOSE
25 TWO ARE FOR MISMATCHED APPROACHES. SO THAT'S THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 COMPARISON.

2 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: THANK YOU.

3 DR. CANET-AVILES: THANK YOU.

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. I DON'T SEE
5 ANY OTHER QUESTIONS, SO WE CAN ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

6 DR. DULIEGE: I MOVE TO APPROVE THIS
7 APPLICATION.

8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: TO APPROVE THE
9 APPLICATION.

10 DR. SOUTHARD: SECOND.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: IT'S MOVED AND
12 SECONDED. WE CAN PROCEED TO DISCUSSION AMONG THE
13 BOARD MEMBERS. NOTHING. OKAY. IS THERE ANY
14 COMMENT FROM THE PUBLIC? THERE IS NOT. ALL RIGHT,
15 SCOTT. YOU CAN PROCEED TO THE VOTE.

16 MR. TOCHER: MARIA BONNEVILLE.

17 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

18 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.

19 DR. CHOU: YES.

20 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.

21 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.

22 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.

23 DR. DULIEGE: YES.

24 MR. TOCHER: YSABEL DURON.

25 MS. DURON: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
2 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.
3 MR. TOCHER: ELENA FLOWERS.
4 DR. FLOWERS: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.
6 DR. HIGGINS: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
10 MR. LAJARA: YES.
11 MR. TOCHER: CHRIS MIASKOWSKI.
12 DR. MIASKOWSKI: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
14 DR. PADILLA: YES.
15 MR. TOCHER: MARV SOUTHARD.
16 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
17 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
18 MS. WYTE: YES.
19 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.
20 DR. XU: YES.
21 MR. TOCHER: JUST CHECKING FOR JOE
22 PANETTA. NO, I DON'T BELIEVE HE IS ON. GREAT.
23 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE MOTION CARRIES.
24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THAT'S VERY GOOD.
25 ALL RIGHT, HAYLEY. WE'RE ON 17081.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DR. LAM: ALL RIGHT. CLIN2-17081. THIS
2 IS AN APPLICATION FOR A NEURAL STEM CELL THERAPY FOR
3 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE. THE APPLICANT IS REQUESTING
4 JUST UNDER 12 MILLION TO COMPLETE THE PHASE 1 B/2A
5 CLINICAL TRIAL.

6 A LITTLE BIT OF CLINICAL BACKGROUND ABOUT
7 THIS ONE. HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE IS AN INHERITED
8 NEURODEGENERATIVE DISEASE WHERE THERE IS MUTATIONS
9 IN THE HUNTINGTIN GENE. SO THE MOVEMENT, COGNITION,
10 AND PSYCHIATRIC SYMPTOMS USUALLY ARISE THE MIDLIFE
11 AND PROGRESS OVER THE COURSE OF 10 TO 20 YEARS.
12 EVENTUALLY THE DISEASE IS FATAL AND ALSO HAS A HIGH
13 BURDEN ON FAMILIES.

14 THERE'S CURRENTLY NO APPROVED THERAPIES
15 THAT SLOW OR PREVENT PROGRESSION OF THE UNDERLYING
16 DISEASE. THE GOAL OF THE PROPOSED PROJECT IS TO
17 PROVIDE NEURAL STEM CELLS TO SUPPORT THE SURVIVAL
18 AND CONNECTIVITY OF THE EXISTING NEURONS AND
19 POTENTIALLY REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF THE PROTEIN
20 AGGREGATES FROM THE HUNTINGTIN PROTEIN.

21 CIRM HAS ONE ACTIVE CLIN1 STAGE AWARD FOR
22 HUNTINGTON'S, WHICH IS ESSENTIALLY THE PREDECESSOR
23 AWARD FOR THIS CURRENT APPLICATION UNDER
24 CONSIDERATION.

25 THE APPLICANT HAS RECEIVED FOUR PRIOR CIRM

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AWARDS, THREE OF WHICH ARE ALL RELATED TO THE
2 CURRENT PROJECT UNDER CONSIDERATION. THE FOURTH IS
3 A DISCOVERY STAGE PROJECT FOR A GENE-MODIFIED
4 VERSION OF A SIMILAR CELL PRODUCT FOR THE SAME
5 INDICATION.

6 THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION
7 FOR THIS APPLICATION WAS A RECOMMENDATION NOT TO
8 FUND THE APPLICATION WITH A SPLIT VOTE ACROSS 1, 2,
9 AND 3: ONE VOTE FOR FUNDING, SIX VOTES FOR TIER II,
10 AND EIGHT VOTES TO DO NOT FUND AND CANNOT SUBMIT FOR
11 SIX MONTHS.

12 THE DEI SCORE FOR THIS APPLICATION WAS 9,
13 AND THE CIRM TEAM RECOMMENDATION CONCURS WITH THE
14 GRANTS WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION TO NOT FUND THIS
15 APPLICATION. CHAIR IMBASCIANI.

16 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, HAYLEY.
17 ANY QUESTIONS?

18 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YEAH. AS WE GO
19 THROUGH THE DISCUSSION AROUND THIS PARTICULAR
20 APPLICATION, I WOULD LIKE TO SUGGEST A POTENTIAL
21 AMENDMENT BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY A 3 SCORE NORMALLY
22 ENGENDER A NO VOTE WITHIN THAT CONTEXT.

23 AND I'D LIKE TO PROPOSE THAT THE APPLICANT
24 BE ALLOWED TO RESUBMIT THIS APPLICATION EARLIER THAN
25 THE NORMAL AT LEAST SIX-MONTH TIMELINE THAT A 3

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WOULD ENGENDER WITH A PERSPECTIVE OF BEING ABLE TO
2 RESUBMIT AT THE TIME OF THE REESTABLISHMENT OF OUR
3 FOLLOW-ON PROCESS FOR ALL OF OUR GRANTS AND REVIEWS.
4 AND THAT IS, AGAIN, THE ONES ARE OR THE PROCESS AS
5 PROPOSED TO BE PRESENTED TO THE BOARD IN MARCH AND
6 EXPECTATION SOMETIME IN THE SPRING FOR
7 REESTABLISHMENT.

8 SO MY PROPOSAL, THEN, IS TO ALLOW THIS
9 APPLICATION TO BE RESUBMITTED AT THAT TIME TO BE
10 ABLE TO PULL IN THE TIMELINE WHERE THAT MIGHT BE
11 CONSIDERED.

12 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU FOR THE
13 MOTION. IT REQUIRES A SECOND.

14 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I SECOND.

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SECONDED BY MARIA.
16 COMMENT? YSABEL, PLEASE.

17 MS. DURON: HAYLEY, CAN YOU EXPLAIN WHY
18 THERE'S SUCH A DISCREPANCY BETWEEN THE SCIENTIFIC
19 SCORE AND THE DEI SCORE? OBVIOUSLY PEOPLE CARED
20 ABOUT THIS PROJECT AS A DEI. SO I'D LIKE TO
21 KNOW -- IT SEEMS TO ME, QUITE FRANKLY, I'LL BE
22 HONEST, SOMETIMES THE SERVICE AND THE INVESTIGATION
23 IS MORE IMPORTANT THAN THE SCIENTIFIC SCORE. THAT'S
24 THE WAY I FEEL SOMETIMES. I'M SORRY.

25 DR. LAM: SO I WOULD SAY OVERALL THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 REVIEW PANEL HAD VERY POSITIVE THINGS TO SAY ABOUT
2 THE DEI ASPECTS OF THE APPLICATION, AND THEY THOUGHT
3 THAT THE APPLICANT HAD REALLY STRONG TIES WITH THE
4 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE PATIENT COMMUNITY AND VERY
5 THOUGHTFULLY PRESENTED THEIR PLAN FOR HOW THEY WERE
6 GOING TO ACHIEVE DIVERSE ENROLLMENT AND ACCESS TO
7 POSSIBLE PEOPLE WHO COULD RECEIVE TREATMENT.

8 I THINK IN TERMS OF THE SCIENTIFIC
9 RECOMMENDATION, IT WAS FOCUSED MAINLY AROUND THE
10 PRELIMINARY DATA THAT WAS GENERATED IN THE
11 PRECLINICAL SETTING. AND THE OVERALL -- AS I
12 MENTIONED, IT WAS A SORT OF A SPLIT VOTE BETWEEN A 2
13 AND 3, BOTH OF THOSE. AND I THINK THAT THERE WAS A
14 GENERAL THOUGHT THAT THE PRELIMINARY DATA WASN'T AS
15 STRONG AS THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE AT THAT STAGE.

16 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. SO WE HAVE A
17 MOTION ON THE FLOOR THAT'S BEEN SECONDED TO ALLOW
18 THEM TO REAPPLY SHORT OF THE TYPICAL SIX-MONTH
19 WAITING PERIOD FOR A TIER III. FURTHER DISCUSSION?
20 YES, ANNE-MARIE.

21 DR. DULIEGE: I CAN MAKE A COMMENT?

22 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES, I AM.

23 DR. DULIEGE: I UNDERSTAND SO MUCH YOUR
24 PERSPECTIVE, BUT MAYBE YOU CAN CLARIFY FOR OTHERS
25 WHY IN THAT CASE WE SHOULD DERAIL FROM THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 RECOMMENDATION COMING FROM THE WORKING GROUP AND THE
2 CIRM TEAM GIVEN HOW, AS YOU HAVE BEEN PART OF IT,
3 VERY CAREFUL WHEN WE DO THAT. AND I'M SURE YOU'RE
4 EXTREMELY CAREFUL.

5 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: THAT'S A GREAT
6 QUESTION. EMBEDDED IN THERE IS A COUPLE OF FACTORS.
7 AND ONE IS WE'VE BEEN IN A SITUATION WHERE THERE'S
8 BEEN SOME DELAYS IN OUR PROCESS. THAT'S THE FIRST
9 POINT.

10 THE SECOND THING, IF WE LOOK AT THIS
11 CURRENT APPLICATION, IT'S RIGHT ON THE BUBBLE
12 BETWEEN A 2 AND A 3 IN THAT ASPECT. AND THAT'S A
13 VERY IMPORTANT CONSIDERATION.

14 AND THE THIRD IS, WHILE THERE IS OBVIOUSLY
15 SOME WORK GOING ON IN HUNTINGTON'S, THIS IS
16 OBVIOUSLY AN EXTREMELY PROBLEMATIC SET OF
17 CONDITIONS. AND I THINK IT'S MERITORIOUS TO BE ABLE
18 TO NOT SAY LET'S GO AHEAD WITH IT, BUT SIMPLY ALLOW
19 THE APPLICANTS TO SUBMIT A TIMELINE THAT WOULD BE A
20 LITTLE BIT FASTER THAN WHAT OTHERWISE WOULD OCCUR.

21 DR. DULIEGE: THANK YOU.

22 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I HAVE ANOTHER
23 COMMENT TOO. YOU CAN IMAGINE AS WE GET CLOSER TO
24 NEW CONCEPT PLANS; AND DEPENDING ON HOW MUCH THOSE
25 CONCEPT PLANS CHANGE, ANYTHING THAT'S SORT OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 EXISTING OUT THERE RIGHT NOW THAT'S SORT OF IN A
2 REVIEW FRAME OR PROCESS MAY HAVE TO REAPPLY IN
3 GENERAL WITH A NEW APPLICATION BECAUSE IT COULD BE
4 DIFFERENT.

5 SO I THINK ACCELERATING THE PROCESS SO
6 THAT THEY ARE ABLE TO SUBMIT AT THAT TIME MAKES
7 SENSE JUST FROM A LOGISTICAL AND PROCESS STANDPOINT.

8 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: THANKS, MARIA.
9 THAT'S A -- SORRY TO INTERRUPT.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: GO AHEAD.

11 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: MY APOLOGIES.
12 THAT'S A GREAT POINT BECAUSE THE NEW PROCESS HAS THE
13 OPPORTUNITY FOR ALL THE WAY THROUGH THE PLATFORM OF
14 ACCELERATION, AND SO YOU DON'T WANT TO PRECLUDE THEM
15 FROM GETTING TO THE STARTING GATE FOR THAT.

16 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.

17 DR. MIASKOWSKI: MARK, I JUST WANT TO
18 CLARIFY. ARE YOU SUGGESTING THIS FOR THIS
19 APPLICATION OR IF WE HAVE OTHERS THAT ARE IN SIMILAR
20 CIRCUMSTANCES?

21 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: THERE'S ANOTHER ONE
22 COMING UP THAT I WILL HIGHLY RECOMMEND THE SAME
23 AMENDMENT TO, PARTICULARLY AROUND TIMING
24 CONSIDERATIONS. AND, AGAIN, NONE OF THAT IS FOR AN
25 APPROVAL. IT'S SIMPLY TO PUT IN A BUCKET THAT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ALLOWS FOR A FASTER DETERMINATION --

2 DR. MIASKOWSKI: I'M JUST ASKING IF WE
3 SHOULD JUST GENERALIZE IT THEN.

4 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: I THINK IT'S BETTER
5 JUST TO DO EACH ONE. THANKS. THANK YOU THOUGH.
6 GOOD POINT.

7 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: PROBABLY BECAUSE WE
8 TAKE THESE ONE AT A TIME ANYWAY. CHRIS, THANK YOU.

9 OKAY. WE'RE STILL ON THE MOTION. I'D
10 LIKE TO HEAR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE MOTION WHICH IS
11 AN AMENDMENT UNLESS THERE'S MORE.

12 MS. MANDAC: WE DO HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT FOR
13 THIS ONE. WE'LL START IN THE ROOM FIRST WITH
14 LESLIE. ON THE LINE WE'LL FIRST CALL ON ANNE, THEN
15 SARAH, THEN FRANCES. YOU'LL ALL HAVE THREE MINUTES
16 EACH. LESLIE, THE CLOCK STARTS NOW.

17 MS. THOMPSON: HI. I'M LESLIE THOMPSON,
18 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE RESEARCHER. AND I HAVE BEEN
19 SENSE THE BEGINNING WITH CLONING OF THE GENE. I AM
20 PI OF CLIN2 PROPOSAL 17081. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
21 THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE BOARD REGARDING OUR
22 DEEP CONCERN FOR REVIEW OF OUR PROPOSAL TO ADVANCE
23 FDA-AUTHORIZED STEM CELL-BASED THERAPY FOR
24 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE.

25 HD IS A DEVASTATING GENETIC

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 NEURODEGENERATIVE DISEASE WITH NO TREATMENT THAT
2 CHANGES THE COURSE OF THE DISEASE. CIRM HAS
3 SUPPORTED OUR PROGRAM AND APPROVED ITS PROGRESS
4 BEGINNING OVER 14 YEARS AGO FROM DISC TO TRAN TO
5 CLIN. THIS WILL BE THE FIRST FDA-AUTHORIZED STEM
6 CELL-BASED TRIAL FOR HD. THERE'S SIGNIFICANT
7 EXCITEMENT IN THE FIELD BY FAMILIES AND RESEARCHERS
8 FOR THE TRIAL. AND THIS TRIAL SATISFIED SPECIFIED
9 GOALS FOR CIRM. WHY THEN ARE WE HERE TODAY?

10 I'D LIKE TO ADDRESS THE TWO MAIN CRITIQUES
11 RAISED IN THE REVIEW. THE FIRST CRITIQUE WAS THAT
12 THE CLINICAL PRECEDENT FOR FETAL TRANSPLANTS IS NOT
13 FAVORABLE. THIS IS AN APPLES TO ORANGES COMPARISON.
14 THE MOST RECENT FETAL TRANSPLANT TRIALS COMMENCED IN
15 2001, WERE COMPLETED IN 2013. BACK THEN THEY DID
16 NOT HAVE THE ABILITY TO CONTROL SUBQUALITY AND
17 CHARACTERIZATION AS WE DO NOW WITH A STEM CELL
18 PRODUCT OR HAVE ACCESS TO ADVANCED SURGICAL METHODS
19 WITH MRI GUIDANCE, UPDATED IMMUNE SUPPRESSION
20 PROTOCOLS, AND PATIENT STAGING.

21 IN CONTRAST, CIRM FUNDING HAS ENABLED THE
22 ROBUST METHODOLOGICAL ADVANCES UNDERLYING OUR
23 FDA-AUTHORIZED TRIAL.

24 THE SECOND MAIN CRITIQUE WAS THAT THE
25 PRECLINICAL DATA DO NOT SUPPORT THE RISK/BENEFIT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 RATIO AT THIS TIME. WE'VE SHOWN ROBUST IMPROVEMENT
2 IN THREE GENETIC MOUSE MODELS INCLUDING THE MOST
3 SEVERE. WE NOT ONLY SHOW COMPLETE PREVENTION OF A
4 KEY MOTOR PHENOTYPE, BUT ALSO SHOWED MULTIPLE
5 IMPROVEMENTS IN QUANTITATIVE, MOLECULAR, AND
6 NEUROCIRCUITRY LEVEL DISEASE OUTCOMES.

7 BECAUSE HD IS UNIVERSALLY DEVASTATING AND
8 FATAL, THE FDA AGREED THAT THE POTENTIAL BENEFIT
9 GREATLY OUTWEIGHS THE RISK.

10 WORKING WITH CIRM THROUGHOUT THE PATH TO
11 IT IND AND HAVING RECEIVED FDA AUTHORIZATION TO
12 PROCEED WITH THIS CELL THERAPY, WE WERE SHOCKED TO
13 BE TOLD THAT CELL THERAPIES FOR THIS FATAL DISORDER
14 WERE NOT WORTH PURSUING BECAUSE OF FAILURES OF
15 STUDIES CARRIED OUT WELL OVER A DECADE AGO.

16 FURTHER, THE SCORE OF A 3 FOR THIS
17 PROPOSAL IN THE JUDGMENT OF THE FDA ARE HIGHLY
18 CONFLICTING. WE BELIEVE THIS IS DUE TO A DISPARITY
19 IN HOW THE ASSESSMENT OF RISK VERSUS BENEFIT TO
20 PATIENTS WAS VIEWED. THE PRECLINICAL DATA
21 SUPPORTING THE PROPOSED TRIAL EXCEEDS THAT FOR ANY
22 PREVIOUS CLINICAL TRIAL OF HD. THE SIX-MONTH DELAY
23 MANDATED BEFORE PROPOSAL SUBMISSION IN ADDITION TO
24 DELAY FROM PAUSING CLIN APPLICATIONS IN FEBRUARY,
25 WHICH IS WHEN WE WERE AWARDED THE FDA APPROVAL, WILL

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PUSH POTENTIAL FUNDING INTO 2026 -- AND I UNDERSTAND
2 WITH THE MOTION BEFORE THE BOARD NOW THAT THAT MIGHT
3 CHANGE -- RESULTING IN LOSS OF CRITICAL TEAM MEMBERS
4 AND DELAY OF POSSIBLE TREATMENT.

5 TODAY WE ASK THAT THIS PANEL NOT LET THE
6 LACK OF SUCCESS IN PREVIOUS FETAL CELL HD TRIALS
7 DEFINE THE POTENTIAL OF MODERN REGENERATIVE MEDICINE
8 TO MOVE NEW TREATMENTS FORWARD. PLEASE CONSIDER
9 SUPPORTING AN EXPEDITED RE-REVIEW IN RESPONSE.
10 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION.

11 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, LESLIE,
12 FOR COMING AND JOINING US. NEXT WE HAVE ANNE. YOUR
13 THREE MINUTES STARTS NOW.

14 DR. ROSSER: SO I'M ANNE ROSSER. I'M A
15 NEUROLOGIST PROFESSOR OF CLINICAL NEUROSCIENCE AT
16 CARDIFF UNIVERSITY IN THE UK. AND SO I'M AN EXPERT
17 IN HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE, AND I'VE ALSO SPENT THE
18 LAST TWO AND A HALF DECADES WORKING ON CELL THERAPY
19 SOLUTIONS FOR HUNTINGTONS'S. IMPORTANT FOR THIS
20 APPLICATION, I'VE GOT FIRSTHAND EXPERIENCE OF FETAL
21 CELL TRANSPLANTS IN HUMANS AS WELL AS PRECLINICAL
22 MODELS.

23 SO WHAT I WANT TO DO IS REALLY TO ANSWER
24 WHAT YOU'VE ALREADY HEARD FROM DR. THOMPSON BECAUSE
25 A MAJOR REASON FOR REJECTING THIS APPLICATION SEEMS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 TO HAVE BEEN THE NOTION THAT PREVIOUS STUDIES OF
2 FETAL CELL TRANSPLANTS DIDN'T PRODUCE BENEFIT IN
3 HUNTINGTON'S PATIENTS; THEREFORE, CELL THERAPY ISN'T
4 VIABLE IN THIS DISEASE. BUT I STRONGLY BELIEVE THAT
5 THIS CONCLUSION IS FLAWED.

6 FIRST AND FOREMOST, A THERAPY CANNOT BE
7 SAID TO HAVE FAILED UNLESS IT'S BEEN GIVEN A FAIR
8 TRIAL. AND THE FETAL TRANSPLANT STUDIES DO NOT, IN
9 MY VIEW, REPRESENT A FAIR TRIAL OF CELL THERAPY IN
10 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE. THE REASON I SAY THIS IS THAT
11 THE SUM TOTAL OF HUNTINGTON'S PATIENTS RECEIVING
12 FETAL TRANSPLANTS ARE VERY SMALL INDEED. SO MOST
13 STUDIES WERE ONLY IN THE REGION OF TWO TO SEVEN
14 PATIENTS LARGELY BECAUSE COLLECTING HUMAN FETAL
15 TISSUE IS EXTREMELY CHALLENGING.

16 NEVERTHELESS, SOME OF THESE SMALL STUDIES
17 HAVE PROVIDED PROOF OF CONCEPT EVIDENCE IN THAT
18 WHERE THERE'S GOOD EVIDENCE OF GRAFT SURVIVAL, THERE
19 WAS ALSO GOOD EVIDENCE OF CLINICAL BENEFIT. THERE'S
20 BEEN ONE LARGER STUDY, A BIG HD STUDY, WHICH WAS
21 HIGHLIGHTED IN THE REVIEWERS' COMMENTS. NOW, I KNOW
22 THIS STUDY REALLY WELL. THERE WERE A TOTAL OF 45
23 PATIENTS TRANSPLANTED OVER A NINE-YEAR PERIOD.

24 SO, FIRST, THIS IS STILL AN UNDERPOWERED
25 STUDY. BUT THE REAL PROBLEM WITH THIS STUDY IS THAT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MOST OF THE GRAFTS SURVIVED VERY POORLY OR NOT AT
2 ALL. SO MOST PATIENTS IN THIS STUDY IN REALITY
3 DIDN'T REALLY HAVE A SURVIVING GRAFT. AND, OF
4 COURSE, WE CAN'T DRAW CONCLUSIONS ABOUT TRANSPLANT
5 CASES WHERE THE GRAFT DID NOT SURVIVE.

6 SO TO SUMMARIZE, I'D SAY THAT THE FETAL
7 TRANSPLANT WORK IN HUNTINGTON'S HAS GIVEN US SOME
8 PROOF OF CONCEPT AND SOME ENCOURAGEMENT, BUT NO
9 SOLID PROOF THAT FETAL CELL TRANSPLANTS EITHER DO OR
10 DON'T WORK.

11 SO IMPORTANTLY, I DON'T THINK IT'S LIKELY
12 THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO GET MUCH FURTHER WITH
13 THESE FETAL CELLS WHICH MAKES IT ALL THE MORE
14 IMPORTANT THAT STUDIES OF STEM CELL-DERIVED PRODUCT
15 SUCH AS THIS ONE ARE ALLOWED TO MOVE FORWARD SO THAT
16 WE CAN TEST THIS THERAPEUTIC IN HUNTINGTON'S
17 DISEASE. AND 17081 WOULD BE THE FIRST STUDY TO TEST
18 THE STEM CELL PRODUCT IN HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE. AND
19 THIS IS WHY I THINK IT'S OF SUCH GREAT IMPORTANCE.

20 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU, DR. ROSSER.
21 DR. SARAH TABRIZI, YOU'RE UP NEXT TO BE FOLLOWED BY
22 DR. FRANCES SALDANA. YOU HAVE THREE MINUTES.

23 DR. TABRIZI: HI. MY NAME IS SARAH
24 TABRISI. I'M A PROFESSOR OF NEUROLOGY AT UCL IN
25 LONDON AT UNIVERSITY COLLEGE IN LONDON. I'M ALSO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE DIRECTOR OF THE UCL HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE CENTER,
2 AND I'VE WORKED IN THE HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE FIELD
3 FOR 30 YEARS. I WAS RECENTLY ELECTED AS ONE OF VERY
4 FEW INTERNATIONAL MEMBERS OF THE U.S. NATIONAL
5 ACADEMY OF MEDICINE IN RECOGNITION OF MY
6 CONTRIBUTION TO HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE IN CLINICAL
7 TRIALS.

8 I JUST WANT TO ADD THAT IN ADDITION TO
9 WHAT DR. THOMPSON AND DR. ROSSER HAVE SAID IS THAT I
10 HAVE SIGNIFICANT CONCERNS ABOUT THE PEER REVIEW
11 PARTICULARLY RELATING TO THE COMMENTS ABOUT THE
12 PRECLINICAL DATA THAT DR. THOMPSON PRESENTED.

13 DR. THOMPSON'S WORK SHOWED IN THREE
14 GENETIC MODELS, MICE MODELS, OF HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE
15 THAT THERE WAS SIGNIFICANT RESCUE OF THE PHENOTYPES.
16 NOW, I'VE LED OVER 20 CLINICAL TRIALS IN
17 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE, AND AS I CAN REITERATE AS A
18 PHYSICIAN, THE MOUSE MODELS ARE NOT HUMAN
19 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE. SO THEY CAN ONLY BE MERELY A
20 MODEL IN WHICH TO TEST THERAPIES.

21 PARTICULARLY, ONE OF THE REVIEWERS
22 COMMENTED ABOUT THE LACK OF THE RESCUE OF THE MOUSE
23 MODELS. THE R6/2 MOUSE MODEL OF HUNTINGTON'S
24 DISEASE WHICH THE REVIEWERS COMMENTED ABOUT IS A
25 VERY AGGRESSIVE MOUSE MODEL. IT'S SEVERELY

1 IMPAIRED, HAS DEFICITS AT BIRTH, AND DIES BY 14
2 WEEKS. IT'S A MODEL IN WHICH IT'S REALLY VERY
3 DIFFICULT TO HAVE ANY THERAPEUTIC IMPACT.

4 DR. THOMPSON'S DATA SHOWED IN JUST OVER
5 ONE MONTH HIGHLY SIGNIFICANT BEHAVIORIAL IMPROVEMENT
6 IN THE MICE. AND THEY ALSO SHOWED BENEFIT IN TWO
7 OTHER SLOWER PROGRESSING MOUSE MODELS. BEYOND THAT,
8 GIVEN THE HUNTINGTON'S AND THE NEURODEGENERATIVE
9 DISEASE FIELD IS MOVING AWAY FROM BEHAVIOR AS A
10 MAJOR OUTCOME IN MOUSE MODEL RESEARCH BECAUSE IT'S
11 BEEN SO POORLY PREDICTIVE OF BENEFIT IN HUMAN
12 STUDIES.

13 THEY DID ADDITIONALLY SHOW IMPROVED
14 OUTCOMES IN ELECTRICAL ACTIVITY AND CIRCUITRY, BOTH
15 ABSOLUTELY CRITICAL IN HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE,
16 CONNECTIVITY BETWEEN THE TRANSPLANTED CELLS AND THE
17 HOST CELLS, A REDUCTION OF AGGREGATION IN HOST
18 TISSUE, PRODUCTION OF GROWTH FACTORS, CRUCIAL GROWTH
19 FACTORS, FOR THE STRIATUM IN HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE,
20 AND PREVENTION OF TRANSCRIPTIONAL DEFICITS.

21 THESE FINDINGS SHOW BROAD IMPACT OF THE
22 CELL PRODUCT. AND I JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT
23 THERE ARE -- THIS IS THE MOST IMPORTANT STUDY WITH
24 STEM CELL TRANSPLANTATION TO SEE IF REGENERATIVE
25 MEDICINE WORKS IN HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE, A TRULY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DEVASTATING DISORDER. AND I THINK WE NEED TO TEST
2 THE EXPERIMENT IN HUMANS PARTICULARLY TO SEE IF
3 THIS --

4 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH,
5 DR. TABRIZI. NEXT WE HAVE DR. FRANCES SALDANA TO BE
6 FOLLOWED BY MELODY BANDLEY. DR. SALDANA, YOU HAVE
7 THREE MINUTES. THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

8 DR. SALDANA: HI. MY NAME IS FRANCES
9 SALDANA. I'M THE CO-FOUNDER OF HD CARE, AND I'M
10 SPEAKING FOR CLIN2-17081.

11 I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR SUPPORTING
12 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE RESEARCH IN THE PAST AND
13 ENABLING OUR SCIENTISTS TO ACHIEVE SO MANY AMAZING
14 BREAKTHROUGHS.

15 I AM NOW ASKING FOR YOUR CONTINUED SUPPORT
16 OF CLIN2-17081. CIRM HAS GIVEN OUR HD FAMILY SO
17 MUCH HOPE FOR A TREATMENT. I HAVE LOST ALL THREE OF
18 MY CHILDREN AND THEIR FATHER TO HUNTINGTON'S
19 DISEASE. AND NOW I LIVE FOR THE DAY THAT WE HAVE A
20 TREATMENT BECAUSE MY TWO GRANDCHILDREN ARE NOW AT
21 RISK OF INHERITING THE SAME FATAL DISEASE.

22 THE REALIZATION THAT WE DO NOT HAVE A
23 TREATMENT FOR HD CONTINUES TO FRIGHTEN ME DAY IN AND
24 DAY OUT AS MY TWO GRANDCHILDREN ARE NOW YOUNG
25 ADULTS. THEY LIVE WITH THE UNCERTAINTY AND FEAR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THAT THEY TOO MAY SUCCUMB TO WHAT I CALL THE WORST
2 DISEASE KNOWN TO MANKIND. THEY SAW THEIR BEAUTIFUL
3 SIMPLY JUST WITHER AWAY UNTIL SHE WAS UNRECOGNIZABLE
4 AND TOOK HER LAST BREATH.

5 MY GRANDCHILDREN NEVER GOT TO MEET THEIR
6 GRANDFATHER AS HE DIED AT THE AGE OF 42. THEY'RE
7 LITERALLY RUNNING SCARED AND PROBABLY WILL NOT TEST
8 FOR THE DISEASE UNTIL THEY FEEL CONFIDENT THAT THERE
9 MAY SOON BE A TREATMENT. I WANT THEM TO HAVE THAT
10 HOPE. MY OWN CHILDREN, MICHAEL, MARGIE, AND MARIE,
11 TECHNOLOGICALLY WERE ALL HD PATIENT ADVOCATES EVEN
12 FROM THEIR WHEELCHAIR AND WHILE IN PAIN. THEY EVEN
13 DONATED SKIN CELLS FOR HD RESEARCH, BUT THE
14 TREATMENT WAS NOT HERE IN TIME FOR THEM.

15 NOT HAVING A TREATMENT SOON WILL MEAN A
16 CONTINUED CYCLE OF HD FAMILIES AND THE RESULTANT
17 TRAGEDY THAT WILL TAKE THE LIVES OF THOUSANDS WHO
18 HAVE ALREADY INHERITED THE MUTANT GENE AS WELL AS
19 FUTURE GENERATIONS WHO WILL ALSO INHERIT THE FATAL
20 DISEASE.

21 I AND OTHER HD FAMILY MEMBERS PARTICIPATED
22 RECENTLY IN THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT STUDIO TO MEET
23 WITH OTHER HD FAMILIES TO DISCUSS THE HNC
24 TRIAL -- EXCUSE ME -- HNSC TRIAL AND WERE SO
25 INSPIRED BY THE POSITIVE PERSPECTIVES OF THE HD

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 TRIAL. THROUGH OUR 30 YEARS OF ADVOCACY, WE HAVE
2 HAD THE OPPORTUNITY OF MEETING WITH SO MANY HD
3 FAMILY MEMBERS, AND WE HAVE BECOME OUR OWN LARGE
4 EXTENDED FAMILY. MANY WHO HAVE PASSED AND CHILDREN
5 AND YOUNG ADULTS NOW, AND THAT INCLUDES MY OWN
6 CHILDREN WHO HAD JUVENILE ONSET HUNTINGTON'S.

7 EVERY TIME WE LOSE ANOTHER HD FAMILY
8 MEMBER, WE ALL SUFFER. OUR HEARTS ARE BROKEN, BUT
9 OUR SPIRIT IS NOT, AND WE CONTINUE TO FIGHT TO SAVE
10 OUR FAMILIES.

11 I WILL REMAIN COMMITTED TO SUPPORTING HD
12 RESEARCH AND PATIENT CARE BECAUSE HOPE FOR TREATMENT
13 IS THE ONLY THING --

14 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU SO MUCH, DR.
15 SALDANA. WE HAVE NEXT MELODY BANDLEY. MELODY, YOU
16 HAVE THREE MINUTES.

17 MS. BANDLEY: HI. MY NAME IS MELODY
18 BANDLEY, AND I'M TOO CALLING FOR THE SUPPORT OF
19 THE APPLICATION FOR HD OR CLIN2-17081. MY HUSBAND
20 HAS ADVANCED HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE. TWO OF MY
21 CHILDREN HAVE ALREADY TESTED POSITIVE. MY YOUNGEST
22 HAS NOT TESTED, BUT IS AT RISK. TIME IS OF THE
23 ESSENCE.

24 THIS IS A STUDY THAT WE IN THE
25 HUNTINGTON'S DISEASE COMMUNITY HAVE BEEN WAITING FOR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR YEARS. I WROTE IN THE EMAIL I SUBMITTED ABOUT
2 HOW I'VE HAD TO WATCH MY HUSBAND CHANGE OVER THE
3 COURSE OF TWO YEARS FROM A VERY INTELLIGENT
4 AEROSPACE ENGINEER AND A KIND, INVOLVED FATHER TO
5 THE POINT WHERE HE HAS DIFFICULTY COMMUNICATING AT
6 ALL AND NEEDS FULL-TIME CARE.

7 I HOPE YOU'LL READ MY LETTER, AND I HOPE
8 YOU READ THE LETTER THAT FRANCES SALDANA WROTE ABOUT
9 THE TERRIBLE IMPACT HD HAS ON FAMILIES.

10 I'M NOT HERE FOR SYMPATHY. I WANT YOU TO
11 RECONSIDER THE APPLICATION. I'M NOT A SCIENTIST,
12 BUT RESPECTFULLY I THINK IT'S CLEAR FROM LETTERS
13 SUBMITTED AND FROM THE INFORMATION GIVEN BY DR.
14 ROSSER AND DR. TABRIZI THAT THE SCIENTIFIC REVIEW
15 WAS FLAWED. I IMPLORE YOU TO PLEASE RECONSIDER YOUR
16 DECISION.

17 MY DAUGHTER AND I WERE BOTH INVOLVED IN
18 THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT STUDIO FOR THE STUDY AND
19 WERE EXCITED TO BE A PART OF IT. I BELIEVE THIS IS
20 THE ONLY STUDY CLOSE MOVING FORWARD THAT IS EVEN
21 ATTEMPTING TO REBUILD THE STRIATUM OR REMEDY IN ANY
22 WAY WHAT HAS ALREADY DETERIORATED. AND I CAN'T
23 STRESS ENOUGH. I SAW ONE OF THE COMMENTS, SOMETHING
24 ABOUT HOW THE IMPROVEMENT WASN'T SUFFICIENT. BUT
25 EVEN THOSE MODEST IMPROVEMENTS MAKES SUCH A

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DIFFERENCE IN DAY-TO-DAY LIVING WITH HD. AND IT
2 SEEMS LIKE THERE'S POTENTIAL FOR MORE.

3 ANYWAY, HD TENDS TO WREAK HAVOC IN THE
4 BRAIN BEFORE EVEN THE TELLTALE PHYSICAL SIGNS. I'VE
5 SEEN THAT IN MY HUSBAND. I FEAR THAT IN MY
6 CHILDREN. THE POSSIBILITY OF REPAIRING THAT DAMAGE
7 TO ANY EXTENT WOULD BE REALLY BE LIFE-CHANGING. I
8 KNOW IT'S TOO EARLY TO KNOW IF THAT ASPECT OF THE
9 STUDY WILL BE SUCCESSFUL, BUT THE PROSPECT IS REAL.
10 NO ONE ELSE IS EVEN CLOSE TO BRINGING IT TO THE
11 CLINIC.

12 SO, AGAIN, AS I MENTIONED IN MY LETTER, I
13 THINK THIS STUDY SEEMS PARTICULARLY IN LINE WITH
14 CIRM'S MISSION TO FUND RESEARCH THAT IS
15 REGENERATIVE. THE FDA HAS ALREADY GRANTED IND
16 STATUS. IT'S SO CLOSE AND READY TO GO. PLEASE
17 DON'T KEEP US WAITING. I'M DEEPLY APPRECIATIVE TO
18 CIRM FOR THEIR SUPPORT OF HD RESEARCH, AND I HOPE
19 YOU WILL PLEASE CONSIDER, PLEASE CONTINUE AND
20 RECONSIDER THE APPLICATION FOR REGEN FOR HD. THANK
21 YOU.

22 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MELODY.
23 MR. CHAIR, THAT SEEMS TO BE IT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON
24 THIS APPLICATION.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU AGAIN,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CLAUDETTE.

2 THE FINAL COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS.

3 OKAY. SCOTT, I THINK MAYBE RESTATE THE MOTION AND
4 WE CALL A VOTE.

5 MR. TOCHER: SURE. CHECK MY MATH PLEASE,
6 MARK. BUT THE MOTION WILL BE TO ALLOW THE APPLICANT
7 TO RESUBMIT THEIR APPLICATION PURSUANT TO THE
8 REVISED CLIN PROGRAM THAT WILL BE PRESENTED FOR THE
9 BOARD'S CONSIDERATION IN MARCH.

10 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

11 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

12 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.

13 DR. CHOU: YES.

14 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.

15 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.

16 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.

17 DR. DULIEGE: YES.

18 MR. TOCHER: YSABEL DURON.

19 MS. DURON: YES.

20 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.

21 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.

22 MR. TOCHER: ELENA FLOWERS.

23 DR. FLOWERS: YES.

24 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

25 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
2 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
3 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
4 MR. LAJARA: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: CHRIS MIASKOWSKI.
6 DR. MIASKOWSKI: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
8 DR. PADILLA: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA. MARV SOUTHARD.
10 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
11 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
12 MS. WYTE: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: AND KEVIN XU.
14 DR. XU: YES.
15 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU, KEVIN. THANK YOU,
16 MR. CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIES.
17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, SCOTT.
18 HAYLEY, WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO OWE 83.
19 DR. LAM: THANK YOU. SO THE NEXT
20 APPLICATION FOR CONSIDERATION IS CLIN2-17083. THIS
21 IS AN APPLICATION FOR AAV GENE THERAPY TO TREAT
22 ARRHYTHMOGENIC RIGHT VENTRICULAR CARDIOMYOPATHY.
23 THE APPLICANT IS REQUESTING EXACTLY 8
24 MILLION TO EXECUTE A PHASE 1 B CLINICAL TRIAL AND
25 WILL PROVIDE 15.9 MILLION IN CO-FUNDING.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 A LITTLE BIT OF BACKGROUND ON THIS
2 DISEASE. THIS TYPE OF CARDIOMYOPATHY IS AN
3 INHERITED CONDITION WHERE THERE'S A PROGRESSIVE LOSS
4 OF HEART MUSCLE OVER TIME. THE TYPICAL SYMPTOMS
5 BEGIN IN THE YOUNG ADULthood AND RESULTS IN A VERY
6 HIGH RISK FOR LIFE-THREATENING HEART COMPLICATIONS
7 THAT CAN RESULT IN PATIENTS DYING SUDDENLY.

8 THE CURRENT STANDARD OF CARE IS TO TREAT
9 THE SYMPTOMS OF IRREGULAR HEART RHYTHMS WITH DRUGS
10 OR IMPLANTABLE DEVICES. THE PROPOSED GENE THERAPY
11 IS INTENDED TO DELIVER A FUNCTIONAL VERSION OF THE
12 PKP2 GENE. IDEALLY THIS WOULD RESULT IN A THERAPY
13 THAT RESTORES NORMAL FUNCTION OF THE HEART AND SLOW
14 OR PERHAPS REVERSE DISEASE PROGRESSION.

15 THE CIRM PORTFOLIO HAS ONE OTHER PROJECT
16 AT THE CLIN1 IND-ENABLING STAGE FOR THIS INDICATION.
17 THE APPROACH IS ALSO A GENE THERAPY, BUT FOR A
18 DIFFERENT GENE THAT INDUCES A GROWTH FACTOR THAT
19 CIRCULATES TO THE HEART TO HELP RESTORE HEART MUSCLE
20 FUNCTION.

21 THE APPLICANT'S TEAM HAS RECEIVED A PRIOR
22 AWARD FOR A DISCOVERY STAGE GRANT FOR DEVELOPING A
23 CANDIDATE FOR HEART FAILURE.

24 THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GRANTS WORKING
25 GROUP WAS A UNANIMOUS RECOMMENDATION TO FUND THIS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PROJECT WITH A DEI SCORE OF 8. THE CIRM TEAM
2 CONCURS WITH THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION
3 TO FUND THIS APPLICATION FOR 8 MILLION. CHAIR
4 IMBASCIANI.

5 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, HAYLEY.
6 I'D LIKE TO HAVE A MOTION FROM THE BOARD.

7 DR. SOUTHARD: SO MOVED.

8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: MARVIN, IT'S A
9 MOTION TO FUND. YES. SECOND?

10 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: SECOND.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARK.
12 DISCUSSION TO APPLICATION FROM MEMBERS OF THE BOARD?
13 NOW WE'RE LOOKING FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THERE IS NO
14 PUBLIC COMMENT.

15 MR. TOCHER: I DON'T SEE ANY.

16 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SCOTT, YOU MAY
17 PROCEED.

18 MR. TOCHER: OKAY. SO THE MOTION IS TO
19 FUND APPLICATION 17083.

20 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

21 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

22 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.

23 DR. CHOU: YES.

24 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.

25 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.
2 DR. DULIEGE: YES.
3 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
4 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.
6 DR. HIGGINS: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
8 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
10 MR. LAJARA: YES.
11 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
12 DR. PADILLA: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA. MARV SOUTHARD.
14 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
15 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
16 MS. WYTE: YES.
17 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.
18 DR. XU: YES.
19 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU, KEVIN. THANK YOU,
20 MR. CHAIR. THE MOTION CARRIES.
21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, SCOTT.
22 AND, HAYLEY, WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO 083.
23 DR. LAM: THANK YOU. SO THE NEXT
24 APPLICATION FOR CONSIDERATION IS CLIN2-17083. THIS
25 IS AN APPLICATION FOR AN AAV GENE THERAPY TO TREAT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ARRHYTHMOGENIC RIGHT VENTRICULAR CARDIOMYOPATHY. THE
2 APPLICANT IS REQUESTING EXACTLY 8 MILLION TO EXECUTE
3 A PHASE 1B CLINICAL TRIAL AND WILL PROVIDE 15.9
4 MILLION IN CO-FUNDING.

5 A LITTLE BIT OF BACKGROUND ON THIS
6 DISEASE. THIS TYPE OF CARDIOMYOPATHY IS AN
7 INHERITED CONDITION WITH A PROGRESSIVE LOSS OF HEART
8 MUSCLE OVER TIME. THE TYPICAL SYMPTOMS BEGIN IN THE
9 YOUNG ADULTHOOD AND RESULTS IN A VERY HIGH RISK FOR
10 LIFE-THREATENING HEART COMPLICATIONS THAT CAN RESULT
11 IN PATIENTS DYING SUDDENLY.

12 THE CURRENT STANDARD OF CARE IS TO TREAT
13 THE SYMPTOMS OF IRREGULAR RHYTHMS WITH DRUGS OR
14 IMPLANTABLE DEVICES.

15 THE PROPOSED GENE THERAPY IS INTENDED TO
16 DELIVER A FUNCTIONAL VERSION OF THE PKP2 GENE.
17 IDEALLY THIS WOULD RESULT IN A THERAPY THAT RESTORES
18 NORMAL FUNCTION OF THE HEART AND SLOW OR PERHAPS
19 REVERSE DISEASE PROGRESSION.

20 THE CIRM PORTFOLIO HAS ONE OTHER ACTIVE
21 PROJECT AT THE CLIN1 IND-ENABLING STAGE FOR THIS
22 INDICATION. THE APPROACH IS ALSO A GENE THERAPY BUT
23 FOR A DIFFERENT GENE THAT INDUCES A GROWTH FACTOR
24 THAT CIRCULATES TO THE HEART TO HELP RESTORE HEART
25 MUSCLE FUNCTION.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE APPLICANT TEAM HAS RECEIVED A PRIOR
2 AWARD FOR A DISCOVERY STAGE GRANT FOR DEVELOPING A
3 CANDIDATE FOR HEART FAILURE.

4 THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GRANTS WORKING
5 GROUP WAS A UNANIMOUS RECOMMENDATION TO FUND THIS
6 PROJECT WITH A DEI SCORE OF 8. THE CIRM CONCURS
7 WITH THE GRANT WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION TO FUND
8 THIS APPLICATION FOR 8 MILLION.

9 CHAIR IMBASCIANI.

10 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, HAYLEY.
11 I'D LIKE TO HAVE A MOTION FROM THE BOARD.

12 DR. SOUTHARD: SO MOVED.

13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: MARVIN, IT'S A
14 MOTION TO FUND? YES. SECOND?

15 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: SECOND.

16 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARK.
17 DISCUSSION ON THIS APPLICATION FROM MEMBERS OF THE
18 BOARD. HOW ARE WE LOOKING FOR PUBLIC COMMENT?
19 THERE IS NO PUBLIC.

20 MR. TOCHER: I DON'T SEE ANY.

21 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SCOTT, YOU MAY
22 PROCEED.

23 MR. TOCHER: SO THE MOTION IS TO FUND
24 APPLICATION 17083.

25 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.
2 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.
3 DR. CHOU: YES.
4 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.
5 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.
6 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.
7 DR. DULIEGE: YES.
8 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.
9 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.
10 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.
11 DR. HIGGINS: YES.
12 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.
13 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.
14 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
15 MR. LAJARA: YES.
16 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
17 DR. PADILLA: YES.
18 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA. MARV SOUTHARD.
19 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
20 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
21 MS. WYTE: YES.
22 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU.
23 DR. XU: YES.
24 TR. TOCHER: GREAT. THANK YOU. MOTION
25 CARRIES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU. AND,
2 HAYLEY, FOR THE FINAL ONE.

3 DR. LAM: ALL RIGHT. FINAL APPLICATION,
4 CLIN2-17091. THIS IS A GENE THERAPY FOR SPASTIC
5 PARAPLEGIA TYPE 50. THE APPLICANT IS REQUESTING
6 14.9 MILLION IN FUNDING WHILE PROVIDING JUST UNDER
7 10 MILLION IN CO-FUNDING TO COMPLETE A PHASE 3
8 TRIAL.

9 SOME BACKGROUND ON THIS PROJECT. SPG50 IS
10 A RARE NEURODEGENERATIVE DISEASE CAUSED BY A
11 MUTATION IN THE ADAPTER PROTEIN COMPLEX 4 GENE,
12 WHICH IS INVOLVED IN PROTEIN TRAFFICKING IN CELLS.
13 THE SYMPTOMS BEGIN EARLY IN LIFE AND START AS MUSCLE
14 WEAKNESS, BUT PROGRESS OVER TIME TO WORSENING
15 STIFFNESS, EPILEPSY, EVENTUALLY PARALYSIS.

16 THERE ARE NO APPROVED TREATMENTS FOR THIS
17 DISEASE, AND THE CURRENT STANDARD OF CARE TREATS THE
18 SYMPTOMS ONLY.

19 THE PROPOSED GENE THERAPY WILL PROVIDE A
20 FUNCTIONAL COPY OF THE DEFECTIVE GENE, IDEALLY
21 SLOWING OR REVERSING DISEASE PROGRESSION.

22 CIRM CURRENTLY HAS NO TRANSLATIONAL OR
23 CLINICAL AWARDS ADDRESSING THIS INDICATION. AND THE
24 APPLICANT HAS AN ACTIVE CLINICAL CLIN1 IND-ENABLING
25 STAGE AWARD FOR A DIFFERENT NEURODEVELOPMENTAL

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DISEASE USING A SIMILAR GENE THERAPY APPROACH.

2 THE RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GRANTS WORKING
3 GROUP WAS A UNANIMOUS VOTE TO NOT FUND THIS
4 APPLICATION WITH A DEI SCORE OF 8. THE CIRM TEAM
5 CONCURS WITH THE GRANTS WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATION
6 TO NOT FUND THIS APPLICATION. CHAIR IMBASCIANI.

7 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, HAYLEY.
8 I'LL RECOGNIZE MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.

9 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YEAH. SIMILAR TO
10 THE LAST APPLICATION THAT HAD A 3 WITH RESPECT TO
11 TIME IS OF THE ESSENCE ON THIS CONDITION, I WOULD
12 LIKE TO MAKE THE PROPOSAL AND RECOMMENDATION TO
13 ALLOW THE APPLICANT TO RESUBMIT A PROPOSAL AT THE
14 TIME THAT THE NEW PROCESSES ARE IMPLEMENTED TO BE
15 ABLE TO PULL IN THE TIME CONSIDERATION. AND, AGAIN,
16 NOT FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF VOTING OR CHANGING OTHER
17 PEOPLE'S OPINIONS OF THE PROCESS, BUT RATHER FROM
18 THE TIME PERSPECTIVE, IN PARTICULAR WITHIN THE
19 CONTEXT OF I BELIEVE THERE'S NEW DATA AND THERE'S
20 ALSO CIRCUMSTANCES WHERE I UNDERSTAND PATIENTS ARE
21 POTENTIALLY LINED UP TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE IN
22 THIS TRIAL. SO TIME IS A VERY IMPORTANT FACTOR
23 HERE.

24 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, MARK.
25 THAT SOUNDED EASIER THE SECOND TIME.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MAY I HAVE A SECOND PLEASE? MARV
2 SECONDED? SIMILAR TO THE LAST TWO APPLICATIONS AGO,
3 CONVERSATION, DISCUSSION FROM BOARD MEMBERS ON THIS
4 APPLICATION? OKAY. I'LL OPEN IT UP TO COMMENT FROM
5 THE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, APPLICATION 17091.

6 MS. MANDAC: WE DO HAVE MEMBERS OF THE
7 PUBLIC IN PERSON AS WELL AS ONLINE. WE'LL START
8 WITH THE MEMBERS IN PERSON, WHICH ARE TERRY AND
9 EMMA. IF YOU COULD PLEASE COME UP TO THE
10 MICROPHONE. YOU'LL HAVE THREE MINUTES. TIME STARTS
11 NOW.

12 MS. PIROVOLAKIS: GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME
13 IS EMMA PIROVOLAKIS AND I'M HERE TODAY AS A MOTHER,
14 DESPERATE, HOPEFUL, AND DETERMINED. MY HUSBAND WAS
15 BORN IN SAN DIEGO, BUT I'M HERE FOR SCHOOL FOR THE
16 GROWTH THAT THIS STATE OFFERS. CALIFORNIA HAS
17 ALWAYS BEEN A LEADER IN MEDICAL ADVANCEMENTS AND A
18 BEACON OF HOPE FOR FAMILIES LIKE MINE.

19 THIS STATE HAS SET THE STANDARD FOR
20 PUSHING BOUNDARIES IN HEALTHCARE AND CHANGING LIVES.
21 MY SON, WHO MOST OF YOU MET THIS MORNING, HAS SPG50,
22 A RARE AND DEVASTATING DISEASE. SPG50 IS
23 PROGRESSIVE. IT TAKES AWAY A CHILD'S ABILITY TO
24 WORK, TO TALK, TO DO ANYTHING INDEPENDENTLY. TIME
25 IS NOT ON OUR SIDE. AT THREE YEARS OLD HE IS PURE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 JOY, BUT THE REALITY IS, WITHOUT TREATMENT, HE WILL
2 BECOME A HUSK OF THE PERSON HE IS NOW.

3 HE WILL BECOME PARALYZED, REDUCED TO A
4 VEGETATIVE STATE. AND AS HIS PARENTS, WE WILL BE
5 DOOMED TO WATCH HIM SLIP AWAY. HERE'S THE CRUEL
6 REALITY. A TREATMENT ALREADY EXISTS. A GENE
7 THERAPY DESIGNED TO ADDRESS SPG50 HAS BEEN
8 DEVELOPED. IT IS THERE IN A FREEZER READY, BUT IT
9 IS INACCESSIBLE, NOT BECAUSE IT DOESN'T WORK, NOT
10 BECAUSE IT'S UNSAFE, BUT BECAUSE THE CLINICAL TRIALS
11 LACK THE FUNDING TO MOVE FORWARD TO REACH CHILDREN
12 LIKE MY SON. THE INJUSTICE OF THAT IS UNBEARABLE.

13 MY CHILD'S FUTURE IS IN PERIL, NOT BECAUSE
14 THERE ISN'T A SOLUTION, BUT BECAUSE WE CAN'T AFFORD
15 TO DELIVER TO HIM. IMAGINE IT WERE YOUR CHILD AND
16 YOU'RE STANDING IN FRONT OF A LOCKED DOOR. ON THE
17 OTHER ON SIDE IS HOPE, A CHANCE FOR THEM TO LIVE A
18 BETTER LIFE, A LIFE NOT DEFINED BY CRUEL DISEASE,
19 BUT YOU CAN'T OPEN THAT DOOR BECAUSE THERE ISN'T
20 ENOUGH MONEY TO TURN THE KEY.

21 THAT'S WHERE WE ARE AND THAT'S WHERE
22 FAMILIES LIKE MINE ARE EVERY DAY. AS WE SPEAK, MY
23 SON'S CONDITION WORSENS. SPG50 WON'T PAUSE. IT
24 DOESN'T GIVE US THE LUXURY OF WAITING. IF THESE
25 TRIALS DON'T HAPPEN NOW, IT WILL BE TOO LATE FOR MY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SON AND FOR SO MANY OTHERS.

2 EACH DAY WITHOUT ACTION MEANS IRREVERSIBLE
3 DAMAGE. WHAT'S EVEN MORE DEVASTATING IS KNOWING
4 THAT WITH YOUR HELP, WITH THIS GRANT, WE COULD MOVE
5 FORWARD. WE COULD GIVE THESE CHILDREN A CHANCE.
6 THIS IS NOT ABOUT FUNDING RESEARCH. THIS IS ABOUT
7 SAVING LIVES. THIS IS ABOUT JUSTICE, ABOUT GIVING
8 OUR SON THE SAME CHANCE ANY CHILD DESERVES. WE ARE
9 NOT ASKING FOR A MIRACLE. WE ARE ASKING FOR THE
10 MEANS TO DELIVER A MIRACLE, A DRUG THAT'S ALREADY
11 BEEN CREATED. PLEASE DON'T LET TIME RUN OUT. A
12 YEAR HAS ALREADY PASSED WITHOUT HIM RECEIVING THE
13 TREATMENT HE NEEDS. APPROVING THIS GRANT COULD MEAN
14 EVERYTHING. THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A LIFE LOST AND
15 A LIFE LIVED, YOU HAVE THE POWER TO UNLOCK THAT
16 DOOR. I AM BEGGING YOU AS A MOTHER ONTO HELP US
17 OPEN IT. THANK YOU.

18 MS. MANDAC: THANK SO MUCH, EMMA. WE'RE
19 ACTUALLY MOVING TO THE ZOOM FIRST. IF WE COULD GO
20 TO REBECCA LOCKARD. WE HAVE THREE MINUTES. YOUR
21 CLOCK STARTS NOW. REBECCA, CAN YOU PLEASE UNMUTE?
22 REBECCA, CAN YOU HEAR US?

23 MS. LOCKARD: I APOLOGIZE. YES.

24 MS. MANDAC: YOUR CLOCK STARTS NOW.

25 MS. LOCKARD: THANK YOU. HELLO, MEMBERS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 OF THE BOARD. MY NAME IS REBECCA AND I'M MOM TO
2 NAOMI AND JACK. MY WORLD COLLAPSED ON MAY 12, 2023,
3 WHEN I FOUND OUT THAT MY DAUGHTER WAS DIAGNOSED WITH
4 SPG50 AND THAT THERE WAS A 25-PERCENT CHANCE THAT MY
5 UNBORN SON WOULD ALSO BE AFFECTED.

6 WHEN OUR FEARS CAME TRUE FIVE WEEKS AFTER
7 JACK'S BIRTH WHEN HIS GENETIC TEST SHOWED THAT HE
8 WAS POSITIVE TOO. I LEARNED THAT MY CHILDREN WOULD
9 SLOWLY DETERIORATE, BECOMING PARAPLEGIC IN
10 ELEMENTARY SCHOOL, QUADRIPLAGIC IN HIGH SCHOOL, AND
11 PERHAPS FACE AN EARLY DEATH. THE IDEA THAT THEY
12 WOULD BE NONVERBAL AND HAVE SEVERE COGNITIVE
13 IMPAIRMENTS WAS DEVASTATING.

14 TWO DAYS AFTER NAOMI'S DIAGNOSIS, I SOBBED
15 ON MOTHER'S DAY WHEN THE SHOCK LIFTED A BIT AND I
16 REALIZED THAT I WOULD NEVER HEAR MY KIDS SAY MAMA.

17 THE ONLY THING THAT GOT ME THROUGH THOSE
18 DARK DAYS WAS THE HOPE OF A GENE THERAPY DRUG THAT
19 WAS ALREADY DEVELOPED AND BEING TESTED ON AFFECTED
20 KIDS. THE IDEA THAT MY CHILDREN'S FACE SHOWED THEIR
21 DEGENERATION WAS NOT SET IN STONE CONTINUES TO HELP
22 ME FIGHT FOR EACH DAY.

23 JACK WAS TREATED IN DECEMBER 2023, A FEW
24 DAYS SHY OF HIS SIX-MONTH BIRTHDAY. HE WAS THE
25 YOUNGEST CHILD TO EVER RECEIVE ANY TYPE OF

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 INTRATHECAL GENE THERAPY. HE FACED NO ADVERSE
2 REACTIONS, AND HE HAS THRIVED SINCE RECEIVING THE
3 DRUG.

4 SO, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD, IF YOU WANT TO
5 KNOW IF THE DRUG WORKS, LOOK AT MY CHILDREN. THEY
6 HAVE THE SAME PARENTS, THE SAME THERAPY PROVIDERS,
7 THE SAME DOCTORS, THE EXACT SAME MUTATED GENES, AND
8 YET DIFFERENT OUTCOMES.

9 JACK IS TWO YEARS YOUNGER THAN NAOMI AND
10 SURPASSED HER DEVELOPMENTALLY. THE ONLY EXPLANATION
11 FOR THE DIFFERENCE IN DEVELOPMENT IS THIS TREATMENT.
12 TODAY MY DAUGHTER NAOMI IS A HAPPY, BRIGHT, AND
13 CLEVER THREE AND A HALF YEAR OLD LITTLE GIRL. SHE
14 DID LEARN TO SAY MAMA AND DADA AND BABA FOR BROTHER
15 TOO. SHE CRAWLS AROUND THE HOUSE AND HAS TAKEN A
16 FEW STEPS IN HER GAIT TRAINER. SHE HAS VERY POOR
17 FINGER STRENGTH, BUT SHE'S FIGURED OUT HOW TO BITE
18 HER STUFFIES TO ACTIVATE THE SOUND AND USING BUTTONS
19 HIDDEN WITHIN THEM. SHE WILL LOSE ALL OF THIS AND
20 SO MUCH MORE WITHOUT THE TREATMENT THAT EXISTS AND
21 IS JUST NOT ACCESSIBLE TO HER.

22 YOUR FUNDING WILL GIVE HOPE TO THE
23 FAMILIES AND FRIENDS OF KIDS WITH SPG50 WHO WORRY
24 DAILY ABOUT WHAT THEIR FUTURE HOLDS. IT WILL HELP
25 SHOW THAT RARE DISEASES ARE WORTH DEVELOPING

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 TREATMENTS FOR, THAT THEY ARE VIABLE TO MOVE THROUGH
2 THE PHASES OF A CLINICAL TRIAL, AND INTO THE PUBLIC.
3 IT WILL GIVE VOICE TO THE SMALLEST COMMUNITIES WHO
4 SUFFER ALONE BECAUSE THEIR CONDITION ONLY AFFECTS A
5 TINY PORTION OF THE POPULATION. AND MOST
6 IMPORTANTLY, IT WILL GIVE CHILDREN A CHANCE AT A
7 FULL AND FRUITFUL LIFE.

8 I WANT YOU TO RECONSIDER YOUR DECISION.
9 THIS PROGRAM IS THE BEST CHANCE THAT KIDS WITH SPG50
10 HAVE AT TREATING THEIR CONDITION. IT IS THE ONLY
11 TREATMENT THAT WILL EXIST FOR THEM AT AN AGE WHERE
12 IT WILL MAKE A DIFFERENCE, A CHANCE TO GIVE THEM A
13 HAPPY AND POSITIVE LIFE, NOT ONE FILLED WITH PAIN
14 AND SUFFERING. I'M ASKING FOR YOU TO HELP ME
15 ACHIEVE THAT GOAL. THANK YOU.

16 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, REBECCA.
17 NEXT WE HAVE DR. DARIUS. IF YOU COULD PLEASE
18 UNMUTE. DR. DARIUS, IF YOU COULD PLEASE UNMUTE.
19 OKAY. WE'LL MOVE RIGHT ON TO THE NEXT ONE.
20 DR. GOTLIEB, IF YOU COULD PLEASE UNMUTE TO BE
21 FOLLOWED BY DR. GRAY. DR. GOTLIEB, YOU HAVE THREE
22 MINUTES.

23 DR. GOTTLIEB: YES. I'M UNMUTED. SO MY
24 NAME IS DR. KEITH GOTLIEB. I'M THE PI FOR THIS ONE,
25 FOR CLIN2-17091. I'M HONORED TO SPEAK TO YOU, TO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE BOARD, TODAY NOT SO MUCH OUT OF FRUSTRATION, BUT
2 ABOUT A DEEP CONVICTION AND UNWAVERING HOPE FOR THIS
3 PROGRAM. IT'S AN EXTRAORDINARY OPPORTUNITY TO
4 CHANGE LIVES AS YOU JUST HEARD FROM TWO INDIVIDUALS
5 AND FAMILIES.

6 I HAVE DEEP ROOTS IN CALIFORNIA. IN FACT,
7 I'VE BEEN HERE SINCE 1996. MY PH.D. IS ACTUALLY
8 FROM THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA IRVINE. MY KIDS
9 WERE BORN HERE. I OWN A HOUSE HERE. MY WIFE HAS A
10 COMPANY HERE. AND MY ENTIRE CAREER HAS BEEN IN
11 COMPANIES IN CALIFORNIA. I'VE PAID TAXES HERE FOR
12 30 YEARS, INCLUDING VOTING FOR THE PROPOSITIONS THAT
13 SUPPORT CIRM IN 2004 AND 2020. AND I WAS HOPING,
14 HOPING WITH ALL MY MIGHT THAT THIS PROGRAM WOULD BE
15 SUPPORTED BY ALL THE WORK THAT HAS GONE INTO THE
16 APPLICATION AND THE AMAZING TECHNOLOGY THAT THIS
17 COULD BE FOR THESE KIDS.

18 SPG50 WAS SELECTED BY THE VERY PRESTIGIOUS
19 JUST BESPOKE THERAPY CONSORTIUM WHICH WAS LED BY THE
20 FOUNDATIONS FOR THE NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF HEALTH.
21 THIS WAS SUPPOSED TO BE A COLLABORATION, IS A
22 COLLABORATION, IN FACT, WITH NIH, THE FDA, AND CIRM
23 ITSELF, SIGNIFYING A PROMISED SCIENTIFIC RIGOR OF
24 THIS PROGRAM. AND THIS RECOGNIZES THE URGENCY AND
25 IMPORTANCE OF ADVANCING IMMUNE THERAPIES FOR RARE

1 DISEASE.

2 YET WHEN I LOOKED AT THE COMMITTEE'S
3 FEEDBACK, I WAS COMPLETELY BLOWN AWAY BY WHAT I SAW.
4 THE CRITIQUES WERE A LACK OF UNDERSTANDING, A
5 MISUNDERSTANDING OF THE UNIQUE CHALLENGES OF
6 ULTRA-RARE CONDITIONS. ONE REVIEWER EVEN SAID THAT
7 OUTSIDE OF A VAGUE STATEMENT ABOUT POTENTIAL
8 IMPROVEMENTS THAT DID NOT PROVIDE ENOUGH INFORMATION
9 ABOUT EFFICACY, AND WE HAD ALREADY TREATED SIX
10 CHILDREN. YOU JUST HEARD ABOUT ONE OF THEM. AND WE
11 ALREADY PRESENTED THIS INFORMATION IN OUR PACKAGE.

12 ANOTHER ONE SAYS THAT THE IMPACT COULD BE
13 MODEST AT BEST. BUT ANY CHANGE IN THESE CHILDREN,
14 MUCH LIKE THE PREVIOUS ONES, A SINGLE STEP TAKEN, A
15 WORD SPOKEN, A MOMENT OF RECOGNITION TO THEIR
16 PARENTS CAN BE LIFE-CHANGING.

17 THIS WAS LIKE A COMPLETE REALITY THAT
18 THESE FAMILIES ARE FACING AT ALL TIMES. I EMPOWER
19 THE COMMITTEE TO EMBRACE THE RESPONSIBILITY THAT YOU
20 HAVE TO FUND THIS SCIENCE. AND I WANT TO END WITH A
21 QUOTE FROM DR. PETER MARKS, WHO'S CURRENTLY THE
22 DIRECTOR OF CBER AT THE FDA WHO STATED THAT RARE
23 DISEASE RESEARCH SERVES AS A TESTING GROUND FOR
24 ADVANCEMENTS THAT WILL ULTIMATELY BENEFIT BROADER
25 PATIENT POPULATIONS. THAT'S WHAT SPG LAYS THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOUNDATION FOR FOR THIS POPULATION. I ENCOURAGE
2 YOU --

3 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, DR.
4 GOTLIEB. NEXT WE HAVE DR. GRAY TO BE FOLLOWED BY
5 DR. KAKKIS. DR. GRAY, IF YOU COULD PLEASE UNMUTE.
6 DR. GRAY, IF YOU COULD PLEASE UNMUTE. ALL RIGHT.
7 WE'LL MOVE ON THEN TO DR. KAKKIS. DR. KAKKIS, IF
8 YOU COULD PLEASE UNMUTE.

9 DR. KAKKIS: HELLO, CIRM BOARD. PLEASED
10 TO BE ABLE TO TALK TO YOU TODAY ABOUT THIS
11 APPLICATION. I'M A MEDICAL GENETICIST M.D./PH.D.
12 TRAINED HERE IN CALIFORNIA, AND I'VE BEEN WORKING IN
13 BIOTECHNOLOGY SINCE LEAVING UCLA AT BIOMARIN AND
14 ULTRAGENICSS. I HAVE PERSONALLY BEEN INVOLVED IN 11
15 DRUG APPROVALS AND HAVE A RECORD OF 11 OUT OF 13
16 PROGRAMS ENTER THE CLINIC. SO I HAVE A DEEP
17 EXPERIENCE AND UNDERSTANDING HOW TO PICK GENE
18 THERAPY PROGRAMS OR OTHER TYPES OF PROGRAMS THAT CAN
19 SUCCEED AND MOVE FORWARD TO SUCCESSFUL PRODUCTS.

20 I GOT INVOLVED WITH THIS PROGRAM EARLY ON.
21 AND PERSONALLY, BECAUSE OF ITS POTENTIAL FOR
22 SUCCESS, DONATED \$800,000 IN THE EARLY DAYS TO GET
23 ENOUGH MANUFACTURING DONE FOR MR. PIROVOLAKIS TO
24 TREAT HIS SON. AND SO I'M DEEPLY KNOWLEDGEABLE WITH
25 THIS, AND OUR TEAM HERE HAS HELPED TERRY AT VARIOUS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 POINTS IN TIME. UNFORTUNATELY, ULTRAGENICS ITSELF,
2 MY COMPANY, CANNOT DEVELOP THIS TREATMENT BECAUSE
3 IT'S JUST TOO RARE A DISEASE FOR US. WE DO A LOT OF
4 RARE DISEASE, BUT THIS ONE IS JUST TOO SMALL. BUT I
5 HAVE HIGH FAITH IN IT, AND I BELIEVE THE REVIEW THAT
6 I READ WAS COMPLETELY OFF BASE. AND I HAVE NO
7 UNDERSTANDING OF HOW THEY GOT UP TO THE CONCLUSIONS
8 THEY HAD. I REALLY THINK THIS NEEDS TO BE REDONE.

9 IF YOU LOOK AT WHAT'S GOING ON RIGHT NOW
10 IN AV9 GENE THERAPY AND SMA, BOTH I.V. AND I.T., IT
11 HAS BEEN A POWERFUL, DRAMATIC CHANGE IN OUTCOME FOR
12 THOSE PATIENTS. SPG50 IS VERY MUCH LIKE SMA IN
13 TERMS OF THE TARGET NEURONS AND THE TECHNOLOGY BEING
14 USED. THE PROBABILITY OF SUCCESS IS HIGH AND THEY
15 HAVE SUCCESSFULLY ALREADY TREATED SIX KIDS,
16 INCLUDING MR. PIROVOLAKIS' OWN SON.

17 THE TRUTH IS THAT THIS IS A PROGRAM THAT'S
18 HIGHLY LIKELY TO BENEFIT PATIENTS. AND HOW
19 PERFECTLY IT BENEFITS THE SPINAL CORD MAYBE IN
20 QUESTION, BUT THE TREATMENT SO FAR HAS SHOWN
21 BENEFIT. AND I WOULD SAY FOR MANY OF THE COMPLEX
22 THINGS THAT CIRM HAS TO FUND AND DO, THIS IS ONE OF
23 THOSE PROGRAMS THAT WILL BE A WIN AND IMPORTANT
24 PLACE FOR CIRM TO CONTRIBUTE TO ACTUAL POSITIVE
25 MOVEMENT AND WITH A DRUG THAT ACTUALLY WORKS AND

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 GETS TO PATIENTS .

2 I THINK THAT THE REVIEW WAS OFF BASE. I'M
3 NOT SURE WHY IT WAS, WHERE THE POINTS WERE. BUT I
4 THINK FROM WHAT I KNOW AS A RARE DISEASE DRUG
5 DEVELOPER WITH A HIGH RECORD OF SUCCESS IN THESE
6 PROGRAMS, HIGH VALUE, HIGH SUCCESS, AND IT'S MOVED
7 TO THIS VERY CRITICAL PLACE TO TREAT MANY KIDS WHO
8 WILL HAVE NO OTHER SHOT. AND I WISH I COULD DO IT
9 AT ULTRAGENICS AND TERRY HAS ASKED ME MULTIPLE
10 TIMES, BUT I CANNOT. BUT I'VE DONE EVERYTHING I CAN
11 TO HELP THIS GET DONE. I THINK CIRM IS ONE OF THE
12 THOSE PLACES THAT CAN HELP THESE DREAMS COME TRUE,
13 AND I THINK THE SCIENCE SHOULD BE REEVALUATED. I DO
14 THINK IT'S A LOT MORE SOLID THAN EVERYTHING WE HAVE,
15 AND THE SCIENCE AROUND SMA AND AV9 TELLS US THIS IS
16 A GOOD PATH FORWARD FOR SPG50, AND I THINK THE DATA
17 TO DATE SUPPORTS THAT. I WANT TO GIVE MY
18 WHOLEHEARTED RECOMMENDATION TO YOU. REDO THE
19 SCIENCE REVIEW--

20 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, DR.
21 KAKKIS. TERRY PIROVOLAKIS, YOU HAVE THREE MINUTES.

22 MR. PIROVOLAKIS: I COME TO YOU TODAY AS A
23 FATHER OF A RARE DISEASE CHILD, A STRONG CIRM
24 PARTNER, A BIOTECH CEO, AND MOST IMPORTANTLY THE
25 VOICE FOR THE RARE DISEASE COMMUNITY. I AM HERE TO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FIGHT FOR THE LIVES OF CHILDREN, CHILDREN WHO OFTEN
2 WILL NOT SURVIVE WITHOUT THE SUPPORT AND LEADERSHIP
3 OF ORGANIZATIONS LIKE CIRM.

4 IN 2022 I PLEADED TO THE BGDC BOARD TO
5 TAKE ON SPG50 DESPITE DESPERATE TO SAVE MORE
6 CHILDREN. THAT PLEA LED TO THE CREATION OF ALTHENA
7 THERAPEUTICS, A CALIFORNIA COMPANY AND AN HISTORIC
8 COLLABORATION INVOLVING CIRM, THE BGDC, NIH, FNIH,
9 AND CEDARS-SINAI. TOGETHER WE SOUGHT TO DELIVER
10 HOPE WHERE THERE WAS NONE. WHAT WE DIDN'T
11 ANTICIPATE WAS THAT COLLABORATION WOULD REQUIRE US
12 TO APPLY TO CIRM, RAISE MILLIONS IN CO-FUNDING, AND
13 NOW STAND BEFORE YOU TO APPEAL A DECISION THAT
14 THOROUGHLY DISTINGUISHED THAT HOPE, NOT JUST FOR
15 SPG50, BUT EVERY CHILD THAT IS AFFECTED BY RARE
16 DISEASE.

17 OUR DRUG IS READY. OUR CHILDREN ARE
18 DESPERATELY WAITING. THE FOREMOST LEADERS IN THE
19 FIELD ARE FULLY COMMITTED TO THIS EFFORT, AND WITHIN
20 MONTHS WE COULD BEGIN SAVING THESE CHILDREN. WE
21 HAVE A CLEAR PATH TO ADVANCE THIS PROGRAM TOWARDS
22 APPROVAL.

23 KEITH HAS ALREADY OUTLINED THE TECHNICAL
24 FLAWS IN THE REVIEW PROCESS. THE REVIEWERS'
25 COMMENTS ARE NOT JUST MISINFORMED, BUT THEY ARE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DANGEROUS. TO SUGGEST THAT A THERAPY COULD WORSEN
2 OUTCOMES OR PRECLUDE FUTURE TREATMENT OPTIONS
3 IGNORES THE SCIENCE, DISMISSES THE URGENCY,
4 UNDERMINES THE MISSION WE ALL SHARE.

5 THE CHILDREN -- THESE CHILDREN HAVE NO
6 TIME TO WAIT FOR ANOTHER THERAPY THAT WILL NEVER
7 COME. BY VOTING AGAINST OUR PROGRAM, THIS BOARD
8 WOULD SEND A CHILLING MESSAGE TO THE RARE DISEASE
9 COMMUNITY THAT CIRM DOES NOT STAND BY ITS
10 COMMITMENTS TO THE BGTC, NIH, OR FNIH THAT IT'S NOT
11 SERIOUS ABOUT RARE DISEASE, THAT DOES NOT BELIEVE IN
12 THE PROMISE OF BRAIN-DIRECTED GENE THERAPIES. IT
13 DOES NOT RECOGNIZE THE VALUE OF ADAPTIVE TRIAL
14 DESIGNS, APPROACHES THE FDA IS ALREADY EMBRACING TO
15 ACCELERATE TREATMENTS FOR PATIENTS IN URGENT NEED.
16 WE CANNOT LET THIS HAPPEN. I AM BEGGING YOU TO VOTE
17 TO APPROVE OUR PROGRAM. THIS IS ABOUT MORE THAN
18 FUNDING. IT'S ABOUT SAVING LIVES.

19 IT'S ABOUT SHOWING THE RARE DISEASE
20 COMMUNITY THAT CIRM STANDS WITH THEM, THAT IT
21 BELIEVES IN BOLD, GROUNDBREAKING SCIENCE, AND THAT
22 IT'S WILLING TO FIGHT FOR CHILDREN WITHOUT OTHER
23 OPTIONS.

24 IF A LEADING PROGRAM LIKE OURS WITH A
25 NATURAL HISTORY SETTING IN CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PARTNERED BY THE BESPOKE GENE THERAPY CONSORTIUM,
2 NIH, AN NINDS, HAS SUPPORT FROM BIOTECHS LIKE
3 ULTRAGENICS, ROCHE, CHARLES RIVER, AND ENVIROGEN,
4 HAS TREATED SIX CHILDREN, HAS FDA APPROVAL FOR A
5 PHASE 3 DOES NOT GET FUNDING, WHAT PROGRAM WILL?
6 THE VOTE IS NOT JUST A DECISION. IT'S A DECLARATION
7 THAT CIRM'S COMMITMENT TO RARE DISEASE AND THE
8 FUTURE OF MEDICINE. PLEASE DO THE RIGHT THING.
9 TAKE ACCOUNTABILITY, APPROVE THIS PROGRAM, AND LET'S
10 SAVE THESE CHILDREN TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

11 MS. MANDAC: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LAST
12 CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS APPLICATION, 17091.
13 MR. CHAIR, THERE ARE NO MORE HANDS RAISED.

14 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU,
15 CLAUDETTE, FOR MANAGING THAT. WE HAVE A MOTION ON
16 THE FLOOR. ARE THERE ANY FINAL COMMENTS FROM BOARD
17 MEMBERS ON BOARD MEMBER FISCHER-COLBRIE'S MOTION?
18 J.T.

19 DR. THOMAS: SO I'D LIKE TO ADDRESS A
20 COUPLE OF COMMENTS TO BOTH THE LAST -- NOT THE
21 LAST -- THIS AND THE HUNTINGTON'S APPLICATION AS
22 WELL.

23 WE HAVE A PROCESS HERE, AND THE PROCESS
24 HAS FOR 20 YEARS BEEN FOUNDED IN HAVING ROBUST PEER
25 REVIEW OF PROPOSALS THAT COME IN FOR FUNDING. IF WE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 DEVIATE FROM THAT, WE WILL BE IN A POSITION WHERE
2 WE'LL BE CHANGING THE WAY THINGS HAVE ALWAYS BEEN.
3 HERETOFORE HAVING GRANTS THAT WERE SCORED TIER III
4 MEANT INEXORABLY THAT THEY WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO
5 REAPPLY UNTIL A MINIMUM OF SIX MONTHS, WHICH IN THE
6 CASE OF THESE TWO PROPOSALS WOULD PUT THEM OUT INTO
7 THE SUMMER.

8 WE HAD A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF INPUT FROM
9 FAMILY MEMBERS, MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, VARIOUS
10 OTHERS ON BOTH OF THESE APPLICATIONS. AND WE HEARD
11 THAT. AND IN SO DOING, BECAUSE WE CAN'T SIT HERE AS
12 A BOARD AND EVALUATE SCIENTIFIC CRITIQUES OF OUR
13 REVIEW PROCESS IN ANY WAY THAT WOULD BE COMPETENT.
14 SO THE BEST WE CAN DO IS TO TRY TO GET THEM
15 RECONSIDERED AS SOON AS WE CAN WITHIN THE CONFINES
16 OF OUR SYSTEM.

17 WE HAPPEN TO BE AT AN INFLECTION POINT
18 WHERE WE ARE CHANGING THE CONCEPT PLANS FOR A NUMBER
19 OF OUR GRANTS, AND THIS ALLOWS US THE OPPORTUNITY,
20 FURTHER TO MARK'S MOTION, TO FOR THE FIRST TIME MOVE
21 UP RECONSIDERATION OF TIER III GRANTS TO A TIME
22 EARLIER THAN WE HAVE PREVIOUSLY. AND THAT IS,
23 WITHIN THE CONFINES OF OUR SYSTEM, THE BEST WE CAN
24 DO. WE CAN'T GO AGAINST THE GWG WITHOUT FURTHER
25 KNOWLEDGE ON THE PART OF THE BOARD.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SO I BELIEVE THAT THIS IS A GOOD
2 COMPROMISE THAT MARK HAS SUGGESTED, AND IT WILL GET
3 BOTH OF THESE GRANTS BACK IN FOR RECONSIDERATION
4 SHORTLY AND, BY THE WAY, WILL ALLOW FOR THEM TO TALK
5 TO MEMBERS OF OUR TEAM WITH RESPECT TO THE CRITIQUES
6 THAT WERE GIVEN BY MEMBERS OF THE GWG TO HELP THEM
7 THINK THROUGH HOW TO FASHION REAPPLICATION IN A WAY
8 THAT WILL GIVE THEM A BETTER SHOT OF APPROVAL.

9 SO, AGAIN, THIS IS MAINLY FOR THE BENEFIT
10 OF OUR NEWER MEMBERS WHO ARE NOT USED TO WHAT WE
11 HAVE HAD HERE TODAY, VERY COMPELLING STORIES AND ALL
12 OF WHICH IS TERRIBLY IMPORTANT. SO I RECOMMEND TO
13 THE BOARD THAT YOU ADOPT MARK'S APPROACH AS YOU DID
14 WITH THE HUNTINGTON'S GRANT AND LET THEM REAPPLY IN
15 SHORT ORDER.

16 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU, J.T.
17 THAT WAS ELOQUENT. NO FURTHER COMMENT, THEN I THINK
18 WE CAN PROBABLY PROCEED TO THE VOTE.

19 MR. PIROVOLAKIS: AM I ALLOWED TO SAY
20 SOMETHING MORE? AM I ALLOWED TO SAY SOMETHING MORE?
21 AM I NOT ALLOWED TO SAY ANYTHING BEYOND THAT?

22 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: I THINK WE
23 PROBABLY -- HAVE WE TERMINATED PUBLIC COMMENT? BUT
24 HE'S EXCEEDED HIS --

25 MR. PIROVOLAKIS: I WOULD LIKE TO SAY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SOMETHING VERY BRIEF.

2 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: TERRY --

3 MR. PIROVOLAKIS: RESPECT THE BOARD --

4 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: -- I WOULD HAVE TO
5 DO THAT FOR 80 OTHER PEOPLE GIVEN THE RESPONSE THAT
6 WE'VE GOTTEN FOR THIS MEETING. I'M SORRY.

7 MR. TOCHER: I'LL CALL THE ROLL.

8 MARIA BONNEVILLE.

9 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: YES.

10 MR. TOCHER: JUDY CHOU.

11 DR. CHOU: YES.

12 MR. TOCHER: LEONDRA CLARK-HARVEY.

13 DR. CLARK-HARVEY: YES.

14 MR. TOCHER: ANNE-MARIE DULIEGE.

15 DR. DULIEGE: YES.

16 MR. TOCHER: YSABEL DURON.

17 MS. DURON: YES.

18 MR. TOCHER: MARK FISCHER-COLBRIE.

19 MR. FISCHER-COLBRIE: YES.

20 MR. TOCHER: ELENA FLOWERS.

21 DR. FLOWERS: YES.

22 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS.

23 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

24 MR. TOCHER: VITO IMBASCIANI.

25 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: YES.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: RICH LAJARA.
2 MR. LAJARA: YES.
3 MR. TOCHER: CHRIS MIASKOWSKI.
4 DR. MIASKOWSKI: YES.
5 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA.
6 DR. PADILLA: YES.
7 MR. TOCHER: JOE PANETTA.
8 MR. PANETTA: YES.
9 MR. TOCHER: MARV SOUTHARD.
10 DR. SOUTHARD: YES.
11 MR. TOCHER: YAEL WYTE.
12 MS. WHITE: YES.
13 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU. KEVIN? WE'RE GOOD
14 ON NUMBERS. THE MOTION CARRIES.
15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. GREAT. THANK
16 YOU VERY MUCH. AND, DR. LAM, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR
17 YOUR PRESENTATION AND YOUR EXPLANATIONS.
18 DR. DULIEGE: FIRST WANTED TO SUPPORT
19 ENTIRELY WHAT J.T. JUST SAID ON BEHALF OF THE CIRM.
20 AND AS THE PRESIDENT OF CIRM, I CAN SUPPORT YOU
21 COMPLETELY. NOT ONLY ON BEHALF OF THE TEAM, BUT ON
22 MY BEHALF AS WELL.
23 IT'S REALLY PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT, AND I
24 DO AGAIN I DO THINK WE UNDERSTAND DEEPLY THE URGENCY
25 THAT FAMILY MEMBERS AND SCIENTISTS FEEL EVERY DAY.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WE UNDERSTAND EMOTIONALLY. I CAN'T PRETEND THAT
2 WE'RE IN THEIR SHOES REALLY. BUT FROM A SCIENTIFIC
3 PERSPECTIVE, I THINK YOU ALL PROBABLY WANT TO
4 UNDERSTAND THAT HERE WE'RE GIVING ANOTHER CHANCE FOR
5 MAYBE AN IMPROVED APPLICATION WHERE THINGS WERE NOT
6 THAT CLEAR.

7 SO MY QUESTION BACK TO US NOW IS HOW MANY
8 MONTH DELAY THIS REPRESENT, ASSUMING THAT THERE
9 WOULD BE AN APPLICATION, LET'S SAY, THIS LATTER
10 PROPOSAL AS SOON AS POSSIBLE?

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: J.T., YOU'RE GOING
12 TO BRING THE CONCEPT PLAN.

13 DR. THOMAS: I'LL TAKE IT. SO THESE ARE
14 FURTHER TO THE NEW CLIN CONCEPT PLAN THAT WILL BE
15 BROUGHT TO THE BOARD IN TWO MONTHS. AND ASSUMING
16 THE BOARD APPROVES, THAT WILL IMMEDIATELY SET IN
17 MOTION THE PROCESS OF GETTING TO WHERE APPLICATIONS
18 WILL BEGIN TO BE ACCEPTED WHICH WILL BE IN THE
19 SPRING AS OPPOSED TO THE WAY IT WOULD BE UNDER THE
20 TIER III, WHICH WOULD BE IN THE SUMMER.

21 DR. DULIEGE: SO IT'S EFFECTIVELY A
22 TWO-MONTH DELAY IN THE PROCESS.

23 DR. THOMAS: IT'S A LITTLE MORE THAN THAT,
24 YES.

25 DR. DULIEGE: THREE- TO FOUR-MONTH DELAY,

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 WHICH --

2 DR. THOMAS: IT'S A COUPLE MONTHS OFF OF
3 WHAT IT WOULD HAVE BEEN HAD THEY WAITED FOR THE
4 NORMAL TIER III TIME.

5 DR. DULIEGE: OKAY. THANK YOU.

6 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: OKAY. WE ARE NOW
7 MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM NO. 13. THIS IS CONSIDERATION
8 OF RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE GOVERNANCE SUBCOMMITTEE.
9 AND I WILL JUST PASS IT OVER TO PAT LEVITT AT THIS
10 POINT, WHO'S ONE OF THE CO-CHAIRS OF THE
11 SUBCOMMITTEE.

12 DR. LEVITT: I AM NOT JUDY GASSON, BUT I
13 WISH I WAS AT THIS TIME.

14 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: IN HER ABSENCE YOU
15 MEAN?

16 DR. LEVITT: IN HER ABSENCE. SHE'S ON A
17 PLANE SOMEWHERE, I THINK.

18 SO FOR THIS AGENDA ITEM, THE GOVERNANCE
19 SUBCOMMITTEE MET LAST WEEK TO TAKE UP AN ITEM ABOUT
20 THE DOCUMENTS THAT ARE USED FOR REVIEW OF THE CHAIR,
21 VICE CHAIR, AND PRESIDENT AND CEO. AND, SCOTT, IS
22 SUSAN WHITE ON --

23 MR. TOCHER: UH-HUH.

24 DR. LEVITT: -- WHO'S GOING TO PROVIDE THE
25 SUMMARY OF THE MATERIALS THAT THE GOVERNANCE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 COMMITTEE APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY?

2 MS. WHITE: YES. AND, PAT, I'M HERE. I
3 DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN SEE ME. HELLO.

4 DR. LEVITT: WE CAN HEAR YOU.

5 MS. WHITE: OKAY. PERFECT. EXCELLENT.
6 SO THANK YOU. IT'S WONDERFUL TO BE BACK WITH ALL OF
7 YOU, AND I WANTED TO GIVE YOU A QUICK UPDATE ON THE
8 EVALUATION OF THE THREE EXECUTIVE POSITIONS THAT
9 WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING IN 2025.

10 SO WE ARE GOING TO DO THE CHAIR AND THE
11 VICE CHAIR OF THE BOARD AGAIN, AND WE'RE GOING TO
12 USE THE SAME QUESTIONS THAT WERE ASKED LAST YEAR.
13 AND WE'RE ALSO GOING TO BE DOING ONE FOR J.T., SO
14 THE PRESIDENT AND CEO POSITION. AND THAT WILL BE A
15 NEW ONE. SO THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE BEEN THE BOARD
16 LAST YEAR AND ARE STILL THERE, WE'RE GOING ASK THE
17 SAME QUESTIONS FOR MARIA AND VITO, BUT ON J.T. WE
18 USED THE SEARCH CRITERIA, THE COMPETENCY STANDARD OF
19 THE JOB TO FORMULATE THE SURVEY QUESTIONS.

20 SO THE TIMELINE, I DID WANT TO GIVE YOU A
21 QUICK HEADS UP ON IT. SO LET ME SEE IF I CAN SHARE
22 MY SCREEN. LET ME GO AHEAD AND SEE IF I CAN GET
23 THAT A LITTLE BIT BIGGER. YEAH.

24 SO WE ARE GOING TO DO THE SAME PROCESS --

25 DR. LEVITT: WE CAN'T SEE THE DOCUMENT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THERE YOU GO. OKAY.

2 MS. WHITE: OH, GOOD. WE'RE GOING TO USE
3 THE SAME PROCESS WHERE VITO, MARIA, AND J. T. --

4 MR. TOCHER: SUSAN, SORRY. THIS IS SCOTT.
5 IS THERE ANY WAY YOU COULD SHOW SINGLE PAGE AT A
6 TIME? IT'S AWFULLY SMALL ON OUR TEENY TINY LITTLE
7 MONITORS ALTHOUGH I'D ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO LOOK INTO
8 THEIR ELECTRONIC NOTEBOOKS IF THEY HAVE IT. IT'S
9 ATTACHED ON OUR AGENDA.

10 MS. WHITE: YES. YOU KNOW WHAT I MIGHT
11 DO. CLAUDETTE, I THINK, HAS THE -- WHY DON'T I LET
12 HER SHOW THE SCREEN. SHE'LL BE ABLE TO -- IF I STOP
13 SHARING, CLAUDETTE MIGHT SHARE THE SCREEN SO SHE CAN
14 DO IT.

15 DR. LEVITT: IT'S IN YOUR ELECTRONIC
16 NOTEBOOK. IT'S THE BRIEFING BOOKS. GO AHEAD,
17 SUSAN. THERE YOU GO. PERFECT.

18 MS. WHITE: OH, GOOD. I'M SO GLAD.

19 SO WE'RE GOING TO ASK EACH OF THE THREE
20 INCUMBENTS TO DO A SELF ASSESSMENT, AND THEY'RE
21 GOING TO BE ASSESSING THEMSELVES ON THE SURVEY
22 BETWEEN MAY 23D AND JUNE 2D. AND THEN WE WILL GET
23 ALL OF YOU A COPY OF THEIR SELF-ASSESSMENT RESULTS
24 SO YOU HAVE A CHANCE TO SEE WHAT THEY FEEL THEIR
25 CONTRIBUTIONS WERE AND HOW THEY DID. AND THEN

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU'LL BE ANSWERING THE SURVEY, YOUR SURVEY
2 QUESTIONS AFTER LOOKING AT THEIRS JUNE 5TH TO JUNE
3 16. AND THEN I WILL BE COMPILING ALL THE
4 INFORMATION, ANALYZING IT, AND DEVELOPING A REPORT,
5 A SUMMARY, OF ALL OF YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE SURVEY AS
6 WELL AS INTERVIEWS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING.

7 I WILL BE INTERVIEWING ALL OF THE
8 SUBCOMMITTEE CHAIRS AND CO-CHAIRS AS WELL AS ALL THE
9 DIRECT REPORTS FOR THOSE THREE POSITIONS. SO PEOPLE
10 WILL HAVE A CHANCE TO VERBALLY ALSO GIVE FLAVOR,
11 COLOR, BACKGROUND, ADDITIONAL COMMENTS.

12 IF ANY OF THE BOARD MEMBERS, AS ALWAYS,
13 WOULD LIKE TO HAVE AN INTERVIEW WITH ME, YOU'RE MORE
14 THAN WELCOME. AND SOME PEOPLE DO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF
15 THAT, MOST DO NOT. IT'S ENTIRELY UP TO YOU. SO I
16 WILL HAVE THE SUMMARY OF THE INTERVIEWS, THE THINGS
17 THAT WE HEAR, YOUR SURVEY DATA RESULTS, AND FOR
18 MARIA AND VITO WE'LL BE ABLE TO COMPARE AGAINST LAST
19 YEAR. I'LL HAVE ALL THAT READY FOR PAT AND JUDY AND
20 THE BOARD GOVERNANCE SUBCOMMITTEE AUGUST THE 5TH.

21 SO AFTER THAT, RIGHT NOW THE PLAN -- I'LL
22 JUST SCROLL DOWN A LITTLE BIT HERE. THE PLAN IS
23 THAT WE'LL BE AT THE SEPTEMBER BOARD MEETING AGAIN
24 WHERE WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY THIS TIME TO GET THE
25 RESULTS FOR ALL THREE OF THE EXECUTIVE POSITIONS'

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PERFORMANCE. AND YOU WILL DISCUSS SHARING THAT
2 INFORMATION WITH THE INDIVIDUALS.

3 I'M TRYING TO THINK. IS THERE ANYTHING
4 ELSE OR ANY QUESTIONS PEOPLE MIGHT HAVE? I'D BE
5 HAPPY TO GO THROUGH THE DETAIL. J.T.'S IS THE
6 NEWEST ONE, AND I'D BE GLAD TO GO THROUGH THAT IF
7 ANYONE WOULD LIKE ME TO IN GREAT DETAIL OR NOT,
8 WHATEVER YOUR PREFERENCE.

9 DR. LEVITT: SO, SUSAN, IT'S PAT. FIRST,
10 I SHOULD HAVE INTRODUCED, SUSAN WHITE, WHO'S THE
11 CONSULTANT AND HAS BEEN WORKING WITH US ON REVIEWS,
12 I DON'T REMEMBER, AT LEAST ONE YEAR, MAYBE MORE,
13 LONGER.

14 MS. WHITE: THIS IS THE THIRD YEAR.

15 DR. LEVITT: AND SO FOR NEW BOARD MEMBERS,
16 SUSAN HAS WORKED VERY CLOSELY WITH JUDY, MYSELF, AND
17 THE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE ON THE REVIEWS. YOU ALL
18 HAD THE -- SO THE ONE CHANGE, THE ONE SIGNIFICANT
19 CHANGE IS TO ALIGN THE REVIEW OF THE PRESIDENT AND
20 CEO IN TERMS OF CONTENT OF WHAT'S BEING REVIEWED.
21 THERE'S SOME SPECIFIC THINGS FOR EACH OF THE
22 POSITIONS. BUT THE NUMBER OF QUESTIONS ARE GREATLY
23 REDUCED, AND THERE'S ALIGNMENT NOW WITH ALL THREE
24 POSITIONS IN TERMS OF THE FORMS THAT WE'RE GOING TO
25 BE FILLING OUT. SO FROM THE GOVERNANCE SIDE OF THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 REPORT, I THINK THE GOVERNANCE SUBCOMMITTEE HAD SOME
2 GOOD DISCUSSION. IT WAS THE ALIGNMENT THAT THEY
3 WERE VERY HAPPY TO SEE, CONSISTENCY, AND THERE WAS
4 VERY LITTLE DISCUSSION. THERE WAS UNANIMOUS
5 APPROVAL.

6 SO I HAVE TO DO A MOTION. I'D ASK FOR A
7 MOTION TO APPROVE THE REVIEW FORMS AND THE TIMELINE
8 FOR REVIEW OF THE BOARD CHAIR, VICE CHAIR, AND
9 PRESIDENT AND CEO. DO I HAVE A MOTION?

10 DR. DEAS: SO MOVED.

11 DR. BLUMENTHAL: SECOND.

12 DR. LEVITT: DEBORAH AND GEORGE.

13 MR. TOCHER: WE GOT IT.

14 DR. LEVITT: YOU DISTRACT ME FROM MY
15 NOTES.

16 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: OF COURSE.

17 DR. LEVITT: SO COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS,
18 ANYBODY? OKAY. SCOTT, CALL THE ROLL.

19 MR. TOCHER: JUST LOOK FOR ANY PUBLIC
20 COMMENT IN THE ROOM.

21 DR. LEVITT: ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? I LOOKED
22 DIRECTLY AT CLAUDETTE AND SHE JUST WENT LIKE THIS.

23 MR. TOCHER: OR ONLINE. OKAY. GREAT.
24 I'LL CALL THE ROLL. ACTUALLY I WON'T CALL THE ROLL
25 FOR THE ROOM. ALL THOSE IN THE ROOM IN FAVOR SAY

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 AYE. OPPOSED SAY NAY. ANY ABSTENTIONS? AND I'LL
2 POLL THE MEMBERS ON THE ZOOM.

3 JUDY CHOU.

4 DR. CHOU: AYE.

5 MR. TOCHER: DAVID HIGGINS. SORRY, DAVID,
6 ARE YOU STILL -- I SEE YOU. I'LL COME BACK TO YOU,
7 DAVID.

8 RICH LAJARA.

9 MR. LAJARA: YES.

10 MR. TOCHER: ADRIANA PADILLA. JOE
11 PANETTA. SORRY, JOE.

12 MR. PANETTA: YES.

13 MR. TOCHER: KEVIN XU. KEVIN, PERHAPS
14 YOU'RE MUTED. KEITH YAMAMOTO.

15 DR. YAMAMOTO: YES.

16 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU. LET ME JUST COME
17 BACK TO DAVID HIGGINS.

18 DR. HIGGINS: YES.

19 MR. TOCHER: THANK YOU, DAVID. AND LAST
20 CALL FOR KEVIN XU. VERY GOOD. OKAY. THANK YOU.
21 THE MOTION CARRIES.

22 DR. LEVITT: MOTION CARRIES. THANKS VERY
23 MUCH. OKAY. NOW WE'RE GOING TO BE ENTERING A
24 CLOSED SESSION. SCOTT, YOU HAVE YOUR FINGER ON
25 PAUSE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MR. TOCHER: NO. NO.

2 DR. LEVITT: I WAS GOING TO ASK YOU TO
3 READ THE STATUTE THAT SENDS US INTO CLOSED SESSION.

4 MR. TOCHER: OKAY. I SHOULD HAVE THIS
5 MEMORIZED BY NOW. THE BOARD WILL BE ADJOURNING TO
6 CLOSED SESSION FOR A DISCUSSION OF PERSONNEL
7 PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 11126 (A) AND
8 HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE SECTION 125290.30(F)(3)(D).

9 SO OUR MEMBERS WHO ARE ON THE ZOOM WILL
10 SEE A TAB TO INVITE YOU TO JOIN A BREAKOUT ROOM. SO
11 CLICK THE BLUE BUTTON TO JOIN THAT BREAKOUT ROOM.
12 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THIS ROOM AND THE TEAM WILL
13 LEAVE US JUST THE BOARD.

14 (THE BOARD THEN WENT INTO CLOSED
15 SESSION, NOT REPORTED, NOR HEREIN TRANSCRIBED. THE
16 FOLLOWING WAS THEN HEARD IN OPEN SESSION.)

17 DR. LEVITT: WELCOME BACK FROM THE BREAK
18 AND JUST TO REPORT BACK THAT NO ACTIONS WERE TAKEN
19 IN THE CLOSED SESSION. THANK YOU.

20 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: BACK TO ME? OKAY.
21 ARE ALL THE BOARD MEMBERS HERE?

22 WELL, PAT, IF I COULD JUST FOOTNOTE ONTO
23 YOUR COMMENT. I'VE GOT TO SHARE WITH BOARD MEMBERS
24 IT ACTUALLY IS QUITE STRANGE TO COME BACK INTO A
25 ROOM WHERE YOU KNOW EVERYONE HAS BEEN TALKING ABOUT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU.

2 FOR THE CATHOLICS IN THE ROOM, THEY
3 MIGHT -- IT WILL BE RESONANT WITH, YOU KNOW, THERE
4 ARE OTHER OPPORTUNITIES FOR CATHOLICS TO DISCUSS
5 THEIR SHORTCOMINGS AND ASPIRATIONS. IT'S CALLED
6 CONFESSION. BUT THE DIFFERENCE IS THAT'S CONDUCTED
7 IN A CLOSED ROOM ONE ON ONE AND IT'S VERY DARK.

8 DR. LEVITT: I THINK BECAUSE I SAID
9 THERE'S NO ACTION, I THINK WE SHOULD MOVE ON.
10 THAT'S MY RECOMMENDATION.

11 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: SO I SEE THE
12 PRESIDENT IS IN THE BATTING CAGE HERE, READY TO GO.
13 THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM.

14 DR. THOMAS: THANK YOU. WITH PERHAPS SOME
15 LIMITED EXCEPTION OF PUBLIC COMMENT AND THAT SORT OF
16 THING, I'VE BEEN INFORMED I'M THE FINAL THING
17 BETWEEN GETTING TO GO HOME, ET CETERA. SO I KNOW
18 MARIA IS WATCHING CLOSELY.

19 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: I AM.

20 DR. THOMAS: AND SCOTT ALREADY PUT THE
21 TIMER ON.

22 SO, MR. CHAIR, MADAM VICE CHAIR, MEMBERS
23 OF THE BOARD, MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, THANK YOU FOR
24 THE OPPORTUNITY TO PLAY CLEANUP HERE IN THIS
25 MEETING. I'VE GOT A COUPLE THINGS I WANT TO TALK

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ABOUT SPECIFICALLY, BUT I DO WANT TO START WITH A
2 COMMENT OR TWO ABOUT THE LAST FEW WEEKS IN LOS
3 ANGELES, WHICH HAVE BEEN EXTRAORDINARILY TAXING
4 WHERE MANY PEOPLE AT A NUMBER OF OUR INSTITUTIONS
5 LOST THEIR HOMES EITHER IN ALTADENA OR THE
6 PALISADES. MANY OTHERS AFFECTED IN A GREAT MANY
7 WAYS, WHETHER IT WAS SMOKE DAMAGE OR VERY LENGTHY
8 EVACUATIONS WHICH BY COMPARISON ARE MINOR, MINOR,
9 MINOR INCONVENIENCES, BUT IT WAS A REALLY DIFFICULT
10 TIME.

11 AND WE HEARD FROM A NUMBER OF OUR
12 RESEARCHERS THAT THE DISRUPTION REALLY HAD AN IMPACT
13 ON A NUMBER OF LABS AND PEOPLE'S ABILITY TO GET IN
14 AND OUT OF PLACES AND THAT SORT OF THING. AND I
15 WANTED TO REPORT TO THE BOARD THAT WERE WE COULD WE
16 REACTED TO THAT TO ACCOMMODATE THESE DISRUPTIONS.
17 FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAD OUR LAST DISC-0 APPLICATION
18 DEADLINE WAS EARLY FEBRUARY. AND WE WERE INFORMED
19 THAT A NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO WERE PUTTING TOGETHER
20 GRANTS FOR THE DISC-0S WERE AFFECTED AND UNABLE TO
21 GET INTO THEIR LABS. THEY COULDN'T GET TO A LOT OF
22 THE DATA THAT WAS GOING TO INFORM THEIR
23 APPLICATIONS. AND SO WE TALKED ABOUT IT INTERNALLY
24 AND FELT WE ABSOLUTELY NEEDED TO DO OUR PART TO HELP
25 THEM OUT.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 SO WE EXTENDED THE APPLICATION BY TWO
2 MONTHS, WHICH WAS RECEIVED VERY FAVORABLY BY OUR
3 MEMBER INSTITUTIONS. BUT JUST A SMALL PART OF
4 THINGS THAT PEOPLE HAVE DONE TO TRY TO HELP. SO I
5 JUST WANTED TO REPORT THAT TO THE BOARD. AND HAPPY
6 TO SAY THAT WITH THE BIT OF RAIN WE HAD LAST
7 WEEKEND, WE'RE PRETTY MUCH THROUGH THAT STRETCH, AND
8 WE'RE HOPING THAT THE NEXT SET OF FIRE CONDITIONS
9 THAT UNDOUBTEDLY WILL ARISE SHORTLY WILL PASS
10 WITHOUT INCIDENT. AND I JUST WANT TO SAY
11 PERSONALLY, AS SOMEBODY WHO LIVES IN THE WEST SIDE
12 OF LOS ANGELES, THAT THE FIREWOMEN AND MEN ARE
13 HEROES. THEY PERFORMED INCREDIBLY UNDER EXTREMELY
14 ADVERSE CONDITIONS, ALMOST UNPRECEDENTED AT THE
15 OUTSET, AND WERE ABLE TO SAVE A GREAT DEAL OF
16 PROPERTY AND PEOPLE'S LIVES AND ET CETERA. SO A
17 MAJOR SHOUT OUT TO THE FIRE DEPARTMENT, NOT JUST OF
18 L.A., BUT LITERALLY THERE WERE FIREMEN AND WOMEN
19 COMING FROM ALL AROUND THE COUNTRY TO HELP OUT. AND
20 THEY JUST DID YEOMAN WORK, AND WE'RE ENDLESSLY
21 APPRECIATIVE.

22 OKAY. SO WITH THAT, I WANT TO GO INTO THE
23 PRESIDENT'S REPORT SO I'M GOING TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT
24 A COUPLE THINGS. ONE IS, AS YOU KNOW, AT THE
25 BEGINNING OF EACH CALENDAR YEAR, THERE'S THE MASSIVE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 JP MORGAN CONFERENCE OF THE BIOTECH INDUSTRY IN SAN
2 FRANCISCO. IT PRETTY MUCH TAKES OVER THE CITY. AT
3 THE BEGINNING OF THAT WEEK, WHICH IMMEDIATELY
4 SUCCEDED THE ISSCR NUCLEUS FORUM THAT VITO
5 DESCRIBED EARLIER IN THE MEETING, THE ALLIANCE FOR
6 REGENERATIVE MEDICINE, WHICH IS SORT OF A
7 ASSOCIATION FOR OUR INDUSTRY, GIVES A STATE OF THE
8 INDUSTRY REVIEW, WHICH SORT OF SETS CONTEXT GOING
9 INTO EACH YEAR FOR WHAT'S GOING ON IN CELL AND GENE
10 THERAPY FROM THE BUSINESS SIDE.

11 SO I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH A NUMBER OF
12 SLIDES BECAUSE I THINK THESE ARE INTERESTING,
13 HOPEFULLY, EVEN LATE IN THE DAY AND WILL GIVE YOU
14 SOME DATA POINTS THAT YOU CAN TAKE AWAY FROM THE
15 MEETING HERE.

16 SECONDLY, I'LL VERY BRIEFLY RECAP THE
17 AFOREMENTIONED MEETING WE HAD WITH THE STATE
18 CONTROLLER AND THE CITIZENS FINANCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY
19 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE IN SACRAMENTO IN DECEMBER.

20 SO WITHOUT FURTHER ADO, PLUNGE INTO THE
21 ARM PRESENTATION. SO ECHOING THE SORT OF POSITIVE
22 SENTIMENT THAT EMANATED FROM THE NUCLEUS FORUM, WE
23 HAD A PRETTY UPBEAT PRESENTATION BY TIM HUNT, WHO'S
24 THE CEO OF ARM, WHO A NUMBER OF US HAVE A GOOD
25 RELATIONSHIP WITH WHO'S VERY MUCH A GREAT AMBASSADOR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR THE INDUSTRY. AND HIS PRESENTATION WAS ALL
2 ABOUT HOW THINGS ARE LOOKING UP FROM, AGAIN,
3 PRINCIPALLY THE BUSINESS SIDE.

4 SO HE BROKE DOWN HIS PRESENTATION INTO
5 FOUR SECTIONS. HISTORY AS A GUIDE. THIS LOOKS LIKE
6 A JEOPARDY BOARD, BY THE WAY. HISTORY AS A GUIDE,
7 ADDRESSING QUESTIONS ABOUT CELL AND GENE THERAPY
8 COMMERCIALIZATION, THE INCREDIBLY BRIGHT FUTURE OF
9 CELL AND GENE THERAPY, AND THEN THE SORT OF
10 INTERESTING FOURTH, OPPORTUNITIES IN THE NEW
11 ADMINISTRATION. WE'LL GET TO THAT ONE AT THE END.

12 SO HISTORY AS A GUIDE. SO I'M NOT GOING
13 TO GO THROUGH THIS OTHER THAN TO NOTE THAT HIS POINT
14 WAS FROM THE FIRST RESEARCH DONE IN MONOCLONAL
15 ANTIBODIES TO WHEN THE FIRST PRODUCT WAS APPROVED
16 WAS 23 YEARS. AND THE POINT OF THIS IS THAT WITH
17 EACH SORT OF ADVANCEMENTS IN THE NEW AREA OF
18 SCIENCE, IT TAKES TIME TO GET TO WHERE YOU GO FROM
19 FIRST INCEPTION TO COMMERCIALIZATION AND THEN THINGS
20 PROCEED FROM THERE. OF COURSE, MONOCLONAL
21 ANTIBODIES ARE NOW A HUGE PART OF THE MARKET. YOU
22 SEE \$250 BILLION IN REVENUE. POINT BEING THAT
23 SIMILAR SORT OF THING APPLIES TO CELL AND GENE
24 THERAPY WHERE THE FIRST GENE THERAPY CONCEPT CAME IN
25 1972, AND IT WASN'T REALLY UNTIL YOU GOT INTO THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 LATE 2010S THAT YOU STARTED TO SEE APPROVALS OF CELL
2 AND GENE THERAPY PRODUCTS.

3 YOU CAN SEE IN 2019 SCOTT GOTLIEB, WHO IS
4 THE FDA COMMISSIONER IN THE FIRST TRUMP
5 ADMINISTRATION, PREDICTED THAT YEAR THAT BY 2025
6 WE'D HAVE 10 TO 20 APPROVALS A YEAR. AND AS YOU
7 SORT OF GO THROUGH AND YOU SEE A COUPLE OF THE BIG
8 NAMES, ZOLGENSMA, WHICH WAS NOVARTIS' SMA PRODUCT,
9 APPROVED AND BECAME A BILLION-DOLLAR BLOCKBUSTER IN
10 2021.

11 YESCARTE, WHICH IS A CAR T PRODUCT FROM
12 KITE THERAPEUTICS, LATER ACQUIRED BY GILEAD FOLLOWED
13 SUIT IN 2023 -- SORRY -- YES -- 2023. ALSO IN 2023
14 FIVE FDA APPROVALS IN THE CELL AND GENE THERAPY
15 SPACE, NINE LAST YEAR. SO WHEN YOU GET TO 2025,
16 WHERE WE ARE NOW, HIS PREDICTION OF 10 TO 25
17 APPROVALS A YEAR IS NOT TOO FAR AFTER THE MARK.

18 OKAY. SO THEN QUESTIONS ABOUT -- THIS IS
19 A BIG TOPIC, CELL AND GENE THERAPY
20 COMMERCIALIZATION, WHICH GETS -- DOVETAILS VERY
21 NICELY WITH MADAM VICE CHAIR'S AND MR. LOMAX AND THE
22 ACCESS AND AFFORDABILITY WORKING GROUP, AND THE
23 PATIENT ACCESS TEAMS, THIS ISSUE OF
24 COMMERCIALIZATION, ACCESS AND AFFORDABILITY IS A BIG
25 DEAL.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THE SLIDES ON THIS, THIS SLIDE JUST IS TO
2 SAY THAT THERE ARE A NUMBER OF ISSUES IN THE FIELD
3 AND THINGS AREN'T PERFECT NOW. THERE ARE THINGS
4 THAT HAVE TO BE WORKED THROUGH. SO YOU CAN SEE SOME
5 THERAPIES FACE CHALLENGES RELATED TO EFFICACY,
6 SAFETY, AND DURABILITY. YOU'VE GOT COST ISSUES.
7 YOU'VE GOT ALL SORTS OF COMMERCIALIZATION ELEMENTS
8 THAT ARE TRICKY, ALL LISTED HERE WHICH YOU CAN READ.
9 I NEEDN'T GO THROUGH. BUT THE POINT BEING IS THERE
10 ARE A LOT OF THINGS THAT NEED TO BE RESOLVED IN THE
11 COMMERCIALIZATION FRONT, WHICH ARE A WORK IN
12 PROGRESS AT THE MOMENT.

13 THERE HAVE BEEN SOME NOTABLE SUCCESSES.
14 SO YOU HAD VERTEX WITH CASGEVY, A TREATMENT FOR
15 SICKLE CELL. FOR THOSE OF US WHO WENT TO THE
16 MEETING ON THE MESA IN PHOENIX, WE SAW THIS
17 REMARKABLE PATIENT JIMMY OLAGHERE WHO HAD SEVERE
18 SICKLE CELL DISEASE, TOOK CASGEVY IN 2020 AND SPOKE
19 ABOUT HIS FOUR YEARS LATER CLIMBING TO THE TOP OF
20 MOUNT KILIMANJARO, WHICH IS A VERY INSPIRING STORY.
21 SO IT'S SOMETHING THAT THINGS ARE HAPPENING IN THE
22 SPACE AND PRODUCTS ARE REACHING COMMERCIALIZATION
23 AND HAVING REAL IMPACT.

24 OKAY. SO COMMERCIALIZATION, QUESTION 1:
25 DO CELL AND GENE THERAPIES REPRESENT COMPELLING

1 COMMERCIAL OPPORTUNITIES? SO HERE THIS IS SUPPOSED
2 TO SAY THAT, AS I MENTIONED BEFORE, THERE HAVE BEEN
3 SEVERAL BLOCKBUSTERS NOW IN THE FIELD DEFINED AS A
4 BILLION OR MORE REVENUE A YEAR. THEY PREDICT BY THE
5 YEAR 2030 THERE WILL BE TEN OF THOSE AT LEAST. AND
6 YOU GO TO THE NEXT PAGE, THIS IS SORT OF THE NEXT
7 TIER DOWN, 500 MILLION PLUS IN ANNUAL REVENUES. YOU
8 HAD TEN SUCH COMPANIES IN 2024. BY 2030 THEY EXPECT
9 TO BE 50 SUCH COMPANIES, WHICH WOULD BE A REAL
10 INCREASE BY ANY ESTIMATION.

11 PROMISING MARKETS FOR BLOCKBUSTER
12 POTENTIAL. SO HERE WE'VE GOT SICKLE CELL,
13 DUCHENNE'S, DYSTROPHIC EPIDERMOLYSIS BULLOSA, AND
14 DANNON DISEASE. AND YOU CAN SEE THE NUMBER OF
15 PATIENTS THAT ARE POTENTIALLY IN THE MARKET AND
16 BELOW, THE VERY BOTTOM ROW, THE COMPANIES THAT ARE
17 INVOLVED IN DEVELOPING THERAPIES IN THAT FIELD.

18 QUESTION NO. 2: LARGE-CAP BIOPHARMA
19 COMPANIES INVESTING IN CELL AND GENE THERAPIES. SO
20 IF YOU GO BACK, I'D SAY, FIVE YEARS OR SO, THE LIST
21 WAS PRETTY SMALL BECAUSE THEY'RE TAKING A
22 WAIT-AND-SEE SORT OF ATTITUDE AS TO WHAT WAS
23 HAPPENING IN THE RESEARCH, WHAT WAS GOING TO BE
24 VIABLE, ET CETERA. AND IF YOU NOW GO, OF THE TOP 15
25 BIG BIOPHARMA, 13 OF THOSE ARE IN THE CELL AND GENE

1 THERAPY SPACE IN ONE WAY OR ANOTHER WITH MERCK AND
2 AMGEN BEING THE HOLDOUTS. AND THEN WE'LL SEE IN A
3 YEAR OR TWO IF EVEN THEY JOIN THE FRAY AS WELL. I
4 THOUGHT THIS WAS A VERY INTERESTING SLIDE, THIS ONE.

5 OKAY. SO LARGE-CAP BIOPHARMA CAN DRIVE
6 COMMERCIAL SUCCESS VIA PARTNERSHIPS AND
7 ACQUISITIONS. AND HERE'S A LIST OF GROUPS THAT CAME
8 TOGETHER. INTERESTINGLY ENOUGH, MOST RECENTLY IN
9 THE BOTTOM RIGHT ROCHE ACQUIRING POSEIDA, POSEIDA
10 BEING A CIRM GRANTEE, BUT YOU SEE IN THE VARIOUS
11 INDICATIONS LISTED THERE, THAT THERE'S SOME PRETTY
12 POWERHOUSE COMBOS, AND THEY'RE REALLY DRIVING
13 COMMERCIAL SUCCESS ACROSS A NUMBER OF INDICATIONS.

14 QUESTION 3: IS CELL AND GENE THERAPY
15 SOLELY IN THE U.S.? OF COURSE, WE KNOW THE ANSWER
16 TO THAT IS NO. BUT HERE'S A BIT OF DETAIL WHICH
17 SHOWS THAT 35 PERCENT OF REVENUE IS EX-U.S. AND IF
18 YOU BREAK THAT DOWN, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF THESE
19 BIG-TIME PRODUCTS THAT ARE OUT THERE THAT A MAJORITY
20 OF THE SALES ARE OUTSIDE THE U.S. SO CELL AND GENE
21 THERAPY IS PERMEATING THE INTERNATIONAL LANDSCAPE.

22 HERE'S JUST ONE STORY. AGAIN, ZOLGENSMA,
23 NOVARTIS' SPINAL MUSCULAR ATROPHY PRODUCT, NOW BEEN
24 APPROVED IN 50 PLUS COUNTRIES. THE ACCESS PATH
25 ESTABLISHED IN OVER 45 OF THOSE. YOU CAN SEE THAT

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 IT'S NOW OVER 4,000 YOUNG CHILDREN HAVE BEEN TREATED
2 WORLDWIDE AND THAT THEY'RE IN PHASE 3 TRIALS FOR
3 APPLICATION UP TO AGE 18, BLOCKBUSTER STATUS OF A
4 BILLION IN 2021, EXPECTED TO GROW TO 2 BILLION BY
5 2028. AND THEN ESTABLISHING ACCESS CAPABILITIES
6 EARLY, WHICH IS ONE THING WE TALK ABOUT A LOT
7 IN-HOUSE, IS CRITICAL FOR COMMERCIALIZATION, WHICH
8 IS ONE OF THE LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE ZOLGENSMA
9 STORY.

10 OKAY. THIS SEGMENT OF HIS TALK WAS THE
11 INCREDIBLY BRIGHT FUTURE OF CELL AND GENE THERAPY.
12 AND WE GET INTO SOME STATS HERE. U.S. CONTINUES TO
13 LEAD, SECTORS GLOBALIZING. YOU CAN SEE PRODUCT, THE
14 COMPANIES DEVELOPING PRODUCT UP 6 PERCENT FROM LAST
15 YEAR, NUMBER OF CLINICAL TRIALS UP 3 PERCENT, AND
16 THE AMOUNT OF INVESTMENT, WHICH IS INTERESTING, UP
17 30 PERCENT, WHICH IS A VERY HEFTY ADD.

18 YOU SAW A LOT OF DIFFERENT WAYS OF
19 FINANCING AND ACQUISITION AFFECTING THE SPACE. YOU
20 HAVE THE IPO EXAMPLES ON THE LEFT, WHICH WERE
21 SIZABLE. YOU HAD VERY LARGE VC ROUNDS IN THE
22 CENTER, ALSO SIZABLE. ACQUISITION AMOUNTS, THERE
23 AGAIN, ROCHE ACQUIRING POSEIDA, OUR GRANTEE, FOR A
24 BILLION AND A HALF, VERY SIGNIFICANTLY SIZED DEALS.

25 THIS IS AN INTERESTING PAGE, I THINK. AS

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 YOU KNOW, 50 PERCENT OF OUR PORTFOLIO IS IN RARE
2 DISEASE. WE REMAIN EXTREMELY COMMITTED TO THE RARE
3 DISEASE SPACE. THIS PARTICULAR SLIDE IS OF INTEREST
4 BECAUSE IT TALKS ABOUT POTENTIAL PREVALENT DISEASE
5 BREAKTHROUGHS THAT ARE COMING IN WET AMD,
6 PARKINSON'S, MULTIPLE SCLEROSIS, AND TYPE 1
7 DIABETES. MANY OF THESE COMPANIES WE'VE BEEN IN
8 DISCUSSIONS WITH TO VARIOUS EXTENTS, NOT THAT THEY
9 NECESSARILY ARE ACTIVE IN CALIFORNIA, BUT WE'RE VERY
10 PLUGGED INTO THE NETWORKS HERE.

11 ONE OF THE PRINCIPAL SCIENTISTS, LORENZ
12 STUDER BEHIND THE PARKINSON'S WORK AT BLUEROCK AND
13 BAYER WAS AT THE NUCLEUS FORUM. A LOT OF US HAD A
14 GOOD OPPORTUNITY TO CATCH UP WITH LORENZ TO HEAR THE
15 LATEST AND GREATEST. VERTEX AND THE TYPE 1 DIABETES
16 HAS ACQUIRED DOUG MELTON'S COMPANY, SEMMA
17 THERAPEUTICS AND ALSO ACQUIRED VIACYTE AS YOU WILL
18 RECALL. DOUG IS A VERY CLOSE FRIEND, AND WE TALK TO
19 HIM AT FAIRLY REGULAR INTERVALS ABOUT THE PROGRESS
20 THAT HE CAN TALK ABOUT PUBLICLY, BUT THEY'RE MAKING
21 GREAT STRIDES. BUT YOU CAN SEE THAT IN THE NOT TOO
22 DISTANT FUTURE THERE ARE GOING TO BE SOME MAJOR
23 DEVELOPMENTS OF SOME VERY BIG-TIME PREVALENT
24 DISEASES.

25 A NUMBER OF TRENDS DRIVING THE

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ADVANCEMENTS IN SOLID TUMOR. CAR-T STARTING TO GET
2 INTO SOLID TUMOR IN A BIG WAY. IT'S ALSO STARTING
3 TO GET INTO AUTOIMMUNE AND LUPUS AND A NUMBER OF
4 OTHER INDICATIONS. AND THEN YOU'RE STARTING TO SEE
5 SOME REAL INTERESTING WORK IN-VIVO GENE EDITING
6 WHICH IS CLEARLY GOING TO BE ONE OF THE WAVES OF THE
7 FUTURE, AND WE'LL SEE A LOT MORE OF THAT AS TIME
8 GOES BY.

9 OKAY. NOW WE GET TO THIS PART OF THE
10 PRESENTATION. SO WE HAVE PICTURES OF OUR TWO MOST
11 RECENT PRESIDENTS. THE POINT OF THIS SLIDE WAS
12 EVERY PRESIDENCY BRINGS BOTH HEADWINDS AND
13 TAILWINDS. AND YOU CAN SORT OF LOOK AND SEE WHAT
14 THEY LISTED WITH RESPECT TO THE FIRST TRUMP
15 ADMINISTRATION AND THE BIDEN ADMINISTRATION.

16 AND THE ISSUE WAS THAT NO MATTER WHO'S
17 PRESIDENT, THERE ARE GOING TO BE CHALLENGES AND
18 OPPORTUNITIES. THIS WAS PRESENTED, AS I MENTIONED,
19 EARLY JANUARY, PRECEDED A NUMBER OF THE MORE RECENT
20 EXECUTIVE ORDERS AND OTHER COMMENTARIES.

21 SO TIM TOOK AT STAB AT HOW THINGS UNDER
22 TRUMP ADMINISTRATION 2.0 MAY BE THINGS THAT CELL AND
23 GENE THERAPY CAN BENEFIT FROM. ONE WAS THAT HAVING
24 THERAPIES AND CURES THAT GET RID OF THE DISEASES AND
25 REDUCE THE NEED FOR CHRONIC CARE IS A MAJOR PILLAR

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 OF THE CURRENTLY UNDER CONSIDERATION SECRETARY OF
2 HHS NOMINEE'S MAKE AMERICA HEALTHY AGAIN AGENDA AND
3 SHOULD BE IN SYNC WITH THAT PHILOSOPHICALLY.

4 THE SECOND POINT WAS THAT THERE'S GOING TO
5 BE REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY THAT ALLOWS FOR
6 ACCELERATED APPROVALS, ET CETERA, WITH NEW
7 TECHNOLOGIES. I'M NOT EXACTLY SURE HOW WE CAN
8 PREDICT HOW THAT'S GOING TO GO, BUT VERY HOPEFULLY
9 THAT'S GOING TO BE THE CASE THAT CLEARLY IS WHERE
10 PETER MARKS AND CBER IS INTENDING TO TAKE RARE
11 DISEASE, IF HE'S ABLE TO DO SO, WHICH WOULD BE A
12 MAJOR DEVELOPMENT FOR THAT PART OF THE DISEASE
13 SPECTRUM.

14 NO. 3 IS, AND AGAIN THIS IS SOMETHING THAT
15 REMAINS TO BE SEEN ALSO, CONTINUATION OF CMMI'S CELL
16 AND GENE THERAPY ACCESS MODEL WHICH IS, FOR THOSE
17 WHO AREN'T ENTIRELY FAMILIAR WITH, IMPROVES HEALTH
18 OUTCOMES FOR PEOPLE ON MEDICAID WHO CAN BENEFIT FROM
19 CELL AND GENE THERAPY BY SUPPORTING OUTCOME-BASED
20 AGREEMENTS BETWEEN STATES AND MANUFACTURERS THAT
21 WILL PROVIDE FOR TREATMENTS WITHIN A FRAMEWORK THAT
22 LOWERS PRICES FOR STATES AND IS TIED TO PAYMENT
23 OUTCOMES.

24 AND THE TWO COMPANIES THAT RECENTLY HAD
25 THEIR STEM CELL PRODUCTS APPROVED HAVE SIGNED ONTO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 THIS IN CONCEPT, AND THERE'S HOPE THAT THIS IS A
2 MODEL FOR TREATING THESE SORTS OF THINGS WITH MANY
3 MORE COMPANIES IN THE FUTURE.

4 NO. 4, STRENGTHENING MANUFACTURING
5 CAPACITY IN THE U.S. AND ONSHORE AS MUCH OF THE
6 TECHNOLOGY AS POSSIBLE TO FURTHER THE AMERICA FIRST
7 AGENDA OF THIS ADMINISTRATION. AND THEN THERE'S THE
8 SENTIMENT THAT HAVING A NEW FTC COMMISSIONER IS
9 GOING TO BE A BOON FOR M&A IN GENERAL AND THAT THAT
10 SHOULD INURE TO THE BENEFIT OF THE INDUSTRY AS IT
11 CONTEMPLATES SMALLER FIRMS BEING MERGED INTO OR
12 BOUGHT OUT BY THE BIG PHARMA.

13 SO THOSE WERE TIM'S FIVE TOP IDEAS OF HOW
14 THINGS COULD GEL WITH THE PHILOSOPHY OF PRESIDENT
15 TRUMP. AND, AS I SAY, WE'LL SEE HOW ALL THIS PLAYS
16 OUT.

17 SO SORT OF THE KEY TAKEAWAYS FROM TODAY
18 BEING FIRST DAY OF JP MORGAN WEEK, HISTORY PROVIDES
19 A GUIDE, CELL AND GENE THERAPIES ARE FOLLOWING A
20 WELL-ESTABLISHED LINEAR PATH -- OR NONLINEAR PATH
21 TOWARDS GREATER ADOPTION MUCH LIKE MONOCLONAL
22 ANTIBODIES DID. AND IF YOU WENT BACK, SMALL
23 MOLECULES BEFORE THAT. BLOCKBUSTERS BECKON. WE'VE
24 GOTTEN A COUPLE BIG ONES ALREADY. WE EXPECT TO HAVE
25 A NUMBER MORE IN THE NEXT FIVE YEARS. SCIENTIFIC

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 BREAKTHROUGHS CONTINUE APACE. AGAIN, YOU ARE GOING
2 TO SEE LOTS OF THINGS LIKE IN-VIVO GENE EDITING AND
3 A VARIETY OF OTHER DEVELOPMENTS THAT FUNDAMENTALLY
4 AFFECT THE FIELD. AND THEN SYSTEMS MODERNIZING
5 THROUGH THINGS LIKE THE CELL AND GENE THERAPY ACCESS
6 MODEL AND OTHER OPPORTUNITIES.

7 AND THAT WAS THAT. THAT WAS TIM HUNT'S
8 PRESENTATION. I JUST GOT THE FIVE-MINUTE SIT DOWN
9 OR YOU'RE IN BIG TROUBLE SIGN FROM SCOTT. THIS WILL
10 TAKE FIVE MINUTES OR LESS.

11 SO IN DECEMBER, AS YOU KNOW, WE ARE
12 OVERSEEN BY THE STATE CONTROLLER WHO ANNUALLY
13 CONVENES THE CITIZENS FINANCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY
14 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE TO TALK ABOUT SEVERAL THINGS.
15 WE MET WITH MELIA COHEN, THE CONTROLLER, AND HER
16 COMMITTEE IN SACRAMENTO IN HER OFFICES IN DECEMBER.
17 AND WE TALKED -- THEY HAD A REVIEW BY MOSS-ADAMS OF
18 OUR FINANCIAL AUDIT, WHICH, OF COURSE, WAS CRYSTAL
19 CLEAR AS IT HAS BEEN FOR YEARS IN A ROW. SHOUT-OUT
20 TO JEN LEWIS AND MEMBERS OF THE FINANCE TEAM FOR
21 ANOTHER SPOTLESS AUDIT, WHICH IS EXACTLY HOW WE LIKE
22 IT.

23 RAPHAEL PRESENTED ON THE LATEST CHANGES
24 THAT WE HAVE MADE IN RESPONSE TO OUR PERFORMANCE
25 AUDIT. FOR YOU NEW MEMBERS, WE HAVE TO DO A

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 PERFORMANCE AUDIT EVERY THREE YEARS TO CHECK ON HOW
2 ALL OF THE THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING ARE BEST
3 PRACTICES. AND THEY ALWAYS GIVE US A NUMBER OF
4 THINGS TO IMPROVE ON, NOTABLY OVER TIME THAT GOES
5 DOWN WITH EACH SUCCESSIVE AUDIT, WHICH IS THE WAY
6 YOU LIKE IT. RAPHAEL DID A GREAT JOB IN PRESENTING
7 IN RATHER SHORT TIME FRAME SHALL WE SAY.

8 AND THEN THE OTHER PART OF THE MEETING WAS
9 I PRESENTED ON CIRM'S WORK AND ALL THE REALLY,
10 REALLY INTERESTING THINGS THAT OUR FUNDED SCIENTISTS
11 ARE DOING ACROSS THE STATE WITH UPDATES ON THE
12 PORTFOLIO, EXAMPLES OF SPECIFIC PROJECTS, AND
13 ANSWERING A LOT OF QUESTIONS THAT THEY HAD ON WHAT
14 WE'RE DOING.

15 IN THE FIRST CFAOC MEETINGS, THERE WAS
16 NONE OF THAT. IT WAS ALL THE FINANCIAL STUFF. ARE
17 YOU BEING GOOD STEWARDS OF THE TAXPAYERS' DOLLARS?
18 NOW THIS PART OF THE MEETING IS SOMETHING THEY
19 REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO BECAUSE THEY'RE ALL
20 FASCINATED BY WHAT THE CIRM FAMILY WRIT LARGE,
21 INCLUDING ALL OF OUR WONDERFUL SCIENTISTS, ARE
22 DOING. AND THEY WERE THE MOST ENGAGED THAT WE'VE
23 EVER HAD THEM IN THIS MEETING. THEY ASKED A LOT OF
24 QUESTIONS, GAVE US A CHANCE TO EXPAND ON WHAT WE'RE
25 DOING. AND THEN THAT, I THINK, THAT WAS A VERY GOOD

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 MEETING. IMPORTANTLY FOLLOWED AFTER THE MEETING,
2 MARIA HAD A CHANCE TO SPEND TIME WITH THE
3 CONTROLLER'S CHIEF OF STAFF AND DEPUTY AND HELPED
4 DEVELOP THOSE RELATIONSHIPS FURTHER, WHICH ARE VERY
5 CRITICAL BECAUSE WE WANT TO BE IN ABSOLUTELY BEST
6 STANDING WITH ALL OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL OFFICERS.
7 AND FOR THAT MATTER ALL THE LEGISLATIVE OFFICIALS IN
8 SACRAMENTO TOO. SO MARIA GOT A LOT OF GOOD SINGLE
9 ONE-ON-ONE TIME WITH THEM.

10 SO THAT WAS THE CFAOC MEETING, AND I THINK
11 IT WAS GOOD. SO WITH THAT, UNLESS ANYBODY HAS ANY
12 QUESTIONS, I MANAGED TO GET IN UNDER MR. TOCHER'S
13 FIVE-MINUTE WARNING. AND THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH.

14 (APPLAUSE.)

15 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: J.T., THAT WAS A
16 GREAT RECAP OF THE LECTURE. THANKS SO MUCH. WE
17 COME NOW TO THE AGENDA ITEM 16, WHICH IS AN
18 OPPORTUNITY FOR BOARD MEMBERS IF THEY HAVE ANY
19 COMMENTS ON OUR APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE
20 PROCESS. ANY COMMENT FROM OUR ONLINE FOLKS? NO.
21 OKAY.

22 GOING TO MOVE ON TO NO. 17, IT'S THE
23 OPPORTUNITY FOR THE PUBLIC TO COMMENT ON ANYTHING
24 THAT WAS NOT ON TODAY'S AGENDA.

25 VICE CHAIR BONNEVILLE: THERE IS ONE.

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: PLEASE IDENTIFY.

2 MS. MANDAC: ANDREA, IF YOU COULD UNMUTE
3 YOURSELF. ALL RIGHT. YOU'LL HAVE THREE MINUTES.
4 YOUR TIME STARTS NOW.

5 MS. FERNANDEZ DE SOTO: THANK YOU SO MUCH
6 FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. MY NAME IS ANDREA, AND I AM
7 CALLING FROM EDMONTON, ALBERTA IN CANADA. I AM THE
8 MOTHER OF JAKOB GUZIAK, THE EDMONTON BUBBLE BOY, AND
9 WHO WAS EARLY DIAGNOSED WITH ADA-SCID THANKS TO THE
10 NEWBORN SCREENING TEST. JAKOB IS THE CLOSEST
11 EXAMPLE OF WHAT YOUR SUPPORT TO GENE THERAPIES FOR
12 RARE CONDITIONS MEAN, THE SUPPORT YOU GIVE TO
13 SCIENTISTS LIKE DR. DONALD KOHN WHO ARE READY CHANGE
14 THE LIFE OF OUR LOVED ONES.

15 AN EXAMPLE OF THE TIRELESS FIGHT WE
16 PARENTS HAVE TO DO IN ORDER TO ACCESS TREATMENT
17 AROUND THE WORLD.

18 JAKOB COULD HAVE BEEN CURED IN THE EARLY
19 YEARS OF HIS LIFE FOR AROUND \$1.5 MILLION OR EVEN
20 LESS IF GENE THERAPY WAS AVAILABLE HERE IN CANADA.
21 FOUR AND A HALF YEARS IS THE TIME THAT WE WAITED TO
22 SAVE OUR CHILD. THANKS TO YOUR SUPPORT AND THE COST
23 OF HIS MEDICATION WE OBSERVED DURING THESE YEARS HAS
24 BEEN AROUND A MILLION DOLLARS.

25 ONCE UPON A TIME, I WAS HERE PLEADING TO

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 ALL OF YOU TO GIVE A LIFE OPPORTUNITY TO MY SON AND
2 TO ADA-SCID. TODAY I WANT TO GIVE TO ALL OF YOU MY
3 INFINITE THANKS AT CIRM FOR YOUR BOLD DECISIONS FOR
4 ADVOCATING FOR WHAT WAS RIGHT, FOR SUPPORTING DR.
5 KOHN, AND MY HUMBLE PLEA TO KEEP IN YOUR
6 CONSIDERATION THE MANY PARENTS THAT ARE HERE TODAY
7 ASKING FOR THE SAME HELP I ONCE ASKED FOR MY CHILD.

8 I FIND MYSELF IN THE WORDS OF EACH MOM AND
9 DAD HERE TODAY AND MY SON IN THEIR STORIES. PLEASE
10 DO NOT FORGET THEM. DO NOT FORGET THEIR FIGHT,
11 THEIR VOICE, AND WHAT YOUR ACTIONS MEAN TO ALL OF
12 US. MORE THAN HOPE IS WHAT YOU GUYS HAVE GIVEN TO
13 OUR FAMILY TODAY. PLEASE DO NOT STOP CHANGING THE
14 LIVES AND GIVING THE SAME HOPE TO ALL THESE FAMILIES
15 FOR A FUTURE OF COMMERCIALIZED GENE THERAPIES.
16 THANK YOU.

17 CHAIRMAN IMBASCIANI: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
18 IT'S HARD TO FOLLOW THAT. OKAY. THANK YOU, BOARD
19 MEMBERS, FOR YOUR ATTENDANCE AND YOUR PARTICIPATION
20 IN TODAY'S MEETING.

21 I'M GOING TO ADJOURN THE MEETING SO THAT
22 WE WOULD COME TOGETHER AGAIN IN SACRAMENTO AT 9 A.M.
23 ON THURSDAY, 27 MARCH AT THE WESTIN HOTEL. THERE
24 MIGHT BE TWO WESTINS IN SACRAMENTO. THIS ONE IS AT
25 4800 RIVERSIDE BOULEVARD. WE'RE PLANNING AND HOPING

BETH C. DRAIN, CA CSR NO. 7152

1 FOR A DINNER, OUR USUAL CUSTOM, THE EVENING BEFORE.
2 THE DETAILS OF THAT ARE TO BE DETERMINED. SO THAT'S
3 THURSDAY, 27 MARCH. SEE YOU THEN. MEETING IS
4 ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.

5 (THE MEETING WAS THEN CONCLUDED AT 4:07 P.M.)
6
7
8

9
10 **REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE**
11
12

13 I, BETH C. DRAIN, A CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER IN
14 AND FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, HEREBY CERTIFY THAT
15 THE FOREGOING TRANSCRIPT OF THE PROCEEDINGS BEFORE
16 THE INDEPENDENT CITIZEN'S OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AND
17 THE APPLICATION REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE
18 CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR REGENERATIVE MEDICINE IN
19 THE MATTER OF ITS REGULAR MEETING HELD ON JANUARY
20 30, 2025, WAS HELD AS HEREIN APPEARS AND THAT THIS
21 IS THE ORIGINAL TRANSCRIPT THEREOF AND THAT THE
22 STATEMENTS THAT APPEAR IN THIS TRANSCRIPT WERE
23 REPORTED STENOGRAPHICALLY BY ME AND TRANSCRIBED BY
24 ME. I ALSO CERTIFY THAT THIS TRANSCRIPT IS A TRUE
25 AND ACCURATE RECORD OF THE PROCEEDING.

26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000